

Development Management Sub Committee

Wednesday 25 February 2015

**Application for Conservation Area Consent 14/01126/CON
At 7, 11, 13 Eyre Terrace, Edinburgh, EH3 5ER
Demolition of 7 Eyre Terrace and existing warehouse known
as the Scotsman Building.**

Item number	6.2(a)
Report number	
Wards	A05 - Inverleith

Summary

The principle of the demolition is acceptable. The demolition of the two unlisted buildings will provide a more suitable redevelopment site in the urban area. Conditions attached to the associated application for redevelopment of the site (if approved) will ensure high quality development which makes a positive contribution to the conservation area. Referral to Scottish Ministers is required.

Links

Policies and guidance for this application	LPC, CITE5, CITE2, OTH, CRPNEW,
--	---------------------------------

Report

Application for Conservation Area Consent 14/01126/CON At 7, 11, 13 Eyre Terrace, Edinburgh, EH3 5ER Demolition of 7 Eyre Terrace and existing warehouse known as the Scotsman Building.

Recommendations

1.1 It is recommended that this application be Granted subject to the details below.

Background

2.1 Site description

The site, approximately 0.39ha, is bounded by Eyre Place to the north, King George IV Park to the east and Eyre Terrace to the south and west. The northern part consists of an area of trees and shrubs and most of the southern part is grassed. An office block, the RBS Computer Data building, is located to the south on Eyre Terrace.

Two vacant buildings are located on the site. The smaller and older one is positioned almost centrally to the site and hard up against the boundary with King George IV Park. It is in an arts and crafts style and currently boarded up and in a state of disrepair. Historic records indicate that it was originally stables or a carter's house. The larger of the two buildings is a former warehouse known as The Scotsman Building. It was most recently used for storage. Other buildings once standing on the site have been demolished.

The surrounding area contains mixed uses with residential being the predominant land use. Shops and business tend to be found at ground floor level with residential use above. There are also several large office buildings in the area such as the RBS Data Centre. The site is near a local centre at Dundas Street and Henderson Row. It is also near frequent bus routes and within walking distance of the City Centre.

The area as a whole consists mainly of stone buildings of Georgian and Victorian eras with some modern buildings sprinkled about the area.

The World Heritage site is nearby. There are no listed buildings on the site.

This application site is located within the New Town Conservation Area.

2.2 Site History

18 June 2010 - Permission refused for the demolition of existing single storey 'PIE' factory and 2 storey office accommodation block, and existing single storey garage lock-ups at 13 Eyre Terrace (planning application 10/00769/CON).

4 April 2012 - Permission granted for the demolition of 11-13 Eyre Terrace and rear single storey lock-ups and replacement landscaping (planning application 11/03575/FUL).

25 April 2012 - Permission granted for demolition of 11-13 Eyre Terrace and rear single-storey lock-ups (planning application: 11/03575/CON).

24 March 2014 - Application received for planning permission in principle for mixed use development. Retail (class 1); financial, professional + other services (class 2); food + drink (class 3); business (class 4); hotels (class 7); residential (class 8, 9 + sui generis), car parking, access + other works, approval of siting + maximum height of principal building block, points of vehicular/pedestrian access + egress (planning application: 14/01177/PPP) (pending decision).

Main report

3.1 Description Of The Proposal

The application seeks Conservation Area Consent to demolish two buildings on the site.

3.2 Determining Issues

Do the proposals harm the character or appearance of the conservation area? If they do, there is a strong presumption against granting of consent.

3.3 Assessment

To address these determining issues, the Committee needs to consider whether:

- a) the buildings make a positive contribution to the character of the area;
- b) the proposed replacement development is of sufficient quality;
- c) the proposal will have any detrimental impact on equalities and human rights;
and
- d) comments raised have been addressed.

a) Character of the Area

The New Town Conservation Area Character Appraisal states that the New Town Conservation Area represents a planned urban concept of European significance with an overriding character of Georgian formality. Linked grid layouts make use of the topography to achieve a cohesive, uniform urban whole. The essential character includes:

- *The use of grid layout forms throughout the area provides a formal hierarchy of streets with controlled vistas and planned views;*
- *The designed relationship of stone buildings, pavements and setted roads gives a disciplined unity and cohesion to the conservation area;*

- *The standard palette of materials including blonde sandstone, timber windows and pitched slated roofs; and*
- *A wooded landscape predominantly of round-crowned deciduous tree of forest scale.*

The demolition of an unlisted building in a conservation area which makes a positive contribution to the character of the area will only be allowed in exceptional circumstances. Policy Env 5 - Conservation Areas - Demolition of Buildings - states that demolition is not normally permitted unless a detailed application is submitted for a replacement building, which enhances or preserves the character of the area or, if acceptable, for the landscaping of the site.

In this case, the accompanying application for redevelopment is for planning permission in principle, not a detailed application. This application is assessed in a separate report (14/01177/PPP). Supporting information submitted for the PPP application includes: a Planning and Heritage Statement; Design Statement; Transport Statement; Ecological Appraisal; Arboricultural Survey Report and Indicative Use Options.

Historic Scotland has advised that the stables/carter's building has a neutral impact in terms of its contribution to the Canonmills area and, therefore, demolition is acceptable. It is acknowledged that the building was designed by a famous Scottish architect, Lorimer, although it is not listed.

The carter's building is mostly hidden from view. It sits behind the tenement blocks in Eyre Terrace and the trees and shrubs of both the application site and King George IV Park. The carter's building has been vacant and boarded up for some time. Some of the original features are in a deteriorated state, have been removed or have been vandalised.

The Scotsman Building is positioned at the very end of Eyre Terrace near the RBS Data Centre and its car park. It is not in a prominent location within the streetscene and is not visible from the junction of Eyre Terrace/Eyre Place. The Scotsman Building is of no architectural merit and does not currently make a positive contribution to the character of the area.

Both buildings proposed for demolition are vacant and sit within a vacant site. Most of the site is in a poor quality state and does not make a positive contribution to the area. The demolition of the buildings would enable the site to be redeveloped more comprehensively. In these circumstances, the demolition is acceptable. Conditions are recommended to ensure that the buildings are not demolished before a detailed scheme has been approved and the Notification of Initiation of Development has been received with a start date for the detailed development.

Given that it has been concluded that the buildings proposed to be demolished do not contribute positively to the character of the area, the proposal does not require to be assessed in terms of Env 2 - Listed Buildings - Demolition.

On balance, therefore, the demolition is acceptable if the proposed replacement buildings(s) are of a high enough quality.

b) Replacement Development

An associated application is considered in a separate report (14/01177/PPP) for an alternative development on the site. It shows the positioning and heights of the blocks on the site. If the Planning Permission in Principle is granted the detailed design of the buildings and their impact on the character of the conservation area will be assessed through one or more AMC applications.

Whilst the design of the replacement buildings is unknown at this time, conditions attached to the PPP application (if approved) will ensure the replacement buildings will be high quality and will make a positive contribution to the character of the area.

It is recommended that the Committee approves this application subject to conditions including referral to Scottish Ministers prior to determination.

To ensure a historic record is retained, it is recommended that the Royal Commission on Ancient and Historic Monuments of Scotland (RCAHMS) is notified of this application and given the opportunity to record the cartman's building prior to its loss.

c) Equalities and Human Rights

It is not expected that the proposed demolitions will raise any equalities or human rights issues.

d) Public Comments

No public comments on material planning matters have been received for this application. However, two comments received relating to the proposed mixed use development on the site (14/01177PPP) referred to the demolition. The Cockburn Association included the planning application reference for the Conservation Area Consent and the other comment advised that a neighbouring building was designed by Lorimer. Neither provided objections or specific comments on the demolition of the buildings.

Conclusion

In conclusion, the principle of the demolition is acceptable. The demolition of the two unlisted buildings will provide a more suitable redevelopment site in the urban area. Conditions attached to the associated application for redevelopment of the site (if approved) will ensure high quality development which makes a positive contribution to the conservation area. Referral to Scottish Ministers is required.

There are no material considerations that outweigh this conclusion.

It is recommended that this application be Granted subject to the details below.

3.4 Conditions/reasons/informatives

Conditions:-

1. No demolition shall start until the applicant has confirmed in writing the start date for the new development by the submission of a Notice of Initiation.

2. The application shall be referred to the Scottish Ministers prior to determination.

Reasons:-

1. In order to safeguard the character of the conservation area.
2. In order to accord with the statutory requirements of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Acts.

Informatives

It should be noted that:

1. The Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Scotland shall be given access to the site, at any reasonable time in a period of at least three months from the date of this consent, for the purposes of recording the building, structure or other item of interest.
2. As soon as practicable upon the completion of the development of the site, as authorised in the associated grant of permission, a 'Notice of Completion of Development' must be given, in writing to the Council.

Financial impact

4.1 The financial impact has been assessed as follows:

There are no financial implications to the Council.

Risk, Policy, compliance and governance impact

5.1 Provided planning applications are determined in accordance with statutory legislation, the level of risk is low.

Equalities impact

6.1 The equalities impact has been assessed as follows:

The application has been assessed and has no impact in terms of equalities or human rights.

Sustainability impact

7.1 The sustainability impact has been assessed as follows:

This application is not subject to the sustainability requirements of the Edinburgh Design Guidance.

Consultation and engagement

8.1 Pre-Application Process

Pre-application discussions took place on this application.

8.2 Publicity summary of representations and Community Council comments

No specific letters of representation were received for the application. However, 23 letters were received for the associated application for Planning Permission in Principle (14/01177/PPP) for a proposed mixed use development on the site. One of the representations commented on the proposed demolition, referring to the building being designed by the famous Scottish architect Lorimer. The other comment was from The Cockburn Association which referred to the Conservation Area Consent application but not specifically to the proposed demolition.

Background reading/external references

- To view details of the application go to
- [Planning and Building Standards online services](#)
- [Edinburgh City Local Plan and Rural West Edinburgh Local Plan](#)
- [Planning guidelines](#)
- [Conservation Area Character Appraisals](#)
- [Edinburgh Local Development Plan](#)
- [Scottish Planning Policy](#)

**Statutory Development
Plan Provision**

The application site is in the New Town Conservation Area and the Urban Area of Edinburgh City Local Plan. It is near to, but not in, the World Heritage Site.

Date registered

24 March 2014

Drawing numbers/Scheme

01 - 03.,

Scheme 1

David R. Leslie

Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards

Contact: Jackie McInnes, Planning officer

E-mail:jackie.mcinnes@edinburgh.gov.uk Tel:0131 469 3731

Links - Policies

Relevant Policies:**Relevant policies of the Edinburgh City Local Plan.**

Policy Env 5 (Conservation Areas – Demolition of Buildings) sets out criteria for assessing proposals involving demolition of buildings in conservation areas.

Policy Env 2 (Listed Buildings - Demolition) identifies the circumstances in which the demolition of listed buildings will be permitted.

Other Relevant policy guidance

The New Town Conservation Area Character Appraisal states that the area is typified by the formal plan layout, spacious stone built terraces, broad streets and an overall classical elegance. The buildings are of a generally consistent three storey and basement scale, with some four storey corner and central pavilions.

Appendix 1

Application for Conservation Area Consent 14/01126/CON At 7, 11, 13 Eyre Terrace, Edinburgh, EH3 5ER Demolition of 7 Eyre Terrace and existing warehouse known as the Scotsman Building.

Consultations

Historic Scotland comment

We have carefully considered the proposal to demolish the former cartman's house and stable taking into consideration our decision in 2012 that the building did not meet the criteria for listing.

Therefore our appraisal has been based on whether the building makes a positive contribution to the New Town Conservation Area. Using the Conservation Area Appraisal document as a baseline for this assessment, we believe that the building has a neutral impact in terms of its contribution to the Canonmills area, therefore in this instance, demolition is acceptable.

We would recommend however, as suggested in the applicants 'Heritage Statement' that the Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historic Monuments of Scotland are notified of this decision and given the opportunity to record the building prior to its loss due to its association with R S Lorimer.

Location Plan



© Crown Copyright and database right 2014. All rights reserved. Ordnance Survey License number 100023420

END