

# Amendment by the Conservative Group

## City of Edinburgh Council

14 March 2019

### Item 8.1 – Edinburgh Tram – York Place to Newhaven Final Business Case

Council

#### 1.1

The City of Edinburgh Council rejects:

- i) The Edinburgh Tram - York Place to Newhaven Final Business Case;
- and
- ii) The increased prudential borrowing authorised limit and operational boundary reported in paragraph 5.3 of the report by the Executive Director of Place.

In doing so, Council:

#### 1.1.1

Notes the Edinburgh Tram - York Place to Newhaven Final Business Case, as referred from the Transport and Environment Committee.

#### 1.1.2

Notes that the anticipated cost of the project and associated funding arrangements, including that the project cost has risen significantly since Councillors were last presented with the Outline Business Case (OBC), with the Full Business Case delivering a project cost (inclusive of risk) of £257.3m against OBC cost of £165.2m.

#### 1.1.3

Rejects the intention for the project to proceed prior to publication of the Edinburgh Tram Inquiry, the comprehensive understanding and incorporation of which are an essential component of any case to extend the tram.

#### **1.1.4**

Considers it unacceptable that, as per the FBC, Lothian Buses will see significant operational disruption, revenue loss and incur additional costs of operation, with a significant proportion of bus users on the proposed tram route modelled to transfer to tram.

#### **1.1.5**

Notes the recent budget process which required Council to deliver £33.1m of cuts to public services, demonstrated competent alternative investment in public services through re-allocation of both the Lothian Buses dividend and capitalisation of tram fares along the existing tram route. Therefore, instructs the Chief Executive to bring forward a report to Council in three cycles detailing options for alternative investment

**Moved by** Councillor Nick Cook

**Seconded by** Councillor Iain Whyte

# Amendment by the Liberal Democrat Group

## City of Edinburgh Council

14 March 2019

### Item 8.1 – Edinburgh Tram – York Place to Newhaven Final Business Case

Delete all and insert:

The City of Edinburgh Council:

1.1 welcomes the considerable work undertaken by officers to finalise the Final Business Case and the substantial programme of engagement with elected members, residents and other stakeholders to allow for an informed decision on the proposed tram extension.

1.2. continues to support the principle of extending the tram to Leith and Newhaven.

1.3. notes paragraph 3(c) of the TEC Motion on the Updated Outline Business Case, approved by full council in September 2017, and continues to believe it wrong to approve the proposed extension before the full recommendations of Lord Hardie's independent tram inquiry are known.

1.4. notes paragraph 8 of the TEC Motion on the Updated Outline Business Case, approved by full council in September 2017, and believes the administration has failed properly to set out how the tram extension project will be linked to broader public transport improvements across the city.

1.5. believes there has been insufficient information provided on the impact the project could have on the resourcing and prioritisation of other transport and infrastructure projects across the city.

1.6. believes there has been insufficient information to explain what impact the £20m extraordinary dividend from Lothian Buses could have on bus ticket prices and operations.

1.7. notes that the current Increased Costs Scenario would involve the significant use of the Council's reserves, leaving the Council financially exposed should unexpected pressures arise which would normally call on the use of reserves.

1.8. notes the wider economic and fiscal uncertainty which has intensified since the Council last considered the tram extension; recognises that a disastrous Brexit remains a possibility, given the current policy position of the UK Government, and could impact the assumptions on which the Final Business Case is based; all of which could expose the Council to further financial risk and none of which has been formally evaluated.

1.9. therefore agrees to continue consideration of the tram extension until the matters raised in this motion are addressed

**Moved by** Councillor Gillian Gloyer

**Seconded by** Councillor Robert Aldridge

# Amendment by the Coalition

## City of Edinburgh Council

14 March 2019

### Item 9.1 – Motion by Councillor Whyte – Street Change Glasgow

Deletes all and replaces with

“Council:

- 1) Notes Glasgow’s decision to adopt the Street Change scheme.
- 2) Notes Street Change is a brand and platform that had been developed in Edinburgh but ceased operating last year.
- 3) Agrees that officers should report to H&E within three cycles on whether the scheme could be reinstated using a partnership model based on a multi-agency response, gauge the appetite from partners to reinstate the scheme, and assess the role it could play in our wider homelessness strategy, including the Rapid Rehousing Transition Plan.

**Moved by** Councillor Kate Campbell

**Seconded by** Councillor Lezley Cameron

# Amendment by the Green Group

## City of Edinburgh Council

14 March 2019

### Item 9.1 – Motion by Councillor Whyte – Street Change Glasgow

Delete all and replace with

“1. Notes the report “Street Begging in Edinburgh” commissioned by Edinburgh Community Safety Partnership and published last week.

2. Notes that the above report sets out 16 key recommendations in relation to street begging in Edinburgh.

3. Agrees to a report to Corporate Policy and Strategy Committee within no less than two cycles, setting out council actions in response to the above recommendations and drawing on examples of initiatives elsewhere in the UK where appropriate.”

**Moved by:** Councillor Susan Rae

**Seconded by:** Councillor Claire Miller