

**Full Planning Application
at
34 Mansionhouse Road
Edinburgh
EH9 2JD**

**Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee**

Proposal: Alteration and extension of garage, to form front room and breakfast area, see previous application ref no , 02/03217/ ful
Applicant: Ms Little
Reference No: 03/01863/FUL

1 Purpose of report

To recommend that the application be **GRANTED** subject to;

Conditions

1. The development hereby permitted shall be commenced no later than five years from the date of this consent.

Reasons

1. In order to accord with the statutory requirements of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Acts.

2 Main report

Site description

The site is a traditional stone built semi-detached villa that is situated on the north east side of Mansionhouse Road. The property has been extended on its north side and is currently sub-divided into two properties. The application property is the ground floor flat. The area is predominantly residential. It is characterised by traditional stone built villa properties set within large garden grounds.

The property lies within the Grange Conservation Area. It is not listed.

Site history

01.12.1993 - Planning permission for the demolition of a flat roofed garage and replacement with a pitched roof garage and utility area granted (A 02435 93).

04.11.2002 - Planning permission for an extension of existing garage and alterations to form new entrances refused (02/03217/FUL).

Reason for refusal related to subdivision of the property, inappropriate design and loss of parking.

Development

It is proposed to extend and alter the existing garage building to form a bed-sitting room. The extension will increase the footprint of the existing garage by approximately 15sq m. The extension will remain behind the front building line of the existing house. A rendered finish to match the existing extension has been specified for the external walls. The roof will be pitched and clad in slate. The front will have three sash and casement timber windows on the front elevation facing the street. The proposed bed-sitting room will utilise the existing door to the garage which is accessed from the house via a covered walkway.

In addition, it is proposed to form a main door entrance to the ground floor flat. This entrance will be on the front elevation of the existing two-storey extension on the north side of the original villa. It will be a traditional style timber door with reconstituted stone rybats and lintol. A new entrance is also proposed on the north elevation of the two-storey extension. An existing arched opening will be built up with a glass panel inserted into the wall and an new glazed doorway. Timber screen trellis, to a height of 1.85m, is to be erected in front of the extension and has been designed to form a small courtyard area.

The elevational treatments have been simplified and improved in comparison to the previously refused scheme. It has also been clarified that there is no intention to subdivide the property.

Rather than the previously proposed canted bay, a simple tripartite sash and case style window is proposed in the extension. A simple door on the front elevation ensures this does not compete with the original main door, as was previously the case.

Consultations

No consultations undertaken

Representations

The application was advertised on 06.06.2003. Four letters of representation have been received, one from The Grange Association and three from neighbouring residents. The issues raised are:

1. Overlooking
2. Adverse effect upon the character and appearance of the Grange Conservation Area
3. Loss of trees
4. Loss of garage will create problems for on-street parking
5. Potential for further house with associated parking problems
6. Extensions/alteration have poor relationship with original house

Policy

The site lies in an area identified as Housing and Compatible Uses in the Central Edinburgh Local Plan.

Relevant Policies:

Policy CD5 (CONSERVATION AREAS - REDEVELOPMENT) sets out the criteria against which new development in conservation areas will be assessed, and seeks to preserve or enhance their character and appearance.

Policy CD16 (NEW DEVELOPMENT IN VILLA AREAS) sets out the essential requirements of approved guidelines which seek to regulate the form and layout of new development in the garden grounds of villa properties.

Policy CD17 (MATERIALS) sets out requirements for materials in new developments and seeks a greater use of stone, roofing slate and other traditional materials in appropriate cases.

Policy CD19 (BUILDING ALTERATIONS) sets out requirements for the design, form, materials and positioning of alterations and extensions.

Non-statutory guidelines on 'VILLA AREAS AND THE GROUNDS OF VILLAS' provide guidance on development, to ensure the conservation and enhancement of villa areas.

Non-statutory guidelines on 'HOUSE EXTENSIONS' set out the design principles against which proposals will be assessed.

Non-statutory guidelines 'DAYLIGHTING, PRIVACY AND SUNLIGHT' set criteria for assessing proposals in relation to these issues.

3 Conclusions and Recommendations

Determining Issues

The determining issues are:

- Do the proposals enhance or preserve the character and appearance of the Conservation Area? There being a strong presumption against the granting of planning permission if this is not the case.
- Do the proposals comply with the development plan?
- If the proposals do comply with the development plan, are there any compelling reasons for not approving them?
- If the proposals do not comply with the development plan, are there any compelling reasons for approving them?

Assessment

In order to address the determining issues, Committee must consider whether a) the proposed extension/alterations are compatible with the character of the existing villa and will have no adverse effect upon the character or appearance of the conservation area, and b) the proposed extension/alterations will have any adverse impact upon residential amenity.

a) The character of the Grange Conservation Area is summarised in the local plan as follows:

A suburban area of villas characterised by extensive gardens and high stone walls, laid out to a plan by David Cousins between 1851 and 1870. Considerable variety exists in building styles including Italianate, Scots Baronial and Gothic - with some notable additions in the inter-war years. The main threat to the area is the over development of villa grounds and erosion of garden space and boundary walls through the sub-division of property.

As a result of earlier extensions, including a two-storey extension to the west side of the villa, the existing built area of the site is more than 1.5 times the original villa. In addition, the 'green' garden ground is currently less than the 60% required by the non-statutory guideline on 'Villa Areas and the Grounds of villas.' However, the extension proposed is of a modest scale and will be on an area of existing hardstanding. The extension will therefore not result in the loss of 'green' garden ground and as a result will have no adverse effect upon the spatial character of the original villa.

Whilst natural stone is normally required to be used for extensions or alterations to villas, particularly when on front elevations, the use of stone is not considered appropriate in this instance. The existing garage is rendered as is the two-storey extension adjacent. All new windows proposed will be timber. The form and materials are therefore considered to be compatible with the original villa.

In view of the above and fact that the extension will remain behind the front building line of the original villa, it is not considered that it will have a detrimental impact upon the streetscene. There will be no loss of trees on the site. The character and appearance of the conservation area will be preserved.

The installation of a secondary access door on the front elevation is achieved in a simple manner. This does not compete with grander and more ornate portico in the door of the main villa building.

b) The extension will have no adverse effect upon daylight or sunlight available to neighbouring occupiers. A separation distance of at least 25m from the opposing windows of 41 Mansionhouse Road will ensure that the privacy of neighbouring occupiers is protected. Whilst a garage will be lost, there is adequate space to park a car on the driveway. The proposal is for an extension and alterations and not for the creation of a further dwelling. There is therefore no requirement for additional off-street parking. Any proposal to create a further flat would require planning permission.

In conclusion, the positioning, scale and form of the proposed extension and alteration as well as the materials proposed are acceptable. The extension/alterations will have no adverse impact upon the character of the villa or the character or appearance of the conservation area or upon the amenity of neighbouring residents. The current proposal addresses the concerns which led to the previous refusal. There are no material considerations to outweigh this conclusion.

It is recommended that Committee approves this application, subject to the conditions stated.

Alan Henderson

Alan Henderson
Head of Planning and Strategy

Contact/Tel David Mudie on 0131 529 3442 (FAX 529 3717)

Ward affected 48 -Sciennes

Local Plan Central Edinburgh

**Statutory Development
Plan Provision** Housing and Compatible Uses

File AF

Date registered 23 May 2003

**Drawing numbers/
Scheme** S1: 1-3



Reproduction from the Ordnance Survey mapping with permission of the Controller of Her Majesty's Stationary Office © Crown Copyright.
 Unauthorised reproduction infringes Crown copyright and may lead to prosecution or civil proceedings. Licence Number LA 09027L The City of Edinburgh Council 1998.

PLANNING APPLICATION

Address	34 Mansionhouse Road		
Proposal	Alteration and extension of garage, to form front room and breakfast area, see previous application ref no , 02/03217/ ful		
Application number:	03/01863/FUL	WARD	48- Sciennes
THE CITY OF EDINBURGH COUNCIL			
THE CITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT- PLANNING & STRATEGY			