

The City of Edinburgh Council

Edinburgh, Thursday 18 and 25 May 2017 (reconvened on 25 May 2017)

Present:- 18 May 2017

LORD PROVOST

The Right Honourable Frank Ross

COUNCILLORS

Robert C Aldridge
Scott Arthur
Gavin Barrie
Eleanor Bird
Chas Booth
Mark A Brown
Graeme Bruce
Steve Burgess
Lezley Marion Cameron
Ian Campbell
Jim Campbell
Kate Campbell
Mary Campbell
Maureen M Child
Nick Cook
Gavin Corbett
Cammy Day
Alison Dickie
Denis C Dixon
Phil Doggart
Marion Donaldson
Karen Doran
Scott Douglas
Catherine Fullerton
Neil Gardiner
Gillian Gloyer
George Gordon
Ashley Graczyk
Joan Griffiths
Ricky Henderson
Derek Howie

Graham J Hutchison
Andrew Johnston
David Key
Callum Laidlaw
Kevin Lang
Lesley Macinnes
Melanie Main
John McLellan
Amy McNeese-Mechan
Adam McVey
Claire Miller
Max Mitchell
Joanna Mowat
Gordon J Munro
Hal Osler
Ian Perry
Susan Rae
Alasdair Rankin
Lewis Ritchie
Cameron Rose
Neil Ross
Jason Rust
Stephanie Smith
Alex Staniforth
Mandy Watt
Susan Webber
Iain Whyte
Donald Wilson
Norman J Work
Louise Young

Present:- 25 May 2017

LORD PROVOST

The Right Honourable Frank Ross

COUNCILLORS

Scott Arthur
Gavin Barrie
Eleanor Bird
Chas Booth
Claire Bridgman
Mark A Brown
Graeme Bruce
Steve Burgess
Lezley Marion Cameron
Ian Campbell
Jim Campbell
Kate Campbell
Mary Campbell
Maureen M Child
Nick Cook
Gavin Corbett
Cammy Day
Alison Dickie
Denis C Dixon
Phil Duggart
Marion Donaldson
Scott Douglas
Catherine Fullerton
Neil Gardiner
Gillian Gloyer
George Gordon
Ashley Graczyk
Joan Griffiths
Ricky Henderson
Derek Howie

Andrew Johnston
David Key
Callum Laidlaw
Kevin Lang
Lesley Macinnes
Melanie Main
John McLellan
Amy McNeese-Mechan
Adam McVey
Claire Miller
Max Mitchell
Joanna Mowat
Gordon J Munro
Hal Osler
Ian Perry
Susan Rae
Alasdair Rankin
Lewis Ritchie
Cameron Rose
Neil Ross
Jason Rust
Stephanie Smith
Alex Staniforth
Mandy Watt
Susan Webber
Iain Whyte
Donald Wilson
Norman J Work
Louise Young

1. Chair

In accordance with Section 4(4) of the Local Government etc (Scotland) Act 1994, Andrew Kerr, Returning Officer, presided at the meeting until the election of the Lord Provost.

2. Roll of Council

The Roll of Council showing the Councillors for the various wards of the City of Edinburgh was submitted as follows:

Ward	Name	Ward	Name
1 Almond	Graham J Hutchison	10 Morningside	Nick Cook
	Kevin R Lang		Melanie Main
	Norrie Work		Neil J Ross
	Louise A L Young		Mandy Watt
2 Pentland Hills	Graeme J Bruce	11 City Centre	Karen Doran
	Neil T Gardiner		Claire H I Miller
	Ricky Henderson		Joanna Mowat
	Susan J Webber		Alasdair C M Rankin
3 Drum Brae/Gyle	Robert C Aldridge	12 Leith Walk	Marion Donaldson
	Claire E Bridgman		Amy McNeese-Mechan
	Mark A Brown		Susan J Rae
4 Forth	Eleanor M Bird	13 Leith	John L Ritchie
	James B Campbell		Chas Booth
	Cameron B Day		Adam R McVey
5 Inverleith	George A Gordon	14 Craigentiny/ Duddingston	Gordon J Munro
	Gavin K Barrie		Ian D Campbell
	Max Mitchell		Joan Griffiths
	Harriet E G Osler		John C McLellan
6 Corstorphine/ Murrayfield	Iain Whyte	15 Southside Newington	Alexander Staniforth
	William Scott Douglas		Steve Burgess
	Gillian E Gloyer		Alison M Dickie
7 Sighthill/Gorgie	Frank Ross	16 Liberton/Gilmerton	Ian Perry
	Denis C Dixon		Cameron Rose
	Catherine Fullerton		Lezley M Cameron
	Ashley Graczyk		Derek H Howie
8 Colinton/ Fairmilehead	Donald C Wilson	17 Portobello/ Craigmillar	Lesley J Macinnes
	Scott Arthur		Stephanie J H Smith
	Philip A Daggart		Kate Campbell
9 Fountainbridge/ Craiglockhart	Jason Rust		Mary Campbell
	Gavin Corbett		Maureen M Child
	Andrew Johnston		Callum Laidlaw
	David Key		

3. Election of Lord Provost

The Council was invited to elect a Lord Provost.

Motion

To appoint Councillor Frank Ross as Lord Provost.

- moved by Councillor McVey, seconded by Councillor Macinnes

Amendment 1

To appoint Councillor Lezley Marion Cameron as Lord Provost.

- moved by Councillor Rose, seconded by Councillor Gloyer

Amendment 2

To appoint Councillor Aldridge as Lord Provost.

- moved by Councillor Lang, seconded by Councillor Whyte

With the agreement of the mover and seconder, Amendment 1 was withdrawn.

Voting

The requisite number of members having so required in terms of Standing Order 22.1, the vote was taken by calling the roll.

The voting was as follows:

For the Motion, to appoint Councillor Ross

Councillor Barrie, Councillor Bird, Councillor Booth, Councillor Burgess, Councillor Ian Campbell, Councillor Kate Campbell, Councillor Mary Campbell, Councillor Corbett, Councillor Dickie, Councillor Dixon, Councillor Fullerton, Councillor Gardiner, Councillor Gordon, Councillor Howie, Councillor Key, Councillor Macinnes, Councillor Main, Councillor McNeese-Mechan, Councillor McVey, Councillor Miller, Councillor Rae, Councillor Rankin, Councillor Ritchie, Councillor Frank Ross, Councillor Staniforth and Councillor Work - 26 votes

For the Amendment to appoint Councillor Aldridge

Councillor Aldridge, Councillor Brown, Councillor Bruce, Councillor Jim Campbell, Councillor Nick Cook, Councillor Doggart, Councillor Douglas, Councillor Gloyer, Councillor Graczyk, Councillor Hutchison, Councillor Johnston, Councillor Laidlaw, Councillor Lang, Councillor McLellan, Councillor Mitchell, Councillor Mowat, Councillor Osler, Councillor Rose, Councillor Neil Ross, Councillor Rust, Councillor Smith, Councillor Webber, Councillor Whyte and Councillor Young – 24 votes

Abstentions

Councillor Arthur, Councillor Cameron, Councillor Child, Councillor Day, Councillor Donaldson, Councillor Doran, Councillor Griffiths, Councillor Henderson, Councillor Munro, Councillor Perry, Councillor Watt and Councillor Wilson

Decision

To approve the motion by Councillor McVey to appoint Councillor Frank Ross as Lord Provost.

4. Motion by Councillor Booth – Air Quality

The Lord Provost ruled in terms of Standing Order 27(1), that this item, which included a recommendation which, if accepted, would require a change to a decision taken by the Transport and Environment Committee on 17 January 2017 (item 4), should be considered due to a material change in circumstances.

The following motion by Councillor Booth was submitted in terms of Standing Order 16:

“Council:

- 1) Notes that in the last air quality update, presented to Transport and Environment Committee on 17 January 2017, that the annual mean nitrogen dioxide objective was exceeded at 26 monitoring locations across the city in 2015;
- 2) Notes that Scottish air quality objectives for PM10 were exceeded at Salamander Street, and Scottish air quality objectives for PM2.5 were estimated to have been exceeded at four sites across the city;
- 3) Notes and welcomes the downward trend in most pollutants but believes that faster progress could and should be made in delivering cleaner air for Edinburgh;
- 4) Notes that four out of five parties represented on the council have made public commitments to introduce a low emission zone (LEZ) in the city in order to tackle poor air quality;
- 5) Notes that the Scottish Government aims to have a single Low Emission Zone in place in Scotland by 2018, is currently seeking a local authority to take the lead on this, and that some Scottish Government funding may be available from the Scottish Government for the first Scottish LEZ only, therefore notes that this is a matter of urgency;
- 6) Therefore agrees that the Council should be prepared to take the lead in progressing a Low Emission Zone for Edinburgh, and calls for additional funding for the Zone to be identified from partners such as the Scottish Government;

- 7) Agrees that the Council Chief Executive will urgently write to the Scottish Government offering to work towards establishing Scotland's first Low Emission Zone in Edinburgh, with the expectation that the Scottish Government can make a significant contribution towards the cost of establishing the Zone, and offering early talks to discuss the practical details of bringing this about."

Motion

To approve the motion.

- moved by Councillor Booth, seconded by Councillor Mary Campbell

Amendment

To take no action on the motion.

- moved by Councillor Nick Cook, seconded by Councillor Mowat

Voting

For the motion - 44 votes

For the amendment - 18 votes

Decision

To approve the motion by Councillor Booth

5. Adjournment

Decision

To adjourn this meeting in terms of Standing Order 17 and continue the remaining business of the meeting to an adjourned meeting of the Council to take place on 25 May 2017.

6. Resumption

The Lord Provost reconvened the meeting adjourned from 18 May on 25 May 2017.

7. Manchester Arena Tragedy

The Lord Provost paid tribute to those involved in the Manchester arena tragedy on 22 May 2017.

The Council observed a minute's silence in their memory.

8. Suspension of Standing Orders

In order to allow consideration to be given to limited appointments at the first (adjourned) meeting, Council unanimously agreed to suspend Standing Order 1 (First meeting of Council after an election).

9. Election of Depute Convener

The Council was invited to elect a Depute Convener.

Decision

To continue consideration of the matter.

10. Appointment of Members to Committees, Boards and Joint Boards (including Senior Councillor Allowances)

The Council was invited to appoint members to Committees of the Council and to Joint Committees and Joint Boards in accordance with Standing Order 3. The Council was also invited to appoint the Convener and Vice-Convener of the Corporate Policy and Strategy Committee (known as the Leader and Depute Leader of the Council).

Motion

(A) Political Management Arrangements

Council regrets that in the three weeks since the election of the Council it remains Leaderless and without a governance structure in place preventing decisions and scrutiny from taking place and that this is an affront to the people of Edinburgh.

Council therefore agrees that since any further delay would be damaging, and when it seems apparent that previous solutions such as a coalition do not appear to be forthcoming, that an Executive Committee of 13 members of Council be formed in strict proportion to the votes achieved by each party (4 SNP members, 4 Conservative members, 2 Labour members 2 Green members and 1 Liberal Democrat member). This Executive Committee would replace the Corporate Policy and Strategy Committee and act as a Council Cabinet.

Delegates all powers of Council not reserved to full Council to said Committee until such time as a full new governance scheme comes forward at the June Council meeting.

In the interim, until fully worked up governance arrangements can be brought forward to the Council Meeting on June 29th, this Committee will meet fortnightly in public, be webcast and decisions will be taken by a simple majority.

The Leader, Depute Leader and Senior Councillors responsible for service areas will be selected from the Council Executive Committee. Appointments to the Committee and Senior Councillor roles will be made using the d'Hondt system – this should take place after an adjournment of this meeting for sufficient time for groups to meet to discuss their nominations but should be no longer than 24 hours.

Council further instructs the Chief Executive to bring forward a report to the June meeting to fully review its current political management arrangements which will comprise four scrutiny committees to ensure that decisions taken by the Executive Committee deliver good value and that officers are rigorously held to account for delivery of services.

The same report should also address the Council's commitment to working in localities by the creation of four Locality Committees. Consultation on the draft Locality Committee proposals should take place over the summer months, with the outcome reported to the Council meeting in September. To ensure effective political governance of the Locality arrangements and drive their development these should ensure effective delivery of services and best value in the four localities.

The political management arrangements should also be accompanied by all the necessary governance documentation.

(B) Appointments

Council recognises its duty to determine individual applications within statutory timescales, and therefore agrees now to appoint members to the following:

- Licensing Board
- Integration Joint Board
- Development Management Sub-Committee
- Licensing Sub-Committee
- Planning Local Review Body (3 Panels)
- Social Work Complaints Review Committee

Council agrees the appointments, detailed in Appendix 1 to this minute, subject to completion of any mandatory training. All other appointments to Committees etc. are to be deferred to the 29 June 2017 Council meeting.

(C) Baillies

Council agrees to appoint five Baillies to support the civic role of the Lord Provost, one from each of the parties represented on the Council, as detailed in Appendix 1 to this minute.

- moved by Councillor Whyte, seconded by Councillor Mowat

Amendment

(A) Political Management Arrangements

Council recognises the need to review the current political management arrangements and structure of committees to improve the Council's decision making processes and ensure it is effectively addressing the challenges and opportunities facing the city.

Council requests that the Chief Executive consults with all the party groupings and brings forward proposals for reform for consideration at the June Council meeting. The Chief Executive is asked to explore with the Lord Provost the possibility of convening the June Council meeting earlier in the month.

The redesign should be based on a streamlined Executive Committee model. The Executive Committees should be based on the political balance of the Council. The political management arrangements should also be accompanied by all the necessary governance documentation.

The same report should also address the Council's commitment to working in localities by the creation of four Locality Committees. Consultation on the draft Locality Committee proposals should take place over the summer months, with the outcome reported to the Council meeting in September.

(B) Appointments

Council recognises its duty to determine individual applications within statutory timescales, and therefore agrees now to appoint members to the following on an interim basis pending the outcome of the review. Should they meet prior to the new structure being agreed, a Chair will be elected from the membership:

- Licensing Board
- Integration Joint Board
- Development Management Sub-Committee
- Licensing Sub-Committee
- Planning Local Review Body (3 Panels)
- Social Work Complaints Review Committee

Council agrees the appointments, detailed in Appendix 1 to this minute, subject to completion of any mandatory training. All other appointments to Committees etc are to be deferred to the June 2017 Council meeting.

(C) Baillies

Council agrees to appoint five Baillies to support the civic role of the Lord Provost, one from each of the parties represented on the Council as detailed in Appendix 1 to this minute.

(D) Interim Leadership Arrangements

Council notes that the Chief Executive would seek political guidance from all Group Leaders when taking decisions under urgency until a Council Administration is formed.

- moved by Councillor Day, seconded by Councillor Burgess

Voting

The voting was as follows:

For the motion	-	17 votes
For the amendment	-	43 votes

Decision

To approve the amendment by Councillor Day.

(During consideration of the above item, Councillor Jim Campbell, seconded by Councillor Mitchell moved that the meeting be adjourned until 2pm to allow Groups to consider the proposals which had been submitted.

In the voting, the motion to adjourn received 17 votes for and 43 votes against.)

(Reference – report by the Chief Executive, submitted)

11. Appointments to Outside Organisations

The Council was invited to appoint/nominate representatives to the various organisations, companies, outside bodies and joint working groups on which it was represented.

Decision

- 1) To agree the appointments to Council companies and COSLA as detailed in Appendix 2 to this minute.
- 2) To continue consideration of all other appointments to outside organisations and the appointment of champions to the full Council meeting in June 2017 and that all the appointments be subject to review at the June meeting.

(Reference – report by the Chief Executive, submitted)

12. Council Diary 2016/17 and 2017/18

The Council was asked to approve a provisional 2017/18 diary, on the basis that a more detailed version would be submitted once the Council had determined any changes to its political management arrangements and appointments were made.

Decision

- 1) To note that its meetings diary for 2016/17 ran until end-August. In view of the intended review of committee structure, to agree to cancel all remaining meetings agreed in the 2016/17 diary, except as follows:
 - Full Council
 - Licensing Board
 - Integration Joint Board
 - Development Management Sub-Committee (other than 7 June 2017 meeting moving to 14 June 2017)
 - Licensing Sub-Committee
 - Planning Local Review Body (3 Panels) (except for 14 June 2017)
- 2) To note that a full 2017/18 meetings diary would be submitted as soon as practicable after any new political management arrangements were agreed.

(Reference – report by the Chief Executive, submitted)

13. Emergency Motion by the Lord Provost - Condolences for Manchester

The Lord Provost ruled that the following item, notice of which had been given at the start of the meeting, be considered as a matter of urgency to allow the Council to give early consideration to this matter.

The following motion by the Lord Provost was submitted in terms of Standing Order 16:

“This Council expresses its deep shock and sorrow at the horrific terrorist attack in Manchester in which school children and young people were tragically involved.

Council notes the heroic actions of the emergency services in the immediate aftermath of the attack and admires the way in the Mancunian community has pulled together in the ensuing days.

Council further notes that the City of Edinburgh has paid its respects by lowering the flags on the City Chambers to half-mast and that a letter of condolence has been sent to the Mayor for Greater Manchester.

Council agrees to stand ready to provide support as may be requested by the City of Manchester in the aftermath of these terrible events.”

Decision

To approve the motion by the Lord Provost.

APPENDIX 1

(As referred to in Act of Council No 10 of 18 May 2017)

APPOINTMENTS 2017/18

MEMBERSHIP OF COMMITTEES AND JOINT BOARDS (in part)

Development Management Sub-Committee

15 members – 5 SNP; 4 Conservative; 3 Labour; 2 Green; 1 SLD.

Councillor Dixon	Councillor Mowat
Councillor Ian Campbell	Councillor Child
Councillor Kate Campbell	Councillor Griffiths
Councillor Gordon	Councillor Perry
Councillor Ritchie	Councillor Booth
Councillor Grazcyk	Councillor Staniforth
Councillor McLellan	Councillor Osler
Councillor Mitchell	

Planning Local Review Body

Three panels as follows (will require to be appointed members of the Planning Committee or equivalent):

Panel 1 (5 members)

Councillor Gordon	Councillor Perry
Councillor Mitchell	Councillor Staniforth
Councillor Mowat	

Panel 2 (5 members)

Councillor Ian Campbell	Councillor Child
Councillor Dixon	Councillor Booth
Councillor Graczyk	

Panel 3 (5 members)

Councillor Kate Campbell	Councillor Griffiths
Councillor Ritchie	Councillor Osler
Councillor McLellan	

Licensing Sub-Committee – 9 members – 3 SNP; 2 Conservative; 2 Labour; 1 Green; 1 SLD

Councillor Barrie
Councillor Dixon
Councillor Fullerton
Councillor Rose
Councillor Smith

Councillor Donaldson
Councillor Doran
Councillor Burgess
Councillor Neil Ross

Licensing Board – up to 10 members – 3 SNP; 3 Conservative; 2 Labour; 1 Green; 1 SLD

Councillor Fullerton
Councillor Key
Councillor Work
Councillor Jim Campbell
Councillor Cook

Councillor Laidlaw
Councillor Cameron
Councillor Day
Councillor Mary Campbell
Councillor Gloyer

Integration Joint Board – 5 elected members – 2 SNP, 1 Conservative, 1 Labour, 1 Green

Councillor Howie
Councillor Rankin
Councillor Webber

Councillor Henderson
Councillor Miller

Social Work Complaint Review Committee - 3 persons drawn from current panel, including all Councillors who are not members of the committees responsible for adult and children and young people social work services:

Baillies – 5 elected members (one from each political Group)

Councillor Work
Councillor Rust
Councillor Cameron
Councillor Staniforth
Councillor Aldridge

APPENDIX 2

(As referred to in Act of Council No 11 of 18 May 2017)

APPOINTMENTS TO ORGANISATIONS, COMPANIES, OUTSIDE BODIES, WORKING GROUPS, ETC 2017 - 2022

Category 1b – Companies and other organisations owned or controlled by the Council and Council joint venture companies

	Organisation	Form	Description	Appointments made for 2017/22	Lead Directorate(s)	Comment
1.	Essential Edinburgh-Business Improvement District (BID) Company Boards	Registered company	To promote collaborative and productive relationships between city centre businesses and the public sector, through the BID framework.	Councillor Barrie	Place	On a division (see note 1 below)
2.	Business Loans Scotland Ltd	Registered company	A pan-Scotland local authority business loan fund.	Councillor Barrie	Place	
3.	Capital City Partnership Ltd	Registered company	The delivery body for the city's employability strategy and programme.	Councillor Barrie Councillor Munro Councillor Whyte	Place	

	Organisation	Form	Description	Appointments made for 2017/22	Lead Directorate(s)	Comment
4.	CEC Holdings Limited	Registered company	Holding company with a portfolio of operational companies, namely, EDI Group, EICC Ltd, New Edinburgh Ltd, Waterfront Edinburgh Limited, Shawfair Land Limited and PARC Ltd with the original purpose of ensuring tax efficiency across the operational company's portfolio and enable appropriate monitoring and control.	Directors: Lord Provost Councillor Munro Councillor Rose	Resources	

	Organisation	Form	Description	Appointments made for 2017/22	Lead Directorate(s)	Comment
5.	EDI Ltd (including EDI Central Ltd, EDI Market Street Ltd, EDI Fountainbridge Ltd, PARC Craigmillar Ltd, PARC Craigmillar Developments LTD, Shawfair Land Ltd, Waterfront Edinburgh Ltd, Waterfront Edinburgh Management Ltd)	Registered company	Private company, owned by the Council and run as an arms-length operation. Main Council owned vehicle for property development and undertakes regeneration projects. It is redeveloping Craigmillar through PARC Limited	7 Directors (1 Executive, 6 Non-Executive) Councillor Barrie Councillor Munro Councillor Whyte 3 External through recruitment	Resources	
6.	Edinburgh International Conference Centre Limited	Registered company	Owned by the Council and operates as an independent commercial venture which provides venues for conferences, conventions and exhibitions and acts as agent for development of Exchange district on behalf of the Council.	Directors: Councillor Munro Councillor Rankin Councillor Smith	Resources and Place	On a division (see note 2 below)

	Organisation	Form	Description	Appointments made for 2017/22	Lead Directorate(s)	Comment
7.	Edinburgh Leisure	Registered company	A not-for-profit company to run the Council's sport and leisure services.	Councillor Bruce Councillor Kate Campbell Councillor Doran Councillor Staniforth	Communities and Families	On a division (see note 3 below)
8.	Edinburgh Leisure Two	Registered company	A trading company of Edinburgh Leisure.	Councillor Bruce Councillor Kate Campbell Councillor Doran Councillor Staniforth	Communities and Families	On a division (see note 4 below)
9.	Energy for Edinburgh – Interim Board	Registered company	The Council's arms-length energy services company.	Councillor Booth Councillor Child Councillor McVey	Place	
10.	Festival City Theatres Trust - Directors	Registered company	A registered charity which is responsible for the operation and management of the Festival and King's Theatres.	Councillor Doran Councillor McNeese-Mechan Councillor Main Councillor Mitchell	Place	On a division (see note 5 below)
11.	LPFE Ltd	Registered company	A trading company of the Lothian Pension Fund.	Councillor Rankin	Resources	
12.	Marketing Edinburgh - Director	Registered company	A public/private body set up to lead and facilitate the promotion of Edinburgh.	Lord Provost Councillor Mowat Councillor Munro	Place	

	Organisation	Form	Description	Appointments made for 2017/22	Lead Directorate(s)	Comment
13.	PARC Craigmillar (Promoting and Regenerating Craigmillar)	Registered company	PARC is a joint venture between EDI Ltd and the City of Edinburgh Council which is spearheading the regeneration of Craigmillar.	See EDI Group membership	Resources	
14.	Transport for Edinburgh Ltd – Board	Registered company	Manages the city's public transport operations to ensure integrated transport across Edinburgh.	Councillor Booth Councillor Day Councillor Laidlaw Councillor McVey	Place	On a division (see note 6 below)

COSLA

Organisation	Description	Council Appointments for 2017/22	Lead Directorate(s)	Comment
COSLA	The representative voice of Scottish local government, lobbying on behalf of Scotland's 32 councils.	Councillor Burgess Councillor Day Councillor Macinnes Councillor McVey Councillor Rose Councillor Whyte	Chief Executive	On a division (see note 7 below)

Nominations to Outside Bodies

Notes:

Nominations on behalf of the SNP were submitted by Councillor Ritchie.

Nominations on behalf of the Conservative Group were submitted by Councillor Mowat.

Nominations on behalf of the Labour Group were moved by Councillor Day.

Nominations on behalf of the Green Group were moved by Councillor Burgess

Nominations on behalf of the SLD Group were moved by Councillor Lang.

Voting

1) Essential Edinburgh – Business Improvement District (BID) Company Boards (1 place)

Councillor Barrie	-	20 votes
Councillor McLellan	-	17 votes

2) Edinburgh International Conference Centre (3 places)

Councillor Rankin	-	19 votes
Councillor Smith	-	17 votes
Councillor Munro	-	11 votes
Councillor Aldridge	-	6 votes

3) Edinburgh Leisure (4 places)

Councillor Kate Campbell	-	19 votes
Councillor Bruce	-	17 votes
Councillor Doran	-	10 votes
Councillor Staniforth	-	8 votes
Councillor Osler	-	5 votes

4) Edinburgh Leisure Two (4 places)

Councillor Kate Campbell	-	19 votes
Councillor Bruce	-	17 votes
Councillor Doran	-	10 votes
Councillor Staniforth	-	8 votes
Councillor Osler	-	5 votes

5) Festival City Theatres Trust (4 places)

Councillor McNeese-Mechan	-	19 votes
Councillor Mitchell	-	17 votes
Councillor Doran	-	10 votes
Councillor Main	-	8 votes
Councillor Gloyer	-	5 votes

6) Transport for Edinburgh Ltd - Board (4 places)

Councillor McVey	-	19 votes
Councillor Laidlaw	-	17 votes
Councillor Day	-	10 votes
Councillor Booth	-	8 votes
Councillor Gloyer	-	5 votes

7) COSLA (6 places)

Councillor Macinnes	-	19 votes
Councillor McVey	-	19 votes
Councillor Rose	-	17 votes
Councillor Whyte	-	17 votes
Councillor Day	-	10 votes
Councillor Burgess	-	8 votes
Councillor Aldridge	-	5 votes