

Development Management Sub Committee

Wednesday 13 January 2016

**Application for Conservation Area Consent 15/03171/CON
At 5 - 11 Ellersly Road, Edinburgh, EH12 6HY
Demolition of extension to Westerlea House, demolition of
Garden Building.**

Item number	4.2(c)
Report number	
Wards	A06 - Corstorphine/Murrayfield

Summary

The proposal complies with the Development Plan and the non-statutory guidance stated and is justified given the lesser architectural importance of the buildings to be demolished and the high quality of replacement buildings. There are no other material considerations which outweigh this decision.

Links

<u>Policies and guidance for this application</u>	LPC, CITE2, CITE3, CITE4, CITE6, NSG, NSLBCA, CRPWMU,
---	---

Report

Application for Conservation Area Consent 15/03171/CON At 5 - 11 Ellersly Road, Edinburgh, EH12 6HY Demolition of extension to Westerlea House, demolition of Garden Building.

Recommendations

1.1 It is recommended that this application be Granted subject to the details below.

Background

2.1 Site description

The site lies just west of Murrayfield Road, north of Murrayfield Stadium, in a predominantly residential area north of Corstorphine Road. Shops exist at Western corner on Corstorphine Road to the south west of the site.

The site is on the south side of Ellersly Road, opposite the former Ellersly House Hotel. The site, which is almost rectangular in plan and 1.46 ha in area, is currently occupied by the charity Capability Scotland as offices and an educational facility. The site contains the category B listed two storey manor Westerlea House which was built by Campbell Douglas and J.J Stevenson between 1860 and 1869 in the Jacobean style. It ranges along the frontage of the site together with a later 1950's two storey addition to the west and a conservatory added to the south west corner by Lorimer in 1913. It was listed on 27 January 1992 (LB ref: 30275).

In addition, there are other C listed outbuildings on the site dated 1860-69 including the Chalet building and the Stable Block courtyard to the east frontage. Behind this is the C listed Garden Building; a low single storey monopitch block. These buildings numbered 5, 7 and 9 Ellersly Road were listed on 27 January 1992 (LB ref: 30276).

The south west quadrant of the site towards Corstorphine Road contains an original Lorimer designed garden circa 1913 with large lawn and accompanying fountain, statue and obelisk. The east part of the site contains modern outbuildings including a hydrotherapy pool, prefabricated classrooms and a garage block. The site is well landscaped and, for the most part, is surrounded by a high stone wall.

2.2 Site History

The original house is dated 1860-69 and was remodelled by Lorimer in 1913. It was occupied by the British Red Cross in 1947 as a school facility for children with disabilities. A two storey extension was built to the west side of the house in the 1950s, designed by Gorden and Dey architects.

March 2009 - consent was granted for alterations to stable block to form extension to early learning centre (application numbers 09/00172/FULand 09/00172/LBC).

July 2015 - listed building application for internal and external alterations to facilitate use as residential (listed building application 15/03170/LBC).

July 2015 - application for planning permission for the conversion of the listed buildings and erection of new build residential blocks (application number 15/03149/FUL).

Main report

3.1 Description Of The Proposal

The proposal is to demolish the two storey 1950's accommodation block to the west side of the main house, the Garden Building, the modern hydrotherapy pool, the pre-fabricated classrooms and the garages on the east side of the site.

3.2 Determining Issues

Do the proposals harm the character or appearance of the conservation area? If they do, there is a strong presumption against granting of consent.

3.3 Assessment

To address these determining issues, the Committee needs to consider whether:

- a) the demolition of the buildings on the site is justified and will not impact on the character of the conservation area; and
- b) there are any equality or human rights issues to consider.

(a) Local Plan Policies

The buildings to be removed from the site and considered under demolition are unlisted buildings.

Policy ENV5 states: *Proposals for the demolition of an unlisted building within a conservation area but which is considered to make a positive contribution to the character of the area will only be permitted in exceptional circumstances and after taking into account the considerations set out in Policy Env 2.* Policy ENV 2 considers the condition and value of the building and merits of alternative proposals.

Proposals for the demolition of any building within a conservation area, whether listed or not, will not normally be permitted unless a detailed planning application is submitted for a replacement building which enhances or preserves the character of the area or, if acceptable, for the landscaping of the site. A detailed planning application has been submitted for the site.

The demolitions on site will allow the main listed building to once again sit in its own space which will vastly improve its setting. The buildings are all modern interventions that have no coherent design or positive impact on the site.

West Murrayfield Conservation Area Character Appraisal

The site sits within the Country House Sub Area of the main West Murrayfield Conservation Area as identified in the Conservation Area Character Appraisal. The essential characteristics are:

- The underlying spatial structure of the area is one of large 'country houses' in generous grounds close to main city access routes.
- The area is bound together by high stone boundary walls with houses less concerned with their relationship to each other, but more with their own design and layout within their grounds.
- Despite a gradual process of subdivision of the grounds, houses remain either free standing in generous plots or more uniformly laid out in smaller plots.
- Imposing gates set into boundary walls mark a transition from public to private, and retain an effect of privacy.
- A continuing interest and concern for landscaped gardens and woodland trees is clearly indicated by a high degree of maintenance.

These characteristics place emphasis on the retention of high boundary walls, creating a sense of privacy between private and public spaces, and concern for areas of landscaping.

The West Murrayfield Conservation Area Character Appraisal refers to the ECLP for policy relating to new development. There is particular focus on retaining and enhancing all features that contribute to the special character of the area.

The buildings proposed to be removed do not provide a positive contribution to the conservation area and their removal is supported. A condition would normally be sought to control the demolition to ensure that a vacant site is not left within the conservation area for an extended period. In this case it is not necessary to control the timing of the demolitions due to the retention of the listed buildings. The demolitions will not create a vacant site within the conservation area.

(b) Human Rights and Equalities

The application has been assessed and has no apparent impact in terms of equalities or human rights.

Conclusion

The proposed demolitions are considered acceptable and will not have an adverse impact on the character or appearance of the conservation area. The application shall be notified to Scottish Ministers prior to the decision being issued.

It is recommended that this application be Granted subject to the details below.

3.4 Conditions/reasons/informatives

Conditions:-

1. The application shall be referred to the Scottish Ministers prior to determination.

Reasons:-

1. In order to accord with the statutory requirements of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Acts.

Financial impact

4.1 The financial impact has been assessed as follows:

There are no financial implications to the Council.

Risk, Policy, compliance and governance impact

5.1 Provided planning applications are determined in accordance with statutory legislation, the level of risk is low.

Equalities impact

6.1 The equalities impact has been assessed as follows:

The application has been assessed and has no impact in terms of equalities or human rights.

Sustainability impact

7.1 The sustainability impact has been assessed as follows:

This application is not subject to the sustainability requirements of the Edinburgh Design Guidance.

Consultation and engagement

8.1 Pre-Application Process

Pre-application discussions took place on this application.

8.2 Publicity summary of representations and Community Council comments

The application was advertised on 17 July 2015. No representations have been received.

Background reading/external references

- To view details of the application go to
- [Planning and Building Standards online services](#)
- [Edinburgh City Local Plan and Rural West Edinburgh Local Plan](#)
- [Planning guidelines](#)
- [Conservation Area Character Appraisals](#)
- [Edinburgh Local Development Plan](#)
- [Scottish Planning Policy](#)

Statutory Development

Plan Provision

The site is allocated as Urban Area in the Edinburgh City Local Plan.

Date registered

2 July 2015

Drawing numbers/Scheme

01 - 47,

Scheme 1

John Bury

Head of Planning & Transport
PLACE
City of Edinburgh Council

Contact: Duncan Robertson, Senior Planning Officer
E-mail:d.n.robertson@edinburgh.gov.uk Tel:0131 529 3560

Links - Policies

Relevant Policies:

Relevant policies of the Edinburgh City Local Plan.

Policy Env 2 (Listed Buildings - Demolition) identifies the circumstances in which the demolition of listed buildings will be permitted.

Policy Env 3 (Listed Buildings - Setting) identifies the circumstances in which development within the curtilage or affecting the setting of a listed building will be permitted.

Policy Env 4 (Listed Buildings – Alterations & Extensions) identifies the circumstances in which alterations and extensions to listed buildings will be permitted.

Policy Env 6 (Conservation Areas Development) sets out criteria for assessing development in conservation areas.

Relevant Non-Statutory Guidelines

Non-statutory guidelines 'LISTED BUILDINGS AND CONSERVATION AREAS' provides guidance on repairing, altering or extending listed buildings and unlisted buildings in conservation areas.

The West Murrayfield Conservation Area Character Appraisal emphasises the range of high quality villas of restricted height enclosed by stone boundary walls, and the predominance of residential uses within the area.

Appendix 1

Application for Conservation Area Consent 15/03171/CON At 5 - 11 Ellersly Road, Edinburgh, EH12 6HY Demolition of extension to Westerlea House, demolition of Garden Building.

Consultations

Historic Environment Scotland

It is clear that the focus of the C-listed Stable complex is the articulated street elevation with returning wings. We therefore welcome that the proposed residential conversion scheme sees the retention and conversion of these elements. The applicant however proposes to demolish the truncated and altered rear wing of the court (now known as the Garden Building) to enable the site to be opened up for a new wing and reconfigured access arrangements. We note that the rear wing is subsidiary in terms of its scale, detailing, materials and layout to the main U-shaped wing. Your council therefore should consider whether its demolition can be viewed as part demolition (alteration) of a less significant component of the overall complex listed at Category C, therefore not requiring a full SHEP Demolition Test.

In the instance that your council determine that the proposal to demolish the rear wing does fulfil the SHEP Test in its own right, we can confirm that the applicant has not fully met the Test. Currently the applicant seeks to justify the demolition of the building by addressing both Test A and C, only one test needs to be met, we would therefore recommend, should your council deem it appropriate, that one test if focused on and fully addressed.

Location Plan



© Crown Copyright and database right 2014. All rights reserved. Ordnance Survey License number 100023420
END