

Development Management Sub Committee

Wednesday 28 January 2015

Application for Planning Permission 14/04101/FUL

**At 3 - 8 St Andrew Square, 7-21 South St David Street,
Edinburgh**

**Proposed amendments to an approved mixed use
development, comprising revisions to the elevational
treatment facing St Andrew square, creating a new façade to
replace the 6/7 St Andrew Square frontage**

Item number	6.3
Report number	
Wards	A11 - City Centre

Summary

The uses, overall concept and layout remain unchanged in relation to the previous consents. The design of the new element now matches that of the remainder of the proposal. The proposal complies with development plan policies and non-statutory guidelines. There is no adverse impact on the appearance of the conservation area or World Heritage Site. There are no other material planning considerations.

Links

<u>Policies and guidance for this application</u>	LPC, CITEM1, CITR2, CITE1, CITE3, CITE4, CITE6, CITD1, CITD3, CITD6, CITD10, CITH5, CITT2, CITT3, CITT4, CITT5, CITT6, CITCA1, NSG, NSLBCA,
---	---

Report

Application for Planning Permission 14/04101/FUL At 3 - 8 St Andrew Square, 7-21 South St David Street, Edinburgh Proposed amendments to an approved mixed use development, comprising revisions to the elevational treatment facing St Andrew square, creating a new façade to replace the 6/7 St Andrew Square frontage

Recommendations

1.1 It is recommended that this application be Granted subject to the details below.

Background

2.1 Site description

The site lies to the south side of St Andrew Square, abutting South St David Street on its west side.

The site has been cleared of all structures other than a sole Edwardian building to the east side, which was listed category A (Reference: 29696) on 14 December 1970.

The site lies in the World Heritage Site.

This application site is located within the New Town Conservation Area.

2.2 Site History

3 May 2007: - listed building consent granted to demolish the listed Victorian facades at 4,5 St Andrew Square and demolish all sections of the Prudential building facing South St David Street and all southern extensions other than the original building itself (6/7 St Andrew Square) (Reference: 06/03441/LBC).

12 October 2007: - planning permission granted for a redevelopment creating office space with retail use on the ground floors (Reference: 06/03441/FUL).

18 June 2008: - the proposed mixed use redevelopment scheme (Reference: 06/03441/FUL) was re-presented to Committee in order to resolve a partial Stopping Up Order required on South St David Street.

10 May 2012: - Proposal of Application Notice received covering the renewal of consent (Reference: 12/01498/PAN).

22 October 2012: - section 42 application approved to renew the consent for a period of 3 years (Reference: 12/03241/FUL).

9 November 2012: - renewal of listed building consent (Reference:12/03241/LBC).

27 June 2013: - planning permission to increase the height of the 1960s block by 700mm was approved (Reference: 13/01835/FUL).

14 August 2013: - an application for listed building consent (identical to the current application in all but description) was continued by Committee for a site visit and to include SHEP test (Reference: 13/01834/LBC) and then withdrawn.

18 September 2013:- an application for listed building consent (Reference: 13/01834/LBC) was withdrawn in relation to legal concerns regarding the description of works.

17 January 2014 - listed building consent granted to demolish the facade of 6/7 St Andrew Square (the 1960s building) to permit reconfiguration of floor plates prior to rebuilding (Reference: 13/03955/LBC).

15 July 2014 - Historic Scotland deleted 6/7 St Andrew Square from the Statutory List.

13 August 2014 - Proposal of Application Notice for the site as a whole (but including current revision) approved (Reference: 14/02836/PAN).

14 October 2014 - conservation area consent granted for the remnant (de-listed) sections in order to clarify that western section of the site may be wholly cleared (Reference: 14/03533/CON).

11 December 2014 - planning permission granted to vary previous consents to widen permitted ground floor uses to also allow classes 2 and 3 (Reference: 14/04100/FUL).

Main report

3.1 Description Of The Proposal

The application seeks a material variation to a live consent, currently on site, to permit a change to the design of a 32m wide section on the north elevation.

This section was previously approved as a facade rebuild of a 1960s building, 6/7 St Andrew Square. It is now proposed as a series of stone fins in front of a largely glazed frontage, echoing the remainder of the design (which is based around vertical bronze fins), but retaining a strong vertical element in the area previously occupied by the stair tower. These fins are spaced slightly wider than on the remainder of the approved scheme, and will over-run at eaves level to create a lattice effect at rooftop level.

Other than this element of frontage, no other aspect of the application proposes changes in relation to existing consents.

Full Design Statements and Pre-Application Consultation Reports were submitted with the application. These are available to view on the Planning and Building Standards online services.

3.2 Determining Issues

Do the proposals harm the character or appearance of the conservation area? If they do, there is a strong presumption against granting of consent.

In considering whether to grant consent, special regard must be had to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses. For the purposes of this issue, preserve, in relation to the building, means preserve it either in its existing state or subject only to such alterations or extensions as can be carried out without serious detriment to its character.

Do the proposals comply with the development plan?

If the proposals do comply with the development plan, are there any compelling reasons for not approving them?

If the proposals do not comply with the development plan, are there any compelling reasons for approving them?

3.3 Assessment

To address these determining issues, the Committee needs to consider whether:

- a) the proposed uses are acceptable;
- b) the re-designed element preserves or enhances the character and appearance of the conservation area;
- c) the re-designed element impacts on the special architectural or historic interest of the listed building or its setting;
- d) road safety and parking issues are adequately addressed;
- e) the proposal has any equalities or human rights impacts; and
- f) the representations raise issues to be addressed.

a) The Acceptability of the Proposed Uses

The uses are unchanged in relation to the live consent.

The predominant use remains office, which fully occupies all upper floor sections within the new building, other than a potential rooftop restaurant. Lower floors uses remain commercial (Classes 1,2 and 3). The eastmost building (the only building remaining on site) continues to be proposed for residential conversion.

The uses remain acceptable.

b) Character and Appearance of the Conservation Area and Effect on World Heritage Site

The New Town Conservation Area Character Appraisal outlines the special character and appearance of the conservation area. It outlines that *the New Town Conservation Area is typified by formal plan layouts, spacious stone built terraces, broad streets and an overall elegance...the 20th century's contribution to the New Town has been muted by comparison with the Georgians and Victorians with a sprinkling of good modern buildings that make a contribution to the New Town.*

St Andrew Square was one of the first squares to be built in the New Town but few of the original buildings remain. The square is characterised by a mix of buildings from all periods and this gives it a unique character which is different to other more formal squares in the New Town, each side of the square having its own unique character.

In relation to the previously agreed (and live) consent, the only element of change is a 32m wide section of the north elevation facing the square. This is now shown echoing the remainder of the new build scheme, rather than a replica frontage as previously consented. In relation to the character and appearance of the conservation area it is conceded that if the design concept is acceptable across the remainder of the site then it is also acceptable over this additional section. The revision creates a more unified form when viewed as a whole. As the frontage at 6/7 St Andrew Square is no longer listed and no longer exists, alternative solutions (other than a replica building as previously approved) may be considered. The design of the previous listed frontage is no longer a determining factor.

In terms of the character of the conservation area, the new section is very similar to the design concept already approved over the remainder of the site, and agreed as being appropriate to its site. The main change in this section is the use of stone rather than metal fins, a design device intended to mark this section as the entrance. The basis of this design is a series of long vertical fins, projecting from the building frontage, counter-balanced with areas of glazing at ground floor and at higher level. The differences from the main design in this revised section are limited to a slightly wider spacing of the vertical fins and change from metal to stone, plus an over-run of the fins at eaves level to create a rooftop lattice effect. The building represents a high quality modern infill development. The form and design are acceptable.

As previously, this section acts as the main entrance to the office component. The new design specifically seeks to create a more open entrance area, echoing the double height glazed frontages approved for the retail elements. The change in materials at upper level seeks to signal this as the entrance.

The overall building envelope remains as previously agreed and there is no effect upon protected key views.

The design of the revised building element is considered appropriate to the character and appearance of the conservation area and has no negative impact on the World Heritage Site.

c) Impact on the Remaining Listed Building and its Setting

The scheme retains a category A building to its east side. The relationship of the new-build elements to this (and other) listed buildings remains unchanged in relation to the live consent and remains acceptable.

No further alterations, beyond those currently consented, are proposed to the sole remaining listed building.

As the formerly listed building at 6/7 St Andrew Square is no longer listed this element can no longer be part of the assessment.

d) Road Safety and Parking

Parking and access arrangements are unchanged in relation to the live consent and do not require further assessment.

Section 75 agreements relating to tram contributions and the public realm are unaltered by the amended proposals. A new Section 75 is not required.

e) Equalities and Human Rights

There are no issues arising in relation to equalities or human rights.

f) Public Comments

Four objections were received including comment from the Cockburn Association.

Material Representations

- The proposed building is of insufficient quality, and lacks the "grandeur" of the rest of the square - addressed in section 3.3 c) of Assessment.

Non-Material Representations

- The new building is a "mirror image" of the buildings demolished - this seems to be a misinterpretation of drawings.
- The scheme should require the retention of the listed building - this is not a matter for consideration. The buildings are no longer listed.
- The alteration will reduce building cost - this is both irrelevant and incorrect. The applicant estimates the additional cost at over £1 million.

Community Council Comments

The New Town and Broughton Community Council made no comments on the application.

Conclusion

The uses, overall concept and layout remain unchanged in relation to the previous consents. The design of the new element matches that of the remainder of the proposal.

The proposal complies with development plan policies and non-statutory guidelines. There will be no adverse impact on the appearance of the conservation area or World Heritage Site. There are no other material planning considerations.

It is noted that (as a development on site) nearly all conditions of the previous consent have been discharged. Two remaining aspects are attached as conditions.

It is recommended that this application be Granted subject to the details below.

3.4 Conditions/reasons/informatives

Conditions:-

1. All living apartments facing St Andrew Square shall be fitted with a suitably designed secondary glazing system to protect apartments from traffic noise. A suitable system of passive ventilation shall be installed to enable fresh air to enter without opening windows. Details of these elements shall be supplied to the Head of Planning and Building Standards for approval prior to works commencing on the residential element.
2. Samples of the approved fin material to be submitted for approval prior to application of this element.

Reasons:-

1. In order to enable the Head of Planning to consider this/these matter/s in detail.
2. In order to protect the amenity of the occupiers of the development.

Financial impact

4.1 The financial impact has been assessed as follows:

There are no financial implications to the Council.

Risk, Policy, compliance and governance impact

5.1 Provided planning applications are determined in accordance with statutory legislation, the level of risk is low.

Equalities impact

6.1 The equalities impact has been assessed as follows:

The application has been assessed and has no impact in terms of equalities or human rights.

Sustainability impact

7.1 The sustainability impact has been assessed as follows:

This application meets the sustainability requirements of the Edinburgh Design Guidance.

Consultation and engagement

8.1 Pre-Application Process

Pre-application discussions took place on this application.

8.2 Publicity summary of representations and Community Council comments

The application was advertised on 24th October 2014. Four representations were received: three from Edinburgh residents and one from the Cockburn Association.

Material Representations

The proposal does not match the grandeur of the square.

The design is "as bad as the buildings being demolished".

Non-material Representations

The new building is a "mirror image" of the buildings demolished.

The previous consent was granted on the basis of the retention of the listed building/ the listed building should be rebuilt.

The proposal will reduce building cost.

Background reading/external references

- To view details of the application go to
- [Planning and Building Standards online services](#)

**Statutory Development
Plan Provision**

The site lies within the Central Area in the core of the World Heritage Site.

Date registered

10 October 2014

Drawing numbers/Scheme

1-20,

Scheme 1

David R. Leslie

Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards

Contact: Stephen Dickson, Senior planning officer

E-mail:stephen.dickson@edinburgh.gov.uk Tel:0131 529 3529

Links - Policies

Relevant Policies:

Relevant policies of the Edinburgh City Local Plan.

Policy Emp 1 (Office Development) identifies locations and circumstances in which office development will be permitted.

Policy Ret 2 (Town Centres) sets criteria for assessing retail development in or on the edge of town centres.

Policy Env 1 (World Heritage Site) protects the quality of the World Heritage Site and its settings.

Policy Env 3 (Listed Buildings - Setting) identifies the circumstances in which development within the curtilage or affecting the setting of a listed building will be permitted.

Policy Env 4 (Listed Buildings – Alterations & Extensions) identifies the circumstances in which alterations and extensions to listed buildings will be permitted.

Policy Env 6 (Conservation Areas Development) sets out criteria for assessing development in conservation areas.

Policy Des 1 (Design Quality and Context) sets general criteria for assessing design quality and requires an overall design concept to be demonstrated.

Policy Des 3 (Development Design) sets criteria for assessing development design.

Policy Des 6 (Sustainable Design & Construction) sets criteria for assessing the sustainable design and construction elements of development.

Policy Des 10 (Tall Buildings) sets out criteria for assessing proposals for tall buildings.

Policy Hou 5 (Conversion to Housing) sets criteria for assessing the change of use to residential.

Policy Tra 2 (Planning Conditions and Agreements) requires, where appropriate, transport related conditions and/or planning agreements for major development likely to give rise to additional journeys.

Policy Tra 3m (Tram Contributions) requires contributions from developers towards the cost of tram works where the proposed tram network will help address the transport impacts of a development.

Policy Tra 4 (Private Car Parking) requires private car parking provision to comply with the parking levels set out in supplementary planning guidance, and sets criteria for assessing lower provision.

Policy Tra 5 (Private Cycle Parking) requires cycle parking provision in accordance with levels set out in supplementary guidance.

Policy Tra 6 (Design of Off-Street Car and Cycle Parking) sets criteria for assessing design of off-street car and cycle parking.

Policy Ca 1 (Central Area) sets criteria for assessing development in the Central Area.

Relevant Non-Statutory Guidelines

Non-statutory guidelines 'LISTED BUILDINGS AND CONSERVATION AREAS' provides guidance on repairing, altering or extending listed buildings and unlisted buildings in conservation areas.

Appendix 1

**Application for Planning Permission 14/04101/FUL
At 3 - 8 St Andrew Square, 7-21 South St David Street,
Edinburgh**

**Proposed amendments to an approved mixed use
development, comprising revisions to the elevational
treatment facing St Andrew square, creating a new façade to
replace the 6/7 St Andrew Square frontage**

Consultations

No consultations undertaken.

Location Plan



© Crown Copyright and database right 2014. All rights reserved. Ordnance Survey License number 100023420
END