

# Development Management Sub Committee

Wednesday 1 August 2018

## Application for Listed Building Consent 18/01357/LBC At 46 Park Road, Edinburgh, EH6 4LD Alterations and extensions to original villa and alterations to entrance gate (as amended)

<b>Item number</b>	4.6(b)
<b>Report number</b>	
<b>Wards</b>	B04 - Forth

### Summary

---

The alterations retain the character of the listed building and comply with non-statutory guidelines on Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas. No other material considerations outweigh this conclusion.

### Links

---

[Policies and guidance for this application](#) NSG, NSLBCA, OTH, CRPNEH,

# Report

## **Application for Listed Building Consent 18/01357/LBC At 46 Park Road, Edinburgh, EH6 4LD Alterations and extensions to original villa and alterations to entrance gate (as amended)**

### **Recommendations**

---

1.1 It is recommended that this application be Granted subject to the details below.

### **Background**

---

#### **2.1 Site description**

The property is a large, detached Victorian villa, located at the end of a cul-de-sac linked to the dog-leg section of Park Road. The property faces south onto a small, privately-owned park, with modern flats on the opposite side of the park. A church standing on much lower ground to the north has been converted to residential use. Ground levels to the west fall dramatically in the engineering work usually called the "Craighall Cut" where 8 metre to 10 metre retaining walls separate the site from Laverockbank Terrace to the west.

The property was in guest house/HMO use for many years and had many alterations and extensions (including fire escapes added to the rear and side). These were recently removed as part of the approved redevelopment as a single large house (see Planning History), which is currently paused on site.

The site as a whole extends to 0.19 hectares. Mature trees line the southern boundary to the park, most notable of which is a very substantial copper beech.

The building was listed category C on 17 October 1996 reference 43721.

This application site is located within the Newhaven Conservation Area.

#### **2.2 Site History**

16 June 2005 - change of use to guest house approved (application number 05/00707/FUL)

14 March 2014 - planning permission and listed building consent granted for reversion to a single house plus restoration and alterations (application numbers 14/00427/FUL and 14/00425/LBC))

19 January 2016 - application for listed building consent approved for redevelopment as a single house (application number 15/05517/LBC)

4 February 2016 - parallel application for planning permission granted (application number 15/05788/FUL)

2 April 2018 - a pair of applications (similar to the current applications) were withdrawn (application numbers 18/00410/FUL and 18/00412/LBC). These differed from the current applications in relation to parking layout, garden division and access arrangement.

A parallel application (application number 18/01355/FUL) has been lodged for planning permission for four residential units.

## **Main report**

---

### **3.1 Description Of The Proposal**

The application proposes the adaptation of a live consent to remodel the existing building as a single house (see History) to instead split the main building from its east and west wings, creating three units in total in the main building.

The west wing is rebuilt in its entirety as a new-build house, attached to the west gable. This is two storey and attic in height, with stone walls and a zinc roof. The central block is restored and extended to the rear with a flat-roofed single storey extension. The east wing is to be restored, other than a small lightweight ground floor extension (replacing the former longer extension).

An additional house to the south (replacing the existing garage) is free-standing and therefore does not need listed building consent and is not assessed in this application.

Alterations to the entrance gates involve a repositioning of the north pier to widen the access and creation of a pedestrian gate. The boundary is listed so these works also need listed building consent.

The amendment included adjustment of the vehicle entrance and adjustment to the roof of Unit 3 to avoid conflict with architectural details on the main villa (Unit 2). Other changes related only to the planning permission elements.

### **3.2 Determining Issues**

In considering whether to grant consent, special regard must be had to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses. For the purposes of this issue, preserve, in relation to the building, means preserve it either in its existing state or subject only to such alterations or extensions as can be carried out without serious detriment to its character.

Do the proposals harm the character or appearance of the conservation area? If they do, there is a strong presumption against granting of permission.

### 3.3 Assessment

To address these determining issues, the Committee needs to consider whether:

- a) the works impact on the character of the listed building;
- b) those works requiring listed building consent have an impact on the character or appearance of the conservation area; and
- c) public comments are addressed;

#### a) Impact on the Listed Building Character

The non-statutory guidelines on Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas consider impact on listed building character.

Works relating to the previous consent have begun, activating that consent. It is noted that all demolition works required for that consent have already been enacted, removing the previous 20th century west wing and removing all fire escape stairs and the 20th century rear extensions. The previously authorised slappings in the rear elevation have also been undertaken.

Whilst the building, in this stripped back condition, is closer to its original form, this does not preclude the rebuilding of those areas already consented, and these authorised changes must be used as a benchmark for assessment of the current application.

In relation to the main house, internal alterations are almost identical to those previously approved and remain uncontroversial. A rear extension is still proposed. However, this is considerably smaller than the extension previously consented. Equally, the alterations to the east wing are more or less identical to the previous consent, including the previously approved rear extension at ground floor.

The west wing represents the principal area of change to the design. Whilst the previously approved scheme is not fully implemented as some of the submitted plans suggest, it is fully authorised and the applicant could complete that scheme without need for further consent. The previous approval for the west wing was for a two storey (and basement) structure, with a flat roof. It was stone built with large areas of glazing, especially to the rear.

The main change in relation to the current proposal is the addition of a pitched roof. The footprint and materials of the lower floors are similar to those already approved.

A pitched roof is more in character with both the existing villa and the broader area. The pitch is proposed in sheet zinc, which is a relatively rare material in this area. The use of zinc in this context is nevertheless acceptable as a contrasting material.

At the entrance gate the existing rendered blockwork panels to each side are rebuilt in natural stone. The north pier is relocated slightly to better improve access and a pedestrian gate is added to avoid conflict between pedestrians and vehicles. The change to the form and design of the entrance is an improvement to the existing character

## b) Impact on the Conservation Area

*Newhaven Conservation Area Character Appraisal identifies the site as being within Zone 2: the Residential Zone*

The appraisal is silent on the villas on Park Road but does include a paragraph on the park: *"The park located off Park Road is a key open space, and dwellings with well maintained front gardens and a variety of boundary treatments assist in creating a varied townscape"*.

Whilst the house (number 4 on plans) to the south does have impact on the conservation area, this does not form part of the current assessment as this element does not require listed building consent. This is considered solely in the parallel application for planning permission.

Works to the main house and its east wing are largely restorative, and notably are less onerous than the live consent. The impact of these elements on the conservation area is acceptable.

The rebuilt west wing gains a pitched roof in relation to the previous consent. The pitched roof is in zinc sheet rather than slate. However, due to the relationship of the building to the remainder of Park Road, this feature will be screened as seen from the south and seen only at a very oblique angle from the east-west section of that road. The extension will be at its most visible from Laverockbank Terrace to the west, which, although separated from the site by Craighall Road (Craighall Cut), is on the same level as the site and not so substantially screened in this view.

Visibility in its own right is not an issue. The remaining issue continues to be the impact on character and appearance of the conservation area in this view. Although the recent demolitions have revealed a long-hidden elevation on the original villa this does not preclude the re-erection of a structure on this side, bearing in mind both the previous building on this side and the live consent for new building on this side. The impact on the conservation area is acceptable in that context.

## c) Public Comments

One letter of support was received from a resident to the north and four objections were received from other neighbours.

### **Material Comments**

- The site lies in the Newhaven Conservation Area - this forms part of the assessment - see section 3.3 b) above.
- The building is a listed building - impact is assessed in 3.3a) above.
- Development would eclipse the original villa- this is assessed in section 3.3a) above.

### **Non-Material Comments**

- This is the third application for the site - there is no limit as to how many applications may be made on any site and this is not part of the assessment.
- House four is unacceptable - this section does not require listed building consent
- Noise and parking concerns - this is assessed in the parallel application for planning permission.
- Loss of trees - this is assessed in the parallel application for planning permission.
- Additional traffic - this is assessed in the parallel application for planning permission.
- Presentation is misleading - whilst some drawings are misleading labelled as "implemented" rather than "consented" this does not materially impact on the understanding of the proposal.

#### d) Equality and Human Rights

The proposal raises no concerns in relation to equality or human rights.

#### Conclusion

The only issue under consideration within this application is the impact of the proposals on the character of the listed building. The character of the listed building is preserved. It is concluded that the proposed works are acceptable and represent an improvement upon those works previously consented.

It is recommended that this application be Granted subject to the details below.

### **3.4 Conditions/reasons/informatives**

#### **Conditions:-**

#### **Informatives**

It should be noted that:

1. The works hereby permitted shall be commenced no later than the expiration of three years from the date of this consent.

### **Financial impact**

---

#### **4.1 The financial impact has been assessed as follows:**

There are no financial implications to the Council.

### **Risk, Policy, compliance and governance impact**

---

**5.1** Provided planning applications are determined in accordance with statutory legislation, the level of risk is low.

## **Equalities impact**

---

### **6.1 The equalities impact has been assessed as follows:**

The application has been assessed and has no impact in terms of equalities or human rights.

## **Sustainability impact**

---

### **7.1 The sustainability impact has been assessed as follows:**

This application meets the sustainability requirements of the Edinburgh Design Guidance.

## **Consultation and engagement**

---

### **8.1 Pre-Application Process**

Pre-application discussions took place on this application.

### **8.2 Publicity summary of representations and Community Council comments**

The application was advertised on 13 April 2018. Five representations were received: one in support, four in objection. These are addressed in section 3.3 d) of the Assessment.

## **Background reading / external references**

---

- To view details of the application go to
- [Planning and Building Standards online services](#)
- [Planning guidelines](#)
- [Conservation Area Character Appraisals](#)
- [Edinburgh Local Development Plan](#)
- [Scottish Planning Policy](#)

**Statutory Development****Plan Provision**

The property lies in the Newhaven Conservation Area.

**Date registered**

28 March 2018

**Drawing numbers/Scheme**

1-5,6a,7-18,19a,20a,23,

Scheme 2

**David R. Leslie**

Chief Planning Officer

PLACE

The City of Edinburgh Council

Contact: Stephen Dickson, Senior Planning Officer

E-mail:stephen.dickson@edinburgh.gov.uk Tel:0131 529 3529

**Links - Policies**

---

**Relevant Policies:****Relevant Non-Statutory Guidelines**

**Non-statutory guidelines** 'LISTED BUILDINGS AND CONSERVATION AREAS' provides guidance on repairing, altering or extending listed buildings and unlisted buildings in conservation areas.

**Other Relevant policy guidance**

The Newhaven Conservation Area Character Appraisal emphasises the importance of the harbour area, the historic alignment and traditional character of the buildings, the prominent views to Fife across the Firth of Forth, and the predominant use of traditional materials.

# Appendix 1

**Application for Listed Building Consent 18/01357/LBC  
At 46 Park Road, Edinburgh, EH6 4LD  
Alterations and extensions to original villa and alterations to  
entrance gate (as amended)**

## Location Plan

---



© Crown Copyright and database right 2014. All rights reserved. Ordnance Survey License number 100023420  
**END**