

Development Management Sub Committee

Wednesday 9 March 2016

**Application for Planning Permission 15/05288/FUL
At Sciennes Primary School, 10 Sciennes Road, Edinburgh
Single storey extension to existing building containing
dining hall and ancillary accommodation.**

Item number	4.6(a)
Report number	
Wards	A15 - Southside/Newington

Summary

The proposal is for an extension to provide a dining hall facility within the grounds of the existing school. By reason of its size, form and design the proposal complies with the relevant provisions of the development plan and the associated guidelines. The proposal has an acceptable impact on the character and appearance on the conservation area. The proposal is acceptable in road safety terms. With the attachment of an appropriate condition, regarding the materials finish, it represents an acceptable form of development. There are no material considerations that outweigh this conclusion.

Links

Policies and guidance for this application	CRPMAR, LPC, CITCO3, CITD3, CITE4, CITE6, NSG, NSGD02, NSLBCA, OTH,
--	---

Report

Application for Planning Permission 15/05288/FUL At Sciennes Primary School, 10 Sciennes Road, Edinburgh Single storey extension to existing building containing dining hall and ancillary accommodation.

Recommendations

1.1 It is recommended that this application be Granted subject to the details below.

Background

2.1 Site description

The site lies on the north side of Sciennes Road at the southern end of Millerfield Place within a predominately residential area. The site is occupied by a main school building constructed in stone with slate roof which was built in 1889. It is 2 storeys in height with a basement and an attic, in a symmetrical H plan arrangement. It is a Category B Listed Building which was listed on 15/01/1992 (Ref LB30479). To the north of the building are prefabricated units used as classrooms. The site is bounded by walls with railings.

To the north of the site lies Millerfield Place which is lined by two sets of residential terraced properties built in 1864. These properties are 2-bay villas with a 3-storey and basement corner tenement pavilion block at the north corner. 1-10 Millerfield Place is Category C Listed Buildings which was listed on 15/01/1992 and amended 26/05/2015 (Ref LB30454) and 11-21 Millerfield Place is Category C Listed Buildings listed on 15/01/1992 and amended on 26/05 2015 (Ref LB30455). The properties on the western side of Millerfield Place are used by the Royal Hospital for Sick Children as offices and consulting rooms.

To the west lies the Royal Hospital for Sick Children. It is a Category B listed Building which was listed on 15.01.1992 (Ref LB30480).

To the south and east lie residential properties.

This application site is located within the Marchmont, Meadows and Bruntsfield Conservation Area.

2.2 Site History

11 August 1997 - Listed Building Consent was approved for placing terracotta tiles made by pupils onto the rear of the bike shed (application number 97/01277/LBC).

11 January 2002 - Planning permission was granted for the construction of a low walled recycled sandstone amphitheatre (application number 01/04299/FUL).

4 December 2002 - Planning permission was granted for upgrading internal doors and screens to improve fire resistance and to form 2 no. new fire escape stairs externally (application number 02/03442/CEC).

4 December 2002 - Listed Building Consent was granted for upgrading internal doors and screens to improve fire resistance and to form 2 no. new fire escape stairs externally (application number 02/03442/LBC).

13 January 2005 - Listed Building Consent was approved for converting a small cloakroom to toilets (application number 04/03862/LBC).

25 November 2015 - An application for Listed Building Consent was submitted for a single storey extension to existing building containing dining hall and ancillary accommodation - This application is pending decision (application number 15/05325/LBC).

Other relevant history

9 December 2014 - Report to Education, Children and Families Committee entitled Free School Meals item 7.1.

Main report

3.1 Description Of The Proposal

The proposal is to erect a single storey dining room extension leading from the existing ground floor dining hall of the primary school.

The extension measures 168.3 square metres. It will have a length of 15.3 metres, breadth of 11 metres and a height of 3.7 metres. It will be connected to the existing dining area and kitchen of the main school building.

The extension is to be located to the north of the existing school buildings on an area of tarmac.

On the north elevation an access ramp is proposed leading from the playground.

The proposed materials are cement cladding panel system for the outside walls, aluminium framed windows and doors.

It is proposed that colour samples will be provided for approval, in consultation with the school, prior to construction on the site.

Supporting statement

- Design and Access Statement
- Risk Assessment
- Geo environmental Assessment

These documents are able to view on the Planning and Building Standards Online Services.

3.2 Determining Issues

Section 25 of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 states - Where, in making any determination under the planning Acts, regard is to be had to the development plan, the determination shall be made in accordance with the plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise.

Do the proposals harm the character or appearance of the conservation area? If they do, there is a strong presumption against granting of consent.

In considering whether to grant consent, special regard must be had to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses. For the purposes of this issue, preserve, in relation to the building, means preserve it either in its existing state or subject only to such alterations or extensions as can be carried out without serious detriment to its character.

Do the proposals comply with the development plan?

If the proposals do comply with the development plan, are there any compelling reasons for not approving them?

If the proposals do not comply with the development plan, are there any compelling reasons for approving them?

3.3 Assessment

To address these determining issues, the Committee needs to consider whether:

- a) the proposal is acceptable in principle;
- b) the proposal will protect and enhance the character and appearance of the conservation area;
- c) the proposal will not have an adverse impact and preserves the setting of the listed building;
- d) the proposal will be of a suitable quality in terms of design;
- e) the proposal will result in an unreasonable loss of privacy or natural light to neighbouring properties;
- f) the proposals affect road safety and car parking;
- g) the proposals will affect archaeology;
- h) the proposal will affect flooding;
- i) the proposal will have any detrimental impact on equalities and human rights; and
- j) comments raised have been addressed.

a) Principle

Edinburgh City Local Plan Policy Com 3 states that permission will be granted for new school development on existing school sites which are compatible with other policies in the Local Plan.

The proposal is acceptable in principle.

b) Character and Appearance of the Conservation Area

The site lies within Marchmont, Meadows and Bruntsfield Conservation Area. The Character Appraisal identifies the site as being within the Marchmont and Meadows area of the conservation area. This part of the conservation area is characterised by the *“open parkland of Meadows and Bruntsfield Links flanked by Victorian tenemental properties”*.

The proposal is of modern style, using modern building materials. It is located to the rear of the main school building in the corner of the playground but attached to an existing single storey extension built at a later date from the original building. There are existing prefabricated structures also to the rear of the building. It fits into and complements the existing massing characteristics of the surrounding buildings by using glazing with proportions in keeping with the traditional windows and complies with the Council's Guidance on Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas. The proposed materials do not detract from the surrounding buildings. Being single storey it does not compete with the original building. Given its size and positioning within the site it would not significantly detract from the overall appearance of the conservation area.

The proposal complies with Policy Env 6 of the adopted Edinburgh City Local Plan.

The proposals will retain the character and appearance of the conservation area.

c) Setting of the Listed Building

The proposal has been designed to fit into the existing palette of materials. Sandstone is the predominant material in the area and the aim is to achieve a similar finish through the use of cement fibreboard. Given the size of the proposal and its positioning within the site, only 50% of the elevation would be visible from the northern end of Millerfield Place. This would have little impact on the setting of original school building and also the adjacent listed buildings on Millerfield Place and the Royal Hospital for Sick Children.

d) Design, Form, Materials and Positioning

The proposal is of a contemporary and functional design, and is of a style and scale which will not compete with the character of the existing traditional school building. As it is single storey in height it is subordinate to the existing form. The materials proposed, primarily cement cladding and double glazed windows reflect the contemporary character of the proposal and will be an acceptable feature within this setting.

The specific colour of the panels is to be finalised. Accordingly, it is proposed to make the submission of samples of cladding materials a condition to ensure a suitable finish.

The proposal complies with policies Des 1 and Des 3 of Edinburgh City Local Plan.

e) Privacy and Daylight

There are three windows proposed facing north. These windows would lie 2 metres approx from the northern boundary and will look onto a blank gable of a building used as a nursery for Royal Hospital for Sick Children and its front garden ground. The other proposed windows face east into the playground and other school buildings.

The proposal will not generate any additional overlooking into neighbouring garden ground.

In terms of daylighting, the proposal complies with the Edinburgh Design Guidelines, using the 45 degree method.

The proposal will not result in an unreasonable loss of privacy or natural light to neighbouring properties.

f) Road Safety and Car Parking

There are no changes to the existing access and car parking arrangements.

The proposal is acceptable in terms of road safety and car parking.

g) Archaeology

The Archaeologist has confirmed that although the site lies within an area of historic interest, due to the development history of the site, it is considered that the impact of this scheme will not be significant in terms of buried archaeological remains. Accordingly it has been concluded that there are no known archaeological implications in regards to this application.

The proposal is acceptable in terms of archaeology.

h) Flooding

The proposal has been assessed in terms of Flood Risk Assessment and Surface Water Management Plan and the proposal requires a Surface Water Management Plan with Self Certification. The flow paths are adequate for this planning application and Flood Prevention have no further comment on the proposals.

The proposal is acceptable in terms of flooding.

i) Equalities and Human Rights Impacts

This application was assessed in terms of equalities and human rights. No impact was identified. An Equality and Rights Impact Assessment Summary is available to view on Planning and Building Standards online services.

j) Public Comments

Material Representations: Objections

- quality of design - assessed in section 3.3(b) and section 3.3(d) and found that the design is appropriate for the area.

Non-material Representations

None

Community Council

No comments were received.

Conclusion

In conclusion, the proposal complies with the development plan and the Council's Edinburgh Design Guidance. The proposal is acceptable in principle, is of suitable quality in terms of design and form, choice of materials and positioning, will not result in any unreasonable loss of privacy or natural light to neighbouring properties, and will not have any detrimental impact on neighbourhood character or amenity. No impact on equalities and human rights was identified.

As this application relates to development proposals affecting the school estate, a Committee decision is required.

It is recommended that this application be Granted subject to the details below.

3.4 Conditions/reasons/informatives

Conditions:-

1. A full schedule of all of the external cladding finishes and colours to be used, including suitable sample sections, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Council as Planning Authority. Those details shall be submitted prior to commencement of development and all works shall be carried out in accordance with that agreed schedule.

Reasons:-

1. In order to enable the planning authority to consider this/these matter/s in detail.

Informatives

It should be noted that:

1. The development hereby permitted shall be commenced no later than the expiration of three years from the date of this consent.

2. No development shall take place on the site until a 'Notice of Initiation of Development' has been submitted to the Council stating the intended date on which the development is to commence. Failure to do so constitutes a breach of planning control, under Section 123(1) of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997.
3. As soon as practicable upon the completion of the development of the site, as authorised in the associated grant of permission, a 'Notice of Completion of Development' must be given, in writing to the Council.

Financial impact

4.1 The financial impact has been assessed as follows:

All financial aspects of this Council project are matters for consideration by Education, Children and Families Committee.

Risk, Policy, compliance and governance impact

5.1 Provided planning applications are determined in accordance with statutory legislation, the level of risk is low.

Equalities impact

6.1 The equalities impact has been assessed as follows:

The application has been assessed and has no impact in terms of equalities or human rights.

Sustainability impact

7.1 The sustainability impact has been assessed as follows:

This application is not subject to the sustainability requirements of the Edinburgh Design Guidance.

Consultation and engagement

8.1 Pre-Application Process

Pre-application discussions took place on this application.

8.2 Publicity summary of representations and Community Council comments

The application was advertised on 4 December 2015 and one letter of representation was received.

Material Considerations

- design and materials not in keeping with the character of existing buildings.

Non-material considerations

No comments were received.

Community Council

No comments were received.

A full assessment of the representation can be found in the main report in the Assessment section.

Background reading/external references

- To view details of the application go to
- [Planning and Building Standards online services](#)
- [Edinburgh City Local Plan and Rural West Edinburgh Local Plan](#)
- [Planning guidelines](#)
- [Conservation Area Character Appraisals](#)
- [Edinburgh Local Development Plan](#)
- [Scottish Planning Policy](#)

**Statutory Development
Plan Provision**

The site lies within the urban area of the Edinburgh City Local Plan where it is designated as being within Marchmont, Meadows and Bruntsfield Conservation Area.

Date registered

18 November 2015

Drawing numbers/Scheme

1-10,

Scheme 1

John Bury

Head of Planning & Transport
PLACE
City of Edinburgh Council

Contact: Jennifer Zochowska, Senior Planning Officer
E-mail:jennifer.zochowska@edinburgh.gov.uk Tel:0131 529 3793

Links - Policies

Relevant policies of the Edinburgh City Local Plan.

Policy Com 3 (School Development) sets criteria for assessing sites for new school development.

Policy Des 3 (Development Design) sets criteria for assessing development design.

Policy Env 4 (Listed Buildings – Alterations & Extensions) identifies the circumstances in which alterations and extensions to listed buildings will be permitted.

Policy Env 6 (Conservation Areas Development) sets out criteria for assessing development in conservation areas.

Relevant Non-Statutory Guidelines

Non-Statutory guidelines Edinburgh Design Guidance supports development of the highest design quality and that integrates well with the existing city. It sets out the Council's expectations for the design of new development, including buildings and landscape, in Edinburgh.

Non-statutory guidelines 'LISTED BUILDINGS AND CONSERVATION AREAS' provides guidance on repairing, altering or extending listed buildings and unlisted buildings in conservation areas.

Other Relevant policy guidance

The Marchmont, Meadows and Bruntsfield Conservation Area Character Appraisal emphasises the well proportioned Victorian tenemental perimeter blocks with Baronial detailing and the substantial area of the open parkland formed by the Meadows and Bruntsfield Links.

Appendix 1

Application for Planning Permission 15/05288/FUL At Sciennes Primary School, 10 Sciennes Road, Edinburgh Single storey extension to existing building containing dining hall and ancillary accommodation.

Consultations

Archaeology

Further to your consultation request I would like to make the following comments and recommendations concerning this application for construction of a single storey extension to existing building containing dining hall and ancillary accommodation.

The site is identified as occurring within an area of historic interest being developed in the Georgian Period for housing and situated on the southern side of the medieval burghmuir, c.150m west of the medieval monastery of St Catherine of Sienna. However it is due to the development history of the site it is considered that the impact of this scheme will not be significant in terms of buried archaeological remains. Accordingly it has been concluded that there are no known archaeological implications in regards to this application.

Please contact me if you require any further information.

Transport

I have no objections to the application.

Location Plan



© Crown Copyright and database right 2014. All rights reserved. Ordnance Survey License number 100023420
END