

Development Management Sub-Committee of the Planning Committee

10.00 am, Wednesday, 6 November 2013

Present

Councillors Perry (Convener), Howat (Vice-Convener), Bagshaw, Blacklock, Brock, Child, Dixon, Heslop, McVey, Milligan, Rose, Robson and Ross.

1. 154 Mcdonald Road, Edinburgh (Agenda Item 6.1)

The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards reported on an application for planning permission for the alterations to and change of use from offices to form residential accommodation. Application no. 13/02458/FUL

He gave details of the proposals and the planning considerations included, and recommended that planning permission be granted.

A site visit was undertaken by the sub-committee on 31 October 2013.

(a) New Town Broughton Community Council

Richard Price, on behalf of New Town Broughton Community Council advised that they objected to this application. Mr Price reiterated the concerns of the Community Council representation on 25 July 2013, primarily:

- Lack of pre-application consultation procedure being employed for a major application of more than 50 dwellings.
- The provision of housing in direct proximity to a primary school could be deemed material in terms of incompatibility.
- Scheme affordability.
- Parking/car ownership.
- External aspects to the building.

Mr Price added that after further consultation with the local community and a site visit in October the Community Council would like further concerns to be noted;

- Those choosing to live in the development (key workers) may have abnormal work patterns/shift work, which is not compatible with the Primary School.
- The school playground was designated as available for use until 9pm. This had caused issues regarding noise in other locations.
- The proposal states that the area was 'highly accessible by public transport' which the Community Council strongly rejected
- Waste management for the development was believed to be inadequate as proposed
- Concluding that the development was not supported by the Environmental Assessment due to noise both internal and external.

(b) Leith Central Community Council

Julian Siann, on behalf of Leith Central Community Council advised that they objected to this application. Mr Siann felt that the building itself did not lend itself to being converted into flats and that no serious attempts had been made by the developers to reform the internal structure to remedy this concern. The objector felt that accommodation would be inflexible and cramped as it did not meet the Edinburgh Design Guidance standards. The objector felt that the development offered no housing mix and as such would lead to a rapid turnover of occupancy. Concerns around the green space and parking facilities for the development were also expressed; in conclusion the Community Council felt that the application was unsympathetic and failed to meet the needs of the area.

(c) Parents of Children at Broughton Primary School

Sandra Bagnall and John Gardner, on behalf of Parents of Children at Broughton Primary School Council advised that they objected to this application. Their objections were on the basis that the planning application does not comply with current development policy, primarily in regards to the size of the apartments, and that the correct application procedure had not been followed. The objector also noted concerns around housing density, waste collection, lack of open and green space, housing mix, lack of affordable housing, and lack of car parking facilities within and around the proposed development.

Sandra Bagnall was concerned about privacy and the potential conflict between residents of the proposed development and the school community. Ms Bagnall said that there was an assumption that prospective owners of the development would accept the noise generated from the school, she also noted that similar developments i.e. residential properties within close proximity to schools, had resulted in conflicts that she did not want to see this replicated at McDonald Road.

(d) Malcolm Chisholm MSP

Malcolm Chisholm MSP addressed the Committee on behalf of his constituents advising that they objected to this application. Mr Chisholm highlighted the number of planning policies that the application contravened. He felt that McDonald Road was a busy thoroughfare and the fact that the development did not offer parking facilities this would only serve to exacerbate the situation. The public transport links, Mr Chisholm felt, would not support the scale of the development. Other concerns raised by Mr Chisholm were that:

- The housing mix was nonexistent.
- Doubted that the Units would meet the 36m² minimum space requirement.
- Units would not receive the necessary day light required.

(e) Cockburn Association

Marion Williams, on behalf of the Cockburn Association advised that they objected to this application. Ms Williams was concerned that the development may hinder the long term viability of the Primary School, as the development would seriously curtail any potential development/redesign to the primary school in order to meet an increasing school role.

(f) The Applicant

Alex Watts and Paul Scott on behalf of Kingsford Development spoke in favour of the development. The applicants empathised with the objectors and welcomed the opportunity to work with them to address their concerns. The applicants felt that the development would address Edinburgh shortage of affordable housing and would help support first time buyers get on the housing market. The applicant recognised that the space for each Unit was limited but by using contemporary and aspirational designs they could maximise the space available adding that the communal facilities within the development would support the design. The developers estimated that around 150 jobs would be created by the development.

(g) Ward Councillors

Councillor Gardner was supportive of the other objectors. He felt that the proposal was not one of affordable housing but would encourage let to buy or party flats, as a consequence he had serious concerns around anti-social behaviour within the development. Councillor Grander has received concerns from across the community, due in part to the location of the development around an already busy road, the size of Units that were below the policy standard and the environment assessment not supporting the application.

Councillor Chapman submitted a statement objecting to the proposal.

Motion

1. To grant planning permission subject to conditions, informatives and a legal agreement as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning.
2. Subject also to conditions that the room sizes be no less that 36m² and that the windows facing the playground in units 18, 19 and 20 be treated to obscure the view of the playground to the satisfaction of the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.

- moved by Councillor Perry, seconded by Councillor Howat.

Amendment

- 1) To indicate the intention to refuse planning permission for the application, for the reason that the proposal is contrary to Edinburgh City Local Plan Policy Ret Local Plan Policy Hou 2, 3 and 5 and Tra 4 & 5.
- 2) The Head of Planning and Building Standards to report further on the detail of the reasons for refusal

- moved by Councillor Bagshaw, seconded by Councillor Brock.

Voting

For the motion - 6 votes
For the amendment - 7 votes

Decision

- 1) To indicate the intention to refuse planning permission for the application, for the reason that the proposal is contrary to Edinburgh City Local Plan Policy Ret Local Plan Policy Hou 2, 3 and 5 and Tra 4 & 5.
- 2) The Head of Planning and Building Standards to report further on the detail of the reasons for refusal

(Reference - report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards, submitted.)

2. General Applications and Miscellaneous Business

The Sub-Committee considered the reports on planning applications and pre-application as listed in Sections 4, 6, 7 and 8 of the agenda for the meeting.

Decision

To determine the application as detailed in the appendix to this minute.

Dissent

Councillor Ross requested that his dissent be recorded in respect of the decision made at agenda item 4.4. The application to Convert the attic and form 6 person HMO maisonette from 5 person HMO flat at 3F1 100 Polwarth Gardens, Edinburgh, EH11 1LH

(Reference – report by the Acting Head of {Planning and Building Standards, submitted)

3. Seaview Terrace

Details were provided of an application to demolish a garage and erect a domestic dwelling at 27 Seaview Terrace. Application number 13/02193/FUL.

The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards gave details of the proposals and the planning considerations included, and recommended that planning permission be granted.

A site visit was undertaken by the sub-committee on 31 October 2013.

Motion

To grant planning permission subject to informatives as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning.

- moved by Councillor Perry, seconded by Councillor Howat.

Amendment

To indicate that the Sub-Committee was minded to refuse the application on the grounds that the development was an unacceptable intrusion to the area and would result in the loss of a key view of the Forth.

- moved by Councillor Child, seconded by Councillor Brock.

Voting

For the motion	-	7 votes
For the amendment	-	3 votes

Decision

To grant planning permission subject to informatives as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning.

(Reference - report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards, submitted.)

4. Shrub Place

Details were provided on applications for a proposed Mixed Use Development redevelopment of Listed Buildings (Tram Workshops) application no. 13/01070/FUL, and proposals to retain the existing chimney, alter the existing tram workshops to accommodate residential development, and reduce the height of the existing gable wall to remove requirement for galvanised steel buttresses application no 13/01071/LBC at 7 Shrub Place, Edinburgh.

The Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards gave details of the proposals and the planning considerations included, and recommended that planning permission be granted.

A site visit was undertaken by the sub-committee on 31 October 2013.

Motion

1. To grant planning permission subject to conditions, informatives and a legal agreement, and listed building consent subject to as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning.
2. To grant planning permission and listed building consent subject to conditions, informatives and notification to the Scottish Ministers prior to determination
3. To note that the Sub-Committee was accepting a minor infringement in terms of sizes of units given the submission of the application before the Edinburgh Design Guidance was adopted, and also because of the extant planning permission where a greater proportion of units were below the minimum floor area in the guidance.

- moved by Councillor Howat, seconded by Councillor Perry.

Amendment

To continue consideration of the applications for discussions with the developer on increasing the room sizes to meet the Edinburgh Design Guidance standards and any proposals to reduce the density of the development.

- moved by Councillor Ross, seconded by Councillor Bagshaw.

Voting

For the motion - 8 votes

For the amendment - 3 votes

Decision

1. To grant planning permission subject to conditions, informatives and a legal agreement, and listed building consent subject to as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning.
2. To grant listed building consent subject to conditions, informatives and notification to the Scottish Ministers prior to determination
3. To note that the Sub-Committee was accepting a minor infringement in terms of sizes of units given the submission of the application before the Edinburgh Design Guidance was adopted, and also because of the extant planning permission where a greater proportion of units were below the minimum floor area in the guidance.

(Reference - reports by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards, submitted.)

APPENDIX

Applications

Agenda Item No/ Address	Details of Proposal/Reference No	Decision
<p>Note: Detailed conditions/reasons for the following decisions are contained in the statutory planning register.</p>		
<p>General application and miscellaneous business</p>		
<p>Item No 4.1 - 1 Craigpark, Ratho (Craigpark Quarry)</p>	<p>Material variation to planning permission Ref; 05/01229/FUL to provide amended housing layout and substitution of house types and associated works. – Application no. 13/02527/FUL</p>	<p>To GRANT the application subject to conditions, informatives and a legal agreement, as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standard</p>
<p>Item No 4.2 - 63A Cumberland Street, Edinburgh</p>	<p>Replace existing sashes in front bedroom window with slimline double glazing units to match existing appearance. Replace fanlight of 3 windows above rear patio door with slimline double glazing to match existing appearance. – Application no. 13/03334/LBC</p>	<p>To GRANT listed building consent with an informative, as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.</p>
<p>Item No 4.3 - Greendykes Road, Edinburgh (Land at)</p>	<p>Approval of matters specified in conditions of application 07/01644/OUT</p>	<p>To APPROVE the application permission subject to conditions as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.</p>
<p>Item No 4.4 - 100 (3F1) Polwarth Gardens, Edinburgh</p>	<p>Convert attic and form 6 person HMO maisonette from 5 person HMO flat. Fit 2 no. rooflights to front elevation, 2 no. rooflights to rear elevation and rooflight to platform roof. – Application no. 13/02955/FUL</p>	<p>To GRANT the application subject to informatives as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.</p> <p>Note: Councillor Ross requested that his dissent be recorded in respect of the above decision</p>
<p>Item No 4.5 - 16 Ravenscroft Street, Edinburgh</p>	<p>Reopening of door in boundary wall to lane to allow access to mobility scooter.– Application no. 13/02968/FUL</p>	<p>To GRANT the application subject to informatives as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.</p>

Agenda Item No/ Address	Details of Proposal/Reference No	Decision
Item No 4.6 - 4 Seafield Street, Edinburgh	Construction of 155 dwellings (145 flats and 10 houses), including demolition of the Gatehouse at 4 Seafield Street and conversion of the Chapel and the Matron's House to form residential dwellings. – Application no. 13/02584/FUL	To GRANT the application subject to conditions, informatives and a legal agreement, as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.
Item No 4.7 - 8 Shandwick Place, Edinburgh	Change of use from vacant storage of a shop and residential accommodation to a hostel (class 7). – Application no. 13/02490/FUL	To GRANT the application subject to informatives and a legal agreement, as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.
Item No 4.8 - 9 Shandwick Place, Edinburgh	Change of use application from Class 1 (Retail) to Class 3 (Food and Drink) at the merged units of 9 and 13 Shandwick Place. – Application no. 13/01433/FUL	To APPROVE the planning permission subject to conditions, to informatives and a legal agreement, as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.
Application for Hearing		
Item No 6.1 - 154 Mcdonald Road, Edinburgh	Protocol note on hearing procedure	Noted
Item No 6.1(a) – 154 Mcdonald Road, Edinburgh	Alteration to and change of use from offices to form residential accommodation (as amended). – Application no 13/02458/FUL	To REFUSE the planning for the reasons that the proposal was contrary to policies Hou 2,3 and 5 and Trans 4 and 5 (On a division)

Agenda Item No/ Address	Details of Proposal/Reference No	Decision
Item No 6.2(b) - 154 Mcdonald Road, Edinburgh	Alterations to form studio residential accommodation (73 units) and associated works including removal of existing internal walls and insertion of new internal partitions; insertion of new windows to rear elevation; insertion of conservation roof lights to rear slope of roof; creation of sun room access to new roof terrace and installation of balustrade; addition of photo-voltaic panels to flat roof; and widening of existing access on south east elevation (as amended to delete rooftop sun room). – Application no. 13/02459/LBC	To GRANT listed building consent with an informative, as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards.
Pre-Application Reports		
Item No 7.1 - A8 West Edinburgh (Land North of)	Forthcoming application by IBG Stakeholders (New Ingliston Ltd, Murray Estates Lothian Ltd, FSH Airport (Edinburgh) Services Ltd)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To note the key issues in the report 2. Transport to circulate the previous report on works required to A8 to members
Item No 7.2 - 59 and 60 Belford Road, Edinburgh (Land at)	Forthcoming application by AMA (New Town) Ltd. for detail proposals for demolition and redevelopment of site for residential and office development	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To note the key issues. 2. Further information on proposals to retain Douglas House
Item No 7.3 - Cammo Estate, Maybury Road, Edinburgh	Forthcoming application by Crammond and Harthill Estate for development of a greenfield site for housing	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To note the key issues. 2. Further information on the proposed design and a scheme for infrastructure improvements to be undertaken prior to work being commenced on site
Item No 7.4 - Cliftonhall Road, Newbridge	Forthcoming application by Roxhill Developments Ltd for planning permission for erection of a distribution warehouse	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To note the key issues. 2. Further information on access proposals

Agenda Item No/ Address	Details of Proposal/Reference No	Decision
Item No 7.5 - Saughton Prison, Stenhouse Road, Edinburgh	Forthcoming application by Scottish Prison Service for a new Women's Regional Unit, associated parking and alterations to the existing prison estate	To note the key issues in the report
Returning Applications Following Site Visit		
Item No 8.1 - 27 Seaview Terrace, Edinburgh	Demolish garage and erect domestic dwelling. Application no. (13/02193/FUL)	To GRANT planning permission subject to informatives, as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards. (On a division)
Item No 8.2(a) - 7 Shrub Place, Edinburgh (Site 69 Metres West Of)	Proposed Mixed Use Development including redevelopment of Listed Buildings (Tram Workshops) – Application no. (13/01070/FUL)	To GRANT the planning permission subject to conditions, to informatives and a legal agreement, as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards. To note that the Sub-Committee was accepting a minor infringement in terms of sizes of units given the submission of the application before the Edinburgh Design Guidance was adopted, and also because of the extant planning permission where a greater proportion of units were below the minimum floor area in the guidance. (On a division)
Item No 8.2(b) - 7 Shrub Place, Edinburgh (Site 69 Metres West Of)	Retain existing chimney, alter existing tram workshops to accommodate residential development, reduce height of existing gable wall to remove requirement for galvanised steel buttresses – Application no. (13/01071/LBC)	To GRANT listed building consent subject to conditions and notification to the Scottish Ministers, as detailed in the report by the Acting Head of Planning and Building Standards. (On a division)