

Education, Children & Families Committee

10.00, Tuesday, 11 December 2018

Community access to secondary school sport facilities – impact of introduction of non-core hour charges

Item number	7.5
Report number	
Executive/routine	
Wards	
Council Commitments	39

Executive Summary

The provision of community access to secondary school sport facilities has placed significant financial pressures on the Communities and Families service. Since the business case for transfer of sports lets to Edinburgh Leisure was approved by the Council additional costs associated with providing community access have resulted in the achievement of the net surplus target becoming more challenging.

Additional costs have been driven by the need to introduce leisure attendants to some schools and the introduction of charges from PPP partners and FM for access outside of core hours.

In addition, the Council approved a saving of £500K against community access at the time of the transfer of sports lets to Edinburgh Leisure on the basis this would lead to increased usage primarily. Whilst improving customer service and generating some increase in usage significant progress towards this target has been compromised due to the additional cost pressures the project has had to seek to manage.

The impact of the additional costs and the £500K approved saving has led to a budget pressure of over £1M.

Council at its budget meeting in February 2018 approved the introduction of non-core hour charges to customers. Council approved a motion at Full Council on 28th June 2018 asking for the introduction of the non-core hour charge to be postponed whilst a club impact assessment is carried out.

The detail of the club impact assessment is contained within this report.

Community access to secondary school sport facilities – impact of introduction of non-core hour charges

1. Recommendations

1.1 The Education, Children and Families Committee is asked to:

1.1.1 To note the content of the report.

2. Background

2.1 Motion from Cllr Staniforth approved by Council on 28 June 2018:

- 1) Notes that from August PPP1 and PPP2 schools will be charging clubs and societies leasing premises outside of core hours an additional £35/hour.
- 2) Notes that sports clubs have not been fully consulted on this price increase and have warned that it could cause clubs to have to close.
- 3) Notes that no assessment of the impact on sports clubs on other users was carried out in advance of the proposal being rolled out.
- 4) Notes that Edinburgh Leisure have tried to resolve this by offering clubs alternative premises but that this is not always possible and/or desirable; and only a matter of days before the end of school term clubs are reporting no clarity on lets available.
- 5) Therefore agrees to delay the imposition of the £35/hour non-core-hour extra charge at PPP schools while a full consultation with sports clubs and other affected bodies is carried out and for a report to be presented to full council or appropriate committee setting out the potential impacts and detailing options for mitigation.”

2.2 The transfer of management of secondary school sport facilities to Edinburgh Leisure began in October 2016 and to date 21 out of 23 secondary schools have been transferred.

2.3 As part of the business case for the transfer to Edinburgh Leisure it was recommended that Council and Edinburgh Leisure charges were harmonised given the disparity in prices for what were essentially identical sporting spaces.

2.4 Along with price harmonisation, the management of PPP costs and PPP 2 banked hours was analysed. These costs were incurred due to community access outside of core hours and resulted in annual charges of c.£250k for the last couple of

financial years. Core and non-core hours differ between CEC, PPP 1 and PPP 2 secondary schools (detailed in appendix 1).

- 2.5 For PPP 2 banked hours, the Council was allocated 4,000 hours per annum to allow community access. After the 4,000 hours had been utilised, the Council is charged c. £50 per hour for every additional hour used. The amount of use over the last few years exceeded 9,000 hours per annum which led to the unbudgeted six-figure bill.
- 2.6 With each school individually managing their own sports lets and no control mechanism in place, exceeding the allocated number of banked hours was inevitable.
- 2.7 The recommended solution was to use the 4,000 hours to create a framework of core opening times for Monday to Sunday across the PPP 2 schools. Any access requests for hours outside the framework would incur the non-core hour charge to cover the costs to the Council from the PPP 2 partner.
- 2.8 An additional challenge to managing community access has been the implementation of the Council approved phase 1 Facilities Management (FM) review covering janitorial services. This covers all non-PPP secondary schools and has resulted in a new core hour framework from 1 August 2018. In short, the new core hours are Monday to Saturday for 52 weeks of the year. Sundays are now designated as non-core therefore Communities & Families Directorate will be re-charged £45 per hour per school for community access to the CEC secondary school estate on this day.
- 2.9 When the Council managed the sports and non-sports related Community Access to Schools (CATS) budget it was set to deliver a net surplus of £960K a year. This covered income less direct costs but excluded the salary costs of CATS Co-ordinators. When the transfer of management of secondary school sports facilities to Edinburgh Leisure was agreed a saving of £500K was approved through the budget setting process. This saving was approved on the basis there would be additional income generated through increased usage and harmonisation of prices with Edinburgh Leisure rates. To acknowledge the reduced demands on Sport & Lifelong Learning, due to Edinburgh Leisure taking on the management of secondary school sports lets, £250K of this approved saving was applied against the staffing review of the service. The remaining £250K saving was added to the CATS budget increasing the net income target accordingly. The addition of annual inflationary income budget increases has resulted in the current net income target of £1.303m.
- 2.10 The expected net surplus from community access to secondary school sport facilities that is built into the department's budget becomes a budget pressure if this is not achieved. The table below details the income and costs borne by community access to secondary school facilities and how PPP and FM re-charges relate to the global financial context of this project.

2018/19 Budget	
Net surplus target (A)	£1,303K
Forecast Income	
Sports lets (managed by Edinburgh Leisure)	£1,052K
Non-sports lets (managed by CEC)	£370K
Total Income	£1,422K
Forecast Costs	
Leisure attendants, equipment, small maintenance	£536K
Management and booking administration	£288K
PPP and FM re-charges	£350K
Total costs	£1,174K
(Profit)/loss - income minus costs (B)	(£248K)
Budget pressure for Communities and Families Department (A minus B)	£1,055K

- 2.11 To mitigate this pressure income and costs will have to increase/reduce by this amount or savings found elsewhere within the department.
- 2.12 The income generated from sports lets during non-core hours amounts to approximately £180k. The PPP, FM and leisure attendant costs are approximately £400K resulting in a net cost of approximately £220K. This figure does not include utility costs therefore the overall subsidy will be higher.
- 2.13 The budget pressures are a result of the current model of service delivery, agreed between the Council and Edinburgh Leisure, and the associated facilities management challenges that have developed over the life of the project. The proposal to introduce a core / non-core hours model was designed to help mitigate some of these pressures.

3. Main report

Club impact assessment

- 3.1 For the purpose of the impact assessment, Edinburgh Leisure took bookings from a typical week in November 2017 when indoor space was well used. The usage was then multiplied by 40 weeks to give an indication of costs for clubs for term time lets.
- 3.2 The analysis does not include bookings at Wester Hailes Education Centre and is for sports use only.
- 3.3 From the information gathered, high level analysis showed that 11 out of the 22 secondary schools had lets during non-core hours. This covered 72 clubs that had a total of 106 lets each week.
- 3.4 If the £35 per hour non-core charge was implemented then the clubs using CEC schools would incur additional costs of £84,250 over 40 weeks and £214,600 for clubs using PPP schools.
- 3.5 Given that the majority of lets within the school estate are concessionary lets, it is junior clubs that would bear the largest share of these costs. Junior club lets amount to 165 hours per week (6,631 hours over 40 weeks), adult lets 62 hours per week (2,490 hours), student lets 15 hours (620 hours) and commercial lets 25 hours (1,020 hours).
- 3.6 The costs incurred from the non-core hour charges over 40 weeks would be £74,230 for adult clubs, £163,620 for junior clubs, £21,700 for student clubs and £31,512 for commercial clubs.
- 3.7 The mitigation strategy for clubs to avoid these charges was to move as many lets as possible from non-core into core hour slots. Analysis shows that there is capacity in all types of sport spaces within the school estate during core hours

Area	Number of non-core hours used by lets per week	Number of hours per week in core hours with no bookings
Games hall	123	165
Gym hall	26.75	257
Pool	37.5	46
3G	44	45
2G	4	148
Dance studio	34	149

Total	270	810
-------	------------	------------

- 3.8 The above table details the level of capacity available. Lets' using gym halls, 2G pitches and dance studios should be able to move into core hour slots. Whilst capacity exists within pools, 3G pitches and games halls during core hours, it is unlikely that all these lets could move into core hours due to length of time slots, clubs' requirement for particular days and location of schools with capacity.
- 3.9 The impact on clubs, should the non-core hour charge come into effect, is wide ranging. Some clubs and sports will see minimal impact where as some sports (particularly those using indoor spaces) could see large increases in their annual costs should they not be able to move their lets into core hours.
- 3.10 The biggest challenge is for clubs and sports using the school estate on a Sunday. One element of the mitigation strategy was to move non-core hour bookings within the PPP secondary school estate into Council run secondary schools. With the implementation of the phase 1 FM review for janitorial services there is no core hour space available on this day of the week at CEC schools and any use will now incur charges from FM which did not happen prior to the review. There are examples of junior clubs using sports halls for 8 hours on a Sunday and with the introduction of the non-core hour charge, this would result in an increase of 171% in annual costs for that one let. Due to costs for junior lets remaining at 17/18 prices for 18/19 and if junior clubs with lets on Sundays can move other lets they have through the week into core hours (or their lets are already in core hours), this would reduce the overall impact. The cost increase, however, would still be significant.
- 3.11 The table below details the price increase for each type of sport space for adult and junior clubs:

	Adult			Junior		
	18/19 Price (£) – per hour	18/19 Price with non-core charge (£) – per hour	Increase (%)	18/19 Price (£)- per hour	18/19 Price with non-core charge (£) – per hour	Increase (%)
Games Hall	40.3	75.3	86.8	20.6	55.6	169.9
Gym Hall	23.1	58.1	151.5	14.6	49.6	239.7
Pool (25m)	40.8	75.8	85.8	27.2	62.2	128.7

3G (1/3 of pitch)	27.11	62.11	129.1	15.2	50.2	230.3
3G (match – 2hrs)	70	140	100	38	108	184.2
2G (1/3 of pitch)	22.2	57.2	157.7	14.6	49.6	239.7
Dance Studio	24.8	59.8	141.1	14.6	49.6	239.7

3.12 The table below details case studies of club increases should they not be able to move their let into core hours:

Club / Space	Day	No of hours	18/19 price (£)	Including non-core charge (£)	Increase per week (£)	Increase per annum (£)	Increase (%)
Junior swimming	Sunday	2.5	68	155.5	87.5	3500	128.7
Junior gymnastics (games hall)	Sunday	6	123.6	333.6	210	8400	169.9
Junior cheerleading (gym hall)	Sunday	3	43.8	148.8	105	4200	239.7
Junior football match (3G)	Sunday	2	38	108	70	2800	84.2
Junior basketball (games hall)	Tuesday	3	61.8	166.8	105	4200	169.9
Student dance group (dance studio)	Thursday	3.5	51.10	173.6	122.5	4900	239.7

- 3.13 A club consultation exercise was carried out in October 2018 with a survey on the Council's Consultation Hub. The survey was drafted in partnership with ClubSportEdinburgh, Basketball Scotland and Edinburgh Leisure. All current school sport let holders were invited to complete the survey which was also distributed through the above partners' networks. The Council received 125 responses. A consultation event with an invited group of clubs was also organised to discuss the issues in further detail.
- 3.14 From the 125 responses, 2 duplicated responses were received, and 7 clubs completed more than one response. 12 of the responses confirmed they did not use secondary schools for training or matches.
- 3.15 The school used the most from the clubs completing the survey was Portobello High School (29 clubs) followed by Forrester/St Augustine's (24), Broughton (14), Royal High School (10) and Leith Academy (9). All other schools were used by 6 or less clubs.
- 3.16 Football the main sport played by clubs completing the survey (59) followed by netball (9), basketball (8), badminton (7), volleyball (6), rugby (4), swimming (4) and dance (4).
- 3.17 The number of lets clubs had was wide ranging. Clubs from swimming, football and basketball had the most lets with some using school sport spaces up to 15 times each week.
- 3.18 59 clubs were adult, 33 junior and 33 had both adult and junior sections. 40 clubs were for males, 13 for females and 71 were both male and female. Membership size ranged from up to 25 (34 clubs), 26 to 50 (29), 51 to 75 (7) and 76+ (55).
- 3.19 68 of the clubs responding to the survey confirmed that they catered for people with disabilities and/or additional support needs and most clubs had an inclusion policy that covered the following areas:

Attracting those who may not traditionally take part in sport	78 clubs
Breaking down barriers to participation in your sport	79 clubs
Helping those who are inactive to become active	87 clubs

- 3.20 81 clubs confirmed that the introduction of the non-core hour charge would affect them.
- 3.21 Clubs were asked about options they had considered to mitigate the impact of the charges and the responses are detailed in the table below:

Moving non-core hour bookings into core hours at the same school	23
Moving lets to a different school	24
Moving lets to an Edinburgh Leisure sports facility	30
Moving lets to a non-Council sports facility	49

3.22 When asked if clubs would be able to implement any of the above actions 7 clubs said they would, 45 clubs said they would not and 27 clubs were unsure.

Challenges for clubs with moving time and/or location of lets included:

- Availability of space and capacity at alternative locations
- Clubs rooted in local community
- Cost of extra travel distance
- Commitments and clashes with members' commitments to other sports, clubs, and activities
- Fixtures organised by leagues and associations – therefore clubs unable to change

3.23 45 clubs confirmed they had been able to determine the financial and/or non-financial impact of the charges on their organisation and 32 clubs said they had not been able to do this. The increase in costs calculated by clubs were on the whole in-line with increases detailed earlier in this report.

3.24 Clubs were also asked to detail the non-financial impact. Most of feedback focused on membership and growth. Comments included:

- Loss of members due to extra travel distance
- Increase in subs would lead to reduced membership
- Clubs sustainability in question, possibly having to fold
- Growth of clubs, leagues and sport hindered
- Reduction in opportunities for young people
- Impact on health and well-being in SIMD areas

3.25 Clubs were also invited to give additional comments to the proposals. A summary of the responses is detailed below:

- Facility access is already too expensive
- Costs are too prohibitive for most families

- Reduction of pathways within sports
 - Sport should be as cheap as possible for children
- 3.26 A club consultation event was also held on Wednesday 7th November 2018. The top 25 clubs affected by the introduction of the non-core charge were invited to meet with officials from the Council, Edinburgh Leisure, clubspotedinburgh and Basketball Scotland.
- 3.27 9 clubs attended the event and the discussion was led by four questions: 1) What is your club's vision/aspirations for the next 5 years? 2) What is the financial impact on your club if the additional charge is introduced? 3) Is relocation to a different venue to move non-core hour bookings into core hours a realistic option for your club? 4) What is the current demographic of your club and how could these charges impact on individuals?
- 3.28 The responses to the question on the clubs' vision and aspirations have been summarised below:
- Clubs, overall, were keen to expand and grow
 - Growth in girls' sports such as netball
 - Clubs have invested in school facilities to support growth
 - Repopulation of areas within city is increasing demand
 - Shortage of facilities on a Sunday is stifling growth
 - Facility access is stifling growth
- 3.29 On the financial impact on clubs the following points were raised:
- Negative impact on communities
 - Clubs would fold
 - Long term sustainability of clubs is uncertain
 - Clubs would have to look elsewhere for facilities which could include outside of Edinburgh
- 3.30 When discussing the possibility of relocation to an alternative venue issues raised included:
- The amount of time taken to find alternative spaces was a stretch on volunteer resources
 - Concern over loss of membership if members (particularly young people) currently walk to venue and new location would require use of transport
 - Availability, quality, and standard of alternative spaces
 - Leagues were open to using alternative venues

- Some clubs were not focused on a school and would be open to moving
- New clubs could be created in schools to accommodate new players
- Programmes run by clubs are, in some instances, developed for the local community therefore could not be relocated
- Changing historic kick-off times may put people off playing sport

3.31 The final question was on demographics and impact on individuals:

- All clubs had an inclusiveness policy and fees were not means tested
- Most clubs catered for young people and adults
- Strong views that adults would stop playing sport to ensure their children could continue
- Potentially pricing young people from SIMD areas out of sport
- Several clubs supporting PE and Active Schools programmes around the city
- Programmes developed to support older people, target groups and those who would traditionally not take part in sport
- Lack of growth in clubs reducing opportunities for people to play sport

4.1 Measures of success

- 4.1 Increased use of secondary school sports facilities
- 4.2 Address and resolve budget pressure from community access to secondary school sports facilities.
- 4.3 Successful partnership working with Edinburgh Leisure, national governing bodies, ClubSportEdinburgh and sports clubs.

5.1 Financial impact

- 5.1 The project has several financial pressures. These pressures represent the true cost of enabling community access and are not a result of the approach taken to the transfer of secondary school sport facilities to Edinburgh Leisure.
- 5.2 Pressures have arisen from additional saving targets, recharges from the PPP contractors, recharges introduced for CEC schools following the FM review and provision of leisure attendants to enable community access to school sport facilities.
- 5.3 Due diligence undertaken estimates the budget pressure for 2018/19 at £1.05M.
- 5.4 The Council and Edinburgh Leisure are working together to mitigate the identified pressures such as control of PPP 2 costs, price harmonisation and management of opening hours.

- 5.5 Introduction of the core hours' model is estimated to mitigate the financial pressure by approximately £220K through reduced costs where bookings are moved into core hours and/or additional income from users to use facilities in non-core hours.

6. Risk, policy, compliance, and governance impact

- 6.1 The transfer to Edinburgh Leisure of the management of community access to school sports facilities which, while not without risk, does support the Council's existing policies on improving health and well-being through greater participation in physical activity and sport, in line with national priorities and policies.

7.1 Equalities impact

- 7.1 An Integrated Impact Assessment (IIA) will be completed in due course.

8. Sustainability impact

- 8.1 Carbon, climate change adaptation and sustainable development impact assessments have enabled consideration of the public body duties under the Climate Change (Scotland) Act 2009. The findings of these assessments will also help to achieve a sustainable Edinburgh regarding progressing climate change, social justice, and community well-being objectives.

9. Consultation and engagement

- 9.1 Regular meetings have taken place with CEC officers, Club Sport Edinburgh, Basketball Scotland, and Edinburgh Leisure to discuss the completion of the club impact assessment and the club consultation exercise.
- 9.2 A club survey was completed through the Council's Consultation Hub and a meeting with sports club representatives took place.

10. Background reading/external references

- 10.1 [Corporate Policy and Strategy Committee Report 4 October 2016](#)
- 10.2 [Corporate Policy and Strategy Committee Report 14 June 2016](#)
- 10.3 [Education, Children, and Families Committee 24 May 2016](#)
- 10.4 [Corporate Policy and Strategy Committee Report 17 May 2016](#)
- 10.5 [Corporate Policy and Strategy Committee Report 29 September 2015](#)
- 10.6 [Culture and Sport Committee 11 March 2014](#)

10.7 [Education, Children, and Families Committee 15 August 2017](#)

Alistair Gaw

Executive Director for Communities and Families

Contact: David Bruce, Senior Manager Lifelong Learning

E-mail: David.Bruce2@edinburgh.gov.uk | Tel: 0131 469 3795

11. Appendices

None.