

**Application by City of Edinburgh Council
04/00759/CEC**

at

Castle Street

Edinburgh

EH2 3DW

**Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee**

26 January 2005

1 Purpose of report

To consider application 04/00759/CEC, submitted by Edinburgh City Centre Management Company Ltd. The application is for: **Installation of street furniture- benches, bollards, signing, litter bins- relocation of telephone boxes and navigator sign**

It is recommended that this application be **APPROVED**.

2 The Site and the Proposal

Site description

The site is the public carriageway and footpath of Castle Street. It includes all surfaces from George Street to Princes Street.

It is in the New Town conservation area and the World Heritage Site.

It includes the setting of several listed buildings that front Castle Street, including some A-listed properties.

Site history

There is no relevant planning history.

Description of the Proposal

This application is part of the streetscape proposals for the New Town. It is proposed to redevelop the entire street, including surface materials and street furniture. The layout of the street would be stone paving footways on either side of the road, stone setts parking bays running beside and, down the centre of the street, stone setts carriageway. The surface materials do not require planning permission. This application is therefore for the street furniture elements only.

There will be various types of street furniture, the descriptions of which are listed below.

There would be thirty two benches located symmetrically along the street in groups of four. They would be positioned in the 'parking bay sections' of the street beside the junctions with George Street, Rose Street and Princes Street. They would be approximately 500mm in height, 900mm in length and 525mm in width. On plan they would be curved at one end and straight at the other. The materials would be light grey polished granite.

There would be twenty four granite bollards located between the stone setts and the stone paving surfaces. They would have a separation of 5 metres between each one and would be in line. They would be 750mm in height, 450mm in length and 425mm in width. They would be designed to have traffic signs fixed to them facing the carriageway. There would also be two of these bollards at the entrance to Castle Street from George Street.

There would be six telephone boxes replaced and repositioned, four on the west side of the street close to Princes Street and two on the east side of the street close to Rose Street. They would be the same size and design as telephone boxes elsewhere in the New Town.

It is proposed to place ten litter bins in line with, and in amongst, the granite bollards. The positions are shown on the submitted plan but the details of the bins themselves have not been finalised. This is due to ongoing discussions with Environmental and Consumer Services over the design of the bin. These details will therefore be agreed at a later date as a reserved matter.

There would be two traffic sign panels on the carriageway, internally illuminated, to the south of the junction with Rose Street. They would be 2 metres in height, 520mm in width and 190mm in thickness. They would have convex curved faces. The top 1550mm would be clear polycarbonate with metal ribbing on the lower part with a stainless steel frame. The lower 450mm would be a curved granite base.

The existing navigator sign would be relocated approximately 1 metre away from its existing location.

There would be sixteen stainless steel bollards, and two indication pillars as part of the scheme. These are to control traffic movements on the street.

There would be three types of bollard, removable, automatic and telescopic. The removable bollard is one that remains up unless manually taken away and stored elsewhere for special events. A circular metal plate would cover the hole. The automatic bollards are electronically controlled to rise and fall as required to permit vehicular access. The telescopic bollards remain below ground unless the automatic bollards fail, at which point they rise and fall manually.

There would be two removable bollards at each of the four corners of the Rose Street Castle Street junction on the pavement. There would be three removable bollards on the carriageway at the Princes Street end. There would be two telescopic bollards followed by a line of two automatic bollards and a removable bollard. These five bollards would be south of the junction with Rose Street.

When up, all three types would measure 900mm in height and would be cylindrical in shape with a diameter of 110mm. The indication pillars would be positioned alongside the automatic and telescopic bollards. They would be approximately 600mm higher than the steel bollards.

There would be a cuboid stainless steel control pillar, or box, positioned against the telephone boxes by Rose Street. It would be connected to the automatic bollards. The dimensions would be 1.5 metres in height, 1 metre in breadth and 250mm in depth.

There have been changes made to the proposals as the application process took its course. These have been made in response to comments made by the Edinburgh World Heritage Trust, Historic Scotland, the Cockburn Association and the Streetscape Working Group. The final scheme is as described above.

3 Officer's Assessment and Recommendations

DETERMINING ISSUES

The determining issues are:

- Do the proposals preserve the listed buildings or their setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest? If they do not there is a presumption against the granting of planning permission. For the purposes of this issue, "preserve", in relation to a building, means preserve either in its existing state or subject only to such alterations or extensions as can be carried out without serious detriment to its character.
- Do the proposals enhance or preserve the character and appearance of the Conservation Area? There being a strong presumption against the granting of planning permission if this is not the case.
- Do the proposals comply with the development plan?

- If the proposals do comply with the development plan, are there any compelling reasons for not approving them?
- If the proposals do not comply with the development plan, are there any compelling reasons for approving them?

ASSESSMENT

To address the determining issues, the Committee needs to consider whether:

- a) The proposals will preserve or enhance the setting of the listed buildings,
 - b) The proposals will enhance or preserve the character and appearance of the Conservation Area and the World Heritage Site,
 - c) The proposals will improve the streetscape of Castle Street.
- a) The majority of the buildings on Castle Street are listed and contribute to the high quality built amenity and character of the area. The streetscape of the public realm on Castle Street and the way it is laid out is very much part of the setting of the listed buildings on the street.

The proposal includes the rationalisation of street furniture, the use of high quality materials and a symmetrical layout. This improves the streetscape environment and therefore the setting of the listed buildings.

The proposals will not be detrimental to the setting of the listed buildings.

- b) The character of the New Town Conservation Area is summarised in the local plan as follows:-

A planned urban concept of European significance, the New Town has an overriding character of Georgian formality. The First New Town, built to James Craig's 1767 plan, has experienced significant redevelopment, while the Second, Third and Fourth New Towns, which were laid out on estates to the north, east and west retain most of their original buildings. Stone built terrace houses and tenements, built to the highest standards, overlook communal private gardens; to the rear are lanes with mews buildings, many of which are now in housing use. The importance of the area therefore lies in the formal plan layout of buildings, streets, mews and gardens and in the quality of the buildings themselves. Many of the New Town's buildings are listed category 'A' of national importance and the area contains some of the city's finest interiors.

The character of the First New Town is one of formality. The proposed streetscape works and furniture continue this theme with the planned street layout replacing a street which has developed in an ad hoc manner over the

years. This will restore something of the original formality of the street. The proposals do not replicate the form of the street as it would have appeared when the First New Town was built. It is a design that relates to the modern regional commercial retail centre that the street has become part of.

The proposals would not be detrimental to the character and appearance of the conservation area and the World Heritage Site.

c) Castle Street is currently blocked off to vehicles from Princes Street. Although this controls vehicle movement and assists pedestrian movement along Princes Street, it does not create a high quality environment on Castle Street. This application would afford more emphasis on pedestrian movement by creating a levelled surface between the carriageway and footway. It would also prohibit vehicles from the southern half of the street at certain times of day. The nature of Castle Street would remain as a street rather than a public square but would be greatly enhanced.

The addition of numerous benches and the rationalisation of all street furniture elements creates a coherent streetscape free of clutter and pleasant to stop in.

The proposals provide a readable, usable pedestrian friendly environment. The streetscape of Castle Street would be improved as a result of these proposals.

It is recommended that Committee approves this application, subject to the conditions stated.

As this is a Council application and there has been an objection, it must be referred to the First Minister as a Notice of Intention to Develop.

FURTHER ASSESSMENT

The application was reported to Committee on 15 December 2004 and continued for better visual material and further information. The visual material has now been provided and is included in the application file.

Further details on the wider streetscape proposals for the World Heritage Site, the proposed litter bins and the control box are as follows.

A report to the full Planning Committee is to be presented on the wider streetscape proposals for the World Heritage Site. These include proposals to develop the public realm on George Street, St. Andrew Square and The Grassmarket.

One option for the litter bins is that they are to be similar in design to the existing black and gold bins in the city. However, the proposed bins would have the gold markings removed. The decision to use existing bins is for consistency and so they can be replaced quickly. If this cannot be agreed

then an option is to have the bins on side streets. The design has not been finalised and therefore this element is to remain as a reserved matter.

The Control Box for the retractable bollards cannot be positioned underground or on Rose Street as the supplier has indicated that this would likely result in a failure of the system caused by distances and changes in operating conditions. Similar systems have been located underground and failed within a year. In addition, the extent of existing underground services may prohibit this option.

The Tram and Streetscape design guides were taken into account when the Castle Street scheme was being developed. The same firm of consultants has been engaged in this proposal and both the Streetscape Manual and Tram design guide. The streetscape manual is only in draft form. However, the ethos of Castle Street does reflect the draft so far. As for the Tram manual this is so far only in outline planning and not detail and only relates to the tram route itself.

It is recommended that Committee approves this application, subject to the conditions stated.

As this is a Council application and there has been an objection, it must be referred to the First Minister as a Notice of Intention to Develop.

FURTHER ASSESSMENT 2

The application was continued again on 26 January 2005 for more visual information and our Streetscape consultant's view on how the design would fit into the standards for the broader centre.

The visual material has been prepared and will be available at Committee.

The following statement has been prepared to answer Committee's concerns on how the proposal fits into the Standards for Streets' Manual.

The object of the street standards is to promote very simple, elegant, clutter free solutions for paving and street furniture, including traffic schemes, so that the special character of the Edinburgh street scene can be more appreciated and enhanced.

The manual refers to the detailed activities that when considered together, have a considerable impact on the urban environment. Well designed, these activities can, over time, improve the quality of public realm. These include footway and carriageway design details and street furniture.

The Castle Street proposals will introduce a number of new features onto the street as well as a new layout for the street. These include bollards (of various types), benches and litter bins as well as traffic signage.

The consultant developing the Edinburgh Standards for Streets with the Council was asked for his views on the Castle Street proposals. Although reluctant to interfere with the work of another consultant he made a number of general comments.

1. The kerb radii at George Street. There is an argument for keeping the original lines of the pavement kerbs and doing away with the build-outs.
2. Traffic signs. Traffic speeds will be low so signs can be kept to a minimum – both in size and number.
3. Bollards. With regard to the moveable bollards do we need bollards to protect other bollards? These should be kept to an absolute minimum. Likewise the stone bollards should be kept to a minimum.
4. The benches. The double bench detail looks fussy.

A detailed account of the various features on Castle Street is set out below, outlining where adjustments have been made in light of both these comments and full consideration of the 'standards' requirements.

1. The George street build-out and kerb radii are a design approach to allow comfortable pedestrian movement across the street and to control the movement of traffic into the street. This way the design contains the vehicle use of the space to a minimum. The overall layout of the street, the relationship of pavement and road will be simple and does not require any further refinement.
2. The use of traffic signage has been limited and is the minimum permitted by the regulations, and will be the smallest version practical.
3. The stone bollards along the kerb serve to protect pedestrians and the basements as well as providing a face for the traffic signs. The design is simple, and takes its reference from those used in the High Street.
4. The movable and automatic bollards were not part of the original design but are proposed for the control of traffic. However, in the light of further consideration, reductions in their use can be achieved with the following measures.

The **automatic bollards** will restrict access to the southern part of the street. They have associated operating pillars, one of which is to be incorporated within the design of the traffic pillar. The other has to stand alone. The **movable bollards** have been proposed as a precaution, to combat illegal car movements. It is now proposed to remove them, but to ensure the design allows for their introduction should it prove necessary, with either the bollards stored below ground (as in the secondary backup to the automatic road bollards) or the bollards not installed (as in the Rose Street pavement and the Princes Street locations).

The bollards should also be consistent with a city centre/ city wide design and should be a standard size where possible. The use of black and grey/ steel would be consistent.

1. The stone benches will reinforce what is proposed as pedestrian realm which could not be safely achieved with wooden benches. Removal of these would require additional bollards. Generally design of the benches should be consistent with a city centre/city wide design which would include the standard wooden benches, however in this location the wooden benches can't be used for safety reasons. The granite benches are a specific design solution for this scheme.
2. Litter bins, as with the benches, should be consistent with a city centre/ city wide design. At present this position has not been established and they should be removed from the scheme.

The remaining footpaths and pavements will deliver the 'good public realm quality' aspired to in the Standards.

As a result of these comments, the only change to the original scheme is that the pavement bollards at the Rose Street/Castle Street junctions are not to be implemented from the outset of the scheme. The foundations would be set in order that, from a road and pedestrian safety aspect, bollards may be placed if necessary in future.

It is recommended that Committee approves this application, subject to the conditions stated.

As this is a Council application and there has been an objection, it must be referred to the First Minister as a Notice of Intention to Develop.

Alan Henderson

Alan Henderson
Head of Planning and Strategy

Contact/tel	David Shepherd on 0131 529 3956 (FAX 529 3717)
Ward affected	18 - New Town
Local Plan	Central Edinburgh
Statutory Development Plan Provision	City Centre Retail Core; Office Core
Date registered	8 March 2004
Drawing numbers/ Scheme	1, 15-20.

Advice to Committee Members and Ward Councillors

The full details of the application are available for viewing on the Planning and Building Control Portal: www.edinburgh.gov.uk/planning.

If you require further information about this application you should contact the following Principal Planner, Ian Dryden on 0131 529 3464. Email: ian.dryden@edinburgh.gov.uk.

If this application is not identified on the agenda for presentation, and you wish to request a presentation of this application at the Committee meeting, you must contact Committee Services by 9.00a.m. on the Tuesday preceding the meeting on extension 4229/4239. Alternatively, you may e-mail blair.ritchie@edinburgh.gov.uk or sarah.bogunovic@edinburgh.gov.uk

Application Type Application by City of Edinburgh Council
Application Address: Castle Street
Edinburgh
EH2 3DW
Proposal: Installation of street furniture- benches, bollards, signing, litter bins- relocation of telephone boxes and navigator sign
Reference No: 04/00759/CEC

Consultations, Representations and Planning Policy

Consultations

Historic Scotland

The Historic Buildings Inspectorate offers no comments.

Edinburgh World Heritage Trust

Comments were made on the choice of bollards, the use of the 'New Town' logo plate and the granite bollards and signpost.

Environmental and Consumer Services

No objections. The choice of litterbin was questioned and this is to be dealt with at a later date.

Transport

Consultation response dated 30 April 2004 requested that the application be continued to ensure that proposed signs conform to the legal layout.

Gillespies have since been in further discussions with Network Services and the final scheme is acceptable to them.

Representations

The application was advertised on 19 March 2004. One letter was received from The Cockburn Association which included comments on the detailed design of the scheme suggesting that closer attention should be paid to surrounding materials and functions. One letter was received from a permit holder operating a stall on Castle

Street which included concerns regarding the established street vendors and the continuance of their business there.

Full copies of the representations made in respect of this application are available in Group Rooms or can be requested for viewing at the Main Reception, City Chambers, High Street.

Planning Policy

The site is within the Central Edinburgh Local Plan area and spans the City Centre Retail Core and the Office Core designations.

Relevant Policies:

Policy CD5 (CONSERVATION AREAS - REDEVELOPMENT) sets out the criteria against which new development in conservation areas will be assessed, and seeks to preserve or enhance their character and appearance.

Policy CD2 (LISTED BUILDINGS) sets out criteria for assessing proposals affecting listed buildings and seeks to safeguard their character and setting.

Policy CD22 (STREETSCENE) sets out design and quality objectives for street furniture and paving.

Policy CD17 (MATERIALS) sets out requirements for materials in new developments and seeks a greater use of stone, roofing slate and other traditional materials in appropriate cases.

Policy CD18 (SAFETY, SUSTAINABILITY AND ACCESSIBILITY) requires the design and layout of development proposals to meet safety, sustainability and accessibility objectives.

Non-statutory guidelines 'ACCESS TO THE BUILT ENVIRONMENT' seek to ensure that development proposals and streetscape works take account of the needs of disabled people.

Non-statutory 'WORLD HERITAGE SITE CONSERVATION MANIFESTO' supplement Central Edinburgh Local Plan policies relating to conservation and design and seeks to assist in preserving the historic fabric of Edinburgh's World Heritage Site and to ensure that changes complement and enhance its special character.

Non-statutory guidelines on 'CONSERVATION AND DESIGN DEVELOPMENT CONTROLS FOR THE FIRST NEW TOWN' supplement local plan conservation and design policies, providing guidance on development in the First New Town.

Non-statutory guidelines on the 'SETTING OF LISTED BUILDINGS' supplement local plan conservation and design policies, providing guidance for the protection and enhancement of the setting of listed buildings.

Appendix B



Application Type Application by City of Edinburgh Council
Application Address: Castle Street
Edinburgh
EH2 3DW

Proposal: Installation of street furniture- benches, bollards, signing, litter bins- relocation of telephone boxes and navigator sign

Reference No: 04/00759/CEC

Conditions/Reasons associated with the Recommendation

Recommendation

It is recommended that this application be **APPROVED**.

Conditions

1. The development hereby permitted shall be commenced no later than five years from the date of this consent.
2. The application shall be referred to the Scottish Ministers prior to determination.
3. Before any work on the site is commenced, details of the undernoted reserved matter shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the planning authority;

RESERVED MATTER: the design of the litter bin.

Reasons

1. In order to accord with the statutory requirements of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Acts.
2. In order to accord with the statutory requirements of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Acts.
3. In order to enable the planning authority to consider this/these matter/s in detail.

End

