

Edinburgh and the Lothians Structure Plan 2015: Annual Housing Monitor 2005**Summary**

- Since the base date of the structure plan, there has been an average build rate in Edinburgh and the Lothians of 4,300 houses per annum (Table 6). Although this is below the target of 5,000 houses per annum, it was always expected that the build rate would be low during the early part of the plan period (para 10).
- To take account of the shortfall, the average five year land supply target must be recalculated for each council area. The five year supply target for the structure plan area as a whole has now been revised from 25,100 to 26,600 (Table 9; para 17).
- The five year effective housing land supply for the structure plan area is above the re-calculated target. Midlothian is the only council area with a shortfall in effective land, but even though this shortfall is over 10%, there is no requirement under HOU 10 to take action as the land supply for the ELSP2015 area as a whole is adequate (Table 10; para 19).
- 73% of the housing land in the base supply which was programmed for 2001 to 2005, has been developed (Table 11).
- Completions to date on windfall sites have been above the assumed 1,000 dwellings per year. Due to the lead in time associated with new housing development, it was anticipated that the number of completions on windfall sites would be lower than the assumed average for the first few years of the plan (para 29).
- The number of units approved on windfall sites since 2001 averages at over 2,500 per year. This would suggest that the assumption of 1,000 units per annum of windfall development may have been a significant under-estimation. The approvals out-with Edinburgh is already considerably above the total expected for the whole plan period (Table 15; paras 32, 33).
- 13% of completions since 2001 have been affordable houses. This equates to around 550 dwellings per year. The effective land supply includes land for a similar number of affordable completions over the next 5 years (Table 21).

Context

Population projections

1. The General Register Office for Scotland (GRO(S)) produces regular projections of population for local authority and health board areas. The latest projections use 2002 as the base year and project forward to 2018. These projections are trend based and assume that factors that influence demographic change remain stable and do not reflect changes in the local and national economies nor strategic and local planning policy. The projections for Edinburgh and the Lothians are summarised in Tables 1 and 2 below.

Table 1: 2002 based population projections for Edinburgh and the Lothians

	Total Population			Change due to	
	2000	2015	Change	Migration	Natural
City Of Edinburgh	448,400	459,700	11,200	11,000	300
East Lothian	89,900	99,100	9,200	10,600	-1,400
Midlothian	81,100	84,700	3,600	3,000	600
West Lothian	157,100	179,200	22,200	15,800	6,400
Lothians	776,500	822,700	46,200	40,300	5,800

2. When the Edinburgh and Lothians Structure Plan was prepared, GRO(S) had not produced population projections which took account of the results of the 2001 Census. The Census showed that the population of the structure plan area had been significantly overestimated and the latest projections are somewhat lower than figures available at the time. The 2002 based population projection to 2015 is some 10,000 people lower than the 2000 based figure (see Table 2).

Table 2: Population projections for Edinburgh and the Lothians by life-style age group

	Total	0-4	5-11	12-15	16-24	25-44	45-64	65-84	85+
2000	776,500	44,020	64,371	36,616	95,036	244,961	177,099	101,148	13,249
2005	788,023	40,157	60,981	37,258	99,656	242,359	190,110	103,794	13,708
2010	804,567	39,809	56,633	34,990	102,572	240,624	207,462	106,550	15,927
2015	822,657	40,841	55,117	32,097	100,400	240,800	216,768	118,679	17,955
<i>2000 based</i>	832,115	43,196	57,443	32,228	102,640	243,545	224,315	113,179	15,569
Change	46,157	-3,179	-9,254	-4,519	5,364	-4,161	39,669	17,531	4,706
%	5.9	-7.2	-14.4	-12.3	5.6	-1.7	22.4	17.3	35.5

Source: GRO(S) 2002 based population projections

Household Projections

3. The Scottish Executive Development Department publishes household projections which are based upon GRO(S) population projections, household formation rates and other factors. These projections were used in assessing the housing land requirement for the ELSP2015. The structure plan housing requirement was based upon the 1998 based household projections. Whilst these were not the latest set of projections, 2000 based figures being available at the time, early results from the 2001 Census showed that the population estimates and consequently population projections for the plan area had been significantly overestimated. As the household projections are heavily based upon the population projections, the housing requirement was based upon the earlier figures as they would be less affected by the problems identified by the Census.
4. The 2002 based projections are the first figures to be produced which take account of the 2001 Census results. The projections for Edinburgh and the Lothians are detailed in table 3 below.

Table 3: Household projections for Edinburgh and the Lothians

	Number of Households					Change 1991 - 2015		Change 2000 - 2015	
	1991	2000	2005	2010	2015	Absolute	%	Absolute	%
City of Edinburgh	190,800	207,390	212,600	223,080	233,930	43,130	23	26,540	13
East Lothian	34,500	37,890	39,880	42,140	44,740	10,240	30	6,850	18
Midlothian	29,800	32,100	33,790	35,280	36,940	7,140	24	4,840	15
West Lothian	55,600	64,550	69,170	74,590	80,400	24,800	45	15,850	25
Lothians	310,700	341,930	355,440	375,090	396,010	85,310	27	54,080	16
<i>1998 based figures</i>	<i>311,900</i>	<i>340,400</i>	<i>361,400</i>	<i>383,400</i>	<i>406,100</i>	<i>94,200</i>	<i>30</i>	<i>65,700</i>	<i>19</i>

Source: SEDD 2002 based Household Projections

5. The projection to 2015 is considerably lower than the 1998 based figures with over 10,000 fewer additional households being predicted over the period from 2000.

The Plan Requirement

6. The forecast of housing need in the ELSP2015 is based upon Scottish Executive projections of the increase in the number of households in the area. Account was taken of expected changes to the non effective stock (second and vacant homes) and changes to actual stock in terms of demolitions and conversions. Table 4 below shows how the total housing need for the structure plan period was calculated.

Table 4. Housing Needs Assessment 1991 - 2015

	1991	2015	Net change
Projected households	311,900	406,100	94,200
Add allowance for vacancies	16,600	21,600	5,000
Add allowance for second homes, business & holiday homes	1,100	1,100	0
Add allowance for demolitions		6,400	6,400
Additional housing need 1991-2015			105,600
Add allowance for Scottish Borders mobile demand			300
Less completions 1991-2001			35,700
Additional housing need 2001-2015			70,200
Housing need per annum 2001-2015			5,000

Source: ELSP2015 supporting statement Table 2.4

Meeting the Plan Requirement

7. The ELSP2015 set out a number of sources of housing land to meet the requirement of 70,200 new dwellings, the majority of which would come from land already identified through the planning system:
- The effective base land supply from Housing Land Audit 2001
 - Output from constrained sites in Audit 2001 that become effective;
 - Sites already identified through local plans but not yet audited as effective;
 - Windfall sites;
 - New allocations in the plan.
8. In addition to the above sources of housing land, the plan acknowledged that there were several major brown field opportunities known to the planning authorities but which did not yet have planning consent

and did not appear in a local plan. These proposals, which include Edinburgh Waterfront sites and sites emerging from the Education Public-Private Partnership programme in Edinburgh, have been known to planning authorities for some time and are not considered as windfall sites, though they are considered as contributing to meeting the overall housing requirement.

9. The combined output from existing housing sites and windfall development over the plan period was anticipated to be 57,800 dwellings, leaving a requirement to allocate an additional 12,400 units. Table 5 below details the anticipated source of housing land by council area. Because of the possibility that the new allocations and other sources of housing land identified in the plan may not be fully developed by 2015, it was considered necessary to provide some flexibility. The plan proposed that land be allocated for 18,200 houses. In relation to the total plan requirement, this represents an additional margin of 8%.

Table 5 Sources of Housing Land by Council Area (excluding new allocations)

	Base Supply	Constrained Sites	Emerging Local Plans	Windfall	Total
City of Edinburgh	7,200	1,000	10,800	12,000	31,000
East Lothian	4,900	100	0	700	5,700
Midlothian	7,600	100	1,800	300	9,800
West Lothian	9,400	900	0	1,000	11,300
Ed. & Lothians	29,100	2,100	12,600	14,000	57,800

Source: ELSP2015 Table 3.2

Housing Completions 2001 - 2005

10. The structure plan requires an average completion rate of 5,000 units per annum to 2015. Between 2001 and 2005, the average completion rate has been 4,300 dwellings. It was always anticipated that completions in the early part of the plan period would be below the required average as it would take time for local plans allocating new housing sites to be prepared and adopted. Table 6 below details housing completions by council area.

Table 6: Housing completions 2001 - 2005

	Total comps. over the plan period	Actual completions					Total	Average per annum
		2001/02	2002/03	2003/04	2004/05			
Edinburgh	33,900	2,535	2,561	2,415	2,597	10,108	2,527	
East Lothian	9,000	576	511	225	435	1,747	437	
Midlothian	11,200	111	150	165	137	563	141	
West Lothian	16,100	1,281	925	1,158	1,288	4,652	1,163	
Edin. & Lothians	70,200	4,503	4,147	3,963	4,457	17,070	4,268	

Source: Edinburgh and the Lothians Housing Land Audits 2001 - 2005

11. The average completion rates in Edinburgh and West Lothian have been slightly above the rate required to achieve all of the required completions by 2015, despite there being no output from the large strategic housing allocations. The rate of completions in Midlothian has been low during the early part of the plan period. A significant proportion of the Midlothian supply is dependent on strategic allocations identified through the local plans. Both of Midlothian's local plans only became effective upon adoption in late 2003 triggering site release and the preparation of development briefs followed. Housing development in Midlothian is currently constrained by water/sewerage capacity problems and the completion rate is expected to increase significantly in the near future. Drainage capacity is currently a constraint in Dunbar, East Lothian. Planning permission was granted in 2005 for a new wastewater treatment works to serve the town. Drainage capacity is also a concern in the west sector of East Lothian, Midlothian and Eastern Edinburgh with a study underway to establish the extent of any problem.

12. Policy HOU10 of the ELSP 2015 says that 'the Lothian Councils will maintain an effective five year land supply for Edinburgh and the Lothians as a whole by supporting the development of housing land consistent with the strategy, including its requirements for essential infrastructure.' Table 3.2 of the plan sets out the average 5 year land supply expected of each council. For the whole structure plan area, the average five year land supply to meet the plan requirement is 25,100 units. At 31 March 2005, the effective five year housing land supply for the structure plan area was 23,100 units - an average of 4,600 units per year. The land supply is highest for year 3 of the five year period with expected completions of around 5,500 units. New windfall sites, however, will increase the actual number of completions in later years. Table 7 below shows the breakdown of the effective land supply by council area.

Table 7: Effective housing land supply March 2005

	2005/06	2006/07	2007/08	2008/09	2009/10	Total
Edinburgh	2,386	2,396	2,969	2,439	2,076	12,266
East Lothian	410	745	638	504	371	2,668
Midlothian	214	429	754	997	1,016	3,410
West Lothian	972	1,155	1,145	811	687	4,770
Edin. & Lothians	3,982	4,725	5,506	4,751	4,150	23,114

Source: Housing Land Audit 2005

13. East Lothian Council published the Finalised East Lothian Local Plan 2005 in August 2005. This allocates sufficient housing land to meet the strategic requirements set out in the Edinburgh & the Lothians Structure Plan 2015 in addition to a limited number of local sites in and adjacent to towns and villages in the Council area. Neither of these sources has been included in the East Lothian portion of the Lothian Housing Land Audit 2005. [Output from strategic sites together with consents since April 2005 are expected to contribute approximately 1800 units in the 5 year period, and are included in Table 8. -
14. In addition to the Audit sites (to March 2005) the land supply in Midlothian comprises consents granted up to December 2005 - 346 units (not included in Table 4), supplemented by expected completions resulting from the social housing programme and implementation of the ELSP2015 requirements in Midlothian. The latter of these involves new strategic housing allocations across the two Core Development Areas amounting to 2,270 houses identified in the Preferred Development Strategy recently subject to consultation. The Finalised Midlothian Local Plan is likely to go on deposit in spring 2006 and will supplement the effective land supply with yields from 2009/10 (185 units). These combined sources are programmed in Table 8
15. The Finalised West Lothian Local Plan 2005, post Structure Plan approval, proposes new local plan sites, including those identified as a consequence of the Council's Open Space Strategy and sites identified within the west of West Lothian, which together with sites granted consent since April 2005 have a total capacity for around 2,000 units. The programme for these sites will yield around 150 units per annum from year 06/07 onwards. Furthermore, West Lothian's new strategic housing allocations within the Core Development Areas, accounting for an anticipated 12,000 units, have not yet been included in the Housing Land Audit 2005. Once taken into account, these sources will have a significant bearing on the housing land supply for West Lothian.
16. Table 8, below summarises housing land brought forward into the effective housing land supply since the audit date of March 2005. This includes consents granted since 31 March 2001 and expected completions on strategic allocations and other sites subject to a council programme of release.

Table 8: Additions to the effective housing land supply

	2005/06	2006/07	2007/08	2008/09	2009/10	2005 - 2010
Edinburgh	0	0	0	0	0	0
East Lothian	0	104	395	632	685	1816
Midlothian	0	86	286	286	473	1,131
West Lothian	0	0	150	560	804	1,514
Edin. & the Lothians	0	190	831	1,478	1,962	4,461

Assessment of the future 5 year land supply target

17. The plan acknowledges that the actual number of completions (Table 6) is unlikely to exactly match the anticipated annual target and requires that as part of the monitoring process, the future five-year land supply target be recalculated for each council area. It is not necessary to re-evaluate the plan period housing needs assessment, as set out in table 1 above, but as the completion rate over the early part of plan period has been slightly lower than the required average, a new target is required which takes into account this shortfall.

Table 9 (19): Meeting the plan requirement by council area

	Total comps. Over plan period	% of plan total	Completions 2001 - 2005	Completions Required 2005 - 2015	Average 5 year land supply
City of Edinburgh	33,900	48	10,108	23,792	11,896
East Lothian	9,000	13	1,747	7,253	3,627
Midlothian	11,200	16	563	10,637	5,319
West Lothian	16,100	23	4,652	11,448	5,724
Edinburgh and the Lothians	70,200		17,070	53,130	26,565

Source: Housing Land Audits 2001 - 2005

18. Under policy HOU10, should a council's contribution to the effective five-year supply fall below 90% of its expected contribution AND the shortfall in the Lothian-wide housing land supply also be more than 10%, that council must bring forward additional land. The expected contribution of each council should now be considered as the recalculated targets as set out in table 9 above, rather than the original targets in table 3.2 of the Structure Plan. Table 10 below compares each councils effective land supply to the updated land supply targets.

Table 10 (20): Five year land supply

	Land supply target	Five Year land supply*	% of target
City of Edinburgh	11,896	12,266	103
East Lothian	3,627	4,484	124
Midlothian	5,319	4,541	85
West Lothian	5,724	6,284	110
Edinburgh and the Lothians	26,565	27,575	104

Source: Tables 7 & 8

19. Taking into account the effective land supply from housing land audit 2005 and additions to the effective land supply identified in table 8 above, Table 10 demonstrates that the total effective land supply for the

structure plan area is more than sufficient to meet the re-calculated land supply target in full. Although the effective land supply target for Midlothian is below 90% of its expected contribution, there is no requirement under HOU10 to take action at this stage as the supply for the plan area as a whole is adequate.

- 20.** As the effective land supply fully meets the 5 year land supply target, there is no need to take account of the contribution that will be made by future windfall sites. However paragraph 3.26 of the ELSP2015 and policy HOU10 specifies that annual monitoring will include an assessment of likely windfall contributions. As detailed in para 29, windfall development across the whole of the structure plan area has been well above the 1,000 units per annum anticipated in the plan. However, as the strategic allocations move into the effective supply, the level of windfall development may diminish as a proportion of the total land supply. As development over the next 2 years will mainly occur on sites within the current effective supply, it is assumed that new windfall development on sites not yet consented may be restricted to 60% of the anticipated five year average of 5,000 units, yielding a total of 3,000 units over the 5 year period. This will supplement the five year land supply identified in Table 10, demonstrating that the target will be further exceeded.

Summary of the Land Supply Components

The 'base-supply'

21. The base housing land supply for the plan is comprised of the sites within housing land audit 2001, excluding the schedule of constrained sites. Whilst the majority of these sites were programmed for the first 5 years, some anticipated development in the longer term. In total, the base land supply was expected to account for 29,100 of the 70,200 units required, 15,500 being programmed for completion by 2005. To date, across the whole plan area, 11,372 units from the base land supply have been completed. This represents 39% of the total base land supply and 73% of the land supply programmed for development by 2005. Table 11 below shows completions on land from the 2001 base land supply by council area.

Table 11 : Housing completions on sites making up the base supply

	base land supply	Prog. to 2005	Actual Completions				Total	% prog
			2001/02	2002/03	2003/04	2004/05		
Edinburgh	7,191	6,455	2,353	1,912	1,125	772	6,162	95
East Lothian	4,964	3,450	524	335	66	290	1,215	35
Midlothian	7,583	1,353	85	98	125	70	378	28
West Lothian	9,389	4,283	1,281	817	618	901	3,617	84
Edin. & Lothians	29,127	15,541	4,243	3,162	1,934	2,033	11,372	73

Source: Housing Land Audits 2001 - 2005

22. Development in Edinburgh has been closest to the 2001 programme with 95% of the anticipated completions taking place. The number of completions in West Lothian was also very close to the amount programmed at 85% but East Lothian and Midlothian have experience far fewer completions on base supply sites than expected.

23. Of the 27,300 units in the effective 5 year land supply, over a third are sites which formed part of the base land supply. For Edinburgh, where a large proportion of the base supply sites have already been completed, the proportion is much lower at 8%. Around half of the effective land supply in East, Mid and West Lothian comes from the base land supply. The base land supply in East and Midlothian is made up to a large extent by the large strategic housing allocations (H7 sites in the Lothian Structure Plan 1994) so completion rates are being suppressed until these sites fully come on stream.

Constrained in the base supply

24. In calculating the housing requirement for the structure plan, an assumption was made that 30% of sites that were agreed as constrained as at 31 March 2001 would be developed over the plan period. In total, the anticipated number of completions on such sites was 2,100 units. Between 2001 and 2005 there has actually been 286 completions or 14% of the expected total. In considering the sites as constrained, early development was obviously not anticipated. Table 12 below shows the breakdown by council area of completions on sites which were considered constrained in 2001.

Table 12: Completions on sites which were constrained in the base land supply

	Anticipated comps to 2015	Actual Completions				Total	% prog
		2001/02	2002/03	2003/04	2004/05		
Edinburgh	1,000	8	62	25	113	208	20.8
East Lothian	100	0	0	0	3	3	3.0
Midlothian	100	0	0	0	0	0	0
West Lothian	900	0	0	61	14	75	8.3
Edin. & Lothians	2,100	8	62	86	130	286	13.6

Source: Housing Land Audits 2001 - 2005

25. Edinburgh is the council area where the highest proportion of constrained units have been brought forward and developed, with over 20% of the expected completions having already taken place. Proportionally, the figures are much lower for the other council areas.
26. Whilst 286 completions have already occurred on previously constrained sites, others have also now become effective and are programmed for development over the next 5 years. Over the whole of the structure plan area, 1,204 units from sites which were classified as constrained in 2001 are programmed for completion by 2010. 834 of these dwellings are in Edinburgh, 349 in West Lothian and 21 are in Midlothian.

Emerging local plan sites

27. The ELSP2015 planned for 12,600 dwellings to be built on emerging local plan sites derived from the previous structure plan but which were not included in the 2001 housing land audit. 10,800 of these completions would be in Edinburgh with the remaining 1,800 in Midlothian. To date, none of the Midlothian sites have yielded completions and there has been 584 completions on the Edinburgh sites. At the time of the 2001 audit, these sites had not gained planning consent, so were not expected to be developed over the early part of the plan period.
28. Emerging local plan sites account for 24% of the effective land supply across the plan area with 4,680 units programmed in Edinburgh and 860 in Midlothian. Of the 12,600 units to be completed on emerging local plan sites, nearly half are now complete or are in the effective 5 year housing land supply.

Windfall sites

29. In calculating the amount of new housing land to be allocated in order to meet the plan requirement, the ELSP2015 assumed that windfall development would account for 14,000 dwellings over the plan period - an average of 1,000 units per year. Windfall is the unplanned element of the housing land supply, i.e. sites which are not allocated in local plans and do not form part of the base land supply. Windfall sites are those sites, therefore, that come naturally through the planning system, and in this case will have been granted planning consent after 31 March 2001. There is obviously some lead in time between a site gaining planning consent and the delivery of the first completions. Consequently, it was expected that the amount of windfall development in the first few years of the plan would be well below the 1,000 per year average. However, the total number of windfall units built over the four years since 2001 has been over 4,000 units, with over 1,500 per year since 2003. Table 13 below details the windfall development by council area.
30. The plan anticipated that the vast majority of windfall developments would occur within the City of Edinburgh. The table above demonstrates that windfall development out with Edinburgh has been much higher than expected with over 75% of the planned total occurring within the first 4 years.

Table 13: Housing completions on 'windfall sites'

	Anticipated comps.	Actual Completions				Total
		2001/02	2002/03	2003/04	2004/05	
Edinburgh	12,000	68	420	976	1,025	2,489
East Lothian	700	52	176	159	142	529
Midlothian	300	22	34	33	31	120
West Lothian	1,000	0	108	479	373	960
Edin. & Lothians	14,000	120	704	1,635	1,571	4,098

Source: Housing Land Audits 2001 - 2005

31. There are currently a further 5,100 units on windfall sites, programmed for development over the next five years. 3,650 of these units are in Edinburgh, 1,100 in West Lothian, 160 in Midlothian and 160 in East Lothian. Windfall sites account for nearly 20% of the effective land supply. The programmed development

of windfall sites over the next three years is well above the target of 1,000 units per annum. The programming of windfall sites for years 4 and 5 is much lower, as the sites that are already part of the land supply would by then be complete. New sites will come through the planning system raising the actual number of completions above that programmed in the 2005 housing land audit. Table 14 below shows the programming of windfall sites which form part of the current effective housing land supply.

Table 14: Windfall sites in the effective housing land supply

	2005/06	2006/07	2007/08	2008/09	2009/10	Total	Total effective land supply	% Total supply
Edinburgh	1,091	1,281	859	304	116	3,651	12,266	30
East Lothian	41	69	54	0	0	164	2,668	6
Midlothian	57	39	31	30	0	157	3,410	5
West Lothian	270	390	238	105	97	1,100	4,770	23
Edin. & Lothians	1,459	1,779	1,182	439	213	5,072	23,114	22

Source: Housing Land Audit 2005

32. Over the four years between 1 April 2001 and 31 March 2005, planning consent has been granted for a further 10,400 houses on windfall sites. This is an average of 2,600 units per year but the yearly figures ranged from 1,900 units in 2001/02 to 3,200 in 2002/03. Table 15 below shows the distribution of these consents across the structure plan area.
33. Edinburgh accounted for 65% of new windfall sites with the remainder being split between West Lothian, East Lothian and Midlothian as 27%, 5% and 3% respectively. The structure plan anticipated that 85% of windfall sites would be in Edinburgh, but in terms of planning consents granted, the other council areas have accounted for much more than expected. Midlothian and West Lothian have, over the first 4 years of the plan, granted consent for more houses on windfall sites than was expected over the entire plan period. Whilst some of the sites that have been given consent may not eventually be developed for housing, the completions to date and the number of consents granted, are strong indicators that windfall development in Edinburgh and the Lothians is occurring at a much greater rate than anticipated by the plan.

Table 15: Planning consents on windfall sites

	2001/02	2002/03	2003/04	2004/05	2001 - 2005	% Total
Edinburgh	1225	2518	1589	1397	6729	65
East Lothian	114	95	202	129	540	5
Midlothian	87	52	20	124	283	3
West Lothian	525	550	1241	516	2832	27
Edin. & Lothians	1891	3233	3101	2232	10384	

Source: Housing Land Audits 2001 - 2005

Strategic housing allocations

34. Having considered the sources of housing land already identified through the planning system and making an allowance for expected development on windfall sites, the ELSP2015 arrived at a need for an additional 12,400 units. In acknowledgement that some of the land already identified may not be fully developed by 2015, it was considered necessary to provide some flexibility. The structure plan therefore required the allocation of additional land for 18,200 houses. The locations of these allocations is set out in Schedule 3.1 of the Edinburgh and Lothian Structure Plan 2015. As these allocations would require the adoption of new local plans, it was expected that completions would occur much later in the plan period. To date there have been no completions from this source of housing land, though the current established housing land supply does include the 1,000 units allocated in the Rural West Edinburgh local plan for Newbridge/Kirkliston/Ratho. Only 240 of these units are classified as effective and programmed within the

5 year period. Progress on strategic housing allocations in East Lothian, Midlothian and West Lothian is set out in paras 13-15.

Other housing land

35. The housing requirement calculation is based upon the sources of housing land set out above. There are however, other sources of housing land which do not fall into these categories. Paragraph 3.13 of the ELSP2015 acknowledges that there are several major brown field development opportunities which are known to planning authorities but which do not have consent and do not appear in adopted local plans. These sites include Edinburgh Waterfront and the Education PPP sites in Edinburgh. In addition, there have been completions on land which is identified in earlier adopted local plans but which is not included as part of the base land supply. These other sources of housing land, mainly within City of Edinburgh, have accounted for 746 completions between 2001 and 2005. Development of these sites is likely to accelerate and there are over 1,500 units programmed within the effective land supply over the next 5 years in Edinburgh and 170 in East Lothian. These additional sites account for 13% of the effective land supply in Edinburgh and 7% of the structure plan area total. Table 16 below details the effective land supply made up by these other sources of housing land.

Table 16. Effective land supply: other sources of housing land

	2005/06	2006/07	2007/08	2008/09	2009/10	Total
Edinburgh	254	206	266	390	428	1,544
East Lothian	22	35	32	55	29	173
Midlothian	0	0	0	0	0	0
West Lothian	0	0	0	0	0	0
Edin. & Lothians	276	241	298	445	457	1,717

Housing contribution by structure plan source

36. Table 17 below summarises all completions according to the source of housing land as defined in ELSP2015 and Table 18 details the effective land supply in a similar manner, but including the additional housing land contribution from Table 8.

Table 17: Housing completions by structure plan source

	2001/02	2002/03	2003/04	2004/05	Total
Total	4503	4147	3963	4457	17070
Base supply	4257	3195	1939	2033	11424
Constrained in base supply	8	62	86	130	286
Emerging LP sites	0	0	193	391	584
Strategic Housing Allocations	0	0	0	0	0
Windfall	120	704	1635	1571	4030
Other sources of housing land	118	186	110	332	746

Source: Housing Land Audits 2001 - 2005

Table 18: The 5 year effective housing land supply by structure plan source, 2005

	2005/06	2006/07	2007/08	2008/09	2009/10	Total	% total
Total	3,982	4,915	6,337	6,229	6,112	27,575	
Base supply	1,501	1,828	1,989	1,808	1,527	8,653	31
Constrained in base supply	78	157	308	325	336	1,204	4
Emerging LP site	515	555	1,482	1,533	1,487	5,572	20
Strategic Housing Allocations	20	30	118	70	0	238	1
Windfall	1,459	1,779	1,182	439	213	5,072	18
Other sources of housing land	276	241	298	445	457	1,717	6
<i>Small Sites</i>	133	135	129	131	130	658	2
Additions to the land supply since 31/03/05	0	190	831	1,478	1,962	4,461	16

Source: Housing Land Audit 2005 & Table 8

37. Small sites are sites with 4 or less units and are audited differently to larger sites. To speed up the consultation process, small sites are not considered individually. Rather, all small sites with planning consent are aggregated and it is assumed that 75% of them will be developed. As the sites are not considered individually, it is not possible to assess their structure plan land supply source.

Completions by land use

38. Policy HOU2 of the ELSP2015 states that 'The Lothian Councils support the development of suitable urban brown field sites for housing through re-use, redevelopment or conversion.' Policy HOU 8 states 'There will be a presumption against new housing development on green field sites other than to meet policy HOU1 and HOU3 requirements.'

39. Between 2001 and 2004, 72% of housing completions occurred on brown field sites, although some of these will be out with settlement envelopes. Table 19 below shows the year by year assessment of brown field development by council area.

Table 19 : Housing completions on brown field sites.

	2001/02		2002/03		2003/04		2004/05		Total	
	All Comps	% BF	All Comps	% BF	All Comps	% BF	All Comps	% BF	All Comps	% BF
Edinburgh	2,535	94	2,561	89	2,415	93	2,597	94	10,108	93
East Lothian	576	45	511	64	225	40	435	31	1,747	47
Midlothian	111	87	150	61	165	66	137	41	563	63
West Lothian	1,281	21	925	29	1,158	43	1,288	54	4,652	37
Edin. & Lothians	4,503	67	4,147	72	3,963	75	4,457	75	17,070	72

Source: Housing Land Audits 2001 - 2005

40. As may be expected, Edinburgh has the highest proportion of development on brown field sites at 93%. West Lothian has the lowest level of brown field development at 37% of the total followed by East Lothian at 47%.

41. The effective housing land supply in Edinburgh is also made up of mainly brown field sites accounting for 88% of the total. The pattern of programmed development, is however, different to past completions for the other council areas. 47% of completions in East Lothian since 2001 have been on brown field sites, though

such sites only account for 15% of the effective land supply. In West Lothian, 60% of programmed development is on brown field sites. For Midlothian, 20% of the effective land supply is on brownfield sites compared to over 60% of recent completions. Table 20 below details the effective land supply by land use for the structure plan area.

Table 20 : Effective land supply by land use 2005

	Total	Greenfield	%	Brownfield	%	Small sites	%
Edinburgh	12,266	1,112	9	10,782	88	372	3
East Lothian	2,668	2,196	82	395	15	77	3
Midlothian	3,410	2,632	77	699	21	79	2
West Lothian	4,770	1,761	37	2,879	60	130	3
Edin. & Lothians	23,114	7,701	33	14,755	64	658	3

Source: Housing Land Audit 2005

Affordable Housing

42. Government policy requires structure plans to identify any shortfall in the provision of affordable housing. Prior to adoption of the ELSP2015, the individual Lothian authorities carried out housing needs assessments for their areas and identified affordable housing requirements and delivery mechanisms. The ELSP2015 stated that due to the changing nature of local needs, affordable housing provision would be dealt with through local plans an/or supplementary guidance.
43. City of Edinburgh Council adopted an affordable housing policy in October 2002. According to this policy, in allocating sites or considering other housing proposals for a number of dwellings equal to or in excess of the set thresholds, the Council would seek the provision of a proportion of affordable units. This proportion varies across the city according to local housing need.
44. East Lothian Council adopted an affordable housing policy as supplementary planning guidance in December 2003. This sets varying percentage requirements (10-22%) based on the six sub areas identified in the Council 2001 Housing Needs Assessment with Blindwells at 30% contribution and applies to sites of five or more units that meet criteria set out in the policy. The policy was amended in June 2005 to take account of advice contained in PAN74. The policy is currently under review in light of the new Lothian HNA 2005 and a commitment in the original policy to review within two years of its adoption. The Finalised East Lothian Local Plan 2005 incorporates an affordable housing policy (Policy H5) that applies to all sites of five or more housing units and an additional policy (Policy H6) that applies to additional affordable housing provision on strategic sites.
45. Midlothian Council adopted affordable housing policies in the context of the Shawfair and Midlothian Local Plans, in September and December 2003 respectively. The former requires the provision of approximately 20% social housing within the allocated housing areas; the latter requires provision in the range 5-10% affordable and special needs housing on allocated sites and also on non-allocated sites of 50 units or more. The Council has completed consultation on a new affordable housing policy to be incorporated into the replacement Midlothian Local Plan (whole of Midlothian) which seeks to increase the requirement to 25% of total site capacity for all allocated and windfall sites.
46. West Lothian Council's Affordable Housing Policy was approved as supplementary planning guidance in March 2005. The policy requires land capable of delivering 15% of the capacity of a site to be transferred to a Registered Social Landlord or other social housing provider, for the provision of affordable housing. The 15% requirement is fixed across the whole district with the exception of developments within core development areas, where an additional 10% requirement is applied.
47. In 2005, a housing needs assessment was carried out which covered the whole of the structure plan area on a consistent basis. The aim of the study 'was to provide a greater understanding of the wider Edinburgh housing market and to inform the further development of the Lothian authorities' local housing strategies, and the development of affordable housing and local planning policies. In particular, the study was intended to provide:
 - an assessment of present and future housing needs and demand for the Lothian area.

- an assessment of house type, size and tenure imbalances Lothian and the sub-areas.'

48. The study revealed that:

- 31% of Lothian households have at least one of the eight housing need indicators used in the study, the key driver of need being affordability - almost one in ten households live in a property that is not currently affordable.
- 16% of households have a need which would require them to move home (or 3 separate needs which would not individually require a move).
- There is currently a backlog of households in need, including concealed households of 12,900.
- Including the backlog, there will be between 46,200 and 47,800 households in need over the next 5 years. Just over 30,700 lets will become available over that period (excluding new build) leaving a shortfall in the region of 15,500 to 17,100 affordable houses.

49. When the structure plan is reviewed and a new housing requirement target is calculated, the backlog of households in need should be considered as additional dwellings to the demographic need obtained from household forecasts. The means of delivering the affordable housing should be addressed through the local plan process or through supplementary planning guidance.

50. Since 2001, there have been 2,200 affordable houses built in the structure plan area. This represents 13% of all housing completions. 77% of all affordable houses were built in Edinburgh with East Lothian accounting for 14% of the total, 8% in West Lothian and 1% in Midlothian. Table 21 below shows the number of affordable housing completions by local authority.

Table 21: Affordable housing completions

	2001/02	2002/03	2003/04	2004/05	Total	% All completions
Edinburgh	670	413	290	326	1,699	17
East Lothian	92	40	48	124	304	17
Midlothian	0	12	14	0	26	5
West Lothian	61	0	18	103	182	4
Edin. & Lothians	823	465	370	553	2211	13

Source: Housing Land Audits 2001 - 2005

51. The effective housing land supply in the Lothians includes land for 2,000 affordable units. Again, nearly 64% of these units are within Edinburgh. There are a further 4,100 affordable dwellings within the established land supply but, programmed for completion beyond 2010. Many of these units are on the large strategic sites which are being developed in the longer term, including the Waterfront area of Edinburgh and the South East Wedge. Table 22 below details the amount of affordable housing within the effective and established housing land supply.

52. The adoption of the affordable housing policy in Edinburgh requires that housing developments of over a certain threshold, depending on where they are within the city, must include a proportion of affordable units. The actual number of affordable houses built should therefore be above the number in the effective land supply as windfall development will include a proportion of affordable units.

Table 22: Affordable housing in the effective land supply

	2005/06	2006/07	2007/08	2008/09	2009/10	2005 - 2010	Post 2010
Edinburgh	209	177	322	303	278	1,289	2,585
East Lothian	12	139	123	63	19	356	649
Midlothian	17	27	59	111	90	304	869
West Lothian	24	35	15	0	0	74	0
Edin. & Lothians	262	378	519	477	387	2,023	4,103

Source: Housing Land Audit 2005