

Committee Minutes

Development Quality Sub-Committee of the Planning Committee

Edinburgh, 11 January 2006

Present:- Councillors Davies (Convener), Child, Gilmore, The Hon David Guest, Harrold, Hunter, Laing, Longstaff, Lowrie, Munro, Murray, Tritton and Wigglesworth.

Also Present:- The Lord Provost and Councillor Rev Ewan Aitken.

1 Chair

Councillor Child chaired the meeting for agenda items 16, 19, 25A, 25B and 29.

2 4 Smith's Place – Refurbishment of Building and Provision of Disabled Access

A planning application (05/03514/FUL) and a listed building consent application (05/03514/LBC) had been received for the refurbishment and installation of front and rear disabled access, including an external rear lift tower, at 4 Smith's Place.

A supporting statement from the applicants and four letters of representation commenting on the proposals had been received.

Motion

- 1) To grant planning permission for the front chair lift and rear garden ramp subject to the conditions contained in the Director of City Development's report.
- 2) To refuse planning permission for the external rear lift tower for the reasons contained in the Director of City Development's report.
- 3) To indicate intention to grant conditional listed building consent for the front chair lift and rear garden ramp subject to the views of the Scottish Ministers.

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
11 January 2006

- 4) To refuse listed building consent for the external rear lift tower for the reasons contained in the Director of City Development's report.

- moved by Councillor Longstaff, seconded by Councillor Lowrie.

Amendment

To continue consideration of the planning and listed building consent applications for:

- 1) A site visit.
- 2) Further details of the appearance of the external rear lift tower and information on the previous delegated refusal for an internal lift tower.

- moved by Councillor Munro, seconded by Councillor Wigglesworth.

Voting

The amendment was carried by 6 votes to 3.

Decision

To continue consideration of the planning and listed building consent applications for:

- 1) A site visit.
- 2) Further details of the appearance of the external rear lift tower and information on the previous delegated refusal for an internal lift tower.

(Reference – reports by the Director of City Development, submitted)

Declaration of Interests

Councillor Child declared a non-financial interest in the above item as a member of Friends of Penumbra (the applicants) and as her son was employed by Penumbra.

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
11 January 2006

3 Applications

The Sub-Committee considered the remaining applications contained on the agenda.

Councillor Rev Ewan Aitken was heard as local ward member in respect of agenda item 23 (Restalrig Crescent/Findlay Avenue).

The Lord Provost was heard as local ward member in respect of agenda item 27 (77 Telford Road).

Decision

To agree as detailed in Appendix 1 to this minute.

(Reference – reports by the Director of City Development, submitted.)

Declaration of Interests

Councillor Munro declared a non-financial interest in agenda item 19 (62 Henderson Street) as a Board Member of the Port of Leith Housing Association and took no part in the determination of the application. However, he addressed the Sub-Committee as local ward member.

Councillor Munro declared a non-financial interest in agenda item 23 (Restalrig Crescent/Findlay Avenue) as a Board Member of the Port of Leith Housing Association.

4 Appeal Decisions by the Scottish Ministers

Decisions on appeals had been made by the Scottish Ministers as detailed in Appendix 2 to this minute.

Decision

To note the report.

(Reference – report no DQ/023/05-06/CS by the Director of Corporate Services, submitted.)

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
11 January 2006

APPENDIX 1

APPLICATIONS

(As referred to in item 3 of the foregoing minute)

Note: Detailed conditions/reasons for the following decisions are contained in the statutory Planning Register.

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No.	Details of Proposals	Decision
3	194 Fountainbridge (land on and adjacent to) (05/00106/OUT)	Mixed use development on brownfield site (in outline).	1) Indicate intention to grant conditional outline planning permission subject to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) A legal agreement. b) The views of the Scottish Ministers. c) Condition 6.1 being amended to read as follows – “Road and footway layouts and linkages to Grove Street, Upper Grove Place and Brandfield Street including junction and parking details.” d) The heading of Condition 12 being amended to read – “Commercial Class 3/Hotel Class 7. “

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
11 January 2006

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No.	Details of Proposals	Decision
			<p>e) The following additional condition being included under Condition 15 (Nursery Class 10) – “The number of children in the outdoor play area shall be restricted to 12 at any one time.”</p> <p>f) The following items being added to the list of reserved matters:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i) The quality of the Public Realm; ii) The mix of affordable housing; iii) Those elements of the development that exceed the height set out in the Fountainbridge Development Brief. iv) Waste management and recycling facilities.

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
11 January 2006

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No.	Details of Proposals	Decision
			<p>2) That a site visit take place at an appropriate stage.</p> <p>3) To note that the proposed legal agreement will set a timescale for the early delivery of affordable housing and to make it clear to the developers that a reduction to 22% on this site would not set a precedent. Moreover, any future affordable housing provision on neighbouring sites will be considered on their merits and the Sub-Committee would expect any justification to be on an "open book" basis.</p> <p>4) That sketch proposals for the south side of Fountainbridge be provided to the Sub-Committee when available.</p>

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
11 January 2006

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No.	Details of Proposals	Decision
			5) To note that the Head of Planning and Strategy would ask the developers to write to the local ward members outlining proposals for construction traffic.
4	28 Baberton Mains Way (05/03811/FUL)	Proposed extension.	Grant planning permission.
5	24 Barnton Avenue West (05/03485/FUL)	Extend detached house and alter exterior finishes (as amended).	Grant planning permission.
6	60 Belgrave Crescent Lane (05/02387/FUL)	Alter windows and door to front and rear elevations and form new rooflights (as amended).	Grant conditional planning permission.
7	15 Bristo Square (McEwan Hall) (05/03717/LBC)	Installation of protective bronze mesh over ground floor 10 circular coloured glass leaded windows.	Indicate intention to grant conditional listed building consent subject to the views of the Scottish Ministers.
8	13 Buckstone Gardens (05/03623/FUL)	Alter and extend house including raising roofline to form accommodation in roofspace (including dormers).	Grant planning permission.
9	22 Cammo Road (05/03598/FUL)	Form "granny flat" extension to 22 Cammo Road and rear dormer window.	Grant planning permission.

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
11 January 2006

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No.	Details of Proposals	Decision
10	11 Commercial Wharf (05/03743/FUL) (05/03743/LBC)	a) Alter existing building to form new garage door, door and windows (partially retrospective) (as amended). b) Alter existing building to form new garage door, door and windows (partially retrospective) (as amended).	Grant planning permission. Indicate intention to grant listed building consent subject to the views of the Scottish Ministers.
11	10 Corstorphine Bank Avenue (05/03620/FUL)	Proposed alterations and extension to form dining room and bedroom.	Grant planning permission.
12	35 Craigcrook Avenue (05/02772/FUL)	Extend dwelling house to rear with new integrated garage to side, form new pitched slated roof with 2 dormer windows to rear.	Grant planning permission.
13	35 Drylaw Crescent (05/03503/FUL)	Alter and extend dwellinghouse (as amended).	Grant planning permission.
14	Fountainbridge (near Gardner's Crescent) (05/02506/FUL)	Retain existing telephone kiosk and replace with a payphone and ATM within the same space.	1) Grant conditional planning permission. 2) That the Head of Planning and Strategy reports further on the re-use of redundant telephone boxes.

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
11 January 2006

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No.	Details of Proposals	Decision
15	111A George Street (05/03615/ADV)	Internally illuminated fascia sign (in retrospect).	Refuse advertisement consent and authorise that enforcement action be taken to remove the unauthorised sign.
16	160 Greendykes Road (05/01772/CEC)	Erection of 60-bed residential care home.	<p>1) To approve the application subject to the conditions detailed in the report by the Director of City Development and subject to Condition 12 being amended to read as follows -</p> <p>“A detailed landscape plan for the former informal footpath to the north west of the site including details of all hard and soft surface and boundary treatments and all planting shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Head of Planning and Strategy before work is commenced on site.”</p> <p>2) To note that as no letters of representation had been received, planning permission is deemed to be granted.</p>

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
11 January 2006

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No.	Details of Proposals	Decision
17	Greenside Row (National Car Park) (05/03603/FUL)	Weekly Sunday car boot sale.	Grant conditional planning permission subject to Condition 4 being amended to read as follows: "all music and vocals, amplified or otherwise, shall be so controlled as to be inaudible within any neighbouring premises".
18	16 (1F2) Grove Street (05/03237/LBC)	Subdivision of rear room, using non-loadbearing timber studs and suspended ceiling, removal of hall cupboard to form room to front (in retrospect).	Refuse listed building consent and authorise that enforcement action be taken to secure the reinstatement of the rear principal room.
19	62 Henderson Street (05/01950/FUL)	Proposed residential flats and re-provision of premises for the tabernacle church (as amended to exclude church element and reduce by one storey).	Continued for: 1) Further comment from Transportation Officials and an improved location plan. 2) The Head of Planning and Strategy to report on appropriate conditions should the Sub-Committee be minded to grant the application.
<p>Declaration of Interests - Councillor Munro declared a non-financial interest in item 19 above as a Board Member of the Port of Leith Housing Association and took no part in the determination of the application. However, he addressed the Sub-Committee as local ward member.</p>			

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
11 January 2006

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No.	Details of Proposals	Decision
20	23 Morningside Place (05/01927/FUL)	Erection of a garden fence on top of small front garden wall, overall total height to be no more than 2.3 metres.	Grant conditional planning permission.
21	67 Prestonfield Avenue (Prestonfield Park) (05/01756/FUL)	Erection of townhouses (amended to three); demolition of existing church hall.	Grant conditional planning permission subject to a legal agreement.
22	26 Redford Loan (05/03854/FUL)	Alterations to dwelling house.	Grant planning permission.
23	Restalrig Crescent/Findlay Avenue (05/03602/OUT)	Proposed erection of five family houses and a community youth facility (in outline).	Continued for: 1) A site visit. 2) The Head of Planning and Strategy to report on appropriate conditions should the Sub-Committee be minded to grant the application.
Declaration of Interests – Councillor Munro declared a non-financial interest in item 23 above as a Board Member of the Port of Leith Housing Association.			
24	11 Silverknowes Crescent (05/03885/FUL)	Attic extension over existing garage with 2 dormers to rear.	Grant planning permission.

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
11 January 2006

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No.	Details of Proposals	Decision
27	77 Telford Road (05/03650/FUL)	Change of use from a doctors surgery to a day nursery with alterations to the back of the property to incorporate a conservatory.	Grant conditional planning permission subject to the following additional conditions: 1) The hours of operation shall be restricted to between 0800 hours and 1800 hours Monday-Friday; and 2) The applicants shall make application for a Traffic Regulation Order to limit waiting on the Groathill Road North/Telford Road Junction (both sides), all at no cost to the Council.
28	102 Tryst Park (05/03751/FUL)	Ground floor extension to dwelling.	Grant planning permission

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
11 January 2006

APPENDIX 2

Appeal Decisions by Scottish Ministers (As referred to in item 4 of the foregoing minute)

Development/Appellant	Decision and Date	Decision by the Scottish Ministers
<p>107-109 Dundee Street</p> <p>Display of one illuminated pylon sign and four pairs of non-illuminated pole-mounted banners</p> <p>(05/00088/ADV)</p> <p>Kwik Fit Properties Ltd</p>	<p>Advertisement consent refused and enforcement action authorised by the Sub-Committee on 22 June 2005.</p>	<p>Appeal <u>allowed</u> in respect of the pylon sign, and advertisement consent granted as detailed in the letter from the Scottish Executive.</p> <p>Appeal <u>dismissed</u> in respect of the four banner poles and attached banners and enforcement notice upheld, as detailed in the letter from the Scottish Executive.</p>
<p>88 Walter Scott Avenue</p> <p>Change of use from shop to hot food take-away and installation of external duct</p> <p>(05/01009/FUL)</p> <p>Mr C Yip</p>	<p>Planning permission refused by the Sub-Committee on 8 June 2005, contrary to officer recommendation.</p>	<p>Appeal <u>allowed</u>, as detailed in the letter from the Scottish Executive.</p> <p><u>No award of expenses.</u></p>