

**Listed Building Consent Application 05/02094/LBC
at
Brodie's Close
302-304 Lawnmarket
Edinburgh
EH1 2PS**

**Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee**

1 Purpose of report

To consider application 05/02094/LBC, submitted by The Mound Property Co Ltd. The application is for: **Internal alterations to form 2 new retail units at ground floor and a bedroom wing for the proposed new hotel at 59-63 George IV Bridge, external repairs to the fabric and shopfronts (as amended).**

It is recommended that this application be **GRANTED** subject to the conditions in Appendix B.

2 The Site and the Proposal

Site description

The application relates to 16th and 17th century buildings located on the south side of the Lawnmarket. The buildings are five storey with an irregular fenestration pattern on the front elevation. The front of No 304 is a painted harled finish with No 302 finished in random ashlar. The buildings have a variety of outshoots to the rear, with both rear elevations finished in random rubble. The roofs of both buildings are finished in pantiles with various rooflights. Modern shopfronts occupy the ground floor facing onto the Lawnmarket with a cafe set to the rear of No 302. The properties incorporate

an arched opening leading to Brodie's Close and an area of open space to the rear.

Although much of the original interiors have been significantly altered, the buildings retain painted timber ceilings (probably 17th century) at second and fourth floors and a stone turnpike staircase. The buildings are currently interlinked and have existing connections to the former Lothian Regional Council Headquarters building at first and fourth floor level.

The buildings are category A listed and are located within the Old Town Conservation Area and World Heritage Site.

Site history

November 2001 - application ref. no. 01/03077/LBC - listed building consent granted for installation of temporary extract fan for the duration of Scottish Parliament Interim.

May 2002 - application ref. no. 02/00970/CEC - planning permission granted for installation of wall mounted CCTV camera.

May 2003 - application ref. no. 03/00973/GDT - no objections raised for consent for window advertisements.

May 2004 - application ref. no. 04/01206/ADV - application withdrawn for Scottish Parliament logo website address and phone number.

June 2004 - application ref. no. 04/01671/GDT - no objections raised for planning permission for renewal of application 03/00973/GDT.

June 2005 - application ref. no. 05/01231/CEC - planning permission granted for refurbishment of existing building and alterations to existing Parliament square door.

June 2005 - application ref. no. 05/01231/LBC - listed building consent granted for refurbishment of existing building and alterations to existing Parliament square door.

Concurrent applications for planning permission and conservation area consent for the redevelopment of the adjacent former Regional Council Head Quarters building are considered in separate reports.

Description of the Proposal

The application is for the conversion of 302-304 Lawnmarket to form bedroom accommodation for the associated hotel/mixed use development on the corner of the Lawnmarket and George IV Bridge. Retail units will be incorporated into the ground floor.

The proposed alterations to the listed buildings include:

- Removal of internal partitions and erecting new partitions to form bedroom and bathroom accommodation.
- Removing a modern fireplace at second floor level.
- Creating new slappings between the existing building and the proposed new build.
- Removing an existing rooflight on the rear elevation of No 302 and installing an area of louvres set behind an existing chimney.
- Removing the signage over the entrance to Brodie's Close.
- Much of the work shown on the drawings relates to the repair and restoration of various elements of the building. These works are intended to be undertaken on a like-for-like basis and are subject to further investigation.

The amendments to the proposals include:

- Retaining and repairing the existing shopfronts facing onto the Lawnmarket.
- Moving the proposed slapping at fifth floor level and associated partitions.
- Detailed drawings were submitted to show the junction between the proposed building and the listed building.

3 Officer's Assessment and Recommendations

DETERMINING ISSUES

The determining issues are:

- Do the proposals preserve the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses? If they do not, there is a presumption against the granting of consent;
- Do the proposals comply with the development plan?
- If the proposals do comply with the development plan, are there any compelling reasons for not approving them?
- If the proposals do not comply with the development plan, are there any compelling reasons for approving them?

ASSESSMENT

To address the determining issues, the Committee needs to consider whether the proposals have an adverse impact on the character of the listed building.

The proposal to remove the existing internal partitions is accepted as these are not original to the building and are of a modern construction and finish. The proposed replacement partitions will allow for the construction of new bedroom accommodation and will reflect the compartmental nature of the original building. The proposed bedrooms at second and fourth floor have been laid out to incorporate the painted timber ceilings which will respect the character of these spaces.

The proposed additional slappings between the buildings will result in the loss of some fabric. The proposed slappings will be limited to doorway width openings and will have minimal impact on the overall character of the listed building. The fireplace proposed for removal at second floor level is a modern addition and its removal is acceptable. The non-original door accessing the turnpike stair will be removed and a partition erected which will retain the stair in tact.

The main features of interest, such as the painted ceilings and the turnpike staircase, will be retained under the proposals. Some initial archaeological research has been undertaken with regard to the painted ceilings and their significance is acknowledged. A condition is recommended for a detailed programme of archaeological investigation to be undertaken. This will ensure the appropriate level of recording and surveying is completed. A condition is also recommended for a conservation plan to be submitted and agreed in writing. The intention of this is to provide a detailed analysis of the significance of the existing fabric, the implications the proposals will have on this historic building with recommendations made for its future conservation.

A number of repairs are proposed for these historic buildings, including the harling on the front elevation of No 304. Some areas of the existing harling have been removed from the frontage and it is evident that parts of the harling is applied to a wire mesh with timber framing set behind. A cement render has been applied to some parts of this facade, possibly as part of more recent repairs. Whilst the proposed drawings show this elevation repaired in cement render it is anticipated that the conservation plan will provide further investigation of these areas when an agreed strategy for repair and materials can be implemented.

The detail of the junction between the proposed new build and listed building shows a set back between the two elements. This will act as a clean break between the buildings and will be a sympathetic method of connecting the buildings.

The proposed louvres on the rear roof plane will replace an existing rooflight and will be set behind an existing chimney. This will be a discreet location on this secondary elevation and will have no adverse impact on the overall

character of the listed building. The submitted drawings propose the installation of a 'Mansafe' system to facilitate future roof maintenance and inspection. The drawings note that this will include roof anchors in discreet locations. Notwithstanding this, a condition is recommended for full detail of this system to be submitted to ensure it respects the character of the listed building.

As a number of en suites are proposed within the building, a condition is recommended for details of ventilation and services to be submitted. This will ensure these are located as sensitively as possible.

The removal of the signage over Brodie's Close is acceptable as this is a recent addition and its removal will help to expose the stonework set behind. The existing shopfronts will be retained and repaired where necessary and the existing appearance of these elements will be respected.

In conclusion, the proposals represent a sensitive re-use of this historic building with the alterations and repairs undertaken in a manner sympathetic to the overall character of the listed building.

The proposals comply with the development plan and non-statutory guidelines and have no adverse impact on the character of the listed building.

There are no other material planning considerations, which outweigh this conclusion.

It is recommended that the Committee approves this application, subject to conditions relating to materials, paint scheme, ventilation and services, the 'Mansafe' system, and a programme of archaeological investigation and conservation plan being submitted and agreed.

Alan Henderson

Alan Henderson
Head of Planning and Strategy

Contact/tel	Damian McAfee on 0131 529 3529 (FAX 529 3717)
Ward affected	32 - Tollcross
Local Plan	Central Edinburgh Local Plan
Statutory Development Plan Provision	Mixed Activities
Date registered	17 June 2005
Drawing numbers/ Scheme	01-04, 06, 13-21 Scheme 2

Advice to Committee Members and Ward Councillors

The full details of the application are available for viewing on the Planning and Building Control Portal: www.edinburgh.gov.uk/planning.

If you require further information about this application you should contact the following Principal Planner, Martin Easson on 0131 529 3989. Email: martin.easson@edinburgh.gov.uk.

If this application is not identified on the agenda for presentation, and you wish to request a presentation of this application at the Committee meeting, you must contact Committee Services by 9.00a.m. on the Tuesday preceding the meeting on extension 4229/4239. Alternatively, you may e-mail blair.ritchie@edinburgh.gov.uk or sarah.bogunovic@edinburgh.gov.uk

Application Type Listed Building Consent Application
Application Address: Brodie's Close
302-304 Lawnmarket
Edinburgh
EH1 2PS

Proposal: Internal alterations to form 2 new retail units at ground floor and a bedroom wing for the proposed new hotel at 59-63 George IV Bridge, external repairs to the fabric and shopfronts (as amended).

Reference No: 05/02094/LBC

Consultations, Representations and Planning Policy

Consultations

No consultations undertaken.

Representations

The application was advertised on 1 July 2005.

One non-material objection was made by the Edinburgh Old Town Association relating to the proposed redevelopment of the neighbouring site, the uses and the proposed new building.

Full copies of the representations made in respect of this application are available in Group Rooms or can be requested for viewing at the Main Reception, City Chambers, High Street.

Planning Policy

The application property lies within the Mixed Activities Zone of the Central Edinburgh Local Plan.

Relevant Policies:

Policy CD2 (LISTED BUILDINGS) sets out criteria for assessing proposals affecting listed buildings and seeks to safeguard their character and setting.

Policy CD19 (BUILDING ALTERATIONS) sets out requirements for the design, form, materials and positioning of alterations and extensions.

Non-statutory guidelines on 'HISTORIC BUILDING REPAIRS' provide good practice for carrying out repairs to historic buildings, and specify when planning permission and/or listed building consent is required.

Non-statutory guidelines 'ALTERATIONS TO LISTED BUILDINGS' provide general guidance for assessing proposals for both internal and external alterations.

Non-statutory guidelines on 'SUB-DIVISION OF LISTED BUILDINGS' supplement local plan conservation and design policies, providing guidance on sub-division with the aim of protecting the character and appearance of listed buildings.

Application Type Listed Building Consent Application
Application Address: Brodie's Close
302-304 Lawnmarket
Edinburgh
EH1 2PS

Proposal: Internal alterations to form 2 new retail units at ground floor and a bedroom wing for the proposed new hotel at 59-63 George IV Bridge, external repairs to the fabric and shopfronts (as amended).

Reference No: 05/02094/LBC

Conditions/Reasons associated with the Recommendation

Recommendation

It is recommended that this application be **GRANTED**

Conditions

1. The works hereby permitted shall be commenced no later than five years from the date of this consent.
2. The application shall be referred to the Scottish Ministers prior to determination.
3. A detailed specification, including trade names where appropriate, of all the proposed external materials shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Head of Planning & Strategy before work is commenced on site; Note: samples of the materials may be required.
4. Details of the paint colour scheme shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Head of Planning & Strategy within three months of the date of this consent, or prior to work commencing on site, whichever is the sooner.
5. Details of all proposed external ventilation and services shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Head of Planning & Strategy before work is commenced on site.
6. A conservation plan for the repair and restoration of the buildings shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Head of Planning and Strategy and the City Archaeologist before work is commenced on site.

7. Details of the proposed 'Mansafe' system shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Head of Planning & Strategy before work is commenced on site.
8. No works shall take place until the applicant has secured the implementation of a programme of archaeological work, in accordance with a written scheme of investigation which has been submitted to and approved in writing by the Head of Planning & Strategy, having first been agreed by the City Archaeologist.

Reasons

1. In order to accord with the statutory requirements of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Acts.
2. In order to accord with the statutory requirements of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Acts.
3. In order to enable the Head of Planning & Strategy to consider this/these matter/s in detail.
4. In order to safeguard the character of the statutorily listed building.
5. In order to enable the Head of Planning & Strategy to consider this/these matter/s in detail.
6. In order to safeguard the character of the statutorily listed building.
7. In order to enable the Head of Planning & Strategy to consider this/these matter/s in detail.
8. In order to safeguard the interests of archaeological heritage.

End



Reproduction from the Ordnance Survey mapping with permission of the Controller of Her Majesty's Stationery Office © Crown Copyright. Unauthorised reproduction infringes Crown copyright and may lead to prosecution or civil proceedings. Licence Number 100023420 The City of Edinburgh Council 2004.

PLANNING APPLICATION

Address	Brodie's Close, 302-304 Lawnmarket, Edinburgh, EH1 2PS,		
Proposal	Internal alterations to form 2 new retail units at ground floor and a bedroom wing for the proposed new hotel at 59-63		
Application number:	05/02094/LBC	WARD	32- Tollcross
THE CITY OF EDINBURGH COUNCIL THE CITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT- PLANNING & STRATEGY			