

Planning Committee

2.00pm, Wednesday, 14 March 2018

Edinburgh Urban Design Panel: Eighth Progress Report

Item number

Report number

Executive/routine

Routine

Wards

All

Council Commitments

[10-15](#)

Executive Summary

The purpose of this report is to summarise the findings from the annual review of the Edinburgh Urban Design Panel's work. A series of recommendations and actions are proposed for Committee's approval.

Edinburgh Urban Design Panel: Eighth Progress Report

1. Recommendations

- 1.1 It is recommended that the Committee:
 - 1.1.1 agrees the recommendations and actions from the annual review of the Edinburgh Urban Design Panel; and
 - 1.1.2 records its appreciation of the voluntary contribution made by Panel members to the design review process.

2. Background

- 2.1 The Edinburgh Urban Design Panel was constituted by the Planning Committee with an agreed remit, function, roles, procedures and principles of conduct. The aim of the Edinburgh Urban Design Panel is to contribute constructive advice which can be used by design teams, planners and developers to develop proposals in a positive way. It also imparts advice on relevant planning policy and guidance. It does this by providing design reviews. For each review, a written report is provided to presenters to the Panel and to planning officials.
- 2.2 The Panel is made up of a range of member organisations including consultees to the Planning process, academics, and professional bodies who each send representatives to its meetings. The Panel is a voluntary body and its members or their organisations are not paid for their contribution.
- 2.3 The Panel was set up by the Council but it is independent of it. It is free to form its own views.
- 2.4 The Panel met for the first time in March 2009. Since then it has carried out 165 individual reviews.
- 2.5 It is part of the Panel's role to undertake a review of its effectiveness each year. Planning Committee requested that an annual review of operation be undertaken. The last progress report was considered by Committee in March 2017. In all cases, Panel members use the annual review exercise to reflect on issues such as the way in which their advice has been applied and to identify any recommendations for change.

3. Main report

3.1 The Panel conducted its 2017 yearly review on 13 December 2017. A report of the meeting is contained in appendix 1.

3.2 The Panel's 2017 yearly review focused on these aspects:

3.2.1 2017 Panel Reviews: Work Programme;

3.2.2 Local Design Panel Forum;

3.2.3 Presenters Feedback; and

3.2.4 Panels Composition

2017 Panel Reviews - Work Programme

3.3 During 2017, the Panel carried out 15 reviews of development proposals within the city. All of these reviews were for developments that have resulted or are expected to result in planning applications. The range of developments that the Panel has covered is similar to those covered in previous years.

3.4 In addition the Panel contributed advice to the review of the Edinburgh Design Guidance.

3.5 Of development types and range reviewed by the Panel, this year represented a broad range of developments across the city and on reflection the Panel agreed that this work programme was representative of the development activity across the city.

3.6 In considering the Panel's future work programme, Panel members requested that they be briefed on policies with respect to the Local Development Plan and assist in the preparation of site briefs.

3.7 Recommendations:

3.7.1 With respect to the selection of future projects for design reviews the Panel concluded that no change is necessary to the range and complexity of development proposals reviewed by the Panel.

3.8 Actions:

3.8.1 Planning officials to provide briefings, on Local Development Plan policies; and

3.8.2 Planning officials to identify opportunities for the Panel to review and assist in the preparation of site briefs.

Local Design Panel Forum

- 3.9 Representatives of the Edinburgh Urban Design Panel met colleagues from other Scottish local authority design review panels at a workshop facilitated by Architecture + Design Scotland (A+DS) in February 2017. The Panel members who attended the forum noted it was very informative and allowed the sharing of practice between other panels in Scotland.
- 3.10 Recommendations:
- 3.10.1 To continue supporting and attending Architecture and Design Scotland local design panel forums.
- 3.11 Actions:
- 3.11.1 Attendees to provide feedback to other panel members.

Presenters Feedback

- 3.12 As part of the 2017 review process, meetings were held with a selection of planning agents who had attended the Panel in the last year. Recurring observations and comments raised at these meetings were discussed with the Panel as part of the review.
- 3.13 General Administration: Generally, it appears that the level of support to the presenting teams is working well and the advice provided at the meeting and through the Panel's written report is considered helpful. The Panel requested that the agenda and planning issues papers are issued as early as possible to assist Panel members preparing for the meeting.
- 3.14 Preparation for the meeting: The presenters suggested that the standard meeting pro forma may benefit from being updated. A more flexible pro forma was suggested to ensure a site specific response. The Panel agreed with this approach and also suggested that this could be supplemented with a standard list of key points which would assist with both the presentation and preparation of the report.
- 3.15 Format of the meeting: The presenters supported the formal format and time allocated for the meeting. However, noted that the review may benefit from the Chair reminding Panel members where, required of the Panel's remit, function, role and procedures during the review. The Panel noted the importance of the planning issues paper to guide a structured discussion on identified topics. The Panel also noted that where possible the planning case officer should attend the meeting.
- 3.16 Panel's Report/Advice: The presenters welcomed the revised format of the meeting report. In taking forward advice the presenters noted the importance of early engagement with the Panel. The Panel are keen to understand how their advice has been taken into account by the developer.
- 3.17 Recommendations:
- 3.17.1 The Panel concluded that no change is necessary.

3.18 Actions:

3.18.1 Planning Officials to review information issue dates of pre meeting papers;

3.18.2 Planning Officials to revise briefing material for presenters;

3.18.3 The Chair, to remind panel members, if required, of the remit, function, role and procedures of the panel;

3.18.4 Council Officials to encourage early engagement with the Panel; and

3.18.5 Council Officials to evidence how the Panel's advice had been taken into account.

Panel Composition

3.19 It was noted that many of the reviews undertaken by the Panel are for housing sites. It was therefore suggested that consideration should be given to inviting a guest panellist, from, for example a housing association, to provide a specialist view on this type of development. The principle of using guest panellists was accepted in last year's Panel review but no opportunity has arisen during the past year.

3.20 Recommendations:

3.20.1 The Panel concluded that no change is necessary.

3.21 Actions

3.21.1 Consideration to be given to inviting a guest panellist.

4. Measures of success

4.1 The Council continues to ensure Edinburgh remains an attractive city through the development of high quality buildings, spaces and places and the delivery of high standards of urban design

5. Financial impact

5.1 There are no direct financial impacts arising from this report.

6. Risk, policy, compliance and governance impact

6.1 The Panel operated in accordance with its remit, function and roles therefore the risk is low.

7. Equalities impact

- 7.1 The Edinburgh Urban Design Panel aims to raise both the quality of the built environment in Edinburgh and the profile of design within the city. It does this through reviewing development proposals at pre-application stage as well as planning policies and guidance that have an urban design impact. Though facilitated by the Council, it is separate from it.
- 7.2 The Panel helps to enhance health and standards of living by supporting the creation of attractive well designed urban environments and places.
- 7.3 The Panel helps productive and valued activities by supporting the economic development of the city by encouraging its physical development. The Panel helps to support rights of the individual and for family and social life by the supporting and creation of good quality places and urban environments. The Panel supports rights of identity, expression and respect by considering all who will be using the built environment.
- 7.4 In relation to advancing equality of opportunity. The Panel supports this by considering all who will be using the built environment. Panel reviews consider many aspects including age, disability and gender with respect to ease of movement and safety. This approach helps to eliminate discrimination, harassment, victimisation and other prohibited conduct. The Panel helps to foster good relations by promoting the integration of new developments within the city.

8. Sustainability impact

- 8.1 The Edinburgh Urban Design Panel aims to raise the quality of the built environment in Edinburgh. This helps make Edinburgh a more sustainable city by creating an environment that can endure.
- 8.2 The proposals in this report will help achieve:
 - 8.2.1 A socially sustainable Edinburgh through the Panels support in providing design advice on new housing developments across Edinburgh;
 - 8.2.2 An economically sustainable Edinburgh through supporting the development of the city; and
 - 8.2.3 An environmentally sustainable Edinburgh because the Panel supports environmental good stewardship.
- 8.3 Although established by the Planning Committee, the Edinburgh Urban Design Panel is independent of the Council, it is free to form its own views. Therefore, it is not bound by the Council's Sustainability Policies.

9. Consultation and engagement

- 9.1 In preparation of this report, the Panel members were consulted.
- 9.2 In relation to the development proposals that the Panel reviews at pre-application stage, the community is consulted via formal community consultation during the Proposal of Application Notice (PAN) period.
- 9.3 In relation to Council policy and guidance that the Panel reviews at draft stage, this is consulted on the community before being finalised.
- 9.4 As part of the Panel's annual review a Presenter's Feedback was carried out.

10. Background reading/external references

- 10.1 The Edinburgh Urban Design Panel's Web Site:www.edinburgh.gov.uk/eudp.

Paul Lawrence

Executive Director of Place

Contact: David Leslie, Service Manager and Chief Planning Officer

E-mail: david.leslie@edinburgh.gov.uk |Tel: 0131 529 3948

11. Appendices

Appendix 1 - Edinburgh Urban Design Panel, 2017 Review Report

EDINBURGH URBAN DESIGN PANEL

2017 Panel Review

REPORT
of meeting held at the
City Chambers on 13
December 2017

List of attendees:

Panel members

David Leslie	Chair – City of Edinburgh Council	Ken Lochrie	EAA
Don McKee	RTPi	Charles Strang	EAA
Harry Smith	Heriot Watt University	Ben Rainger	EAA
Steven Robb	Historic Environment Scotland	Susan Horner	Secretariat – City of Edinburgh Council
Nazan Kocak	Napier University	Ruth White	Secretariat – City of Edinburgh Council
Sam Thomas	Landscape Institute Scotland		

Apologies

Stephen McGill
Sole Garcia Ferrari

Police Scotland
ESALA

Observer

Ding Cong

EAA

Summary

This report summarises the discussion recommendations and actions arising at the Edinburgh Urban Design Panel's Yearly Review of 2017. The Panel has continued to carry out reviews as defined within the remit of the Panel across the city.

1 Introduction

1.1 The Edinburgh Urban Design Panel was constituted by the Council's Planning Committee with a remit, functions, roles, and principles of conduct. The Panel met for the first time in March 2009 to undertake design reviews of major development proposals and planning policies of urban design significance to the City.

1.2 It is part of the Panel's role to undertake a review of its effectiveness each year. Progress reports have been made to Planning Committee yearly since 2010. At its yearly review, the Panel has discussions which result in recommendations being made to Planning Committee.

1.3 The 2017 yearly review which this report summarises concentrated on four aspects:

- 2017 Panel Reviews: Work Programme
- Local Design Panel Forum
- Presenters Feedback
- Panel Composition

2 2017 Panel Reviews: Work Programme

2.1 During 2017, the Panel carried out 15 reviews of development proposals within the city. All of these reviews were for developments that have resulted or are expected to result in planning applications.

The range of developments that the Panel has covered is similar to those covered in previous years. In addition the Panel contributed advice to the review of the Edinburgh Design Guidance.

- 2.2 The Panel reviewed the development types and mix and were of the view that during the year the broad mix of developments was representative of the development activity across the city, including within the World Heritage Site.
- 2.3 With respect to the selection of development proposals for future reviews the Panel considers that developments should continue to be reviewed as part of the pre-application/PAN process. This is considered by the Panel to be the most appropriate time in the design process for the Panel to contribute advice. Also, with respect to the selection of future reviews the Panel will continue to suggest sites for consideration, as previous years.
- 2.4 The Panel welcomed the opportunity to review and assist in the preparation of site briefs at the earliest possible stage for land owned by The City of Edinburgh Council.
- 2.5 The Panel welcomed the opportunity to review guidance and strategies and requested that they be briefed on policies with respect to the Local Development Plan
- 2.6 The Panel requested to be kept informed regarding Architecture and Design Scotland's Design Forum, work programme, with respect to projects within the City.

Recommendations and Actions:

Action: The Panel welcomed the opportunity to review and assist in the preparation of site briefs at the earliest possible stage for land owned by The City of Edinburgh Council.

Action: Planning officials to provide briefings on Local Development Plan policies.

Action: Planning officials to provide updates with respect to Architecture and Design Scotland's Design Form

Actions: With respect to the selection of future projects for design review the Panel concluded that no change is necessary to the range and complexity of development proposals reviewed by the Panel.

3 Local Design Panel Forum

- 3.1 Representatives of the Edinburgh Urban Design Panel met colleagues from other Scottish local authority design review panels at a workshop facilitated by Architecture + Design Scotland (A+DS) in February 2017. The Panel members who attended the forum noted it was very informative and allowed the sharing of practice between panels.

- 3.2 Recommendations and actions:

Recommendation: To continue supporting and attending the Architecture and Design Scotland local design panel forums.

Action: Attendees to provide feedback to other Panel members.

4 Presenters Feedback

As part of the 2017 review process meetings were held with planning agents who had attended the Panel in the last year. The points raised at these meetings were discussed with the Panel as part of the review. The following topics were discussed;

General Administration: Generally, it appears that the level of support to the presenting teams is working well and both the advice provided at the meeting and through the report is considered helpful. The Panel requested that the agenda and planning issues papers are issued as early as possible to assist Panel members preparing for the meeting. The RTPI asked that the meeting papers be sent direct to their representative for the meeting.

Action: Planning Officials to review information issue dates of pre meeting papers.

Preparation for the meeting: The presenters suggested that the standard meeting pro forma may benefit from being updated. A more flexible pro forma was suggested to ensure a site specific response. The Panel agreed with this approach and also suggested that this could be supplemented with a standard list of key points which would assist with both the presentation and preparation of the report.

Action: Planning Officials to revise briefing material for presenters.

Format of the Meeting: The Presenters supported the formal format and time allocated for the meeting. However, noted that the review may benefit from the Chair reminding Panel members if required of the Panel's remit, function, role and procedures during the review. The Panel noted the importance of the planning issues paper to guide a structured discussion on identified topics. The Panel also noted that where possible the case officer should attend the meeting.

Action: The Chair, to remind panel members, if required of the remit, function, role and procedures of the panel.

Panel's Report/Advice: The presenters welcomed the revised format of the meeting report. In taking forward advice the presenters noted the importance of early engagement with the Panel. The Panel are keen to understand how their advice has been taken into account by the developer.

Action: Council Officials to encourage early engagement with the Panel.

Action: Council Officials to evidence how the Panel's advice had been taken into account

5 Panel Composition

5.1 It was noted that many of the reviews undertaken by the Panel are for housing sites. It was therefore suggested that consideration should be given to inviting a guest panellist, from, for example a housing association, to provide a specialist view on this type of development.

5.2 Recommendations and actions:

Action: Consideration to be given to inviting a guest panellist.