

Committee Minutes

The City of Edinburgh Council

Year 2012/2013

Meeting 3 – Thursday, 28 June 2012

Edinburgh, 28 June 2012 – At a meeting of The City of Edinburgh Council.

Present:

LORD PROVOST

The Right Honourable Donald Wilson

COUNCILLORS

Elaine Aitken
Robert C Aldridge
Norma Austin Hart
Nigel Bagshaw
Jeremy R Balfour
Gavin Barrie
Angela Blacklock
Chas Booth
Deidre Brock
Tom Buchanan
Steve Burgess
Andrew Burns
Steve Cardownie
Maggie Chapman
Maureen M Child
Bill Cook
Nick Cook
Gavin Corbett
Cammy Day
Denis C Dixon
Karen Doran
Paul G Edie
Catherine Fullerton
Nick Gardner
Paul Godzik
Joan Griffiths
Bill Henderson
Ricky Henderson

Dominic R C Heslop
Lesley Hinds
Sandy Howat
Allan G Jackson
Karen Keil
David Key
Richard Lewis
Alex Lunn
Melanie Main
Mark McInnes
Adam McVey
Eric Milligan
Joanna Mowat
Gordon J Munro
Jim Orr
Lindsay Paterson
Ian Perry
Alasdair Rankin
Vicki Redpath
Cameron Rose
Frank Ross
Jason G Rust
Alastair Shields
Stefan Tymkewycz
David Walker
Iain Whyte
Norman Work

1 Deputations

(a) **Boroughmuir High School Parent Council** (item 2)

The deputation indicated that although they were delighted that a new school was to be provided for Boroughmuir, they had three main areas of concern which they felt should be taken into consideration to achieve the best possible outcome. They outlined these concerns as being the inadequacy of the proposed capacity of 1,150, the detrimental impact of the proposed site layout, and the opportunity to create outdoor sports facilities at Harrison Park East.

They stressed that the school roll had already increased and was projected to rise even further which would mean that the new building would be over capacity from day 1. They asked the Council to consider relocating the park the other side of the site to run alongside the canal area and requested that consideration be given to redeveloping part of Harrison Park East for sports facilities for the school. They welcomed the opportunity to be involved as the development progressed.

(Reference – e-mail request, submitted.)

(b) **North Edinburgh Women's Group and Edinburgh Fights Back – Anti-Poverty Charter** (item 3)

The deputation presented their anti poverty charter which asked the Council to meet the needs of the needs of people within the City.

The deputation raised issues in relation to Young People, Senior Citizens, Women, Living Wage and Employment Rights, Privatisation and Education, Fuel Poverty and Housing and Racism.

(Reference – e-mail request, submitted.)

2 **Proposals for the Future Location of Boroughmuir High School: Outcomes Arising from Statutory Consultation and Project Update**

The outcome of statutory consultation on proposals for the location of Boroughmuir High School was detailed, together with associated minor catchment changes affecting the school, Tynecastle High School and Bruntsfield and Dalry Primary Schools. A response to the main issues raised during the consultation and an update on the project, including the wider Fountainbridge site, were provided. Recommendations were made on how the proposals should be progressed.

The City of Edinburgh Council
28 June 2012

The Council had heard a deputation on the matter from Boroughmuir High School Parent Council (item 1(a) above).

Decision

- 1) To approve new build on Fountainbridge as the project for the replacement of Boroughmuir High School.
- 2) To approve minor revisions to the catchment area of Boroughmuir and Tynecastle High Schools and Bruntsfield and Dalry Primary Schools, as set out in the consultation proposals, to be implemented from the academic year within which the new Boroughmuir High School would open.
- 3) To pursue a Compulsory Purchase Order if necessary to secure the site at the corner of Viewforth and Dundee Street under S20 of the Education (Scotland) Act 1980.
- 4) To accept the tender from Allan Murray Architects and to enter into a contract with them as the design team to deliver the new school project on the Fountainbridge site.
- 5) To approve a budget of £1.25m from the Children and Families Capital Investment Programme for design fees and other necessary costs to take the project forward to Stage D (submission of planning).
- 6) To note the intention for a further report to be submitted to Council on the project and budget status at Stage D which would include detailed consideration of options to enhance outdoor sporting facilities.
- 7) To note that the strategy for the future development of the wider site was progressing.
- 8) To approve further discussion with the Scottish Government to determine the most appropriate school roll on which funding should be based.
- 9) To note the intention to continue to explore any possible re-configuration of the site currently allocated to the school and the adjacent park with options identified to be discussed with local members.

(References – Act of Council No 4 of 24 November 2011; report no CEC/13/12-13/C&F by the Head of Resources, Children and Families, submitted.)

Declaration of Interests

Councillors Chapman, Munro, Ross and Rust declared a non-financial interest in the above item as Board members of EDI Group Ltd.

3 North Edinburgh Women's Group – Motion by Councillor Day

The following motion by Councillor Day was submitted in terms of Standing Order 28:

“Council congratulates the work of the North Edinburgh Women's Group in their award for local community activity - outstanding achievement for adult learning (adult education awards).

Furthermore Council commends the highly successful community conference organised by North Edinburgh Fights Back and the Muirhouse Women's Group specifically in regards to highlighting poverty, inequality and fuel poverty.

Council welcomes the anti-poverty charter, and agrees to work with these groups in addressing poverty and inequalities.”

The Council had heard a deputation on the matter from North Edinburgh Women's Group and Edinburgh Fights Back (see item 1(b) above).

Decision

To approve the motion by Councillor Day.

4 Questions

Questions put by members to this meeting, written answers and supplementary questions and answers are contained in the Appendix to this minute.

5 Minutes

Decision

To approve the minutes of the Council meetings of 26 April and 17 and 24 May 2012 as correct records.

6 Appointments – Committee Convener and Outside Bodies etc

The Council was invited to appoint the Convener of the Personnel Appeals Committee and make nominations to a number of outside bodies.

The City of Edinburgh Council
28 June 2012

Decision

- 1) To appoint Councillor Austin Hart as Convener of the Personnel Appeals Committee.
- 2) To appoint Councillor Munro as Chair of the Board of EICC Ltd.
- 3) To appoint Councillor Buchanan as Chair of Waterfront Edinburgh Ltd.
- 4) To appoint members to outside bodies as follows:

Borders Railway Joint Committee	Councillor Perry
Children's Panel Advisory Committee	Councillor Key
Edinburgh International Jazz and Blues Festival	Councillor Lewis
Edinburgh International Science Festival Limited	Councillor Austin Hart
Merchant Company – Endowment Trust	Councillor Ross Councillor Aitken
Torness Local Liaison Committee	Councillor Dixon Councillor Booth

- 5) To appoint the Lord Provost as Veterans' Champion.

(References – Acts of Council No 1 and No 2 of 24 May 2012; report no CEC/10/12-13/CG by the Director of Corporate Governance, submitted.)

Declaration of Interests

Councillors Aldridge and Munro declared a non-financial interest in the above item as Board members of EICC Ltd.

7 Festivals and Events Champion

The Council was invited to appoint a Capital Coalition Councillor to the role of Festivals and Events Champion.

The City of Edinburgh Council
28 June 2012

Decision

To appoint Councillor Cardownie as Festivals and Events Champion.

(References – Executive of the Council 28 August 2001 (item 4); report no CEC/11/12-13/CG by the Director of Corporate Governance, submitted.)

8 Leader's Report

The Leader presented his report to the Council. The Leader thanked the previous Lord Provost, George Grubb, for his 5 years of dedicated service to the city and to the former Leader, ex-Councillor Jenny Dawe, for her efforts on behalf of the city. He wished them well for the future.

The Leader commented on:

- Tram project – provision of frank and honest assessments as the project progressed
- Property Conservation – replacement service
- Capital Coalition commitments

The following questions/comments were made:

Councillor Balfour	- Information provided to members before released to press
Councillor Burgess	- Capital Coalition commitments - conducting Council business - cross-party dialogue
Councillor Edie	- Edinburgh Community Safety Partnership – appointment of Chair
Councillor Rose	- Statutory Repairs
Councillor Rust	- Festivals and Events Champion – assessment of performance
Councillor Aldridge	- Condolences to the family of Nikki Thomson, formerly of the Edinburgh Tenants' Federation, who had died on 28 June 2012 - Tram Inquiry – outcome of discussions with Scottish Government

The City of Edinburgh Council
28 June 2012

- | | |
|----------------------|--|
| Councillor Cardownie | - Tram Inquiry – timing |
| Councillor Tymkewycz | - Budgetary constraints – UK Government reductions |
| Councillor Mowat | - Tram project – information for local members on developments at York Place |
| Councillor Booth | - Physical exercise for children |

(Reference – report no CEC/20/12-13/L by the Leader, submitted.)

9 SESplan Governance Review and 2012/13 Operating Budget

The Planning Committee had recommended the delegation of authority to the SESplan Joint Committee in respect of the Strategic Development Plan.

Decision

To ratify and approve the amendments to SESplan's constitution, scheme of delegation and financial regulations as outlined in paragraphs 3.5 to 3.12 of the report by the Director of Services for Communities.

(References – Planning Committee 14 June 2012 (item 2); report no CEC/12/12-13/SfC by the Acting Head of Legal and Administrative Services, submitted.)

10 Unaudited Financial Statements 2011/12

The unaudited financial statements for 2011/12 were submitted for the Council's consideration.

Decision

- 1) To note the unaudited financial statements for 2011/12 and that these would be submitted to the Controller of Audit.
- 2) To note that a detailed report on the outturn position would be reported to the Finance and Resources Committee in July 2012.

The City of Edinburgh Council
28 June 2012

- 3) To note that the financial statements would be resubmitted to the Audit Committee in September 2012, at the conclusion of the audit and thereafter to Council.

(Reference – report no CEC/14/12-13/CG by the Director of Corporate Governance, submitted.)

11 Lothian Pension Funds Annual Report 2011/12 – Unaudited

The unaudited Lothian Pension Funds Annual Report for the year ended 31 March 2012 was presented. The Annual Report had been approved by the Pensions and Trusts Committee on 27 June 2012.

Decision

To note the Pension Funds Annual Report (Unaudited) for the year ended 31 March 2012.

(References – Pensions and Trusts Committee 27 June 2012 (item 3); report no CEC/15/12-13/CG by the Director of Corporate Governance, submitted.)

12 Contract for Community Connecting Service

Decision

To award four Block Contracts for the provision of a Community Connecting Service to the two providers detailed in paragraph 2.12 of the report by the Director of Corporate Governance for a period of two years from 1 October 2012 to 1 October 2014, with the option to extend for up to a further two years.

(References – Finance and Resources Committee 17 January 2012 (item 6); report no CEC/16/12-13/CG by the Director of Corporate Governance, submitted.)

13 Police and Fire Reform – Pathfinder Committee Proposal

Proposals were set out on how to progress the Pathfinder Scrutiny/Overview Committee for policing and fire in light of the Scottish Government's indication that no additional resources would be made available for this function.

The City of Edinburgh Council
28 June 2012

Decision

- 1) To approve the Pathfinder project on the basis detailed in paragraph 2.7 of the report by the Director of Corporate Governance.
- 2) To establish the Pathfinder Committee in terms of Standing Order 37(3) with the political balance of 3 Labour, 3 SNP, 2 Conservative, 1 Green, and appoint the following members:

Councillor Bill Cook (Labour)
Councillor Lunn (Labour)
Councillor Walker (Labour)
Councillor Barrie (SNP)
Councillor Bridgman (SNP)
Councillor Tymkewycz (SNP)
Councillor Rust (Conservative)
Councillor Whyte (Conservative)
Councillor Main (Green)

(References – Policy and Strategy Committee 26 March 2012 (item 6); report no CEC/19/12-13/CG by the Director of Corporate Governance, submitted.)

14 Corporate Governance Structure – Chief Financial Officer

Interim arrangements in the Corporate Governance Directorate for the post of Head of Finance and designation of the role of Chief Financial Officer were outlined, pending the outcome of a recruitment process for posts within the Directorate.

Decision

To endorse the designation of Hugh Dunn as Chief Financial Officer for up to six months pending a further report on the appointment of the Head of Finance.

(Reference – report no CEC/17/12-13/CG by the Director of Corporate Governance, submitted.)

15 Report from the Pentlands Neighbourhood Partnership

The Pentlands Neighbourhood Partnership had referred a motion on the Council's representation on the Pentland Hills Regional Park Consultative Forum.

The City of Edinburgh Council
28 June 2012

Decision

To note the report.

(Reference – report no CEC/18/12-13/SfC by the Director of Services for Communities, submitted.)

16 Chair

The Depute Convener assumed the Chair for the remaining items of business.

17 Business Centre, City Chambers – Motion by Councillor Heslop

The following motion by Councillor Heslop was submitted in terms of Standing Order 28:

“Council agrees that the Business Centre situated in the City Chambers should be renamed as the Queen Elizabeth Diamond Jubilee Business Centre in recognition of Her Majesty's 60 years as our Monarch; further notes Her Majesty's dedication to the City of Edinburgh and its people and feels that this would be a fitting tribute to mark this wonderful and special occasion and would invite Her Majesty to re-open the Centre should Council approve this move.”

Decision

To request a report within two cycles on options for an appropriate commemoration of the Queen's Diamond Jubilee.

18 Tram Inquiry – Motion by Councillor Aldridge

The following motion by Councillor Aldridge was submitted in terms of Standing Order 28:

“Council, noting the commitment of the previous Leader of the Council to seek an inquiry into all aspects of the Edinburgh Tram project at the earliest possible opportunity, and welcoming the commitment in the manifesto of the Labour Party to seek an urgent inquiry, affirms its commitment to a full and wide ranging inquiry as soon as possible and instructs the Leader of the Council to enter into discussions with the First Minister to progress this matter.”

The City of Edinburgh Council
28 June 2012

Decision

- 1) To note that all parties on the Council supported a public inquiry into the Tram Project and that the Leader and Depute Leader of the Council had already initiated discussions with the Scottish Government and would continue to pursue dialogue with the Scottish Government on this matter.
- 2) To request a report on progress of the discussions with the Scottish Government.

19 Community Empowerment and Renewal Bill – Motion by Councillor Chapman

The following motion by Councillor Chapman was submitted in terms of Standing Order 28:

“Council:

1. Welcomes the consultation on the Community Empowerment Bill, which runs until 29 August 2012;
2. Notes the excellent work undertaken in several areas of the Council on community engagement and empowerment, including initiatives such as £eith Decides participatory budgeting and Donkeyfield Orchard, and the potential to build on these projects and extend the devolution of decision-making and management of community assets to community groups in other areas of the Council;
3. Believes that such processes contribute to community resilience, help build social capital, and aid the long term social, economic and environmental sustainability of communities;
4. Agrees to receive a draft response to this Bill at Policy and Strategy Committee on 7 August that highlights existing participatory and engagement projects as exemplars of community empowerment, identifies other key opportunities for the Council to further engage and empower communities, and outlines the required legislative changes that would enable such opportunities to be explored (such as urban right to buy).”

Decision

To approve the motion and add:

- 5) To note that the Council was leading on preparation of a response to the Bill on behalf of the Edinburgh Partnership to be submitted to the meeting of the Edinburgh Partnership Executive on 9 August 2012.

20 Lothian and Borders Police Force Reserves – Motion by Councillor Main

The following motion by Councillor Main was submitted in terms of Standing Order 28:

“Council notes that on 31 March 2013 when the Lothian and Borders Police Force is dissolved, there will be a capital sum of around £1.5m returned to the City of Edinburgh Council from the Force Reserves;

Council notes that the vision of Lothian and Borders Police is creating community well-being with prevention very much at its heart;

Council notes that restorative justice in England and Wales has been shown to deliver 85% victim satisfaction for victims who choose to participate; and reduces the frequency of re-offending by 14% according to the latest Ministry of Justice evidence;

Council also notes the success of restorative justice projects in schools and the wider community across the UK, for example the two-year Restorative Justice pilot in Hull which resulted in schools having 73% fewer classroom exclusions and 81% fewer fixed term exclusion days;

Council agrees that the funds returned from the Lothian and Borders Police Force Reserves should be ring-fenced for restorative justice projects, and calls for a report on possible projects.”

Motion

To approve the motion.

- moved by Councillor Main, seconded by Councillor Burgess (on behalf of the Green Group).

Amendment

- 1) To note that when the Lothian and Borders Police Force is dissolved, a proportion of any unallocated reserve might be returned to the City of Edinburgh Council.
- 2) To note that the amount available for return would be dependent on a range of factors and therefore there could be no certainty as to the eventual amount.
- 3) To note further that any funding returned would be on a one-off basis and would not recur.

The City of Edinburgh Council
28 June 2012

- 4) To agree, therefore, not to ring-fence any potential funds at this stage but to consider their best use as part of the budget setting process and in light of the financial circumstances prevailing at the time that any such funds were returned.

- moved by Councillor Whyte (on behalf of the Conservative Group), seconded by Councillor Bill Cook (on behalf of the Capital Coalition).

Voting

The voting was as follows:

For the motion - 6 votes
For the amendment - 49 votes

Decision

To approve the amendment by Councillor Whyte.

21 Third Sector Training and Information for Councillors – Motion by Councillor Booth

The following motion by Councillor Booth was submitted in terms of Standing Order 28:

“Council:

1. Notes the valuable contribution made by the Third Sector to the lives of many people in the City, as service providers, employers, partners, advocates and trainers;
2. Acknowledges the diversity within the Sector, which includes voluntary organisations, social enterprises and other not-for-profit groups;
3. Recognises the increasing importance of this Sector to the Council, especially with the changing demographic profile of the city, increasing pressures on public finances, and the continuing focus on partnership working, co-production and community engagement;
4. Agrees to design a training and briefing programme for Councillors in consultation with EVOG and other key bodies that extends the induction sessions held over the last 8 weeks, to enable Councillors to better understand the Sector and its role in delivering services and supporting the work the Council does.”

The City of Edinburgh Council
28 June 2012

Decision

To approve the motion subject to the replacement of paragraph 4 with:

- 4) To note that a briefing session on the Third Sector with input from the sector was already being planned for the Autumn phase of the Elected Members training programme and, accordingly, to take no further action at this stage, with the proviso that further training would be provided, if required.

22 Splashback – Community Bid for Leith Waterworld – Motion by Councillor Lewis

The following motion by Councillor Lewis was submitted in terms of Standing Order 28:

“Council:

1. Notes the Council decision of 7 February 2012 to give Splashback six months until 7 August to produce a community bid for Leith Waterworld.
2. Notes the considerable work undertaken by the Splashback community group since February to put together a business case for the running of Leith Waterworld, and congratulates the group on this work and its intention to submit a bid in August.
3. Encourages the ongoing dialogue between Splashback and Council officers.
4. Thanks the Council officers in Culture and Sport, City Development, and Legal Services for the information and assistance they have given Splashback so far in preparation for this bid.
5. Notes that there is additional information still being compiled by Council officers and instructs that this and other information is made available to Splashback as soon as possible to allow the deadline to be met.”

A written submission in support of the motion had been received from the Splashback Campaign.

The City of Edinburgh Council
28 June 2012

Decision

To approve the motion by Councillor Lewis.

(References – Acts of Council Nos 1(b) and 3 of 2 February 2012; submission from Splashback Campaign, submitted.)

23 Tram Project – Closure of York Place – Motion by Councillor Mowat

The Lord Provost ruled that the following item, notice of which had been given at the start of the meeting, be considered as a matter of urgency due to the planned closure of York Place to facilitate tram works.

The following motion by Councillor Mowat was submitted in terms of Standing Order 27:

“Council is concerned that the decision to close York Place to all traffic from September to facilitate construction of the tram track has been taken and that notification of preparatory works and the subsequent closures was not notified to opposition spokespersons, Councillors and residents until preparatory works had begun; Council thus asks for the following information:

1. When was the decision taken to close York Place to all traffic;
2. Which officers took this decision; and
3. What modelling took place prior to the taking of this decision?

Council also instructs the Chief Executive and her officers to ensure that, for any future works:

1. No works related to the tram (MUDFA or Infraco) commence before Councillors have been notified of planned works;
2. No works related to the tram commence before affected residents and businesses have been notified;
3. The press is only informed of planned works after Councillors, residents and businesses have been made aware of these planned works.”

Decision

To approve the motion by Councillor Mowat.

24 Sir William Y Darling Award for Good Citizenship

The Council, in terms of Section 50(A)(4) of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973, excluded the public from the meeting during consideration of the following item of business for the reason that it involved the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in Paragraph 6 of Part 1 of Schedule 7(A) of the Act.

Details were given of nominations for the Sir William Y Darling Award for Good Citizenship for the municipal year 2011/2012.

Decision

To make the Sir William Y Darling Award for Good Citizenship for the municipal year 2011/2012 to Stanley McWhirter.

(Reference – report no CEC/18/12-13/CS by the Director of Corporate Governance, submitted.)

Appendix
(As referred to in Act of Council No 4 of 28 June 2012)

QUESTION NO 1

**By Councillor Edie answered by the
Convener of the Health, Social Care
and Housing Committee**

Question (1) The new Administration's coalition deal states that the council will "examine ways to bring the Council, care home staff and users together into cooperatives to provide the means to make life better for care home users and care providers".

Question (2) Can the Convener of Health, Social Care and Housing elaborate on what this means in practice?

Answer The Capital Coalition has made a commitment to listen to people and to work with local communities, business and the third sector. Our vision of a co-operative Council is one where people who deliver and use our services work with us to make improvements and make decisions about how resources are used.

In respect of care services, including care homes, we will open discussions with service users, staff and providers about the feasibility of developing co-operative models.

Supplementary Question Can I thank the Convener for, well, what I can only describe is his non answer that certainly would not have happened under the previous Administration. The Labour manifesto and the coalition agreement you have come up with have very clear differences of emphasis on this issue particularly relating to care. Now, there is not a huge amount in it, the coalition deal relating to care, but there are differences between those and I have asked senior officers in Health and Social Care to clarify exactly what your commitments mean in practice and they cannot tell me because they do not understand and, judging by this answer today, neither does the Convener. Can he tell me is he proposing to turn our residential care homes into companies owned by their workers which is what I understand co-ops to be?

The City of Edinburgh Council
28 June 2012

**Supplementary
Answer**

What I can advise him today is that initial discussions on this are at an early stage and once we are in a position to report back to Committee then we will share all that full information with Councillor Edie and his colleagues

The City of Edinburgh Council
28 June 2012

QUESTION NO 2

**By Councillor Edie answered by the
Leader of the Council**

Question (1) Did the Lord Provost meet with His Holiness the Dalai Lama on his visit to Edinburgh on 22 June 2012?

Answer (1) Yes.

Question (2) If not why?

Supplementary Question Can I thank the Council Leader for his full and extensive answer? I was really proud last week, Lord Provost, to sit behind you and our Council Leader and Councillor Cardownie when you welcomed His Holiness the Dalai Lama to this city. I think the strong civic leadership that you have demonstrated here contrasts starkly with the lack of it that our First Minister has shown on this issue. Does the Council Leader share with me my dismay that Mr Salmond will sit down and meet with Rupert Murdoch and the Donald Trumps of this world at the drop of a hat but turns his nose up at meeting probably the humblest man on this planet?

Supplementary Answer No

The City of Edinburgh Council
28 June 2012

QUESTION NO 3

**By Councillor Rose answered by the
Leader of the Council**

Question **(1)** What meetings have been held between the Council or its senior representatives with the Consul General of the People's Republic of China or other representatives of the Chinese Government since the beginning of 2012?

Question **(2)** Have any such meetings (which and who) discussed:

- the visit of the Dalai Lama?
- Confucius Institute for Scotland or its work?

Answer The Council has regular dialogue with the Chinese Consul General, both through meetings and events in the city.

The Council engages regularly with the city's Consular Corps and their respective countries on civic, cultural, educational and business links, and opportunities to promote Edinburgh. The Council would not make public topics or discussions entered into with any of the Consular Corps.

**Supplementary
Question** I thank the Leader for his answer to my question. My question arose from some of my constituents who visited me. I do have a large number of constituents who come from East Asia and many of them do have concerns about undue pressure being put on them.

The City of Edinburgh Council
28 June 2012

One of the things that we value in Edinburgh and in this country most is our freedom and we have a responsibility to protect our folk and anyone who comes here and allow them to engage in the freedoms which we experience, and so I was rather disappointed to see your reply. I can understand that you may not want to give specific details about conversations, but at the very least I would have thought we could have a list of the meetings with the very specific people that I raised in my question and I am disappointed that, in view of the background which has already been alluded to and the fact that there has been publicity that there have been meetings between Edinburgh Council and the Chinese Consul General, you could not at the very least reassure the public and reassure my constituents that we will not have pressure put on us as a city and an organisation although I do realise that we have a balance to draw here with our economic relationship with China and indeed other countries in that area.

**Supplementary
Answer**

I can completely appreciate the points that Councillor Rose makes and interestingly say I share the sentiments you have just expressed but I am really not at liberty or prepared to expand further on the written answer that I have already provided. Consular Corps discussions and decisions must remain private and I hope Councillor Rose and his constituents would take some reassurance by the very fact that the Lord Provost did indeed meet the Dalai Lama.