Section 4 Integrated Impact Assessment

Summary Report Template

Each of the numbered sections below must be completed

Interim report	x	Final report		(Tick as appropriate)

1.   Title of plan, policy or strategy being assessed

Proposals to End Overdue Library Fines

2.   What will change as a result of this proposal?

On 16 May 2024, the Council's Culture and Communities Committee will consider the abolishment of overdue fines for libraries. If the proposal is agreed, the temporary pause on the charging of overdue fines for late or non-return of stock will become permanent. Pre covid library members with overdue items were charged 30p per day rising to 35p per day after seven days for adults which applied to all items on loan including CD's and DVD's. The service has not historically charged children or young people.

3.   Briefly describe public involvement in this proposal to date and planned

There has not been any public involvement in the proposal, however, the proposal is based on both international and national experience and evidence from other library authorities where overdue fines have been abolished. The evidence suggests that members of the public and communities have responded positively to this change.

4.   Is the proposal considered strategic under the Fairer Scotland Duty?

Yes.

5.   Date of IIA

   10 May 2024

6. **Who was present at the IIA? Identify facilitator, Lead Officer, report writer and any partnership representative present and main stakeholder (e.g. NHS, Council)**

Name	Job Title	Date of IIA training	Email
Evelyn Kilmurry (Facilitator)	Head of Libraries, Sport and Wellbeing	**December 2021**	evelyn.kilmurry@edinburgh.gov.uk
Cleo Jones	Libraries Development Manager	**November 2023**	cleo.jones@edinburgh.gov.uk
Hana MacKechnie	Libraries Development Manager	**November 2023**	hana.mackechnie@edinburgh.gov.uk

7. **Evidence available at the time of the IIA**

Evidence	Available?	Comments: what does the evidence tell you?

| Data on populations in need | Scotland Census Data – Rounded Population Estimates release 14 Sept 2023 | At the time of the 2022 census, Edinburgh had a (rounded) population of 512,700.
Female – 264,000 (51.5%)
Male – 248,700 (48.5%)

Age (adapted from Census figures):
0 – 04 yrs – 22,100
05 – 11 yrs – 33,810
12 – 17 yrs – 32,220
18 – 64 yrs – 342,470
65+yrs – 82,100 (16%)

Total: 512,700
Females total just over half of the population. |
| | Edinburgh Poverty Commission Edinburgh by Numbers 2022 | Edinburgh is an affluent city with high average incomes and employment rates and low unemployment. Information detailed within Edinburgh by Numbers shows that compared to other major UK cities, Edinburgh also performs well when measuring personal wellbeing.
The city, however, has a high number of residents that fall into the high poverty risk groups. The 2018 report by the Edinburgh Poverty Commission estimates that 82,000 people live in relative poverty, 16% of the total population.
The poverty rates vary across from 5% to 27%. It is also estimated that 22% of all children in Edinburgh live in poverty while some areas record child poverty rates as high as 35%.
People from minority ethnic groups are also more likely to be in poverty compared to those within the White – British group. Asian and Asian – British groups along with other minority ethnic groups have between 35% and 38% living in poverty (across Scotland) compared to 18% of the White – British group. |

		Poverty rates are also higher for families in which someone is disabled. Households without a disabled child or adult living in poverty sit at 19% and 17% respectively compared to 25% and 24% for those households with a disabled child/adult.

Evidence	Available?	Comments: what does the evidence tell you?
Data on service uptake/access	[Edinburgh People's Survey 2018](#)	**Percentage of people who have visited a neighbourhood library in the past 12 months** 36% of respondents have visited a neighbourhood library in the past 12 months. Those most likely to have visited their local library were retired people (45%) part time workers (42%), those with children (45%), ethnic minorities/non-UK citizens (42%), those with a long-term health problem/disability (43%) and women (42%) The likelihood of having visited increased with age, with 28% of 16–24-year-olds having done so compared to 43% of the over 65s. Those least likely to have visited were those in full time employment (70%) and those from socio economic groups C2 (72%) and D (70%). **Satisfaction with the library service** 82% of respondents were satisfied with the library service (excluding 'don't know') Satisfaction was highest for retired respondents (90%) and those aged 65+ (89%), while those in the 16-24 age band had below average levels of satisfaction (76%) Those with long-term health problem/disability were more likely to be satisfied than those without (88% compared to 81%) as were ethnic minorities/non-UK citizens (87% v 82 others) and women (84% v 80% of men). **Number of library members who have used their library card during recent 12 month period**

Evidence	Available?	Comments: what does the evidence tell you?
	Edinburgh Libraries Service Data 2023	In the current period, April up to 1st September 2023, the total number of active members was 94,404 (almost 1 in 5 of the population). Whilst the overall active borrowers total is still 7% below pre Covid opening (2019/20), the number of active library members continues to increase with an additional 6,507 active members since 1st April 2023. Over 30% of children and young people living in Edinburgh having used their library card at least once in the past 12 months. Teenage active users have increase by 32% from pre covid figures. **Item Issues 2018 – 2023 (Physical)** 2018/19 - 1,677,430 issues 2019/20 – 1,579,442 issues 2020/21 – 75,401 issues (Covid-19) 2021/22 –676,898 issues 2022/23 – 1,234,961 issues 2023 to end Sept – 650,093 (part year) Note: 2023/24 (Forecast) - 1,340,200 **New Library members** April – August 2023 – 14,222 new members an increase of 10% from the previous year
Data on socio-economic disadvantage e.g. low income, low wealth, material deprivation, area deprivation.	SIMD Scotland 2020	**Library locations within the SIMD Context** (see table below)

Library locations within the SIMD Context

SIMD Q1	SIMD Q2	SIMD Q3	SIMD Q4	SIMD Q5
Craigmillar	Balgreen	Balerno	Colinton	Blackhall
Gilmerton	Drumbrae Hub	Central	McDonald Rd	Currie
Granton	Fountainbridge	Corstorphine	S Queensferry	Morningside
Leith	Moredun	Kirkliston		Newington

Evidence	Available?	Comments: what does the evidence tell you?				
		South Office & Library	*Muirhouse	Oxgangs		**Ratho
		Wester Hailes	Piershill	Sighthill		

*Muirhouse currently closed – operating from Edinburgh College Granton Campus
**Ratho currently closed – operating from part time mobile service

High School Student Population within SIMD Context

Deprivation Indicators
SIMD Unknown – 0.10%
SIMD Q1 – 18.40%
SIMD Q2 – 15.10%
SIMD Q3 – 11.70%
SIMD Q4 – 16.80%
SIMD Q5 – 38.10%

Evidence	Available?	Comments
Scottish Government 2022 High School Statistics		(see above)
Edinburgh Poverty Commission 2022		Estimated 77,600 people were in poverty in Edinburgh in the year prior to the coronavirus outbreak, including almost one in five of all children.

Estimated 77,600 people were in poverty in Edinburgh in the year prior to the coronavirus outbreak, including almost one in five of all children.
Almost two thirds of people on very low incomes live in areas out with those parts of Edinburgh commonly described as 'deprived' or 'disadvantaged'.

Scotland
Poverty rates are higher for people from BAME backgrounds than for White British people in Scotland. 38% of Asian or Asian British people in Scotland live in poverty, double the average for all citizens.
23-25% of households with a disabled child or adult are in poverty, compared to 17% of those with no disabled resident.
Estimated that child poverty in Scotland could rise steadily throughout the 2020's to reach a level of just under 38% by 2028/29 –

Evidence	Available?	Comments: what does the evidence tell you?
		representing an increase from roughly 1 in 4 children in Scotland at baseline to well over 1 in 3 children by the end of the coming decade.
Data on Equality outcomes	SIMD Scotland 2020	

Ethnicity	SIMD Q1	SIMD Q2	SIMD Q3	SIMD Q4	SIMD Q5	Total
African Scot/Brit	1439	851	674	477	897	4338
Other African	23	31	16	15	25	110
Bangladeshi	178	259	147	207	454	1245
Chinese / Scot / Brit	748	1132	1423	1162	3542	8007
Indian / Scot / Brit	543	970	1074	1352	2439	6378
Other Asian	619	730	820	737	1639	4545
Pakistani	670	1037	749	1081	2205	5742
Black / Scot / Brit	92	83	68	56	99	398
Caribbean	95	68	76	70	188	497
Other Caribbean or Black	20	18	29	16	38	121
Mixed or multiple ethnic groups	426	531	572	624	1874	4027
Arab / Scot / Brit	449	455	481	278	799	2462
Other ethnic group	159	178	154	157	439	1087
Gypsy/Traveller	56	77	79	69	105	386
Irish	456	884	1257	1559	4337	8493
Other British	2583	4373	6859	8579	32767	55161
Other White	1499	2685	4182	4198	11386	23950
Polish	2659	2891	2458	2301	2401	12710

Scottish	42597	47093	44133	52523	142106	328452
Total (Ethnic Minority)	**12714**	**17253**	**21118**	**22938**	**65634**	**139657**
Overall Total	**55311**	**64346**	**65251**	**75461**	**207740**	**468109**

Disability

Disability	SIMD Q1	SIMD Q2	SIMD Q3	SIMD Q4	SIMD Q5	Total
Blindness / Partial sight loss	1493	1737	1274	1567	3992	10063
Deafness / partial hearing loss	3134	3934	3143	3989	11440	14200
Developmental disorder	544	507	365	384	881	2681
Learning difficulty	2134	2111	1821	1960	4429	12455
Learning disability	451	484	382	284	534	2135
Mental Health condition	4321	4058	3415	2905	5551	20250
No condition	36562	44667	48700	58541	161058	349528
One or more conditions	18749	20673	17410	20044	50222	127098
Other conditions	10790	12213	10289	12258	31068	76618
Physical Disability	4709	4910	3405	3505	7873	24402
Total (with condition / disability)	46352	50627	41504	46896	115990	301369
Overall Total	**82887**	**95294**	**90204**	**105437**	**277048**	**468109**

Evidence	Available?	Comments: what does the evidence tell you?
Research/literature evidence	Scottish Book Trust – [Reading in Scotland –](#)	**National Study** National sample group provided feedback of life in lockdown and if reading played a part in supporting health and wellbeing.

Evidence	Available?	Comments: what does the evidence tell you?

	[Reading Over Lockdown](#)	- **Wellbeing**
		• 98% agreed that reading supports their wellbeing.
		• 97% agreed that reading helps them to relax.
		• 92% agreed that reading has been important to them in times of stress or anxiety throughout their lives
		- **Connection and isolation**
		• 64% agreed that reading made them feel less isolated.
		• 46% reported speaking about reading with someone new and 63% agreed that reading had helped them bond with others.
		• 50% agreed that sharing their reading with family and friends made them feel less stressed
		   - **Access to books**
		• 75% used the library to get print books for themselves
		• 94% of those with children used the library to get print books for them
		   - **Reading habits**
		The majority of panellists reported reading more over the lockdown, with some noting they had more energy for reading due to working from home.
		• 65% were reading more than they used to.
		• 60% enjoyed reading things they would not normally have read.
		• 25% discovered they really enjoyed a new genre.
		• 49% discovered a new favourite book, author or series
		Many panellists hoped to continue dedicating more time to reading, reading more as a family and exploring a wider range of genres and formats.

	[Reading Over Lockdown](#)	

Evidence	Available?	Comments: what does the evidence tell you?
	[The Power of Scottish Public Libraries](#)	• 72% agreed that they would like to continue with some aspects of their lockdown reading habits There are 1.9 times more public library visits than there are to the top 10 free visitor attractions in Scotland each year **Social Wellbeing** For many people, interacting with staff, taking part in activities, and feeling part of a community in a welcoming and non-judgemental space, are all key social wellbeing benefits of public libraries • Over 23m visits in one year to nearly 550 library service points and mobile libraries • 27,000 Bookbug sessions **Economic Wellbeing** The economic value and impact of libraries may be hard to quantify, but every day thousands of people benefit from their free internet access and opportunities to learn, read and develop new skills. All of these create better life opportunities for individuals and improve local communities • Potential monthly saving per user £93.88 • Over 1.7m computer hours used and access to free Wi-Fi _____
	[Department for Education - Research evidence on reading for pleasure](#).	Research reports a link between library use and reading for pleasure; young people that use their public library are nearly twice as likely to be reading outside of class every day (Clark and Hawkins, 2011). There is a growing body of evidence which illustrates the importance of reading for pleasure for both educational purposes as

Evidence	Available?	Comments: what does the evidence tell you?
		well as personal development (cited in Clark and Rumbold, 2006). • Evidence suggests that there is a positive relationship between reading frequency, reading enjoyment and attainment (Clark 2011; Clark and Douglas 2011). • Reading enjoyment has been reported as more important for children's educational success than their family's socio-economic status (OECD, 2002) **Benefits of reading for pleasure** A growing number of studies show that promoting reading can have a major impact on children and adults and their future. Upon reviewing the research literature, Clark and Rumbold (2006) identify several main areas of the benefits to reading for pleasure: • Reading attainment and writing ability; • Text comprehension and grammar; • Breadth of vocabulary; • Positive reading attitudes; • Greater self-confidence as a reader; • Pleasure in reading in later life; • General knowledge; • A better understanding of other cultures; • Community participation; and • A greater insight into human nature and decision-making
Public/patient/client experience information		Currently undertaking comprehensive public engagement and consultation on experience of all aspects of library service.
Evidence of inclusive engagement of people who use the service and involvement findings	No Going Back Edinburgh Libraries Youth Engagement survey	2,097 young people (11 – 18 years) provided views of the current library service with suggestions for positive change Action plan agreed to manage an improvement programme Individual school and community libraries provided with comments for each location 44% of respondents visit a school library regularly, once or more each week

Evidence	Available?	Comments: what does the evidence tell you?
		- 38% visit a school library sometimes, once or more each month - 12% hardly ever visit a school library (a few times each year) - 12% never visit a school library - 15% visit a community library once or more each week - 38% visit a community library sometimes, once or more each month - 2% visit a community library only during school holidays - 3% only visit a community library for study - 25% hardly ever visit a community library (few times each year) - 26% never visit a community library
Evidence of unmet need		Further evidence of unmet library need is currently being gathered through the engagement and consultation processes and will be analysed in detail.
Good practice guidelines	[Forward: Scotland's Public Library Strategy (scottishlibraries.org)](#)	National public library strategy – sets out the vision, mission and outcomes for public libraries across Scotland.
Environmental data	No	
Risk from cumulative impacts	Possible low risk	There may be a low risk that the abolishment of overdue fines may mean the late or non-return of stock, however currently (post covid) no fines have been levied and there is a recorded decrease in the numbers of stock not returned.
Other (please specify)	No	

Evidence	Available?	Comments: what does the evidence tell you?
Additional evidence required		

7. In summary, what impacts were identified and which groups will they affect?

Equality, Health and Wellbeing and Human Rights	Affected populations
Positive The abolishment of overdue fines should result in increased library membership and borrowing, and a no-fines approach will encourage the return of lapsed users to the service. Evidence suggests fines act as a barrier to access for those who are least able to pay the charges with those who are from lower income households more likely to avoid use of the service which in turn has a wider impact on social disadvantage e.g. digital and social inequality. The removal of fines could help to tackle the poverty agenda and promote inclusivity by improving access to service for those who are most in need but who are most likely to be deterred by the potential of a financial penalty. Reports suggest that people are more likely to return their long overdue books to the library without the threat of an overdue fine, and that the practice of levying overdue fines has the opposite effect to what was intended with customers holding on to books because they cannot afford to pay the costs.	The whole population of Edinburgh – currently 1 in 5 citizens are active members of the library service. Evidence from the Edinburgh Survey 2018 highlights in particular - Older and retired people - 45% of respondents used the library regularly and 90% of them were satisfied with the service. Ethnic minorities and non UK citizens, 42% indicated that they used their library regularly and 81% said that they were satisfied. Those with disabilities or chronic health issues in the family, 42% indicated that they used the library regularly and 88% were satisfied. 45% of respondents had young children.

	More women than men use the service. All the groups above have a higher chance of living in poverty. SEGs A and B also had above average use of libraries Least likely to use libraries are those in employment and from socio economic groups C2 and D.
Negative The only potential negative impact could be that people choose to return their items later than the due date. This could impact negatively on the numbers of books available to borrow across libraries. However, there is no evidence to support the likelihood of this. In addition, the mitigation is that the service continues to issue automated electronic overdue reminders and if an item of stock is lost or not returned, a replacement cost is currently charged based on the value of the specific item which has been lost.	We are currently engaging and consulting with library members and non-members to assess what we can do to remove any perceived or actual barriers to use or to make the service more accessible.

Environment and Sustainability	Affected Populations
Positive The library service contributes to wider environmental sustainability as a direct consequence of lending free resources, reducing the need for ongoing purchasing and discarding of items, therefore improving service provision and increasing numbers of people who choose to borrow books and use resources rather than buy them.	All Citizens

Negative	
None.	

Economic	Affected populations
Positive The removal of library overdue fines will especially benefit those who are from lower income households who may avoid use of the service due to the threat of incurring fines and financial penalties due to the late return of stock. This exacerbates already existing inequalities. The removal of fines could help to tackle the poverty agenda and promote inclusivity by improving access to service for those who are most in need but who are most likely to be deterred by overdue fines. The library service provides benefit to the city's economy through the provision of accessible resources for study, opportunities to engage with lifelong learning, and support for individuals to develop literacy, numeracy and employability skills. All of which contribute to supporting individuals to develop and advance opportunities to upskill and enter new or improved learning and employment opportunities. Evidence suggests that the library service can support customers to access a wide range of services in addition to library services which can assist to create financial savings for those individuals. e,g, the recent Warm Welcome initiative promotes partnership approaches to support people to access services such as debt advice, employability and advice services.	All Citizens but especially those who are unemployed and those who live in poverty as we have a higher usage by these groups People with disabilities or chronic illness, older people

Negative None.	

9. **Is any part of this policy/ service to be carried out wholly or partly by contractors and how will equality, human rights including children's rights, environmental and sustainability issues be addressed?**

No.

10. **Consider how you will communicate information about this policy/ service change to children and young people and those affected by sensory impairment, speech impairment, low level literacy or numeracy, learning difficulties or English as a second language? Please provide a summary of the communications plan.**

If Committee agree the recommendation to end library overdue fines, a Communications Plan will be developed to communicate the decision to as many people as possible to encourage lapsed users to return to the library and new customers to join. All current communications on charges and service will be reviewed and updated in line with new policy e.g. charges posters; website information; electronic reminder emails.

11. **Is the plan, programme, strategy or policy likely to result in significant environmental effects, either positive or negative? If yes, it is likely that a [Strategic Environmental Assessment](#) (SEA) will be required and the impacts identified in the IIA should be included in this. See section 2.10 in the Guidance for further information.**

No

12. **Additional Information and Evidence Required**

If further evidence is required, please note how it will be gathered. If appropriate, mark this report as interim and submit updated final report once further evidence has been gathered.

No further evidence required

13. **Specific to this IIA only, what recommended actions have been, or will be, undertaken and by when? (these should be drawn from 7 – 11 above) Please complete:**

Specific actions (as a result of the IIA which may include financial implications, mitigating actions and risks of cumulative impacts)	Who will take them forward (name and contact details)	Deadline for progressing	Review date
Development of a Communications Plan	Hana MacKechnie	End May 24	

14. **Are there any negative impacts in section 8 for which there are no identified mitigating actions?**

No

15. **How will you monitor how this policy, plan or strategy affects different groups, including people with protected characteristics?**

We will continue to monitor service use, stock management/ volumes and any feedback received from service users as a result of any change.

16. **Sign off by Head of Service/ Project Lead**

Name – Evelyn Kilmurry – Head of Libraries, Sport and Wellbeing.

Date – 10 May 2024

16. **Publication**

Completed and signed IIAs should be sent to:

integratedimpactassessments@edinburgh.gov.uk to be published on the Council website www.edinburgh.gov.uk/impactassessments

Edinburgh Integration Joint Board/Health and Social Care
sarah.bryson@edinburgh.gov.uk to be published at www.edinburghhsc.scot/the-ijb/integrated-impact-assessments/

Section 5 Contacts

- **East Lothian Council**

Please send a completed copy of the IIA to equalities@eastlothian.gov.uk and it will be published on the Council website shortly afterwards. Copies of previous assessments are available via http://www.eastlothian.gov.uk/info/751/equality_diversity_and_citizenship/835/equality_and_diversity

- **Midlothian Council**

Please send a completed copy of the IIA to zoe.graham@midlothian.gov.uk and it will be published on the Council website shortly afterwards. Copies of previous assessments are available via http://www.midlothian.gov.uk/downloads/751/equality_and_diversity

- **NHS Lothian**

Completed IIAs should be forwarded to impactassessments@nhslothian.scot.nhs.uk to be published on the NHS Lothian website and available for auditing purposes. Copies of previous impact assessments are available on the NHS Lothian website under Equality and Diversity.

- **The City of Edinburgh Council**

Completed impact assessments should be forwarded to Strategyandbusinessplanning@edinburgh.gov.uk to be published on the Council website.

- **City of Edinburgh Health and Social Care**

Completed and signed IIAs should be sent to Sarah Bryson at sarah.bryson@edinburgh.gov.uk

- **Edinburgh Integration Joint Board**

Completed and signed IIAs should be sent to Sarah Bryson at sarah.bryson@edinburgh.gov.uk

- **West Lothian Council**

Complete impact assessments should be forwarded to the Equalities Officer.