

Development Management Sub Committee

Wednesday 17 June 2015

**Application for Planning Permission 15/01354/FUL
At 8 Ettrick Road, Edinburgh, EH10 5BJ
Extend garage and raise wall head with pitched roof over
incorporating bedroom/shower room.**

Item number	9.3
Report number	
Wards	A10 - Meadows/Morningside

Summary

The proposed development complies with the provisions of the Edinburgh City Local Plan and preserves the character and appearance of the Merchiston and Greenhill Conservation Area. Although it does not comply with Guidance for Householders in respect of loss of sunlight, an exception is justified in this case. There are no material considerations upon which to justify refusal of planning permission.

Outcome of previous Committee

This application was previously considered by Committee on 03.06.2015.

Site visit - This application was continued by the Committee for a site visit. The application is returning to Committee for a decision.

Links

[Policies and guidance for this application](#) CRPMER, CITE6, CITD11, NSHOU, NSLBCA,

Report

Application for Planning Permission 15/01354/FUL At 8 Etrick Road, Edinburgh, EH10 5BJ Extend garage and raise wall head with pitched roof over incorporating bedroom/shower room.

Recommendations

1.1 It is recommended that this application be Granted subject to the details below.

Background

2.1 Site description

The property is a detached two-storey villa on the west side of Etrick Road. This application site is located within the Merchiston and Greenhill Conservation Area.

2.2 Site History

5 October 1994 - planning permission was granted for the formation of two window openings in the kitchen and erection of a cold water storage tank housing on the roof, (application number 94/01890/FUL).

22 January 2008 - planning permission was granted for alterations to form an enlarged kitchen in to the garage, to replace the conservatory with a sun lounge, to add an en-suite shower room, and to enlarge the utility room, (application number 07/05086/FUL).

Main report

3.1 Description Of The Proposal

The application is to form a pitched roof and raised wall head over the existing garage, and to bring the front wall forward. The extension will measure 12.6m deep, extending 4.4m beyond the existing garage front. It will be 6.1m high, 2.4m higher than the existing garage. It will add a pitched roof over the garage, and the resulting valley will have a hidden platform on the east side of the new roof. The wall head on the west boundary will be increased in height by 80cms.

The front-facing window will be timber sash and case with double glazed units, and conservation-type rooflights are proposed on the north and west elevations. The walls will be harled to match the existing house, the roof will be slated, downpipes will be cast iron, and the garage door will be metal.

3.2 Determining Issues

Do the proposals harm the character or appearance of the conservation area? If they do, there is a strong presumption against granting of permission.

Do the proposals comply with the development plan?

If the proposals do comply with the development plan, are there any compelling reasons for not approving them?

If the proposals do not comply with the development plan, are there any compelling reasons for approving them?

3.3 Assessment

To address these determining issues, the Committee needs to consider whether:

- a) There is any adverse impact on the character and appearance of the conservation area or on that of the existing house;
- b) There is any adverse impact on neighbouring amenity;
- c) Equalities and human rights impacts have been addressed; and
- d) Public comments have been addressed.

a) Impact on the character and appearance of the conservation area and of the existing house

Edinburgh City Local Plan Policy Env6 states that development within a conservation area will be permitted which preserves or enhances the special character or appearance of the conservation area and is consistent with the relevant conservation area character appraisal. The relevant character appraisal is the Merchiston and Greenhill Conservation Area Character Appraisal (MGCACA). The spaciousness presented by the layout of the houses is referred to in MGCACA as being contributive to the character of the conservation area, as is the domestic grain, scale and building mass and the generous settings of individual houses.

The villas in Etrick Road feature a variety of extensions and additions of differing types, styles, scales, and forms. The proposed extension will not affect the spaciousness or the setting of the house within its curtilage, as it will be 4.4m deeper than the existing garage, but no wider, and it will occupy the space between the application property and No10 Etrick Road. The proposed extension is of a domestic scale and character, and will preserve the character of the conservation area.

Edinburgh City Local Plan Policy Env6 states that development within a conservation area will be permitted which demonstrates high standards of design and utilises materials appropriate to the historic environment. The extension is designed to match the pitched roof form of the existing extension and to unify that extension and the garage in appearance.

The proposed materials are to match the existing house, and the use of double glazing in the front window is acceptable. The proposed extension complies with this requirement of policy Env6.

The council's non-statutory Guidance for Householders contains specific advice on 'Extension to Villas', which is relevant in this assessment. The villa guidance requires that the character of the original villa should not be adversely changed as a result of development. Development in this case affects an extension and non-original garage. The original villa will not be adversely changed as a result of this development.

Villa guidance requires that the whole building should be in character with the scale, spacing, and rhythm of the street. The proposed extension is set behind the principal elevation, and is still of a domestic scale and appearance. The neighbouring property at No 10 Etrick Road has a large side extension. When considered with the proposed extension, this will not create the impression of a terrace, as the extensions will be read as later additions to the original buildings. Other properties in the street have had side extensions which have changed the scale, spacing, and rhythm of the street from its original character. In this case, the proposal will be sympathetic in character to these elements, albeit that that character has been compromised.

Villa guidance requires that the design approach should be subservient to the original building and relate to it. This proposal is a modest addition to the existing house which respects the pitched roof form of the existing extension and is subservient in scale. It is a domestic alteration to a domestic property.

The council's non-statutory Guidance for Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas states that the aim of development should be to preserve the spatial and structural patterns of the historic fabric and the architectural features that make the conservation area significant. The proposed extension is of a domestic scale, set behind the building line, and matching the roof pitch and materials of the existing house and extension. It will preserve the spatial and structural patterns within Etrick Road and the character and appearance of the conservation area.

b) Neighbouring amenity

The proposed extension will not result in any loss of privacy. The only window within 9m of a side boundary is for a shower room which would not be expected to have transparent glazing.

The proposed extension will not cause any loss of daylight to neighbouring windows. The windows on the extension to No 10 Etrick Road have been positioned closer to the boundary than those of the original house. As such, these windows are not afforded the same degree of protection as original windows are.

The proposed extension will not satisfy the 45 degree sunlight test in Guidance for Householders.

As a result of increasing the wall height by 80cms there will be additional overshadowing of 6.6sqm of the rear garden ground of No 10 Etrick Road. However, the orientation of Nos 8 and 10 is such that loss of sunlight will only be an issue in the mornings.

In addition, the area affected is of comparatively low amenity value. The space between the rear wall of the extension to No 10 Ettrick Road and the summerhouse belonging to 10B is shaded on three sides already, and the summerhouse itself is set within an area which is already overshadowed by the existing garage wall.

Loss of light and/or privacy to land and windows within the gable-to-gable situation is not protected, and is not assessed in this case.

c) Equalities and Human Rights

This application has no impact in terms of equalities and human rights. An Equalities and Human Rights Impact Assessment has been completed.

d) Public Comments

Material comments in objection

- Not in keeping with the character of the house - this has been addressed in the assessment - 3.3a);
- Not in keeping with the character and appearance of the conservation area - this has been addressed in the assessment - 3.3a); and
- Impact on amenity of neighbours by loss of daylight, sunlight, and privacy - 3.3b.

Non-material comments in objection

- The need for the development. It is not for the planning system to question the need for development;
- This proposal will set a precedent. The planning system is not based on precedence, but on whether development is in accordance with the local plan and assessment of other material considerations;
- Possible future use of the property as other than residential. The application is not for material change of use of the property. If there were to be a future material change of use of the property without planning permission, this would be a breach of planning control and could be investigated as such;
- Loss of view. The planning system protects amenity, which is a public consideration. It does not seek to protect private views over another person's property; and
- Disturbance during work if planning permission were granted. Noise arising from the implementation of lawful development is not controllable through the planning system.

Addendum to Assessment

The application was considered at the Development Management Sub-Committee on 3 June 2015.

Committee wished to visit the neighbouring garden to the north, in order to consider the impact on residential amenity.

The recommendation remains the same.

Conclusion

It is recommended that this application be Granted subject to the details below.

3.4 Conditions/reasons/informatives

Conditions:-

Informatives

It should be noted that:

1. The development hereby permitted shall be commenced no later than the expiration of three years from the date of this consent.
2. No development shall take place on the site until a 'Notice of Initiation of Development' has been submitted to the Council stating the intended date on which the development is to commence. Failure to do so constitutes a breach of planning control, under Section 123(1) of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997.
3. As soon as practicable upon the completion of the development of the site, as authorised in the associated grant of permission, a 'Notice of Completion of Development' must be given, in writing to the Council.

Financial impact

4.1 The financial impact has been assessed as follows:

There are no financial implications to the Council.

Risk, Policy, compliance and governance impact

5.1 Provided planning applications are determined in accordance with statutory legislation, the level of risk is low.

Equalities impact

6.1 The equalities impact has been assessed as follows:

The application has been assessed and has no impact in terms of equalities or human rights.

Sustainability impact

7.1 The sustainability impact has been assessed as follows:

This application is not subject to the sustainability requirements of the Edinburgh Design Guidance.

Consultation and engagement

8.1 Pre-Application Process

There is no pre-application process history.

8.2 Publicity summary of representations and Community Council comments

The application was advertised on 10 April 2015. 13 representations were received, all of which were objections. These included comments from Merchiston Community Council.

The letters of representation raised the following issues;

Material Representations

- The proposal is not in keeping with the character of the house;
- The proposal is not in keeping with the character and appearance of the conservation area; and
- Loss of neighbouring amenity.

Non-material Representations

- The need for the development;
- Setting a precedent;
- Future use of the property or change of use of the property;
- Loss of private view; and
- Disturbance during work if planning permission were granted.

Merchiston Community Council commented on the 'poor quality' of the submitted drawings, that the proposal is not in keeping with the character of the house. that the proposal is not in keeping with the character and appearance of the conservation area, loss of sunlight, and loss of privacy.

Background reading/external references

- To view details of the application go to
- [Planning and Building Standards online services](#)
- [Edinburgh City Local Plan and Rural West Edinburgh Local Plan](#)
- [Planning guidelines](#)
- [Conservation Area Character Appraisals](#)
- [Edinburgh Local Development Plan](#)
- [Scottish Planning Policy](#)

Statutory Development

Plan Provision

Date registered 23 March 2015

Drawing numbers/Scheme 01 - 11,

Scheme 1

David R. Leslie

Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards

Contact: Mark Dunlop, Planning Officer

E-mail: mark.dunlop@edinburgh.gov.uk Tel: 0131 469 3642

Links - Policies

Relevant Policies:

The Merchiston & Greenhill Conservation Area Character Appraisal emphasises the consistent domestic grain, scale and building mass; the high quality stone built architecture of restricted height, generous scale and fine proportions enclosed by stone boundary walls and hedges which define the visual and physical seclusion of the villas; the uniformity resulting from the predominant use of traditional building materials; and the predominance of residential uses within the area.

Policy Env 6 (Conservation Areas Development) sets out criteria for assessing development in conservation areas.

Policy Des 11 (Alterations and Extensions) sets criteria for assessing alterations and extensions to existing buildings.

Non-statutory guidelines 'GUIDANCE FOR HOUSEHOLDERS' provides guidance for proposals to alter or extend houses or flats.

Non-statutory guidelines 'LISTED BUILDINGS AND CONSERVATION AREAS' provides guidance on repairing, altering or extending listed buildings and unlisted buildings in conservation areas.

Appendix 1

**Application for Planning Permission 15/01354/FUL
At 8 Etrick Road, Edinburgh, EH10 5BJ
Extend garage and raise wall head with pitched roof over
incorporating bedroom/shower room.**

Consultations

No consultations undertaken.

Location Plan



© Crown Copyright and database right 2014. All rights reserved. Ordnance Survey License number 100023420
END