

**Listed Building Consent Application  
at  
Royal Infirmary  
1 Lauriston Place  
Edinburgh  
EH3 9EE**

---

**Development Quality Sub-Committee  
of the Planning Committee**

**Proposal:** Part demolition, alteration and extension to The Medical Hospital and Jubilee Pavilion  
**Applicant:** Southside Capital Ltd.  
**Reference No:** 02/01669/LBC

**1 Purpose of report**

To recommend that the application be **GRANTED** subject to;

**Conditions**

1. The works hereby permitted shall be commenced no later than five years from the date of this consent.
2. The application shall be referred to the Scottish Ministers prior to determination.
3. The Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Scotland shall be given access to the site, at any reasonable time in a period of at least three months from the date of this consent, for the purposes of recording the building, structure or other item of interest.
4. All stone repairs shall be carried out in natural stone to match existing.

5. All new and/or replacement windows shall be single glazed, timber sash and case,
6. All meeting bars, mullions, and glazing bars of the replacement windows shall correspond to the original window pattern, to the satisfaction of the Head of Planning & Strategy.

### **Reasons**

1. In order to accord with the statutory requirements of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Acts.
2. In order to accord with the statutory requirements of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Acts.
3. In order to safeguard the interests of architectural heritage.
4. In order to safeguard the character of the statutorily listed building.
5. In order to safeguard the character of the statutorily listed building.
6. In order to safeguard the character of the statutorily listed building.
7. NB This consent is for Listed Building Consent only. Work must not begin until other necessary consents, eg Planning Permission, have been obtained.

## **2 Main report**

### **Site description**

The application properties are the category B listed (Tollcross Ward), four storey and attic, Scots Baronial style Medical Hospital by David Bryce and Jubilee Pavilion by Sydney Mitchell and Wilson, dating from 1872-79 and 1897 respectively. The buildings are situated in the south-east sector of the RIE site within the Marchmont and Meadows Conservation Area and World Heritage Site.

The Medical Hospital comprises four south facing pavilions, with conical-roofed corner turrets overlooking the Meadows, constructed in bull-faced Hailes sandstone with ashlar dressings, slate roofs and timber framed sash and case windows. The pavilions are linked by a single storey interconnecting corridor assimilated within their northern facades. Two single storey classrooms project from the north elevation and a link corridor from the Surgical Hospital adjoins this elevation. There is a conglomeration of structures dating from the early 20th century and later on the eastern end of the north elevation.

The Jubilee Pavilion by Sidney Mitchell and Wilson was erected in the honour of Queen Victoria's Diamond Jubilee in 1897. The building is constructed in bull-faced red sandstone in the "Old Flemish" style with splayed polygonal corner towers and a two storey, flat roofed link to the westernmost pavilion of the Medical Hospital. An additional storey was added to this link in the later part of the 20th century.

Also during this period, a conglomeration of temporary and permanent single and two storey structures were erected between and to the south of each pavilion of the Medical Hospital and Jubilee Pavilion, including enclosed concrete balconies between the twin towers at the southern ends.

### **Site history**

The RIE site has been in hospital use since the construction of George Watson's Hospital in 1740 and has been developed largely without statutory planning control. Health Boards and other specified health service bodies were removed from Crown Exemption in 1991.

There is no planning history relevant to the determination of this application.

### **Development**

The application is for the restoration and refurbishment of the Medical Hospital and Jubilee Pavilion to form residential apartments.

The proposed external alterations involve the removal of all 20th century accretions, including the enclosed balconies, link corridors and pre-fabricated huts. The original fenestration pattern will be reinstated on the south elevations, with the addition of new metal balustrades in the position of the original cast iron balconies. Minor reconfiguration is proposed to the existing window openings on the north elevations and all new windows installed will be timber framed sash and case. The slated sides of the majority of dormer bays will be replaced with framed glazing in order to provide natural light to the attic rooms and a roof terrace is to be formed at the north end of each pavilion. Extensive restoration work will be carried out, including the reconstruction of chimneys to their original height, reparation of the ventilation towers and reinstatement of missing finials.

Internally, the existing partitions and stairs will be removed and replaced with new partitions to form living accommodation and access stairs.

The original scheme proposed the addition of curvilinear glass bays on the south elevation and 7 eight to ten storey contemporary style infills between the pavilions with glazed links to the original structures on the flanking elevations. These infills have been amended to freestanding structures ranging from eight to ten storeys, which form part of the associated full planning application.

This application is one of nine separate applications for listed building consent for alterations to or demolition of listed structures on the RIE site. The associated application for planning permission is for the redevelopment of the site as a new urban quarter entitled "Quartermile" comprising residential uses in the south and east sections of the site with commercial and retail uses concentrated in the centre. Extensive landscaping is proposed to create green space around the retained historic buildings and contemporary style new structures.

### **Supporting Information**

The application is accompanied by a Heritage Statement, Condition Survey and model.

The former provides comprehensive descriptions of the historic and architectural development of each listed building, accompanied by plans and photographs, and justifications for the proposed alterations to or demolition of the structures. The Statement concludes that the present buildings on the RIE site present an incongruous mix of differing qualities and styles as a result of over two hundred years of development.

The Condition Survey details the structural form, defects and loading capacity of each listed building in written and photographic form.

The architects have also produced a detailed 3-dimensional model depicting the entire development and immediate surroundings.

### **Consultations**

No consultations undertaken.

### **Representations**

The application was advertised on 24 May 2002. Seven letters of representation were received, including letters from the South Side Community Council, Edinburgh World Heritage Trust, Cockburn Association, AHSS and Edinburgh Old Town Association.

The contributors objected to the proposed additional bays between the twin towers on the south elevations of the pavilions. The Edinburgh World Heritage Trust and AHSS were also concerned that the proposed infill blocks would dwarf the original buildings.

### **Policy**

#### **Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997**

##### Section 25 - Status of Development Plans

"Where, in making any determination under the planning acts, regard is to be had to the development plan, the determination shall be made in accordance with the plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise".

#### **National Planning Guidance**

NPPG 18: Planning and the Historic Environment (April 1999) promotes the protection, conservation and enhancement of the historic environment and reflects the existing statutory framework and existing guidance set out in the "Memorandum of Guidance on Listed Buildings and Conservation Area, 1998".

## **The Memorandum of Guidance on Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas (1998)**

Para. 2.21: "When considering applications for alterations or extensions, planning authorities should satisfy themselves that no unnecessary damage to historic structures will be caused, that additions are in keeping with other parts of the building, and that any new external or internal features harmonise with their surroundings."

### **Lothian Structure Plan (approved 4 July 1997)**

Policy ENV3A states that the overall character and appearance of Lothian's high quality urban areas, particularly the form of Edinburgh's distinct Old and New Town of the World Heritage Site and the city's landscape and historical features, should be protected and where possible enhanced.

Policy ENV5 states that local plans shall contain policies to maintain and enhance the character of conservation areas and to protect all listed buildings and their settings.

### **Central Edinburgh Local Plan (adopted 29 May 1997)**

The site is located within the Mixed Activities Zone and is identified as a Major Development Opportunity with preferred land uses being housing, academic or other institutions, hotel or commercial uses, small scale employment uses and public short stay parking.

### **Planning Brief (approved by the Planning Committee, May 1998)**

The brief, which includes an addendum approved in August 2000, seeks to ensure the re-integration of the site with the wider city. The listed buildings on the site should be retained and re-used in balance with the best planning of the site, which should incorporate a mix of uses and housing tenures and promote high quality development with an identifiable urban form of individual character.

The brief states that the Bryce and Sydney Mitchell and Wilson buildings are robustly constructed in a confident, grand manner and appear to be in good condition. A key objective is therefore to reassert their setting by re-establishing breathing space around the buildings through the removal of modern accretions.

#### Relevant Policies:

Policy CD2 (LISTED BUILDINGS) sets out criteria for assessing proposals affecting listed buildings and seeks to safeguard their character and setting.

Policy CD17 (MATERIALS) sets out requirements for materials in new developments and seeks a greater use of stone, roofing slate and other traditional materials in appropriate cases.

Policy CD20 (WINDOW ALTERATIONS) sets out different levels of control for window alterations for listed buildings, non listed buildings in conservation areas and non listed buildings in defined areas of window control.

Non-statutory guidelines 'ALTERATIONS TO LISTED BUILDINGS' provide general guidance for assessing proposals for both internal and external alterations.

Non-statutory guidelines on 'WINDOW ALTERATIONS' supplement local plan conservation and design policies, providing additional guidance on window alterations.

Non-statutory guidelines on 'DOOR ALTERATIONS IN LISTED BUILDINGS AND CONSERVATION AREAS' supplement local plan conservation and design policies, providing additional guidance on door alterations.

### **3 Conclusions and Recommendations**

#### **DETERMINING ISSUES**

The determining issues are:

- do the proposals preserve the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses? If they do not, there is a presumption against the granting of consent;
- do the proposals comply with the development plan?
- if the proposals do comply with the development plan, are there any compelling reasons for not approving them?
- if the proposals do not comply with the development plan, are there any compelling reasons for approving them?

#### **ASSESSMENT**

To address the determining issues, the Committee needs to consider whether the proposals have an adverse impact on the character of the listed building.

The proposed conversion of the Medical Hospital and Jubilee Pavilion will restore and reveal the original structures, which have been partially concealed under modern accretions. The tall and extensively glazed ward blocks originally looked out on to landscaped courtyards between. However, this clarity of design has been lost with functional additions of poor quality filling in much of the available open space.

The proposed external alterations include significant conservation gain through the restoration of previously reduced chimneys to their original height, reparation of the ventilation towers and replacement of modern uPVC double glazed units with sash and case windows matching the original fenestration pattern. Extensive stonework repairs will be undertaken and the existing profusion of downpipes will be reduced and rationalised. The 20th century accretions that are to be removed are of no intrinsic architectural merit, and the enclosed balconies between the twin towers at the south ends of the pavilions are visually intrusive from the Meadows.

The proposed minor reconfiguration of the existing window openings on the north elevations will have minimal effect on the appearance of the listed buildings as these elevations are relatively utilitarian compared to the south facades and are concealed from major viewpoints. The new glazed areas and balconies on the roof will not be conspicuous from ground level. The demolition of the original single storey corridor at the northern end of the buildings is necessary to remove a physical and visual barrier between the core of the site and Meadows.

The interiors of the Medical Hospital and Jubilee Pavilion are largely undistinguished due to restricted hospital budgets at the time of construction. The proposed internal alterations will therefore have no detrimental impact on historic or architectural character.

The proposals comply with the development plan and non-statutory policies and have no adverse impact on the character of the listed building.

There are no other material planning considerations which outweigh this conclusion.

It is recommended that the Committee approves this application, subject to the conditions stated.

*Alan Henderson*

**Alan Henderson**  
Head of Planning and Strategy

**Contact/tel** Clare Leith on 0131 529 3510 (Fax 629 3717)

**Ward affected** Tollcross

**Local Plan** Central Edinburgh

**Statutory Development  
Plan Provision** Mixed Activities Zone

**File** AF

**Date registered** 10 May 2002

**Drawing numbers/  
Scheme** 8, 24, 30, 151-60, 179, 218-25 + 233218-25 + 233  
S2

