

Committee Minutes

Development Quality Sub-Committee of the Planning Committee

Edinburgh, 18 August 2004

Present:- Councillors Davies (Convener), Child, The Hon David Guest, Hunter, Laing, Longstaff, Lowrie, Munro, Murray, Ponton, Tritton and Wigglesworth.

Also present:- Councillor Mackintosh.

1 37-43 Craigmillar Park – Alterations and Change of Use of 37 and 39 Craigmillar Park to Form Four Flatted Dwellings and Demolition of 41 and 43 Craigmillar Park and redevelopment to form 32 Flatted Dwellings

A planning application (03/03361/FUL) and a conservation area consent application (03/03361/CON) had been received for alterations and change of use of 37 and 39 Craigmillar Park to form four flatted dwellings and the demolition of the existing villas and in-fill extension at 41 and 43 Craigmillar Park and redevelopment to form 32 flatted dwellings.

The site was visited on 29 July 2004.

The Director of City Development reported on the applications.

325 letters commenting on the planning application were received and a further 265 letters were received commenting on the conservation area consent application including letters from Councillor Mackintosh, the Architectural Heritage Society of Scotland, the Cockburn Association, the Craigmillar Park Association, the Grange Association, Waverley Park Amenity Association and the Lady Road Residents Association.

Mr Neil Gillespie (Reiach & Hall Architects) was heard on behalf of the applicants.

The Sub-Committee then heard from Marilyn Higgins BA Mph (Senior Lecturer, School of the Built Environment, Heriot-Watt University) on behalf of the objectors.

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
18 August 2004

Councillor Mackintosh was heard as local ward member.

Members of the Sub-Committee then asked questions of the various parties present.

Councillor Davies thanked all parties for their respective contributions.

Motion

To continue consideration of the planning and conservation area consent applications:

- 1) To ask the applicant to consider ways of reducing the height and scale of the corner block.
- 2) To obtain a model of the proposed development and additional contextual presentation material to assist in assessing the height of the buildings, the contours of the site and its relationship with the Cameron Toll Shopping Centre.

- moved by Councillor Davies, seconded by Councillor Child.

Amendment

- 1) To indicate intention to refuse planning permission and conservation area consent for the reasons that:
 - a) The loss of the villas at 41 and 43 Craigmillar Park was detrimental to the character and appearance of the conservation area and would set an undesirable precedent contrary to Policy CD4 of the Central Edinburgh Local Plan.
 - b) The proposals were out of scale with the existing villas to the detriment of the character and appearance of the conservation area and the setting of the listed buildings contrary to policies CD2, CD4 and CD5 of the Central Edinburgh Local Plan.
 - c) The proposals, by way of their height and massing, did not respect the character of their surroundings or the conservation area in general, contrary to Policy CD11 of the Central Edinburgh Local Plan.

- 2) To ask the officials to report on the proposed reasons for refusal.

- moved by Councillor Lowrie, seconded by Councillor Longstaff.

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
18 August 2004

Voting

The motion was carried by 8 votes to 3.

Decision

To continue consideration of the planning and conservation area consent applications:

- 1) To ask the applicant to consider ways of reducing the height and scale of the corner block.
- 2) To obtain a model of the proposed development and additional contextual presentation material to assist in assessing the height of the buildings, the contours of the site and its relationship with the Cameron Toll Shopping Centre.

(Reference – report by the Director of City Development, submitted.)

2 Adjournment

At this point the Convener (Councillor Davies) adjourned the Sub-Committee for a period of five minutes.

3 Applications

The Sub-Committee considered the remaining applications contained on the agenda.

Decision

To agree as detailed in the Appendix to this minute.

(Reference – reports by the Director of City Development, submitted.)

Declaration of Interest

Councillor Longstaff declared a non-financial interest in item 25 (102A Roseburn Street – Murrayfield Stadium) as a member of a rugby club which was affiliated to the Scottish Rugby Union (SRU).

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
18 August 2004

APPENDIX

APPLICATIONS

(as referred to in item 3 of the foregoing minute)

Note: Detailed conditions/reasons for the following decisions are contained in the statutory planning register.

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No	Details of Proposals	Decision
3	37-43 Craigmillar Park (03/03361/FUL)	(a) Alterations and change of use of 37 and 39 Craigmillar Park to form 4 flatted dwellings, demolition of 41 and 43 Craigmillar Park, and redevelopment to form 32 flatted dwellings.	<p>Continue:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) To ask the applicant to consider ways of reducing the height and scale of the corner block. 2) To obtain a model of the proposed development and additional contextual presentation material to assist in assessing the height of the buildings, the contours of the site and its relationship with the Cameron Toll Shopping Centre. <p>(On a division, see item 1 of foregoing minute.)</p>

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
18 August 2004

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No	Details of Proposals	Decision
	(03/03361/CON)	(b) Demolish existing villas and large infill extension to numbers 41-43 Craigmillar Park.	<p>Continue:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) To ask the applicant to consider ways of reducing the height and scale of the corner block; 2) To obtain a model of the proposed development and additional contextual presentation material to assist in assessing the height of the buildings, the contours of the site and its relationship with the Cameron Toll Shopping Centre. <p>(On a division, see item 1 of foregoing minute.)</p>

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
18 August 2004

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No	Details of Proposals	Decision
4	55-61 Jeffrey Street (02/03306/FUL)	Former tannery site; flatted residential, hotel bedroom extension and mixed commercial use, as amended.	Grant conditional planning permission subject to: 1) a legal agreement; 2) the following additional conditions: a) details of a scheme to provide public art within the development (including street furniture etc, as appropriate), shall be submitted for the further written approval of the Head of Planning and Strategy and thereafter implemented to the satisfaction of the Head of Planning and Strategy;

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
18 August 2004

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No	Details of Proposals	Decision
			<p>b) a scheme for recycling and waste management shall be submitted to and implemented to the satisfaction of the Head of Planning and Strategy and the Director of Environmental and Consumer Services; and</p> <p>c) Details of architectural detailing and proposed finishes shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Head of Planning and Strategy before work is commenced on site.</p>

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
18 August 2004

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No	Details of Proposals	Decision
5	3-15 Portobello High Street + 10 Fishwives Causeway (03/03021/OUT)	Erection of superstore, petrol filling station and associated parking, landscaping and access roads.	<p>To advise the Scottish Ministers that, had the planning authority been able to determine the application, it would have refused outline planning permission for the reason detailed in the Director of City Development's report and the following additional reasons:</p> <p>1) The development would have adverse effects, due to increased traffic generation, on the environmental quality and amenity of the area, and would be contrary to the aims of Policy S7 in the North East Edinburgh Local Plan;</p>

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
18 August 2004

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No	Details of Proposals	Decision
			2) The development would have a detrimental economic impact on the Portobello Town Centre and, in particular, on the variety of its retail units which contribute to its character, vitality and viability and would, on balance, not compliment the Centre in its existing role, contrary to Policy S1 in the North East Edinburgh Local Plan.
6	5-15 Portobello High Street (04/00188/OUT)	Formation of car parking, bus stop and landscaping, ancillary to proposed superstore.	To advise the Scottish Ministers that, had the planning authority been able to determine the application, it would have refused outline planning permission for the reason detailed in the Director of City Development's report and the following additional reasons:

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
18 August 2004

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No	Details of Proposals	Decision
			<p>1) The proposal, as part of a larger development, would have adverse effects, due to increased traffic generation, on the environmental quality and amenity of the area, and would be contrary to the aims of Policy S7 in the North East Edinburgh Local Plan;</p> <p>2) The proposal, as part of a larger development, would have a detrimental economic impact on the Portobello Town Centre and, in particular, on the variety of its retail units which contribute to its character, vitality and viability and would, on balance, not compliment the Centre in its existing role, contrary to Policy S1 in the North East Edinburgh Local Plan.</p>
7	5 Alnwickhill Road (04/02019/FUL)	Change of use to House in Multiple Occupation.	Grant planning permission.

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
18 August 2004

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No	Details of Proposals	Decision
8	33 Baberton Mains Lea (04/01213/FUL)	Form a front/side extension to include a new entrance and additional accommodation. Form a rear family room extension. All single storey with tiled roof and roughcast finish (as amended).	Grant planning permission.
9	23 Bridge Street, Newbridge (04/02324/FUL)	Construction of new dwelling house.	Continue: 1) For a site visit; 2) For further assessment of car parking provision; and 3) For further assessment of garden ground provision, particularly in relation to other recently approved consents.
10	76 Buckstone Road (04/01732/FUL)	Extension to dwellinghouse.	Grant planning permission.
11	9 Chesser Loan (04/02558/FUL)	Installation of rooflights and erection of garage.	Grant planning permission.

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
18 August 2004

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No	Details of Proposals	Decision
12	40 Coilliesdene Avenue (04/01305/FUL)	Single storey extension to full east elevation and part of rear elevation of dwelling house (as amended).	1) Grant planning permission. 2) To ask the Director of City Development to report to a future meeting of the Planning Committee on any need to review the Non-Statutory Guidelines on House Extensions to deal specifically with bungalows.
13	21 Comely Bank (04/01965/FUL)	Alter existing gates between rear garden and lane, construct lean-to car port and green house (partially in retrospect).	Refuse planning permission and authorise that enforcement action be taken.
14	187 Craigmook Road (04/01972/FUL)	Construct an extension to a dwelling house, erect porch to side entrance door and alter rear dormer window.	Grant planning permission.
15	7 Craigmount Avenue North (04/00886/FUL)	Proposed extension and alterations to existing house.	Refuse planning permission.
16	9C Doune Terrace (04/02034/FUL)	Increase in no of children under 2 attending from 0 to 8, increase in no of children over 2 attending from 28 to 30.	Grant conditional planning permission.

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
18 August 2004

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No	Details of Proposals	Decision
17	13A Dundas Street (04/01209/FUL)	(a) Paint whole shop front grey (in retrospect).	<p>Refuse planning permission and authorise that enforcement action be taken for the reasons:-</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) The proposal is contrary to Central Edinburgh Local Plan Policy CD2 (in respect of listed buildings) as the paintwork is inappropriate to the care and restoration of the listed building and adversely affects its appearance. 2) The proposal is contrary to Central Edinburgh Local Plan Policy CD4 (in respect of Conservation Areas) as the paint will harm the stonework and destroy the uniformity of the terrace at ground floor level thus damaging the character and the appearance of the conservation area.

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
18 August 2004

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No	Details of Proposals	Decision
			<p>3) The proposal is contrary to Central Edinburgh Local Plan Policy CD5 (in respect of conservation areas) as the paint will harm the stonework and destroy the uniformity of the terrace at ground floor level thus neither preserving nor enhancing the character or appearance of the conservation area.</p> <p>4) The proposal is contrary to the Council's Non-Statutory Guidelines in respect of Colour of Buildings, as external stonework must not be painted.</p> <p>5) The proposal is contrary to the Council's Non-Statutory Guidelines in respect of Alterations to Listed Buildings, as the paintwork will damage the historic fabric and appearance of the listed building.</p>

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
18 August 2004

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No	Details of Proposals	Decision
	(04/01209/LBC)	(b) Paint shop front grey (in retrospect)	<p>Refuse listed building consent and authorise that enforcement action be taken for the reasons:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) The proposal is contrary to Central Edinburgh Local Plan Policy CD2, in respect of Listed Buildings, as the paintwork is inappropriate to the care and restoration of the building and adversely affects its appearance. 2) The proposal is contrary to Central Edinburgh Local Plan Policy CD19, in respect of Building Alterations, as the alterations harm the stonework thus damaging the special character of the listed building.

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
18 August 2004

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No	Details of Proposals	Decision
			<p>3) The proposal is contrary to the Council's Non-Statutory Guidelines in respect of Colour of Buildings, as external stonework must not be painted.</p> <p>4) The proposal is contrary to the Council's Non-Statutory Guidelines in respect of Alterations to Listed Buildings, as the paintwork will damage the historic fabric and appearance of the listed building.</p>
18	4 Galachlawside (04/02447/FUL)	Extension of upper storey over garage, new extension to side of existing dwelling house (as amended).	Grant conditional planning permission.
19	Glendevon Avenue (04/01471/FUL)	Erection of two dwellings.	Continue for a site visit.
20	9 Gogarloch Haugh (04/02063/FUL)	Single storey extension to the side.	Grant planning permission.
21	57 Hosie Rigg (04/01678/FUL)	Two storey extension to existing house.	Grant planning permission.

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
18 August 2004

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No	Details of Proposals	Decision
22	21 Lovedale Road, Balerno (04/02030/FUL)	Extending existing breakfast room and roofspace over to create new ground floor garden room, new stairs to new attic bedroom and bathroom, 1 dormer window, 5 velux rooflights to rear of property.	Grant planning permission.
23	8 Meadowhouse Road (04/02293/FUL)	Demolish dwelling house and erect 3 houses.	Grant conditional planning permission.
24	29 Pittville Street (Pittville Street Lane) (04/01548/FUL)	Demolish garage/store and erect a 2 storey dwelling house in the garden of house (to be entered from Pittville Street Lane).	Continue for – 1) a site visit. 2) a further transportation assessment.
25	102A Roseburn Street (Murrayfield Stadium) (03/04724/ADV)	Signage.	Refuse advertisement consent.
Declaration of Interest – Councillor Longstaff declared a non-financial interest in item 25 above as a member of a rugby club which was affiliated to the Scottish Rugby Union (SRU).			
26	16 Thompson Grove, Currie (04/02288/FUL)	Proposed entrance porch and garage extension.	Grant planning permission.