

Development Management Sub Committee

Wednesday 19 April 2017

**Application for Listed Building Consent 16/05983/LBC
At 19 Dublin Street, Edinburgh, EH1 3PG
Internal alterations to lower three storeys of existing B listed townhouse (former office use) to form 3 new dwellings, one on each floor. Alterations include new slappings, removal of unsympathetic lower ground and ground floor rear extensions (as amended).**

Item number	4.5(b)
Report number	
Wards	A11 - City Centre

Summary

The amended proposals comply with the development plan and non statutory guidelines and do not adversely affect the special character and historic interest of the listed building or the character and appearance of the conservation area. There are no material considerations which outweigh this conclusion.

Links

<u>Policies and guidance for this application</u>	LDPP, LEN04, LEN06, LDES12, NSG, NSLBCA, OTH, CRPNEW,
---	---

Report

**Application for Listed Building Consent 16/05983/LBC
At 19 Dublin Street, Edinburgh, EH1 3PG
Internal alterations to lower three storeys of existing B listed townhouse (former office use) to form 3 new dwellings, one on each floor. Alterations include new slappings, removal of unsympathetic lower ground and ground floor rear extensions (as amended).**

Recommendations

1.1 It is recommended that this application be Granted subject to the details below.

Background

2.1 Site description

The application site relates to the basement, ground and first floors of a 3-storey, basement and attic terrace tenement. The application property is accessed from the main entrance door onto Dublin Street. The upper flat (19A) has a separate side entrance from Dublin Street Lane South.

The townhouse occupies a prominent corner site at the junction of Dublin Street and Dublin Street Lane South. There is a stone/brick extension on the rear elevation of the townhouse which is linked internally to the property at basement and ground floor levels. A small open area of car parking lies to the rear and is within the same ownership as the application site.

The property is currently vacant and was last in use as offices. Neighbouring properties are a mix of mainly residential with some office uses. Dublin Street Lane South is characterised by several mews properties on both the north and south sides of the lane.

The property was designed by Thomas Bonnar between 1824 and 1825 and is category B listed, listed 24 May 1966, LB Ref 28682.

The site is within the World Heritage Site.

This application site is located within the New Town Conservation Area.

2.2 Site History

March 2017 - associated application for planning permission under consideration for alteration and conversion of lower three storeys of existing B listed townhouse to form 3 new dwellings. Partial alteration and doughtaking to stone stores to rear. Formation of new extension to the rear at lower ground and ground floor levels (as amended) (application number 16/05981/FUL).

Main report

3.1 Description Of The Proposal

The application is for the conversion of the vacant commercial property to form three residential flats. The application also proposes the partial removal of the external stone/brick stores to the rear and the erection of a new extension to the rear of the townhouse at lower ground and raised ground floor level.

The proposed mews dwelling to the rear of the site on Dublin Street Lane South has been deleted from the scheme.

The accommodation will provide one flat per floor and will comprise the following units:

- Basement level - Three bedroom unit with small enclosed terrace area;
- Raised Ground floor - Two bedroom unit; and
- First floor - Two bedroom unit.

External alterations

The scheme has been amended, deleting the whole removal of the later stone/brick structure to the rear. The amended scheme proposes the partial removal of the structure and its replacement with a new extension for the new residential units. The footprint of the new extension will be the same as the existing (3.6m in width and 5.6m in depth). The height of the new extension will be slightly lower (150 mm) and also narrower at its apex than the existing structure. Materials will be random rubble stone for the north and south elevations, making use of any stone from the original structure which will be partially removed. New openings from the 2 no. flats at lower ground floor and ground floor levels will form links into the extension.

The proposed terraces for the flats at raised ground floor and first floor level have been deleted. The terrace for the lower ground floor flat will be retained as part of the amended scheme. This terrace is screened from the neighbouring property by a 2 m boundary wall.

The remaining stone/brick structure to the rear of the townhouse is unaffected and does not form part of this application. This will be retained in its entirety. The east facing elevation of this will be re-rendered with an oatmeal render finish.

External alterations are also proposed to the front elevation at basement level, swapping the door and window position by removing the existing sash window and replacing this with a solid timber door and replacing the door with a new sash window.

Internal alterations to form three flats have been amended and are proposed as follows:

- install kitchen base units on the rear wall of the principal front room at ground floor level;
- erect new screen within main vestibule at ground floor level;
- retain the original stair between the lower ground and basement levels;
- retain nibs either side of the new openings from the lower ground floor and ground floor flat into the new extension;
- install slimline double-glazing in the existing window frames with 6mm cavity; and
- plans also show clearer annotations, with all fireplaces shown in situ and kitchen layout confirmed.

Scheme 1

The original application proposed a mews dwelling to the rear of the site on Dublin Street Lane South. This element has been deleted from the application.

The application also proposed the whole demolition of the large stone/brick built store to the rear of the townhouse and the erection of a 3 storey extension (basement, ground and first floors). A roof terrace was proposed for the upper flats at raised ground floor and first floor levels respectively within the rear extension. The application also proposed large downtakings to the rear elevation of the townhouse at basement level.

Internal alterations proposed the removal of the internal staircase between the basement and ground floor levels. Large downtakings on the rear elevation of the townhouse at lower ground and ground floor levels were also proposed.

Supporting Statement

The agent has provided a further supporting statement as part of the submission documents for the amended scheme. This document and an amended Schedule of Works are available to view on the Planning and Building Standards On-line Services.

3.2 Determining Issues

In considering whether to grant consent, special regard must be had to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses. For the purposes of this issue, preserve, in relation to the building, means preserve it either in its existing state or subject only to such alterations or extensions as can be carried out without serious detriment to its character.

Do the proposals harm the character or appearance of the conservation area? If they do, there is a strong presumption against granting of permission.

3.3 Assessment

To address these determining issues, the Committee needs to consider whether:

- a) the proposals have an adverse impact on the special architectural or historic interest of the listed building or the character and appearance of the conservation area,
- b) any impacts on equalities or human rights are acceptable, and
- c) comments have been addressed.

a) Character of Listed Building and Character and Appearance of Conservation Area

The conversion to residential use presents considerable conservation gain. The conversion from office use to three residential flats will involve the removal of unsympathetic office fittings and reinstatement/restoration of original architectural features. There are no original doors in situ. Many of the fireplaces are non original.

Historic Environment Scotland has concerns regarding the proposed mews. This element has been deleted from the application. The concerns regarding the loss of the internal stair and the proposed large slappings on the rear elevation of the townhouse have been addressed in the amended scheme, which retains the stair and restricts the openings to the rear. There are also concerns regarding the vestibule area. This entrance is already divided therefore the subdivision of the vestibule is no worse than the existing situation. Further details of this area have been requested as a condition of this consent.

Whilst there is a normal presumption against kitchens in principal rooms, particularly to the front, the use of the ground floor principal room as open-plan living room/kitchen will enable the successful conversion of the former offices to flats without compromising the proportions of these rooms. The kitchen fittings comprise a minimalist run along the rear wall at ground floor level so the units will not interfere with the general proportions of the room. The conversion of the property to three flats will preserve the plan form, in accordance with policy. The existing link into the extension at ground floor level is a modern stud partition. There is no loss of fabric and the alterations are acceptable within this context. The amended scheme is sympathetic to the character of the listed building, retaining any existing original features including wine stores at basement level. The amended proposals will not have an adverse impact on the character of the listed building.

Externally, the removals are focussed on areas of secondary importance. The amended scheme proposes the partial removal of this stone/brick structure. The removal of a section of the stone/brick stores which currently dominate this rear elevation will allow more of the original elevation and stonework of the townhouse to be visible and is welcomed. The existing structure comprises a mix of rubble wall material, brick masonry, render and concrete capping stones. The new extension will be constructed from natural rubble stone making use of stone from the existing structure. This lane elevation is also visible from Dublin Street and from the wider conservation area. The amended scheme has reduced the height of the extension so that it ties in with the eaves level of the adjoining mews.

The proposed alterations to the window and door opening at basement level on the front elevation will match the fenestration pattern of several neighbouring properties, and is acceptable.

The proposals will therefore have no adverse impact on the character of the listed building or character or appearance of the conservation area, in compliance with LDP Policies Env 4 and Env 6.

b) Impact on Equalities and Human Rights

This application was assessed in terms of equalities and human rights and no impact has been identified.

c) Public Comments

Scheme 1

A total of 10 letters of representation were received, including a letter from the Architectural Heritage Society and a letter from a Member of Parliament on behalf of a constituent.

The Architectural Heritage Society objects to the loss of the basement stair and the loss of fabric from the proposed downtakings to the rear of the townhouse. They welcomed the removal of the rear stores and reuse of stone.

Material Representations - Objection

- impact on character of conservation area and World Heritage Site. This has been addressed in section 3.3 a).
- impact of character of listed buildings and their setting. This has been addressed in section 3.3 a).
- loss of internal staircase, proposed large slappings to rear elevation of townhouse into extension. This points have been addressed in section 3.3 a).
- loss of daylight, privacy and overshadowing. This has been addressed in the concurrent planning application.
- impact on parking and traffic. This has been addressed in the concurrent planning application.
- loss of original structure. This has been addressed in section 3.3 a).
- height, scale and massing of new mews. This element has been deleted from the application.

Non-material issues:

- impact of construction work.
- increase in domestic waste from new dwellings.

Scheme 2 was not re-advertised.

Community Council

No comments were received.

Conclusion

The amended application complies with the development plan and the relevant non statutory guidelines. The proposal will not have an adverse impact upon the listed building or the New Town Conservation Area. There are no material considerations that outweigh this conclusion and approval is recommended.

It is recommended that this application be Granted subject to the details below.

3.4 Conditions/reasons/informatives

Conditions:-

1. Details of the vestibule alterations shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority before work is commenced on site.
2. Details of kitchen layout at ground floor level shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority before work is commenced on site.

Reasons:-

1. In order to enable the Council as Planning Authority to consider this/these matter/s in detail.
2. In order to enable the Council as Planning Authority to consider this/these matter/s in detail.

Informatives

It should be noted that:

1. The works hereby permitted shall be commenced no later than the expiration of three years from the date of this consent.
2. This consent is for listed building consent only. Work must not begin until other necessary consents, eg planning permission, have been obtained.

Financial impact

4.1 The financial impact has been assessed as follows:

There are no financial implications to the Council.

Risk, Policy, compliance and governance impact

5.1 Provided planning applications are determined in accordance with statutory legislation, the level of risk is low.

Equalities impact

6.1 The equalities impact has been assessed as follows:

The application has been assessed and has no impact in terms of equalities or human rights.

Sustainability impact

7.1 The sustainability impact has been assessed as follows:

This application is not subject to the sustainability requirements of the Edinburgh Design Guidance.

Consultation and engagement

8.1 Pre-Application Process

There is no pre-application process history.

8.2 Publicity summary of representations and Community Council comments

The application was advertised on the 16 December 2016.

A total of ten letters of representation were received, including a letter from the Architectural Heritage Society and a letter from a Member of Parliament on behalf of a constituent.

A full assessment of the representations can be found in the main report in the Assessment Section.

Background reading/external references

- To view details of the application go to
- [Planning and Building Standards online services](#)
- [Planning guidelines](#)
- [Conservation Area Character Appraisals](#)
- [Edinburgh Local Development Plan](#)
- [Scottish Planning Policy](#)

**Statutory Development
Plan Provision**

The application site is located within the Urban Area as identified in the Edinburgh local Development Plan.

Date registered

6 December 2016

Drawing numbers/Scheme

1, 2A-9A, 10-11.,

Scheme 2

David R. Leslie

Chief Planning Officer
PLACE
The City of Edinburgh Council

Contact: Diana Garrett, Planning Officer
E-mail:diana.garrett@edinburgh.gov.uk Tel:0131 529 3620

Links - Policies

Relevant Policies:

Relevant policies of the Local Development Plan.

LDP Policy Env 4 (Listed Buildings - Alterations and Extensions) identifies the circumstances in which alterations and extensions to listed buildings will be permitted.

LDP Policy Env 6 (Conservation Areas - Development) sets out criteria for assessing development in a conservation area.

LDP Policy Des 12 (Alterations and Extensions) sets criteria for assessing alterations and extensions to existing buildings.

Relevant Non-Statutory Guidelines

Non-statutory guidelines 'LISTED BUILDINGS AND CONSERVATION AREAS' provides guidance on repairing, altering or extending listed buildings and unlisted buildings in conservation areas.

Other Relevant policy guidance

The New Town Conservation Area Character Appraisal states that the area is typified by the formal plan layout, spacious stone built terraces, broad streets and an overall classical elegance. The buildings are of a generally consistent three storey and basement scale, with some four storey corner and central pavilions.

Appendix 1

**Application for Listed Building Consent 16/05983/LBC
At 19 Dublin Street, Edinburgh, EH1 3PG
Internal alterations to lower three storeys of existing B listed
townhouse (former office use) to form 3 new dwellings, one
on each floor. Alterations include new slappings, removal of
unsympathetic lower ground and ground floor rear
extensions (as amended).**

Consultations

HISTORIC ENVIRONMENT SCOTLAND

The application proposes a series of internal and external alterations at 19 Dublin Street. The removal of later additions and walling will also help facilitate the construction of a new mews building. While overall we consider it unlikely that these proposals will have a significant detrimental impact, it would be worth considering some of the scheme's details further.

In looking at the existing plans, it appears that past alterations - likely associated with conversion to office use - have impacted on the original character of the property. As the contents of the design statement focus on the external works and mews property, the nature of past alterations and the extent of surviving features has not come through in the supporting information. However, we would highlight that removal of the basement stair and a large section of the rear wall has the clear potential to cause adverse impacts. The new works may also bring unwelcome impacts, i.e. addition of new screen and bathroom within the ground floor hallway. We would be happy to provide further advice on the significance of the existing internal spaces if this would be helpful.

Externally, the extent of removal appears to be focused on areas that are of secondary importance. However, some of the walling to be removed, while clearly altered, is potentially early. Again a more detailed analysis on site would be helpful. If the stone is removed we note the intention to re-use within the new-build mews.

The lane itself exhibits a range of mews developments - some are original (the adjacent property) and some more modern - which vary in height, materials and detailing, but many follow the two-storey mews typology. The first OS map (c1850) shows a building on the site. We have no role in assessing the impact of development of the setting of a B-listed building. However, if your Council views this application as concerning the extension of a B-listed building we would suggest that the new mews building follows the scale and massing of the adjacent original mews building (No.23).

