

**Listed Building Consent Application 05/03514/LBC
at
4 Smith's Place
Edinburgh
EH6 8NT**

**Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee**

1 Purpose of report

To consider application 05/03514/LBC, submitted by Penumbra. The application is for: **Upgrade/refurbishment including provision of disabled access + external lift**

It is recommended that the Sub-Committee issue a **MIXED DECISION** to part-approve and part-refuse this application subject to the conditions and reasons detailed in Appendix B.

2 The Site and the Proposal

Site description

The site is a terraced villa on the south side of the square, situated behind the shops and tenements fronting Leith Walk. The building is one room deep with a corridor and turnpike stair to the rear. The rear is rubble built with only one small square window to light each level of the rear corridor.

The building is category 'B' listed, dated 1824. It is a three storey and basement classically styled villa with rusticated ground floor.

The site is in the Leith Conservation Area.

Site history

No formal planning history recorded. However, the premises was the subject of internal alterations at or around 1979 - these works were carried out for the benefit of Edinburgh Woman's Aid, who were resident at that time.

Penumbra first occupied the premises in the mid-1980s - at this time the facilities were being registered with City of Edinburgh Council Registration and Inspection Service as a Care Home. The situation remains in place today albeit with Registration to Scottish Care Commission rather than Edinburgh Council, but on the basis of a Care Centre with capacity to accommodate those seeking care on a short term basis only, up to a maximum of seven days.

Description of the Proposal

The proposal is to refurbish the building which is used as a mental health care drop-in centre and provide a wheel chair hoist in the front garden from ground floor to basement and provide an external lift up the back of the building to serve each floor. The rear lift would be enclosed within a narrow glass and steel tower.

3 Officer's Assessment and Recommendations

DETERMINING ISSUES

The determining issues are:

- Do the proposals preserve the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses? If they do not, there is a presumption against the granting of consent;
- Do the proposals comply with the development plan?
- If the proposals do comply with the development plan, are there any compelling reasons for not approving them?
- If the proposals do not comply with the development plan, are there any compelling reasons for approving them?

ASSESSMENT

To address the determining issues, the Committee needs to consider whether the proposals have an adverse impact on the character of the listed building.

The proposed chair lift in the front garden will be in a secluded position screened by the railings, shrubs and trees from direct view from the street. It

will be positioned close to an existing set of steps and will not detract from the frontage. The basic concept of the chair lift at the front has been made to be as inconspicuous as possible with glazed sides and is acceptable. The rear garden ramp is simple and will not detract from any listed feature. A condition is recommended to see details of the design and materials of both these structures.

The tall glazed steel and glass structure of the lift tower will contrast adversely with the fabric of this solid masonry building and will not be in keeping with the architecture. The proposed lift tower is slender and projects only 1.85 metres from the face of the building and only 1.85 metres wide. The turnpike stair projects 1.9 metres. Nonetheless, the tower would mask part of the rear of this unique building and require a door slapping at each floor in the plain rubble stonework. The uniform appearance of this rear wall would be adversely affected and whilst the position of the tower at the rear is very secluded and not readily visible to the public, the character of the listed building would be detrimentally affected by this structure. The proposals will have a detrimental impact on this unusual and interesting building.

The chair lift and rear ramp proposals comply with the development plan and non-statutory policies. The proposed lift tower does not comply with the development plan or the non-statutory policies and will have an adverse impact on the character and integrity of the listed building.

There are no other material planning considerations which outweigh this conclusion.

It is recommended that the Committee approves the chair lift and ramp subject to conditions on design materials and referral to Scottish Ministers. It is recommended that the Committee refuses the rear lift tower for reasons of the effect on the character and integrity of the building, loss of wall fabric and not minimising the impact on the fabric.

Alan Henderson

Alan Henderson
Head of Planning and Strategy

Contact/tel	Duncan Robertson on 0131 529 3560 (FAX 529 3717)
Ward affected	22 - Lorne
Local Plan	North East Edinburgh Local Plan
Statutory Development Plan Provision	Housing and Compatible Uses
Date registered	28 October 2005
Drawing numbers/ Scheme	01 - 04 Scheme 1

Advice to Committee Members and Ward Councillors

The full details of the application are available for viewing on the Planning and Building Control Portal: www.edinburgh.gov.uk/planning.

If you require further information about this application you should contact the following Principal Planner, Martin Easson on 0131 529 3989. Email: martin.easson@edinburgh.gov.uk.

If this application is not identified on the agenda for presentation, and you wish to request a presentation of this application at the Committee meeting, you must contact Committee Services by 9.00a.m. on the Tuesday preceding the meeting on extension 4229/4239. Alternatively, you may e-mail blair.ritchie@edinburgh.gov.uk or sarah.bogunovic@edinburgh.gov.uk

Application Type Listed Building Consent Application
Application Address: 4 Smith's Place
Edinburgh
EH6 8NT
Proposal: Upgrade/refurbishment including provision of disabled access + external lift
Reference No: 05/03514/LBC

Consultations, Representations and Planning Policy

Consultations

Historic Scotland

Historic Scotland offers the following informal comments: The plans to construct a rear elevator would result in the loss of a significant amount of external historic fabric.

4 Smith's Place forms part of a category B listed terrace dating from the early 19th century. From the street elevation these buildings appear similar, but the rear elevations clearly show number 4 to be of a differing plan.

Considerably narrower than those adjacent, this building is differentiated by its near blind rear elevation, with very small, irregularly placed windows and turnpike stair with semi-conical slated roof.

The building is to be used as a crisis centre. The interior of this building is one room deep and accessed off a rear corridor. The proposals would see little change to the interior, which retains elements of the original detailing, such as cornicing and timber doors. The major proposal would see the addition of a glass lift to the rear of the building. The lift would be sited within an enclosed rear courtyard, would not rise above the wallhead level of the building and would not significantly impact on the adjacent listed buildings or the wider conservation area.

Whilst the applicant has submitted justification for the need to construct this lift for the client group using the building, Historic Scotland would offer the following advice regarding its effect on the listed building. At present the rear elevation is blind with small windows. The construction of the lift would mean making four sizeable slappings to access each level of the building through the historic fabric, and this is of concern. It is of the opinion that internally, the principle rooms' dimensions should not be broken by the introduction of a lift, especially given the narrow depth of the building and realise why this may appear to be the most practical siting for such a facility. Its construction would result in the loss of historic fabric and may set a

precedent for other buildings within Edinburgh, which do not have a specific client based need for such a feature.

Historic Scotland is content with the sensitive way in which the lift to the basement is to be added from the platt on the main entrance.

Representations

The application was advertised on 11 November 2005. Four letters of support for the application have been received, one from Edinburgh Carers Council, two from Councillor Philip Attridge and one from Leith Lorne Community Council.

Full copies of the representations made in respect of this application are available in Group Rooms or can be requested for viewing at the Main Reception, City Chambers, High Street.

Planning Policy

The site is allocated as Housing and Compatible Uses in the North East Edinburgh Local Plan.

Relevant Policies:

Policy E18 (LISTED BUILDINGS) sets out criteria for assessing proposals affecting a listed building and its setting, including alterations, extensions and changes of use.

Non-statutory guidelines 'ALTERATIONS TO LISTED BUILDINGS' provide general guidance for assessing proposals for both internal and external alterations.

Non-statutory guidelines 'ACCESS TO THE BUILT ENVIRONMENT' seek to ensure that development proposals and streetscape works take account of the needs of disabled people.

Application Type Listed Building Consent Application
Application Address: 4 Smith's Place
Edinburgh
EH6 8NT
Proposal: Upgrade/refurbishment including provision of disabled access + external lift
Reference No: 05/03514/LBC

Conditions/Reasons associated with the Recommendation

Recommendation

It is recommended that the Sub-Committee issue a **MIXED DECISION**

1. The **consent** relates to the front chair lift and rear garden ramp only, and is subject to the following conditions:-
 - a). The works hereby permitted shall be commenced no later than five years from the date of this consent.

Reason: In order to accord with the statutory requirements of the town and country Planning (Scotland) Acts.
 - b) The application shall be referred to the Scottish Ministers prior to determination.

Reason: In order to accord with the statutory requirements of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Acts.
 - b). Details of the design and materials of the front chair lift and the rear courtyard ramp shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Head of Planning and Strategy before work is commenced on site.

Reason: In order to enable the Head of Planning and Strategy to consider these matters in detail.

1. The **refusal** relates to the erection of the rear lift tower. The refusal reasons are as follows:-
 - a). The proposal is contrary to North East Edinburgh Local Plan Policy E18, in respect of Listed Buildings, as the external lift tower would adversely affect the character and integrity of the listed building, by masking this unique rubble wall rear elevation, and requiring four wall slappings which will lead to a loss of original fabric.
 - b) The proposal is contrary to Non-Statutory Guidelines in respect of Alterations to Listed Buildings, as the external lift tower will result in loss of external wall fabric to the detriment of the listed building.
 - c) The proposal is contrary to the Non-Statutory Access to the Built Environment, as the external lift tower will not minimise the visual and physical disruption to the built fabric.

End

Application Type Listed Building Consent Application

Proposal: Upgrade/refurbishment including provision of disabled access + external lift

Reference No: 05/03514/LBC

Location Plan

