

# Edinburgh and South East Scotland City Region Deal Joint Committee

Friday 1 March 2019

## City Region Deal Regional Transport Appraisal Board

Item number 5.9

### Executive Summary

---

The upgrading of existing transport infrastructure is a key element of the City Region Deal theme of 'Removing the physical barriers to growth'. This report summarises the agreed aims, objectives, and strategic actions to maximise transport connectivity across the region, so as to most effectively support the agenda for securing inclusive growth. The report also notes the agreed governance arrangements, with specific recommendations in respect of the establishment of the Transport Appraisal Board.

#### **Dr Grace Vickers**

Chief Executive, Midlothian Council

E-mail: [grace.vickers@midlothian.gov.uk](mailto:grace.vickers@midlothian.gov.uk) | Tel: 0131 271 3002

Lead Contact: Ian Johnson, Midlothian Council,

E-mail: [ian.johnson2@midlothian.gov.uk](mailto:ian.johnson2@midlothian.gov.uk) | Tel: 0131 271 3002



## City Region Deal Checklist

Criteria	Details/Link to Document
<b>Contribution to City Region Deal commitments and Inclusive Growth Framework</b>	The upgrading of transport infrastructure will increase connectivity and ease of access across the region through reduced journey times and, in some instances, greater modal choice. This will provide better linkages between existing as well as planned new residential areas and centres of employment and training.
<b>Alignment, integration with, or dependence on, other City Region Deal activities</b>	The work of the Transport Appraisal Board (TAB) will relate closely to the nature and location of major City Region Deal investment arising through the work of the Boards responsible for Housing, Data Driven Innovation and the Integrated Regional Employability and Skills programme.
<b>Scale and regional distribution of expected outcomes, benefits, and leverage, from activity</b>	The City Region Deal document specifically identifies two projects, these being improvement of the A720 Sheriffhall junction on the City Bypass, and a strategic package of transportation improvements at West Edinburgh. The TAB will also be working with the other City Region Deal Boards to identify interventions to support objectives in such areas as workforce mobility and in the seven strategic housing locations, and as part of the innovation projects.
<b>Compliance with financial requirements and agreed expenditure profile</b>	The TAB will operate within the financial requirements and profile of the City Region Deal.
<b>Equalities Impact</b>	(See part 5 of main report)
<b>Anticipated significant risks and mitigation measures</b>	One of the first tasks of the newly established TAB will be to prepare and maintain a register of risks
<b>Alignment and fit with City Region Deal governance arrangement</b>	This report recommends the establishment of the TAB in accordance with the provisions of the City Region Deal as agreed by all partners
<b>PMO check</b>	All information provided.
<b>Government approval</b>	Not required, as TAB is part of the City Region Deal governance arrangements already agreed by the Governments and City Region Deal partners.
<b>Partner sign-off</b>	Not required at this stage. Partner sign off will be required at the point of project proposition approvals.
<b>Advisory Board sign off</b>	Not applicable
<b>Executive Board sign off</b>	Agreed at meeting of 14 February 2019.
<b>PMO Recommendation</b>	That the Joint Committee approves the recommendations in the report.

# Report

## City Region Deal Regional Transport Appraisal Board

### 1. Recommendations

---

- 1.1 To approve the establishment of the Transport Appraisal Board on the terms set out in this report.
- 1.2 To appoint Dr Grace Vickers (Chief Executive, Midlothian Council) to act as Chair of the Transport Appraisal Board with delegated responsibility for its operation.
- 1.3 To note that individual proposals once prepared, will be presented to this Joint Committee for approval.

### 2. Background

---

- 2.1 Transport is one of the five key elements of the City Region Deal and is integral to securing the overarching aim of achieving sustainable inclusive growth across the region. The City Region Deal agreement specifically identifies the need to upgrade existing transport infrastructure so as to assist in removing physical barriers to growth. To be fully effective, the transport element is identified as being significant in supporting the programmes of investment in innovation, employability/skills and housing. The City Region Deal agreement also specifies as part of the governance structure the requirement for a Transport Appraisal Board (TAB) to focus on these matters.

### 3. Main report

---

- 3.1 A copy of the remit and terms of the TAB as set out in the City Region Deal agreement forms Appendix A to this report. It specifies that membership of the Board shall comprise representatives from the six constituent local authorities, the South East Scotland Transport Partnership (SESTran) and Transport Scotland.

- 3.2 In December 2018 Transport Scotland wrote to all local authorities in Scotland setting out its proposals for Regional Transport Working Groups (Appendix B to this report). In the case of Edinburgh and South East Scotland City Region, it proposed a working group “*Based around the emerging City Region Transport Appraisal Board involving those partners leading on the development of the Regional Economic Partnership and implementation of the City Region Deal*”. In its response to this letter (Appendix C to this report), the Executive Board of the Edinburgh and South East Scotland City Region Deal welcomed this proposed arrangement for the region; noting the approach under which economic development, planning and strategic transport issues need to be considered together.
- 3.3 The letter of response also refers to SEStran, noting that its membership of the TAB will ensure an inclusive and informed position as the new context for regional transport planning evolves. Discussion will be required at an early stage with Clackmannanshire and Falkirk Councils, which are members of SEStran but lie outwith the City Region Deal boundary.
- 3.4 There are two named transport projects within the City Region Deal, these being at Sheriffhall and West Edinburgh. The A720 Sheriffhall junction improvement on the City Bypass trunk road is a scheme for which the Scottish Government has set aside up to £120m of its contributory City Region Deal funding. At its meeting in December 2018, this Joint Committee instructed that officers engage with Transport Scotland so that the Committee can be better informed of the timing for implementation of the scheme as set within a business case programme. Officers will report on the outcome of such discussions at this meeting of the Joint Committee. At West Edinburgh, the Scottish Government is committing £20m of its contributory City Region Deal funding to support public transport infrastructure improvements identified in the West Edinburgh Transport Appraisal.
- 3.5 In addition to those named projects the TAB will work with the other City Region Deal thematic advisory boards to assess transport interventions in areas such as new infrastructure to support innovation projects, new infrastructure to unlock strategic housing sites and measures to encourage greater workforce mobility.
- 3.6 The TAB will also provide the City Region Deal input to programmes at a national level of which the most significant at this time are the Scottish Government’s emerging review of its National Transport Strategy and the forthcoming second Strategic Transport Projects Review.
- 3.7 It is intended to convene the first meeting of the Board in late March/April at which the schedule for further meetings can be agreed. It is anticipated that a full report and presentation on regional transport can be provided to the Joint Committee for its June or September meeting.

## 4. Financial impact

---

- 4.1 Scottish Government has committed a total of £140m to two specific City Region Deal projects; these being up to £120m to support improvements to the A720 City Bypass for the grade separation of the Sheriffhall junction, and £20m to support public transport infrastructure improvements identified by the West Edinburgh Transport Appraisal.
- 4.2 Further investment in transport infrastructure and accessibility is expected to form part of projects within the innovation, employability/skills, and housing themes. A specifically identified part of the Easter Bush data driven innovation business case is the A701/A702 scheme which is to receive £10.9m of City Region Deal funding.
- 4.3 The terms of the agreed City Region Deal also commit the partners to put in place a Regional Developer Contributions framework to assist funding of identified regional transport infrastructure to further the aims of the City Region Deal and related regional planning, economic and transport strategies.

## 5. Equalities impact

---

- 5.1 As noted above, the transport connectivity theme of the City Region Deal is an integral part of accelerating inclusive growth across the region. Removing physical barriers to growth has been identified one of five key interventions in the Deal Document's Inclusive Growth Framework. As a consequence, there are three specific positive impact on equalities which are to be achieved.
  - Upgrades and additions to existing infrastructure, with the resultant reduced journey times and increased modal choice, can readily support residents of more disadvantaged communities to more easily access job opportunities and education/training centres.
  - Transport infrastructure upgrades to unlock housing development sites enable the increase in the supply and availability of housing, particularly in the affordable sector, to assist directly those households which cannot access the private housing market.
  - Infrastructure improvements which assist in the delivery of data driven innovation projects and other business development areas will enable accelerated overall economic growth, as well as providing good accessibility to the increased job opportunities arising from those implemented projects.
- 5.2 The Transport Appraisal Board will be expected to prepare performance indicators to monitor the impact of interventions.

## **6. Background reading/external references**

---

- 6.1 [Edinburgh and South East Scotland City Region Deal Document, August 2018](#)

## **7. Appendices**

---

- 7.1 Appendix A: extract from the Edinburgh and South East Scotland City Region Deal Document, August 2018: Transport Appraisal Board Membership and Remit.
- 7.2 Appendix B: copy of letter from Transport Scotland to all local authorities on Regional Transport Working Groups
- 7.3 Appendix C: copy of letter of response to Transport Scotland from the City Region Deal Executive Board, dated 29 January 2019.

## **Edinburgh and South-East Scotland Regional Transport Appraisal Board**

### **Membership**

The Edinburgh and South-East Scotland Regional Transport Appraisal Board (TAB) Group will comprise:

- SESTran
- Representatives from the six local authorities in the City Region Deal
- Transport Scotland
- City Region Deal PMO (observer)

### **Purpose**

To make recommendations to the Joint Committee on the approach towards delivering the transport elements of the City Region Deal Investment Programme through the consistent adoption of best practice from the Scottish Transport Appraisal Guidance and the Treasury Green Book, as appropriate. Although the Transport theme covers only two projects (A720 and West Edinburgh) the Board will also consider transport elements of other City Region Deal projects, particularly in the Housing and Innovation themes.

The TAB will build on existing best practice and consider the most relevant technical approaches including modelling tools.

The TAB will also:

- Consider the strategic rationale, demand/need, objectives, evidence, costings and delivery programme and mechanisms for projects, their relationship and phasing in the overall programme, including cumulative impact.
- Consider approaches to the use of the proposed city region data store to establish a shared evidence base.
- Establish the evidence base and options for future investment in the city region's strategic transport infrastructure programme.
- Consider access to funds and budgets,
- Provide input as a region into other projects as appropriate; such as, the National Transport Strategy and Strategic Transport Project Review 2.

### **Meeting schedule**

To be confirmed.

### **Current status and implementation**

Discussions on the Terms of Reference for this group are ongoing between partners, Government and Transport Scotland, so are subject to change. The Board will be formed following Joint Committee ratification of Governance Framework and the signing of the City Region Deal.

**Alison Irvine**  
**Director for Transport Strategy and Analysis**

Buchanan House, 58 Port Dundas Road, Glasgow G4 0HF  
Direct Line: 0141 272 7590  
Alison.irvine@transport.gov.scot



To  
All Local Authorities (inc. National Parks as planning authorities) and Regional Transport Partnerships

## **REGIONAL TRANSPORT WORKING GROUPS**

On behalf of Scottish Ministers, Transport Scotland is progressing two key pieces of policy development and transport planning work which would benefit from your input as local and regional partners involved in transport, land use and economic development planning. This work is intended to set the transport policy and strategic transport interventions for a 20 year horizon which will link with wider government planning and delivery to enable sustainable and inclusive growth across the country.

The review of the National Transport Strategy is now at the stage of sharing and testing emerging policies to support the Strategic Vision and Outcomes and would benefit from your input on a regional basis. The second Strategic Transport Projects Review (STPR2) will use the emerging policy priorities and the developing national and regional evidence base to identify objectives and potential transport interventions. The NTS work to date has been progressed in a co-creative and collaborative manner and STPR2 will be seeking to adopt a similar approach from early in 2019.

Initial preparatory work on STPR2 has been progressed over the past few months and Transport Scotland is currently in the process of appointing consultants to take forward the majority of the STPR2 evidence base, objective setting and appraisal work from early 2019. The first stages of work will set the approach to engagement and the regional element of this dialogue will be key.

The Scottish Government recognises the importance of addressing regional economic development, planning and strategic transport issues in tandem. That is why we are writing to you about formation of Regional Transport Working Groups. In establishing Regional Transport Working Groups, we would like to observe the principles guiding development of Regional Economic Partnership (REP) arrangements. This would allow the Working Groups to be tailored to regional conditions and work in cognisance of existing partnerships will assist partners to share data and evidence to inform regional priorities. We want regional groupings to be voluntary and self assembled around the bespoke requirements of particular regions. Whilst recognising the existing Regional Transport Partnership structure, in order to meet our objectives for these new groups, the existing and emerging REPs which are taking shape largely around City and Regional Growth Deals appear to be a reasonable starting point for this fresh engagement. However, this will be subject to your feedback. Although the new REPs are

starting to mature in many parts of Scotland, that is not the case everywhere at the current time. This will require a flexible approach to be taken in some areas, in order to achieve all Scotland coverage by Regional Transport Working Groups. Whilst it is too early to define the approach to the next National Planning Framework as long as scrutiny of the Planning Bill continues, it is expected that future engagement on strategic planning matters could also align well with this approach

The potential terms of reference are set out in Annex A along with initial groupings in Annex B to start discussion. We recognise the need for there to be liaison between the groups and for them to avoid operating in isolation.

Membership of the new Regional Transport Working Groups is not intended to be static and each meeting or piece of work can involve relevant partners and stakeholders, working across boundaries as appropriate, however we believe the core team should involve senior level officials responsible for Transport, Economic Development and Social Equity in the region. We will of course engage more widely than the core group including elected members. However, we think it makes sense to have a smaller group of lead professionals informing the wider work and means of engagement. We would also seek to align this with the preparation of NPF4 after Parliament's consideration of the Planning Bill has concluded, subject to the final form of the legislation.

I would be grateful if you would consider and discuss the above within your respective organisations and existing regional forums and provide initial feedback from a nominated contact person by end of January 2019. Your feedback will allow Transport Scotland and the appointed consultant team to consider the approach to regional engagement within the scoping and inception discussions. Please share your feedback with David Torrance, Head of Regional Transport and Development Planning [David.Torrance@transport.gov.scot](mailto:David.Torrance@transport.gov.scot).

### STPR2 Evidence Gathering

Transport Scotland have been involved in transport appraisal and transport planning with all of the authorities since the publication of the first STPR. We are aware of work and effort which organisations have put into transport appraisals, business cases, surveys, economic impact assessments, feasibility studies etc. We want to ensure this evidence is captured in the first stage of STPR2 i.e. establishing the case for change. Therefore it would be helpful if you can collate any previous work you would believe would provide evidence of problems, opportunities, issues and constraints, for your region – in order to share with the appointed consultants at the appropriate time. We recognise in areas where an Initial Appraisal has been undertaken very recently, this exercise has been completed.

### Next Steps

Feedback from authorities on regional groupings will be considered in discussion with the appointed STPR consultants from January 2019. From February / March 2019 Transport Scotland and the consultant team will meet with each of the emerging regional groupings. The agenda for these meetings will be dependent on recent work in that area, however each will set a plan for engagement and collaboration on NTS and STPR.

We intend to take a transparent and collaborative approach in the development of these Reviews. For information on the NTS review, please visit <https://www.transport.gov.scot/our-approach/strategy/national-transport-strategy/#> . Further information on STPR2 will be available in the New Year.

We look forward to working with you.

Kind Regards,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Alison Irvine". The signature is written in a cursive style with a small dot above the 'i' in "Irvine".

Alison Irvine  
Director of Transport Strategy and Analysis

## **Annex A – Terms of Reference**

### **Regional Transport Working Groups**

#### **General Terms of Reference for all Groups**

This Regional Transport Working Group will assist Transport Scotland in its delivery of two key pieces of policy development and transport planning work. This work is aimed at setting the policy and strategic transport projects for a 20 year horizon which will link with wider government planning and delivery to enable sustainable and inclusive growth across the country. This requires input from the regional partners and members of this group agree to work collaboratively through the course of these projects.

The Regional Transport Working Group agree to share information, data and evidence, set direction and regional priorities for transport, be constructive and proactive in addressing challenges, in a co-creative and collaborative manner.

Membership includes commitment from senior level officials responsible for Transport, Economic Development and Social Equality within regional organisations, along with Transport Scotland supported by their consultants. The group commit to involving and engage other partners and stakeholders during the process as appropriate. The group will endeavour to keep discussions focussed, specific and outcome orientated.

#### **Regional Transport Working Group – Specific Terms of Reference**

To be developed by working groups as appropriate.

## Annex B – Existing Groupings

### City Region Groupings

- Aberdeen City Region (Based around the City Region Transport Working Group with input from the Regional Economic Partnership/ ONE Group)
- Edinburgh City Region (Based around the emerging City Region Transport Appraisal Board involving those partners leading on the development of the Regional Economic Partnership and implementation of the city region deal)
- Glasgow City Region (Based around the emerging City Region Transport Groupings and assisted as required by the Regional Economic Partnership)
- Inverness and Highlands (Potential to consider sub areas of the Highlands as appropriate)
- Tay Cities Region (Based around the recently agreed HoT and developing Regional Economic Partnership)
- Stirling / Clackmannanshire / Falkirk (Based around the emerging Stirling and Clackmannanshire City Region Transport Grouping; early regional economic partnership arrangements, and featuring the collaborative participation of Falkirk Council)

### Regional Groupings

- Argyll and Bute (Based around the local authority boundary and informed by the emerging Argyll and Bute Growth Deal work)
- Ayrshire and Arran (Based around the emerging Regional Economic Partnership and Ayrshire Growth Deal involving all three Ayrshire Councils)
- South West (Based around the South West study)
- South East (Based around the Borders Connectivity work)
  - We recognise that the SE and SW groupings will need to work closely together to support the South of Scotland and the two Scottish local authorities that are part of the Borderlands Inclusive Growth Deal.
- Moray (Based on emerging discussions around the Moray Growth Deal)
  - Moray area could consider potential alignment and interaction with Aberdeen City Region and Inverness / Highlands area.
- Northern Isles (Recognising the routes to and interconnectivity of Orkney and Shetland and the emerging Islands Growth Deal discussions)
- Western Isles (Recognising the routes to and interconnectivity of the Western Isles and the emerging Islands Growth Deal discussions)



Ms Alison Irvine  
Director of Transport Strategy and Analysis  
Transport Scotland  
Buchanan House  
58 Port Dundas Road  
Glasgow  
G4 0HF

Our Ref: GV/AI/01

Your Ref:

Date: 29 January 2019

Dear Ms Irvine,

### **Regional Transport Working Groups**

Thank you for your letter in respect of the above. It has been considered by the Executive Board of the Edinburgh and South East Scotland City Region Deal (the partner local authorities being City of Edinburgh, East Lothian, Fife, Midlothian, Scottish Borders and West Lothian). As Executive Board lead on the transport element of the City Region Deal I have been asked to inform you of the collective view of the City Deal partner authorities.

By way of context, the Edinburgh and South East Scotland City Region Deal was signed by the UK and Scottish Governments and the partners in August 2018. In support of its overall aim of accelerating inclusive growth there is a need to ensure a robust strategic co-ordinated approach to maximising inclusive economic development, land use planning and transport connectivity. The fifteen year timescale for the City Deal provides for such an approach as well as a basis for longer term strategic regional development.

The signed City Region Deal document identifies specific regional inclusive growth challenges including those relating to transport and connectivity; and addresses these under the major theme of removing the physical barriers to growth, including the upgrade of existing transport infrastructure. In overall terms the City Region Deal partners regarding transport improvements as essential in supporting the key objectives of the City Region Deal on housing, innovation, employability and skills, and wider social benefit, through reduced journey times, public transport improvements and other measures to increase accessibility across the region. A number of specific transport projects are included in the City Region Deal as well as related commitments including the establishment of a Regional Developer Contributions framework.

The City Region Deal document also identifies as part of its governance structure a Transport Appraisal Board which will report to the City Deal Joint Committee. Board membership will comprise representatives of the six constituent local authorities, Transport Scotland and the current regional transport partnership (SESTran). The Board is expected to begin operating from summer 2019. One of its primary tasks will be to engage positively with Transport Scotland in providing input to the ongoing review of the National Transport Strategy and the second Strategic Transport Projects Review.

The City Region Deal Executive Board comprising the partner local authorities and a representative of the higher and further education sector, welcomes the overall approach set out in your letter to establish regional transport working groups. In particular, the Board agrees that for the Edinburgh City Region the most effective working group would be that which you note in Annex B to your letter, *“based around the emerging City Region Transport Appraisal Board involving those partners leading on the development of the Regional Economic Partnership and implementation of the city regional deal”*.

The General Terms of Reference at Annex A to your letter would accord with the approach being taken in the Edinburgh City Region; and assuming that membership would also include officials responsible for planning, as referred to in the fourth paragraph of your letter. In relation to the specific terms of reference for the working groups, the City Region Deal document sets out the terms of reference for the Transport Appraisal Board, and these can be further developed and refined as the Board becomes established, including changes that may be consequent on any new transport and planning legislation that comes into force.

As noted above, the current regional transport group (SESTran) will be a member of the Transport Appraisal Group, therefore ensuring an inclusive and informed position as a new context for regional transport planning evolves. The City Region Deal partners will also be sensitive to the views of those local authority members of SESTran (Clackmannanshire and Falkirk) which are not part of the Edinburgh and South East Scotland City Region Deal.

Two of the Edinburgh City Region Deal local authority partners are also part of other proposed groupings as set out in Annex B to your letter. Fife Council is part of the Tay Cities Region; and Scottish Borders Council is part of the Borderlands Inclusive Growth Deal. Accordingly, either or both Councils may wish to submit additional comments to you on those aspects.

In summary, the Executive Board of the Edinburgh and South East Scotland City Region Deal welcomes the overall proposals set out in your letter to establish regional transport working groups, agrees that the most appropriate way forward in the City Region is through the emerging City Region Deal Transport Appraisal Board, and commits to working closely with Transport Scotland in securing a co-ordinated strategic approach to transport, planning and economic growth across the region.

Yours sincerely,



Dr Grace Vickers  
Chief Executive, Midlothian Council  
on behalf of the Executive Board of the Edinburgh and South East Scotland City Region Deal  
Waverley Court  
4 East Market Street  
Edinburgh EH8 8BG