Prior Approval 12/00915/PA
at
York Place
Edinburgh

Development Management Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee

1 Purpose of report

To consider application 12/00915/PA, submitted by Turner Townsend. The application is for: Prior Approval Application for erection of tramstop and associated street furniture, the repositioning of two overhead line equipment (OLE) poles to accommodate the tramstop, revised kerb lines and the repaving of footway, as part of the Edinburgh Tram Network.

It is recommended that this application be Granted by Committee.

2 The Site and the Proposal

Site description
The site includes approximately 300 metres of carriageway and footpath on York Place, in Edinburgh city centre, and extends to approximately 0.89ha. The site extends westwards from the junction with Picardy Place and Broughton Street to approximately 65 metres beyond the junction with Elder Street. Elder Street provides bus access to Edinburgh Bus Station and passenger and service vehicle access to the St James Shopping Centre to the south.

York Place is a main east-west transport route for buses and other vehicles travelling to and from the city centre, via Queen Street, to the west and consists of a six lane carriageway including two bus lanes. Footways are four to five metres in width and are made of pre-cast concrete flags with traditional
whinstone kerbs. Due to the cross gradient of the road, the southern footway is raised up and includes three steps.

The stepped nature of the footway is a traditional characteristic of the street. There are existing bus stops on the southern and northern footways. Existing street lighting is building mounted.

York Place forms part of the first Georgian New Town and there are numerous listed buildings of historic and architectural interest on either side of the street. Particularly prominent is the St Paul’s and St George’s Church which acts as a landmark building and is located on the north east corner of York Place and Broughton Street. The church was listed category A (reference 27509) on 24 May 1966. The centre of Edinburgh including York Place was awarded World Heritage status in 1995 by UNESCO.

This site is located within the New Town Conservation Area.

Site History

11 December 2008 - Prior approval granted for the erection of a tram stop at Picardy Place including associated shelter and furniture, hard landscaping, tram Overhead Line Equipment (OLE), street lighting and bus shelters (erection, retention and relocation) as part of the Edinburgh Tram (reference 08/03723/PA).

7 July 2008 - Prior approval granted for the erection of overhead line equipment (OLE), street lighting and relocation of bus shelters in York Place and Queen Street as part of works for the Edinburgh Tram (reference 08/01879/PA).

Other Relevant History

6 December and 24 November 2011 - Conservation area consent and full planning consent granted for the demolition of existing public toilet block and Council hand cart storage and erection of 2 substations, one serving the Edinburgh Tram and rebuilding of existing retaining wall on land in Cathedral Lane to the south east of the site (references 11/03129/CON and 11/03129/FUL).

Pre-Application Process

Following the decision of 29 November 2011 for the revised tram route to terminate on York Place, various discussions were held between the tram design team and the Council to consider a revised design incorporating a temporary tram stop and tram reversing siding.
Description of The Proposal

The proposals include approximately 255m of tramway, overhead line equipment (OLE) and a temporary island type tram stop and reversing siding, forming the terminus of the tram system, which would be located at the eastern end of York Place. The temporary tram stop would be 40m long and three metres wide and be positioned 300mm above the existing carriageway. The tramway is generally double track but would narrow to become single track along the length of the single sided platform.

Passengers arriving at the tram stop would alight onto the platform located on the south side of the tracks which would provide access to signalised crossings located at the eastern and western ends of the platform. To facilitate this, a new pedestrian crossing would be installed at the western end of the platform. A pedestrian guardrail preventing persons stepping out into road traffic would be situated along the southern platform boundary. The guardrail would be grey painted ‘Lothian pattern’ railings measuring 1100mm high.

The platform would feature a shelter, bins, benches, passenger information display (PID), ticket machines, CCTV, public address system and tram stop name signage. In order to minimise clutter, the tram stop furniture will be grouped at the back of the platform. The shelter would be a cantilever type structure and 7.2m in length with internal lighting and seating. As the stop is designed to be temporary in nature, the shelter is a more simple design and differs from the elliptical shaped design to be used on the remainder of the tram network. As per the previous prior approval, street lighting would be building mounted with no additional street lighting being located on the platform.

The tram stop would have a concrete platform edge and be paved with concrete paving slabs measuring 400x400mm. The tramway itself would be finished with imprinted concrete. Outwith the tram stop, areas of new footway will be natural coloured pre-cast paving slabs measuring 600x450mm. Elsewhere, the existing pavements will be retained and made good where required.

A total of 11 OLE poles would be installed. These would be a side pole design of height 7m with a diameter of 273mm at the base tapering to 219mm at the top. The poles would be painted grey and would include finials. The positions of the OLE are largely as per previous prior approvals with the exception of two OLE poles that would be relocated due to the new tram stop position. One OLE would move from the south eastern margin of the existing pedestrian island onto the northern margin of the island, to a position between the various crossings. The second OLE would be relocated from within the existing roadway to an existing landscaping area to the north east of the Broughton Street/ Picardy Place junction.
General traffic lanes would be formed either side of the tram stop, facilitating existing bus stops and traffic movements. Two staged pedestrian crossings are shown east – west and north – south at the junction with Elder Street. As per existing, the new carriageway areas would be finished in black asphalt.

The existing street has a significant cross slope, with the severity lessening from west to east. As part of the works to resolve level issues associated with the design, steps along the southern footway will be reduced or eliminated where possible.

Previous proposals

The previous design was for a double track tramway with turn back facility, leading to a permanent tram stop at Picardy Place to the east. The prior approval showed two lanes of general traffic road being retained in each direction either side of the tram tracks, with the total road width being extended by approximately 1m. With the exception of existing crossings, new or amended pedestrian crossings were direct with no stages. The previous design included granite setts rather than imprinted concrete between the tram tracks. The change of surface material is due to cost and is being implemented in various locations along the on street sections of route.

A design statement has been submitted with the proposals and is available to view via Planning and Building Standards Online Services.

3. Officer’s Assessment and Recommendation

Determining Issues

Do the proposals harm the character or appearance of the conservation area? If they do, there is a strong presumption against granting of permission.

Do the proposals comply with the development plan?

If the proposals do comply with the development plan, are there any compelling reasons for not approving them?

If the proposals do not comply with the development plan, are there any compelling reasons for approving them?

ASSESSMENT

To address these determining issues, the Committee needs to consider whether:

a) the development ought to be, and reasonably could be, carried out elsewhere on the land designated specifically within the Limits of Deviation; and/or
b) the design or external appearance of the development would injure the amenity of the neighbourhood and if so, is reasonably capable of modification to avoid such injury (adapted from GDPO Class 29). (In relation to prior approval for works affecting a listed building, consideration of the phrase "injury to the amenity of the neighbourhood" shall be deemed to include the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses. (Source, Section 70, Tram Bills Lines 1 and 2))

In order to assess the submission in relation to the above determining issues, the following specific considerations need to be taken into account:

- Do the proposals comply with the Tram Design Manual and the development plan?

- If the proposals do comply with the Tram Design Manual and the development plan, are there any compelling reasons for not approving them?

- If the proposals do not comply with the Tram Design Manual and the development plan, are there any compelling reasons for not approving them?

a) Notwithstanding the above considerations, the proposal is effectively permitted development and the prior approval submission can only be refused (or granted subject to conditions) if it is reasonable to locate the proposal elsewhere within the Limits of Deviation (LOD) or the external appearance is reasonably capable of modification.

The main reason for the changes is the previous decision to terminate the tram route on York Place and the requirement to provide an appropriate temporary terminus and turn back facility. As a result, this amended design supersedes the eastern section of the previous prior approval 08/01879/PA. The site also amends the westernmost part of the section of route containing the Picardy Place tram stop which was granted under prior approval 08/03723/PA.

There are various constraints which limit the ability to move the proposals within the limits of deviation. The site is located within the Edinburgh World Heritage Site and the New Town Conservation Area and is overlooked to the south and north by listed buildings. Retaining an appropriate setting for the buildings is therefore paramount whilst ensuring the tram works can also be accommodated. There are also various underground cellars associated with the listed buildings which require to be retained. Further reasons which restrict the ability to move the proposals are the significant cross falls within the site which impact on the design from an engineering perspective and the need to maintain effective traffic circulation.
The current design retains the central axis to the tram alignment that was accepted in the previous prior approvals and extends that concept to accommodate the temporary island type tram stop. The positioning of infrastructure within the LOD is therefore acceptable, subject to further consideration of the design and amenity impacts.

b) Design policies D1, D4 and D5 in the Edinburgh City Local Plan (ECLP) require a high quality of design and layout to be demonstrated and require amenity issues to be fully considered. The development must also comply with relevant parts of the Tram Design Manual and the Edinburgh Standards for Streets.

The proposed temporary tram stop design utilises and extends the existing pedestrian island arrangement at the eastern end of the site, thereby minimising the need for new infrastructure. Similarly the tram stop infrastructure has been rationalised to minimise clutter and to promote ease of passenger movement. The use of concrete edge material for the platform rather than natural stone and the use of a non-standard shelter represent departures from the Tram Design Manual but are acceptable as temporary installations. The use of an imprinted concrete finish rather than cobbles for the track bed, has been agreed by the project team working with the Council as a revised treatment for the on street sections of route. This is also acceptable, including from a cycle user perspective.

Minor changes to the position of the OLE have been made in order to accommodate the tram stop. The precise placement of the new infrastructure minimises impacts on pedestrian movements and on the setting of surrounding buildings. The design of a tram buffer to be located at the eastern end of the stop and finial details for the OLE require further confirmation as part of applicant informatives, thereby ensuring those elements are appropriate in terms of the surrounding context. The staged pedestrian crossing facilities at Elder Street would result in improvements for pedestrian users and are also acceptable.

In terms of amenity issues for adjoining buildings there would be no issues associated with the building mounted street lighting which remains as per the previous prior approval or the proposed public address system which would comply with the requirements set out in the Environmental Statement prepared for Tram Line One. Overall the design and appearance of the development is acceptable subject to the recommended applicant informatives.

In conclusion, the proposed development complies with relevant policies in the Edinburgh City Local Plan. The temporary nature of the tram stop ensures compliance with relevant parts of the Tram Design Manual. The position of the development within the Limits of Deviation is acceptable and design and amenity issues have been addressed. It is recommended that prior approval be granted subject to a applicant informatives relating to the design of the tram buffer and confirmation of finial details for the OLE.
REASON FOR DECISION

The proposed development complies with relevant policies in the Edinburgh City Local Plan. Individual departures from Tram Design Manual are justified in terms of the temporary nature of the tram stop. The position of the development within the Limits of Deviation is acceptable and design and amenity issues have been suitably addressed.

John Bury
Head of Planning & Building Standards

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contact/tel</th>
<th>Hamish Bell on 0131 529 3143</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ward affected</td>
<td>A11 - City Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Plan</td>
<td>Edinburgh City Local Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statutory</td>
<td>The Site includes land reserved for the Edinburgh Tram,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development Plan</td>
<td>is located in the Central Area and forms part of a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision</td>
<td>Conservation Area.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date registered</td>
<td>20 March 2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drawing numbers/</td>
<td>01-07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scheme</td>
<td>Scheme 2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Advice to Committee Members and Ward Councillors

The full details of the application are available for viewing on the Planning and Building Standards Portal:  www.edinburgh.gov.uk/planning.

If you require further information about this application you should contact the following Principal Planner, Linda Hamilton, 0131 529 3146, linda.h.hamilton@edinburgh.gov.uk

If this application is not identified on the agenda for presentation and you wish to request one at the Committee meeting, you must contact Committee Services by 9.00a.m. on the Tuesday preceding the meeting. Contact details can be found in the Committee agenda papers.
Appendix A

Application Type: Prior Approval
Application Address: York Place
Edinburgh

Proposal:
Prior Approval Application for erection of tramstop and associated street furniture, the repositioning of two overhead line equipment (OLE) poles to accommodate the tramstop, revised kerb lines and the repaving of footway, as part of the Edinburgh Tram Network.

Reference No: 12/00915/PA

Consultations, Representations and Planning Policy

Representations

A single objection has been received raising issues to do with cost and the use of cobbles from a cycle user safety perspective. The issues are non-material.

Planning Policy

The Edinburgh City Local Plan, adopted 2010

The site is safeguarded for the Edinburgh tram network.


The Tram Design Manual sets out the criteria for assessing tram proposals. It seeks to ensure a high quality tram system for Edinburgh that embraces the best practice demonstrated in other European cities, and is of a standard appropriate to the city’s world-renowned status.

Relevant Policies:

Relevant policies of the Edinburgh City Local Plan.

Policy Des 1 (Design Quality and Context) sets general criteria for assessing design quality and requires an overall design concept to be demonstrated.

Policy Des 4 (Layout Design) sets criteria for assessing layout design.

Policy Des 5 (External Spaces) sets criteria for assessing landscape design and external space elements of development.
Policy Env 1 (World Heritage Site) protects the quality of the World Heritage Site and its settings.

Policy Env 3 (Listed Buildings - Setting) identifies the circumstances in which development within the curtilage or affecting the setting of a listed building will be permitted.

Policy Tra 7 (Tram) prevents development which would prejudice tram safeguards or identified tram routes.

**Relevant Non-Statutory Guidelines**

**Non-statutory guidelines** 'The Edinburgh Standards for Streets' sets out principles and guidance whose aim is to achieve a coherent and enhanced public realm.

**Non-statutory guidelines** on 'MOVEMENT AND DEVELOPMENT' establish design criteria for road and parking layouts. The Tram Design Manual sets out the criteria for assessing tram proposals it seeks to ensure a high quality tram system for Edinburgh that embraces the best practice demonstrated in other European cities, and is of a standard appropriate to the city's world-renowned status.
Appendix B

Application Type: Prior Approval
Application Address: York Place
Edinburgh

Proposal: Prior Approval Application for erection of tramstop and associated street furniture, the repositioning of two overhead line equipment (OLE) poles to accommodate the tramstop, revised kerb lines and the repaving of footway, as part of the Edinburgh Tram Network.

Reference No: 12/00915/PA

Conditions/Reasons associated with the Recommendation

It is recommended that this application be Granted by Committee, subject to the conditions, reasons and informatives stated below.

Infomatives

It should be noted that:

1. The development hereby permitted shall be commenced no later than the expiration of three years from the date of this consent.

2. That further details of the tram buffer including details of fixing and any applied paint finish (RAL/ Pantone) or cladding materials designed to enhance its appearance in the streetscape shall be submitted for the prior written approval of the Head of Planning and Building Standards.

3. That further details of finials to be applied to the OLE shall be submitted for prior consideration by the Head of Planning and Building Standards.

End
Appendix C

Application Type: Prior Approval

Proposal: Prior Approval Application for erection of tramstop and associated street furniture, the repositioning of two overhead line equipment (OLE) poles to accommodate the tramstop, revised kerb lines and the repaving of footway, as part of the Edinburgh Tram Network.

Reference No: 12/00915/PA

Location Plan

Reproduction from the Ordnance Survey mapping with permission of the Controller of Her Majesty's Stationery Office © Crown Copyright.

Unauthorised reproduction infringes Crown copyright and may lead to prosecution or civil proceedings. Licence Number 100023420 The City of Edinburgh Council 2005.