

Committee Minutes

Development Management Sub-Committee of the Planning Committee

Edinburgh, 11 May 2011

Present:- Councillors Lowrie (Convener), Burgess, Dundas, Hinds, McIvor, Milligan, Morris, Mowat, Munn, Rose and Thomas.

1 Fountain Brewery, Gilmore Park, Edinburgh

The Sub-Committee had under consideration an application for planning permission (no 10/02955/PPP) for a mixed use development including offices (class 4), residential (class 2), food and drink (class 3), assembly and leisure (class 11), non-residential institutions (class 10), hotel (class 7), care home (class 8), student housing, servicing, access arrangements and provision of urban realm. Approval of siting of the principle development blocks, maximum massing and heights of the principle development blocks, points of pedestrian, vehicular and service vehicle access and egress, location of pedestrian/cycle routes through the site, and location of urban spaces including park, central amenity space, commercial amenity space and canal zone.

The Sub-Committee agreed to consider the application by means of a hearing. The Sub-Committee had previously visited the site on 7 April 2011.

A pre-application report on the proposals was approved on 30 June 2010 with a formal consultation strategy which ran from June to September 2011.

The Head of Planning gave details of the application and the planning considerations involved.

The application site related to the former Scottish and Newcastle Brewery site within the Fountainbridge area of the city. The site covers approximately 5.26 hectares and is bounded by the Union Canal to the south; Fountainbridge and Dundee Street to the north; Gibson Terrace, a residential tenemental street to the west; and a vacant site (which benefits from planning permission for a residential and mixed use development) known as Freer Street immediately lying to the east. Edinburgh Quay lies beyond this. The site lies immediately south and west of the city's business district - the Exchange, Haymarket and Tollcross.

The site is currently occupied by the former, vacant brewery buildings. These include a category C(S) listed building which was part of the former North British Rubber Company which occupied the site prior to the brewery.

The application is for Planning Permission in Principle and is for a mixed use development

The proposals comply with the development plan and nonstatutory guidance including the Development Brief. The mix of uses and formation of public spaces will deliver a vibrant new canal quarter in this location. The scheme would enhance the townscape to the benefit of the wider area. In other respects the proposals were acceptable in terms of environmental impact, residential amenity, transportation and sustainability. There were no material considerations which outweighed this conclusion.

In conclusion, he recommended that the application be approved, subject to the conditions, legal agreements and informatives as contained in his report.

The Sub-Committee heard representations on behalf of:

- a) Tollcross Community Council
- b) The Cockburn Association
- c) LTSB (Fountainbridge 1) Ltd and LTSB (Fountainbridge 2) Ltd.

Tollcross Community Council

Paul Bestwick on behalf of the Community Council indicated that they were pleased that the now derelict, brewery site was to be developed and that a wide mix of uses were to be incorporated. However the application did seem to include almost all the use classes so no predicted balance of uses appeared in the PPP. The Community Council also supported the multiplicity of routes through the site, including at Gibson Terrace and felt that this permeability to and from the canal was very important. However they did have some concerns about the proposals which included the need to consider the balance of populations with regard to student accommodation, and an over saturation of licensed premises.

Building Heights

The height of the buildings along the canal should be lower than the rest in order to give a more pleasant canal side experience; although and some should be no more than 3 storeys. They were concerned that some of the proposed heights were excessive and would detract from some local views and the perceptions of safety when traversing the site. The Fountainbridge Development Brief (FBDB) of 2004 was quite clear about heights for site 1 which was the area of the proposal. Subsequent amendments have not changed these. These are that buildings should be generally 16m to eaves and 19m to ridge, but in N-S links 19m to eaves. The brief also suggests that residential blocks should be 16m to eaves but that this could be moderately exceeded on N-S links with views from Viewforth and Leamington.

The plans in the proposals make it rather difficult to discern the heights of buildings by using heights above sea level. This is compounded by the fact that the site is roughly 5m lower on Fountainbridge than at the canal. It was clear that the proposals are for buildings (other than on the canal edge) ranging from 23m upwards. These could be 27m on Fountainbridge. Some of the buildings in the centre of the development would be 30m above Fountainbridge/Da/ry Road. Whilst there may be a case for higher buildings on the lower land along Viewforth, 8m above the guidelines seems excessive. The proposed buildings along Gilmore Park are shown as 28m above the road which makes these 9m above the guidelines in the FBDB. Even though Springside buildings have been allowed to broach the height recommendations to a smaller extent, this is not an allowed excuse for further developments to exceed these heights. There are no convincing arguments of the developers in their Design and Access Statement (section 11) as to why the proposed increases in heights, in the centre of the development, somehow fit in with the detailed principles designed to guide proposals given in the FBDB.

The residents of Gibson Terrace have expressed concern about the closeness of the proposed blocks to their properties and feel that their height will cause overshadowing. There is a tendency for all new large developments to include a 'landmark building' which tends to fall short of the quality of Edinburgh's traditional landmark buildings. This proposal is no exception with a proposed approx 35m (114 feet) high building. There must be a suspicion that this is simply a ruse to get a larger volume on the site. However there may be a case for a landmark building if it is of sufficient quality. A failing of the planning system is that the PPP may be approved, including such a large building with no guarantee of 'quality'.

Transport Analysis (TA)

The key thing in the appendix is the adjustment of the 2001 census travel to work data for Edinburgh which recorded that 30.6% of people travelled by car to work (nearly 40% when passengers are included) in 2001.

Rather than using modal split figures based on the census they have adjusted the census work mode share so that only 13% travel to work by car (14.8% inc. passengers) The justification for this is that car parking spaces will be constrained on the development site to 760 (rather than the upper limit of 1,041 which would have been permitted). The site has good public transport and the site design will encourage cycling and walking. This may be true but is surmise rather than based on evidence.

There is a weak approach to travel planning suggested in the TA; i.e. that a travel planning coordinator should be appointed and that cycling, walking and PT should be encouraged. The planning system can set a modal share target. I think this should be a condition. No more than 14% of travel, related to this proposal should use a car.

There are some gaps in information:

1. No safety calculations have been made which would be expected in a Transport Analysis.
2. Not clear what date the model predictions relate to (2011 mentioned in the Appendix, 2013 in the TA). If either of these were correct interpretations the modelling is deficient, since it should relate to the whole development when completed.
3. If 457 car parking spaces were provided underground for office use - one would expect them to be used every day. Similarly the 77 car parking space for the hotel, 20 for retail, 206 for residential use (though the latter may not hold - people may just use cars at the weekend. Fig. 7.21 gives a smaller number.

Local Centre

The FBDB envisaged a local centre around where Viewforth joins Fountainbridge. There was an acknowledgement that shopping facilities in this area are poor. The local centre was envisaged as redressing this deficiency and to act as a community focus. This proposal does not address this issue in any specific terms. Also, as portions of the site are developed by different developers, none wish to make this contribution. The Springside development which accounts for some of the area of the proposed local centre has made no contribution. We would ask that a condition of approval would address this.

Water Space

Much is made of the additional water space and we are very keen to see this happen. Some drawings in the proposal do not show additional water space. As mentioned before, piecemeal development will leave one developer with this requirement when this expensive addition should be borne by the development as a whole. It is in these situations that the public realm (the local centre and water space) gains can be lost.

North British Rubber Company building

The proposal assumed that this building would be demolished whereas this decision had not been taken.

The Cockburn Association

Jon Grounsell advised having studied the plans for the development the Association had the following observations on the proposals.

The primary concern with the Master plan was the spatial arrangements of open space and circulation routes in relation to the bulk and height of proposed buildings. There appeared to be an over provision of open space, which was unlikely to attract the variety and amount of users suggested. This was not a busy waterfront and even if it were to grow it still had to compete with other

Development Management Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
11 May 2011

central areas such as Princes Street gardens, the Old Town and the emerging Waterfront in Leith, as places of leisure activities.

The Master plan also has to consider the vibrancy and commercial success of the Fountainbridge edge, and drawing too much activity to the canal edge may detract from this area's vitality. The Association would prefer to see a strategy which prioritised certain frontages for commercial and leisure activity and that the canal side may then be envisaged as an extension of the parkland to the west, with only occasional café and feature activities along the canal frontage

As proposed the numerous buildings along the canal side depended on commercial tenants for the Master plan to become successful and this was a weakness of the proposals. A strategy which located all commercial activity at ground floor level would have much more flexibility and allow canal and street frontages to adapt if the footfall increased to the desired levels

One consequence of the over provision of external space, was the excessive height of the buildings proposed. While existing blocks on Fountainbridge were 16m above pavement level, most of the blocks proposed here were 32m above pavement level. The Association was firmly opposed to such heights and would endorse the recommendations in the Skyline Study , that no blocks should be built in the area to the west of the castle above the established building heights.

A lowering in roof heights could be achieved by a reduction in the amount of ambiguous open space creating tighter high density development without resorting to high rise.

The proposed circulation across the site did not address the primary concerns of improving North-South access across this area of the city, which has long been constrained by East-West infrastructure such as the canal and railways, with four main roads from East to West but no direct link in the other direction. A route should be established from the bridge at St Peters place to the west of Dundee Street and another to the new route through the Springside development. A similar strategy should be adopted at the Gilmore park bridge, linking directly to Grove Street and Springside. This would allow traffic to North-South without having to travel along Fountainbridge, it would also relate the footpath network more closely to desire lines

There is only scope for one East-West route and this should be broadly at the mid-point of the development rather than to the rear of Fountainbridge properties, allowing these properties to have proper rear amenity space, with servicing taking place from front. The dedicated service streets are neither desirable nor required for this type of development. Routes through the heart of the development and a balance had to make between vitality and the deadening impact of too much pedestrianisation. Quiet spaces may be achieved along the canal or in private open space to the rear of buildings, which would lessen the impact of local traffic through the development.

The Association was supportive of the use of underground parking which was a desirable provision for the future needs of the development and freed up surface

space for better uses, and accorded with the associations wish to see higher density but lower height development.

The Association also supported the introduction of a new canal basin as an excellent use of external space, and one which was likely to be busy and commercially successful. The success of the canal and related developments depended on increased public use of the waterway, which for the public can most easily be achieved by tourist excursions or scheduled barges operating along parts of its route. In conclusion he emphasised the importance of selecting consistent materials, preferably natural stone for the development.

Presentation on Behalf of the Applicant

Michael Halliday of CB Richard Ellis and Allan Murray of Allan Murray Architects advised that this was the first step in the regeneration of this part of the city and would bring significant monetary and employment benefits to the city.

This would be a high quality development and would increase the use of the canal, and help restore the economy of the area, a flexible approach to the development was being adopted which would allow the proposals to adapt to changing market conditions.

The student housing part of the proposal was required by Napier University as a key part of their future accommodation strategy

The emphasis of this development was to develop a canal quarter and not just produce a set of streets which would attract visitors as well as residents to this part of the city

The proposals would produce a thriving commercial and residential environment and examples showed that this type of development had worked successfully in other parts of the country.

The density of the development responded to the needs of the city and the community, with a good mix of open space and appropriately designed buildings with good quality materials.

It was also proposed to construct new bridges across the canal and the provision of a new water basin to enhance the use of the canal.

In conclusion Mr Halliday and Mr Allan advised that this was a high quality development which would help to boost the economy of this part of the city, bringing with it significant benefits to the city.

.Decision

To approve the recommendation by the Head of Planning to grant planning permission, subject to the conditions, informatives and legal agreements as contained in his report.

(Reference – report by the Head of Planning, submitted).

2 7 Clerk Street, Edinburgh

Details of an application for planning permission for the partial demolition and conversion of the former cinema (in part) and new development to create a hotel incorporating bar and restaurant facilities, artist's studios and galleries and community facilities at the former Odeon Cinema, 7 Clerk Street, Edinburgh(08/00197/FUL) had been circulated.

The Head of Legal and Administrative Services advised that since the issue of the agenda, the applicant, Duddingston House Properties had been in correspondence with the Council requesting the Council's Monitoring Officer to look at the issues raised by them about the processing of the application. Given the complexity of the issues raised in the correspondence, the Monitoring Officer recommended that the Sub-Committee continue consideration of the report to the next appropriate meeting of the Sub-Committee to allow time for him to examine the points made and come to a considered view.

He further advised that this delay should in no way be seen as confirmation of there being any issues at this stage, and should not be seen as setting a precedent for dealing with future applications.

Decision

To continue the application to the next appropriate meeting of the Sub-Committee, to allow the Council's Monitoring Officer to examine the issues raised in the correspondence from the applicant and to come to a considered view.

(Reference – report by the Head of Planning, submitted.)

3 7 Clerk Street, Edinburgh

Details of an application for listed building consent for the partial demolition of and internal and external alterations to the former Odeon Cinema, 7 Clerk Street, Edinburgh (11/00394/LBC) had been circulated.

The Head of Legal and Administrative Services advised that since the issue of the agenda, the applicant, Duddingston House Properties had been in correspondence with the Council requesting the Council's Monitoring Officer to look at the issues raised by them about the processing of the application. Given the complexity of the issues raised in the correspondence, the Monitoring Officer recommended that the Sub-Committee continue consideration of the report the next appropriate meeting of the Sub-Committee to allow time for him to examine the points made and come to a considered view.

He further advised that this delay should in no way be seen as confirmation of there being any issues at this stage, and should not be seen as setting a precedent for dealing with future applications.

Decision

To continue the application to the next appropriate meeting of the Sub-Committee, to allow the Council's Monitoring Officer to examine the issues raised in the correspondence from the applicant and to come to a considered view.

(Reference – report by the Head of Planning, submitted.)

4 Other Applications

The Sub-Committee considered the Other Applications on the agenda.

Decision

To determine the other applications as detailed in Appendix 1 to this minute.

(Reference – reports by the Head of Planning, submitted)

OTHER APPLICATIONS

Note: Detailed conditions/reasons for the following decisions are contained in the statutory planning register.

| | | |
|--|---|--|
| <p>Item 3 - Fountain Brewery, Gilmore Park, Edinburgh</p> | <p>Mixed use development including offices (class 4), residential (class 9), retail (class 1), financial, professional and other services (class 2), food and drink (class 3), assembly and leisure (class 11), non-residential institutions (class 10), hotel (class 7), care home (class 8), student housing, servicing, access arrangements and provision of urban realm. Approval of siting of the principal development blocks, maximum massing and heights of the principal development blocks; points of pedestrian, vehicular and service vehicle access and egress; location of pedestrian/cycle routes through the site; and location of urban spaces including park, central amenity space, commercial amenity space and canal zone (as amended). (10/02955/PPP)</p> | <p>To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions, informatives and legal agreements as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning.</p> |
|--|---|--|

Development Management Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
11 May 2011

| | | |
|--|--|---|
| <p>Item 4 - 226 Braid Road, Edinburgh</p> | <p>New dwelling house including integral garage, new access from Braid Road and 1 additional parking space (as amended) (08/04064/FUL)</p> | <p>To REFUSE planning permission for the following reasons;</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The proposed house will overshadow the play area of the nursery at 226 Braid Road and the windows on the northern gable will reduce the privacy of the same play area contrary to Policy Des3 of the Edinburgh City Local Plan and the Council's Non Statutory Guidelines on Daylighting, Sunlight and Privacy; 2. The proximity of the proposed house and garden in relation to the external children's play area at 226 Braid Road could adversely affect the future operations of the nursery contrary to Planning Advice note 1 2011 'Planning and Noise'. |
| <p>Item 5 - 7 Clerk Street</p> | <p>- Partial demolition and conversion of former cinema (in part) and new development to create hotel (incorporating bar/restaurant facilities), artist's studios/galleries, community facilities (08/00197/FUL)</p> | <p>To CONTINUE the application to the next appropriate meeting of the Sub-Committee to allow the Council's Monitoring Officer to examine the issues raised in the correspondence from the applicant and to come to a considered view.</p> |
| <p>Item 6 - 7 Clerk Street</p> | <p>Partial demolition of and alterations (internal and external) to former Odeon cinema (11/00394/LBC)</p> | <p>To CONTINUE the application to the next appropriate meeting of the Sub-Committee to allow the Council's Monitoring Officer to examine the issues raised in the correspondence from the applicant and to come to a considered view.</p> |

Development Management Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
11 May 2011

| | | |
|---|--|---|
| <p>Item 7 - 41 Colinton Mains Drive</p> | <p>Proposed erection of 15m tall monopole to accommodate Vodafone and O2 antenna within GRP shroud plus 2 ground level cabinets. (11/00359/FUL)</p> | <p>To REFUSE planning permission for the reasons recommended by the Head of Planning and detailed in his report.</p> |
| <p>Item 8 - Gardner's Crescent Gardens</p> | <p>Reinstatement of stone gate piers, gates, railings and internal pathways, replacement of existing trees with new lime trees and flowering cherry trees, introduction of shrub planting and bench seating (11/00935/FUL)</p> | <p>To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions as recommended by the Head of Planning and detailed in his report.</p> |
| <p>Item 9 - 500 Gorgie Road</p> | <p>Proposed telecommunications transmission dish installation at Chesser House, Edinburgh(11/00990 /FUL)</p> | <p>To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions as recommended by the Head of Planning and detailed in his report</p> |

Committee Minutes

Development Management Sub-Committee of the Planning Committee

Edinburgh, 25 May 2011

Present:- Councillors Lowrie (Convener), Burgess, Child, Hinds, McIvor, Mowat, Munn, Paisley, Rose and Thomas.

1 Applications

The Sub-Committee considered the applications contained on the agenda.

Councillors Day and Jackson were heard as local ward members in respect of agenda item 5 (Site 150 Metres Northwest Of 4 South Trinity Road.)

Decision

To determine the applications as detailed in Appendix 1 to this minute.

(References – letter dated 24 May 2011 from Councillor Cardownie in relation to agenda item 5, email dated 24 May 2011 from Councillor Wilson in relation to agenda item 20, reports by the Head of Planning, submitted)

2 Stopping Up – Rose Street South Lane

The Acting Director of Corporate Services recommended a Stopping-Up Order in respect of Rose Street South Lane, Edinburgh, in order to facilitate implementation of planning permission in full to construct a flagship retail development of over 70,000 sq. ft across six floors (including basement) with active frontage to Princes Street and new active frontage to Rose Street at 91-93 Princes Street.

Decision

To confirm the City of Edinburgh Council (Rose Street South Lane) (Stopping Up) Order 2011.

(Reference – report by the Acting Director of Corporate Services, submitted)

3 Stopping Up – Lady Nairne Place

The Acting Director of Corporate Services recommended a Stopping-Up Order in respect of Lady Nairne Place, Edinburgh, in order to facilitate implementation of planning permission in full for a change of use of open grass area to a private garden, including the closing of a footpath.

Decision

To confirm the City of Edinburgh Council (Lady Nairne Place, Edinburgh) (Stopping Up) Order 2009.

(Reference – report by the Acting Director of Corporate Services, submitted)

APPLICATIONS

Note: Detailed conditions/reasons for the following decisions are contained in the statutory planning register.

| Agenda Item No. | Address/ Reference No | Details of Proposals | Decision |
|-----------------|--|---|--|
| 3 | <u>21-23 Windsor Place</u> (10/02971/CON) | Demolish office building | To GRANT conservation area consent subject to conditions and informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning and subject to prior notification to Scottish Ministers. |
| 4 | <u>21-23 Windsor Place</u> (10/02971/FUL) | Demolition of office , construction of 23 flats | 1) To GRANT planning permission subject to the conditions and informatives as detailed in the reports by the Head of Planning. 2) To add an additional condition that the north facing gable wall be rendered in a suitable colour to the satisfaction of the Head of Planning. 3) To add an additional informative that one of the six parking spaces be allocated as a disabled parking space |

Development Management Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
25 May 2011

| Agenda Item No. | Address/ Reference No | Details of Proposals | Decision |
|-----------------|--|--|--|
| | | | 4) To include in the legal agreement that the developer make a contribution to the City Car Club, to benefit residents in the development, to be agreed by the Head of Planning. |
| 5 | <u>4 South Trinity Road (Former Trinity Park House) (Site 150 Metres Northwest of)</u> (11/00387/FUL) | Residential development comprising villas, mews houses and apartments within existing walled grounds with associated new link to cycle path. | To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions, informatives and legal agreements as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| 6 | <u>4 Lady Lawson Street (Telecomms Apparatus 44 Metres Northwest of)</u> (11/01078/FUL) | Installation of telecommunications Broadband Cabinet. | To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions and informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| 7 | <u>Queensferry Road, Kirkliston (Land Adjacent to)</u> (10/03053/AMC) | Development of 31 dwellinghouses, associated roads, footpaths, walls, fences, soft/hard landscaping (as amended) | To Approve the application subject to conditions and informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| 8 | <u>14 Polwarth Terrace (Telecomms Apparatus 20 Metres South of)</u> (11/01133/FUL) | Installation of telecommunications broadband cabinet. | To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions and informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |

Development Management Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
25 May 2011

| Agenda Item No. | Address/ Reference No | Details of Proposals | Decision |
|-----------------|---|---|---|
| 9 | <u>69 Warrender Park Road (Telecomms Apparatus 15 Metres South of)</u> (11/01123/FUL) | Installation of telecommunications broadband cabinet. | To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions and informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| 10 | <u>13 Lonsdale Terrace (Telecomms Apparatus 13 Metres South of)</u> (11/01059/FUL) | Installation of telecommunications broadband cabinet. | To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions and informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| 11 | <u>2 Barclay Terrace (Telecomms Apparatus 21 Metres South of)</u> (11/01124/FUL) | Installation of telecommunications broadband cabinet. | To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions and informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| 12 | <u>12 Merchiston Place (Telecomms Apparatus 23 Metres North of)</u> (11/01058/FUL) | Installation of telecommunications broadband cabinet. | To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions and informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| 13 | <u>4 Bruntsfield Avenue (Telecomms Apparatus 9 Metres Southwest of)</u> (11/01055/FUL) | Installation of telecommunications broadband cabinet. | To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions and informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |

Development Management Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
25 May 2011

| Agenda Item No. | Address/ Reference No | Details of Proposals | Decision |
|------------------------|---|--|---|
| 14 | <u>26 Roseneath Place</u> (Telecomms Apparatus 16 Metres West of) (11/01060/FUL) | Installation of telecommunications broadband cabinet. | To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions and informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| 15 | <u>33 Gilmore Place</u> (Telecomms Apparatus 10 Metres Northeast of) (11/01056/FUL) | Installation of telecommunications broadband cabinet | To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions and informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| 16 | <u>49,51 Home Street</u> (11/00230/FUL) | Part change of use from hot food and vacant hairdressers to hot food with ancillary delicatessen. | To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions and informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| 17 | <u>1 Saunders Street</u> (Telecomms Mast 31 Metres North of) (11/00511/FUL) | Proposed erection of 14.8m tall slimline monopole to accommodate Vodafone and O2 antenna within GRP shroud and 1 ground level cabinet. | To REFUSE planning permission for the reasons recommended by the Head of Planning and detailed in his report. |
| 18 | <u>11 West Shore Road</u> (Land 215 Metres North of) (11/00797/FUL) | Flap valve surface water outfall and surface water drain. | To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions and informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |

Development Management Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
25 May 2011

| Agenda Item No. | Address/ Reference No | Details of Proposals | Decision |
|-----------------|--|--|---|
| 19 | <u>3 Lonehead Drive</u> <u>(Site 212 Metres East of)</u> (11/00921/FUL) | Erection of motor vehicle sales dealership and motor vehicle maintenance workshop and associated offices, formation of car parking with associated landscaping and alteration of one existing road bellmouth to form service vehicle access (as amended) | To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions and informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| 20 | <u>64-84 Slateford Road</u> <u>(Land to the Rear of)</u> (10/02631/FUL) | Proposed mixed use development comprising 16 flats, and 420 m2 office space, (amendment of application reference no 02/02290/ful) | To continue until a later meeting. |
| 21 | <u>18-20 King's Stables Road</u> <u>(Telecomms Apparatus 6 Metres North of)</u> (11/01129/FUL) | Installation of telecommunications cabinet. | To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions and informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| 22 | <u>78 West Port</u> <u>(Telecomms Apparatus 28 Metres Northwest of)</u> (11/01130/FUL) | Installation of telecommunications cabinet. | To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions and informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |

Committee Minutes

Development Management Sub-Committee of the Planning Committee

Edinburgh, 8 June 2011

Present:- Councillors Lowrie (Convener), Burgess, Child, Dundas, McIvor, Milligan, Morris, Mowat, Munn, Peacock, Rose and Thomas.

Also in Attendance – Councillors Hinds, Whyte and Wilson.

1 **7 Clerk Street, Edinburgh – Partial Demolition of Cinema, etc**

The Sub-Committee had continued consideration of two applications, from its meeting of 11 May 2011, for a report from the Monitoring Officer, as follows -

Application no 08/00197/FUL – partial demolition and conversion of former cinema (in part) and new development to create hotel (incorporating bar/restaurant facilities), artist's studios/galleries, and community facilities, at 7 Clerk Street, and

Application no 11/00394/LBC – partial demolition of and alterations (internal and external) to former cinema at 7 Clerk Street, Edinburgh.

The Head of Planning reported on the applications and the planning considerations involved. On application no. 08/00197/FUL, the Sub-Committee had agreed on 29 October 2008 that it was minded to grant consent, subject to conditions and a legal agreement. However, the legal agreement had not been concluded and in the light of this and, additionally, the subsequent refusal by Scottish Ministers of listed building consent for the development, the matter had been returned to the Sub-Committee for determination. (Application no. 11/00394/LBC was a new application for listed building consent, in connection with the development proposals.)

At its meeting on 11 May 2011, the Sub-Committee had asked for a report from the Monitoring Officer relative to complaints from the

applicants that the officer's reports had displayed bias, incompetence, or a lack of professional judgement in reporting on their applications. The Monitoring Officer had looked into the issues raised and concluded that there was no evidence to support the applicants' complaints and that the Head of Planning had been correct in returning the 2008 application to the Sub-Committee for determination.

The Head of Planning said that the decision of Scottish Ministers to refuse listed building consent had raised new material considerations; the Ministers had taken a view that it had not been demonstrated that special regard had been given to preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest. Having re-assessed the proposals, including the information submitted by the applicants on the condition of the building, costs of repairing and maintenance, and evidence of demand for the building and valuations, the Head of Planning was now of the view that a sufficient case had not been made out to allow the partial demolitions of the listed building, in terms of policy Env2 in the Edinburgh City Local Plan, and that planning permission should be refused.

Motion

To approve the recommendations by the Head of Planning that the applications be refused for the reasons as detailed in his reports

– moved by Councillor Lowrie, seconded by Councillor Burgess.

Amendment

That the Sub-Committee be minded to grant the applications, on the basis that the arguments put forward by the applicants that the repair of the building was not economically viable, and that it had been marketed at a price reflecting its condition for a reasonable period, were accepted and therefore could meet the criteria of the statutory tests for listed buildings to allow partial demolition. The Council also had regard to the significant economic benefits to the wider community from re-development and therefore permission could be given for the development – with the Head of Planning asked to report back on suitable conditions.

- moved by Councillor Rose, seconded by Councillor McIvor.

Voting

The motion was carried by 8 votes to 4.

Decision

In terms of the motion by Councillor Lowrie, the Sub-Committee therefore resolved as follows:

Planning Application no. 08/00197/FUL: To refuse the application for the reason that the proposals fail to comply with Policy Env2 and do not have regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

Listed Building Consent 11/00394/LBC: To refuse the application for the reasons that –

1. The proposed demolition of the auditorium does not satisfy tests a), b), c) or d) of the Scottish Historic Environment Policy (July 2009).
2. The proposals are contrary to policy ENV 1C of the Edinburgh and the Lothians Structure Plan 2015 as demolition of the auditorium would harm the character and appearance of the listed building and the specific features which justify its designation.
3. The proposal is contrary to the Edinburgh City Local Plan policy Env 2 in respect of Listed Buildings – Demolition, as the circumstances for the demolition of the auditorium are not exceptional, taking into account criterion a), b) and c).
4. The proposal is contrary to the Edinburgh City Local Plan policy Env 4 in respect of Listed Buildings – Alterations and Extensions, as the demolition of the auditorium would cause unnecessary damage to and diminish the interest of the listed building.
5. The proposal is contrary to Non Statutory Guidelines in respect of Alterations to Listed Buildings, as the demolition of the auditorium would adversely affect the character of the listed building.

(References – Development Management Sub-Committee 11 May 2011 (items 3 and 4), reports by the Head of Planning, 28 October 2008, with Addendum and 11 May 2011, with Addendum, submitted)

2 Other Applications

The Sub-Committee dealt with the remaining applications on the agenda as detailed in the Appendix to these minutes.

(Councillors Hinds and Whyte were heard as ward members in connection with agenda items 6a and 6b (Application nos. 10/03246/FUL and 10/03246/LBC) and Councillor Wilson was heard in connection with agenda item 7 (Application 10/02631/FUL).)

Decision

The Committee agreed to determine the applications as detailed in the Appendix to these minutes.

(Reference – reports by the Head of Planning, 8 June 2011, submitted.)

APPENDIX

APPLICATIONS

Note: Detailed conditions/reasons for the following decisions are contained in the statutory planning register.

(Control click on the report references to view the reports for this meeting)

| Agenda Item No. | Address/ Reference No | Details of Proposals | Decision |
|-----------------|---|--|---|
| 3 | <u>Pitsligo Road, Edinburgh (Reports, PDF, 316.19 KB)</u> | Report on forthcoming Application for Residential Application – Protocol note and report by the Head of Planning (circulated) | To approve the report, as submitted. |
| 5 | <u>Fairmilehead Water Treatment Works, 55 Buckstone Terrace, Edinburgh (Reports, PDF, 2.49 MB)</u> (11/00188/PPP) | Planning permission in principle for residential development with associated roads, parking, landscaping and access. | To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions and informatives, including legal agreement, as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| 6A | <u>Raeburn House Hotel, 112 Raeburn Place and The Edinburgh Academical Club, 11A Portgower Place, Edinburgh</u> (10/03246/FUL) | Extension to existing hotel and new members clubhouse (all to operate with hotel liquor license), alterations to boundary wall | To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions and informatives, including legal agreement, as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |

| Agenda Item No. | Address/ Reference No | Details of Proposals | Decision |
|-----------------|---|--|--|
| 6B | <u>Raeburn House Hotel, 112 Raeburn Place and The Edinburgh Academical Club, 11A Portgower Place, Edinburgh (Reports, PDF, 1.08 MB)</u> | Conservation and repair of B-Listed Georgian villa, currently used as hotel, extension to existing hotel and new members clubhouse, alterations to boundary wall at Raeburn House Hotel, 112 Raeburn Place and the Edinburgh Academicals Sports Centre Clubhouse, Portgower Place, Edinburgh (10/03246/LBC) | To GRANT listed building consent subject to conditions and informatives, as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. (Application subject to notification to Scottish Ministers.) |
| 7 | <u>64-84 Slateford Road, Edinburgh - Land To The Rear (Reports, PDF, 1.15 MB)</u> (10/02631/FUL) | Proposed mixed use development comprising 16 flats, and 420 m2 office space, (an amendment of application no 02/02290/FUL) (10/02631/FUL) | To CONTINUE consideration and request the officers to provide further information relative to parking provisions. |
| 8 | <u>21 Claylands Road, Edinburgh - Land 104 Metres Southeast Of (Reports, PDF, 2.93 MB)</u> (10/02552/FUL) | Construction of an Anaerobic Digestion Plant comprising enclosed reception area, processing and storage facilities together with controlled access point and associated parking. | To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions and informatives, including legal agreement, as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| 9 | <u>50F Gracemount Drive, Edinburgh - Site 155 Metres East Of (Reports, PDF, 1.17 MB)</u> (10/03193/AMC) | Erection of 46 houses and 70 flats | To APPROVE the application subject to conditions and informatives, as recommended by the by the Head of Planning and detailed in the report. |

| Agenda Item No. | Address/ Reference No | Details of Proposals | Decision |
|-----------------|---|--|---|
| 10 | <u>4 Hillpark Way, Edinburgh - Land Adjacent To</u> <u>(Reports, PDF, 732.87 KB)</u> (11/01188/FUL) | Single dwelling, detached private. | To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions and informatives, as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| 11 | <u>77 Nicolson Street, Edinburgh</u> <u>(Reports, PDF, 553.24 KB)</u> | Change of use from class 1 (retail) to class 3 (food and drink - cafe) with ancillary hot food takeaway sales. (11/00820/FUL) | That the Committee was MINDED TO REFUSE the application for the reason recommended by the Head of Planning and detailed in his report. |
| 12 | <u>106 Niddrie Mains Road, Edinburgh - Telecomms Mast 44 Metres East Of</u> <u>(Reports, PDF, 363.83 KB)</u> (11/01156/FUL) | Proposed erection of 15m tall monopole to accommodate Vodafone/O2 antenna within GRP shroud plus 1 ground level cabinet. | To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions as recommended by the Head of Planning and detailed in his report. |
| 13 | <u>Roseburn Street, Edinburgh - Land Adjacent To</u> <u>(Reports, PDF, 577.55 KB)</u> (11/01535/PA) | Prior approval to erect 2 bridges, associated retaining structures and Overhead Line Equipment (OLE) poles for the Edinburgh Tram Network. | To GRANT planning permission, with informative as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| 14 | <u>14 - 7 Scotstoun Grove, South Queensferry</u> <u>(Reports, PDF, 459.66 KB)</u> (11/00856/FUL) | Part change of use from a Shop to Shop and Hot Food Take-away | To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions and with informative, as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| 15 | <u>9 South Gyle Crescent, Edinburgh</u> <u>(Reports, PDF, 338.75 KB)</u> (11/00836/FUL) | Change of use to teaching with ancillary office (Class 10). | To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions and informative as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |

| Agenda Item No. | Address/ Reference No | Details of Proposals | Decision |
|-----------------|--|--|--|
| 16 | <u>8-9 Teviot Place, Edinburgh (Reports, PDF, 592.04 KB)</u> (11/01039/FUL) | Change of use from retail shop (class 1) to sitting in coffee and sandwich shop (class 3) and alterations to shop-front. | To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions and informatives, as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| | | | |

Committee Minutes

Development Management Sub-Committee of the Planning Committee

Edinburgh, 22 June 2011

Present:- Councillors Lowrie (Convener), Blacklock, Burgess, Child, Dundas, McIvor, Milligan, Morris, Mowat, Paisley, Peacock, Rose and Thomas.

1 Fordel Junction, Dalkeith (A68) – Tourist Retail Outlet

Midlothian Council had consulted the City of Edinburgh Council on an application (no. 11/01811/MLC) for planning permission in principle for erection of hotel, tourist retail outlet and tourist orientation centre, with formation of associated car parking and vehicular and pedestrian access and associated works, on a site at Fordel Mains, located approximately two miles to the south-east of Dalkeith, at the junction of the A68 and A6124 roads.

The Head of Planning reported on the application and the planning considerations involved. He was of the view that the Council should object to the retail element of the application on grounds:

- that the need for a countryside location had not been satisfactorily demonstrated and the development would have a detrimental visual impact from a main approach road to Edinburgh;
- that the site did not meet the sequential approach to locations for retail development and suitable alternative locations across the expected catchment area (with the exception of Dalkeith) had not been explored;
- that there was no quantitative or qualitative efficiency in retail provision in the local area (including Edinburgh) that this proposal could meet;
- that the proposal posed a significant threat to the vitality and viability of Edinburgh City Centre, and other centres, and

- that the site was not accessible by existing or proposed regular, frequent, and convenient public transport services or footpaths/cycle routes.

For these reasons, the retail element of the application was considered to be a significant departure from structure plan policies ENV3, RET1, RET2 and RE13. The hotel and tourist orientation elements of the application did not raise any strategic or cross boundary concerns.

Motion

To approve the recommendations by the Head of Planning that the application be refused for the reasons as detailed in his reports

– moved by Councillor Lowrie, seconded by Councillor Mowat.

Amendment

That the grounds for objection outlined by the Head of Planning should be ameliorated in respect of the detrimental visual impact on the countryside and on the threat to vitality of and viability of Edinburgh City Centre, by: deletion of the first paragraph of grounds of objection, as above, and, in the fourth paragraph, deletion of the word 'significant' from 'significant threat' to vitality and viability of Edinburgh City Centre.

- moved by Councillor Rose, seconded by Councillor Morris.

Voting

The motion was carried by 9 votes to 4.

Decision

Accordingly, to resolve in terms of the motion by Councillor Lowrie and advise Midlothian Council –

- (1) That the City of Edinburgh Council raise objections on this consultation, for the reasons below.

Reasons

1. The proposal was contrary to Policy ENV3 (Countryside) of the Edinburgh and the Lothians Structure Plan 2015.
 2. The proposal was contrary to policies RET1, RET2 and RET3 of the Edinburgh and the Lothians Structure Plan 2015.
- (2) That, in accordance with the Edinburgh and the Lothian's Structure Plan Joint Liaison Committee Code of Practice on planning

applications and local plan referrals, if minded to grant consent, the application should be referred to the Edinburgh and the Lothians Structure Plan Joint Liaison Committee or directly to Scottish Ministers.

(References –report by the Head of Planning, 22 June 2011, submitted)

2 Other Applications

The Sub-Committee dealt with the remaining applications on the agenda as detailed in the Appendix to these minutes.

Decision

The Sub-Committee agreed to determine the applications as detailed in the Appendix to these minutes.

(Reference – reports by the Head of Planning, 22 June 2011, submitted.)

3 Harvesters Way, Edinburgh – Stopping-Up Order

A stopping-up order was required at Harvesters Way, Edinburgh, in order to facilitate a planning proposal for a Healthy Living Centre. The order had been advertised on 1 April 2011 and there were no outstanding objections.

Decision

To confirm the City of Edinburgh Council (Harvesters Way, Edinburgh) (Stopping-Up) Order 2011.

(Reference – report by the Acting Director of Corporate Services, 22 June 2011, submitted)

APPENDIX

APPLICATIONS

Note: Detailed conditions/reasons for the following decisions are contained in the statutory planning register.

(Control click on the report references to view the reports for this meeting

| Agenda Item No. | Address/ Reference No | Details of Proposals | Decision |
|------------------------|---|---|--|
| 3 | <u>104 Newcraighall Road, Edinburgh (Newcraighall East)</u> (10/03506/PPP) | Planning permission in principle for new housing, local mixed use facilities together with open space, access and services, infrastructure, landscape and footpath/cycle provision. | To refer consideration of the matter, including any hearing, to a future meeting to allow for a further report to be made by the Council's Monitoring Officer. |
| 4 | <u>103 Newcraighall Road, Edinburgh (Newcraighall North)</u> (10/03449/PPP) | Development including new housing, potential mixed-use facilities, open space, access and services infrastructure. | To refer consideration of the matter, including any hearing, to a future meeting to allow for a further report to be made by the Council's Monitoring Officer. |
| 5 | <u>34 Cramond Road North, Edinburgh - Forthcoming Application by AMA (New Town) Ltd for Proposed Sports Facilities and a Care Village</u> | Pre-Application Report - Proposed Sports Facilities and a Care Village | To note the key issues as described in the report, plus issues in relation to accessibility through the site to be considered. |
| 6 | <u>545 Old Dalkeith Road, Edinburgh - Forthcoming Application by Baywater (IOM) Ltd for a Mixed Use Development Etc</u> | Pre-Application Report – Mixed Use Development | To note the key issues as described in the report. |

Planning Committee
Development Management Sub-Committee
22 June 2011

| Agenda Item No. | Address/ Reference No | Details of Proposals | Decision |
|-----------------|---|---|---|
| 7 | <u>Royal Hospital for Sick Children and Associated Expansion of the Royal Infirmary of Edinburgh and Public Transport Variations - Forthcoming Application by the NHS for the Re-Provision, Edinburgh</u> | Pre-Application Report – Royal Hospital for Sick Children – Re-provision and Associated Expansion of the Royal Infirmary of Edinburgh and Public Transport Variations | To note the key issues as described in the report, plus issue of public transport accessibility, bus routes and stops etc to be included under transport accessibility; also information on helicopter pad and usage, and also energy/sustainability issues to be included. |
| 8 | <u>1 Slateford Road, Edinburgh - Forthcoming Application by AMA (New Town) Ltd</u> | Pre-Application Report – Major Development | To note the key issues as described in the report. |
| 9 | <u>Winton Gardens, Edinburgh - Forthcoming Application by Miller Homes</u> | Pre-Application Report – Residential Development | To note the key issues as described in the report. |
| 10 | <u>15A Albert Terrace, Edinburgh</u> (11/01217/FUL) | Alterations and extensions to house incorporating extension to side, replacement of timber structure to rear and new dormer windows to the front elevation. | To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions and informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |

Planning Committee
Development Management Sub-Committee
22 June 2011

| Agenda Item No. | Address/ Reference No | Details of Proposals | Decision |
|-----------------|--|--|--|
| 11 | <u>55 – 63 Dundee Street, Edinburgh</u> (11/00123/FUL) | Proposed erection of student residence (117 flats) with student centre and associated ancillary facilities, access, infrastructure and landscaping, a retail unit (Class 1), a community facility (Class 10 with ancillary cafe) and a public park. | To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions and informatives, including legal agreement, as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| 13 | <u>86 Gilmore Place (Telecomms Apparatus)</u> (11/01054/FUL) | Installation of telecommunications broadband cabinet. | Item withdrawn from the agenda for the meeting at request of the applicant and not considered. |
| 14 | <u>42 Hamilton Place</u> (11/01305/FUL) | Change of use from gallery space to retail unit. | To GRANT planning with informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| 15 | <u>11 Logie Green Road/ 26,28a,29,32,33 Beaverbank Place</u> (11/00475/FUL) | Amendment to planning permission for the change of use of 389 sq.m. of class 4 office accommodation located in block C (approved by planning permission ref: 08/01365/ful) to student residential accommodation, together with minor alterations to the north-western elevation. | To continue consideration for a site visit and further information on the marketing of these commercial units and supply/distribution of commercial units generally in the area. |
| 16 | <u>19 Polwarth Terrace (Telecomms Apparatus)</u> (11/01136/FUL) | Erect telecommunications broadband cabinet. | To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions and informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |

Planning Committee
Development Management Sub-Committee
22 June 2011

| Agenda Item No. | Address/ Reference No | Details of Proposals | Decision |
|------------------------|--|--|---|
| 17 | <u>32 Morrison Street (Telecomms Apparatus)</u> (11/01128/FUL) | Erect new telecommunications cabinet. | To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions and informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| 18 | <u>212 – 214 Morrison Street (Telecomms Apparatus)</u> (11/01132/FUL) | Erect new telecommunications cabinet. | To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions and informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| 19 | <u>78 Portobello High Street (Site)</u> (11/01346/FUL) | Revision to planning application ref 05/00572/FUL for three flats and associated parking - change to floor levels. | To continue consideration for a site visit and further details relative to over-shadowing/sunlight issues |

Committee Minutes

Development Management Sub-Committee of the Planning Committee

Edinburgh, 6 July 2011

Present: - Councillors Lowrie (Convener), Burgess, Dundas, Milligan, Morris, Mowat, Peacock and Rose.

1 Applications

The Sub-Committee considered the applications on the agenda.

Decision

To determine the applications as detailed in Appendix 1 to this minute.

(Reference – reports by the Head of Planning, submitted).

Development Management Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
6 July 2011

APPENDIX 1

APPLICATIONS

(As referred to in item 1 of the foregoing minute)

Note: Detailed conditions/reasons for the following decisions are contained in the statutory planning register.

| Agenda Item No/ Address | Details of Proposals/ Reference No | Decision |
|--|---|--|
| <u>Item 3 - 14 Greenbank Park</u> | One and a half storey rear extension with dormer & new front dormer. (11/01677/FUL) | To GRANT planning permission subject to informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| <u>Item 4 - 64 - 84 Slateford Road (Land to the rear of)</u> | Proposed mixed use development comprising 16 flats, and 420 m2 office space, (amendment of application reference no 02/02290/ful) (10/02631/FUL) | To Continue consideration of the application for further consultation on parking provision in the area. |
| <u>Item 5 - 5 Alfred Place (Site at former)</u> | Provision of a satellite dish and garden shed to each of the 14 dwelling houses (11/00859/FUL) | To GRANT planning permission subject to informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| <u>Item 6 - 10 Atholl Crescent</u> | Demolition of existing outbuilding and construction of extension to rear of existing townhouse (re-submission). (11/01531/FUL) | To GRANT planning permission subject to a condition and an informative as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |

Development Management Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
6 July 2011

| Agenda Item No/ Address | Details of Proposals/ Reference No | Decision |
|---|--|---|
| <u>Item 7 - 7 Dell Road (Colinton Parish Church), 8 Dell Road (Land 16 Metres Northwest Of), 51 Spylaw Street, Spylaw Street (Footpath) and Woodhall Road (Gardens)</u> | Public art project in centre of Colinton including new railings, statue, metal arch and other displays and signs. (11/01018/FUL) | To GRANT planning permission subject to a condition and an informative as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| <u>Item 8 - 3 Craigmillar Park</u> | Extension of existing hotel, including car parking and landscaping. (11/00714/FUL) | To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions and informatives as recommended by the Head of Planning and detailed in his report. |
| <u>Item 9 - 23 Craigmount View</u> | Build one-and-one-a-half storey extension to front + single storey extension to rear, convert roof void into accommodation with 2 dormers to front + rear, build wall round rear garden. (11/01416/FUL) | To GRANT planning permission subject to a condition and an informative as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| <u>Item 10 - 2,4,20,22 Dumbiedykes Road, 100, 102 Holyrood Road, 1, 17, 23, 25, 27, 31 Viewcraig Street, 34, 45 Viewcraig Gardens</u> | External refurbishment scheme to include new tiled roof coverings rainwater services, application of insulated render system, aluminium oversills to windows. (11/01296/FUL) | To GRANT planning permission subject to informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| <u>Item 11 - 39 Old Dalkeith Road (Land 37 metres southeast Of)</u> | Form off-street parking area. (11/01474/FUL) | To GRANT planning permission subject to a condition and informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |

Development Management Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
6 July 2011

| Agenda Item No/ Address | Details of Proposals/ Reference No | Decision |
|---|---|---|
| <u>Item 12 - 43-45 Salisbury Road</u> | Variation of condition No.8 of planning permission 06/04175/FUL to extend hours of operation of licensed use from 12:00-14:30 hours and 18:00 - 21:30 hours to 12:00 - 23:00 hours (11/01629/FUL) | To GRANT the application subject to a condition and informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| <u>Item 13 - 1,2,3,4 West Woods (Fettes College)</u> | Erect 2/3 storey boarding house + associated staff accommodation. (11/01036/FUL) | To GRANT planning permission subject to conditions and informatives as recommended by the Head of Planning and detailed in his report. |

Committee Minutes

Development Management Sub-Committee of the Planning Committee

Edinburgh, 20 July 2011

Present: - Councillors McIvor (in the Chair), Dundas, Morris, Mowat, Munn and Paisley.

1 Pre-Application Report/Other Applications

The Sub-Committee considered a Pre-Application Report and the Other Applications on the agenda.

Decision

To determine the pre-application report and the other applications as detailed in Appendix 1 to this minute.

(Reference – reports by the Head of Planning, 20 July 2011, submitted).

Development Management Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
20 July 2011

APPENDIX 1

APPLICATIONS

(As referred to in item 1 of the foregoing minute)

Note: Detailed conditions/reasons for the following decisions are contained in the statutory planning register.

| Agenda Item No/ Address | Details of Proposals/ Reference No | Decision |
|---|--|--|
| Item 3 - Land at Beaverhall Road , Edinburgh | Pre Application Report – Proposed residential development of 90 units. | To note the key issues for consideration, as described in the report by the Head of Planning, and request that these also include: parking provision/organisation (with an early stage indication required from the developer as to how matters of parking were to be addressed) and including provision for motor-cycles; noise issues, particularly having regard to existing industrial/business activity in adjoining area; and the issue of provision of adequate open space. |
| Item 4 - 21 <u>Grassmarket,</u> <u>Edinburgh</u> | Change of use from sandwich shop to coffee shop with seating for 20 persons with permission for soup tureen, microwave and panini machine. (11/01680/FUL) | To REFUSE planning permission for the reasons as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning and approve ENFORCEMENT action. |
| Item 5 - 16 <u>Greendykes Road,</u> <u>Edinburgh (Land 38</u> <u>Metres Northeast of)</u> | Erection of a single storey building with brick/block metal profiled roof (all insulated) to provide a secure enclosure for a district heating system. (11/01233/FUL) | To GRANT planning permission subject to the conditions with informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |

Development Management Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
20 July 2011

| Agenda Item No/ Address | Details of Proposals/ Reference No | Decision |
|---|--|--|
| <u>Item 6 - 115,117 Grove Street, Edinburgh</u> | Modify the planning permission reference 04/00695/FUL by having Section 75 Agreement, between Triple Crown and the City of Edinburgh Council, removed and replaced with an agreement that a contribution of £7,000 would be made to the City Car Club. (11/01267/OBL) | To GRANT planning permission subject to the informatives, including legal agreement, as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| <u>Item 7 - Lanark Road West, Edinburgh</u> | Erection of 15m tall monopole supporting Vodafone/O2 antenna within GRP shroud plus 1 ground level cabinet (11/01746/FUL) | To REFUSE planning permission for the reasons as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| <u>Item 8 - 14 Niddrie House Drive, Edinburgh</u> | Conversion of the ground floor into a one bed-roomed flatted residential dwelling and conversion of the first floor into a three bed-roomed flatted residential dwelling. (11/01737/FUL) | To GRANT planning permission with informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| <u>Item 9 - 25 Palmerston Place, Edinburgh</u> | Change of use to place of worship (class 10). (11/01353/FUL) | To GRANT planning permission subject to the condition and with informative as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |

Development Management Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
20 July 2011

| Agenda Item No/ Address | Details of Proposals/ Reference No | Decision |
|--|--|---|
| <u>Item 10 - 20 St Fillan's Terrace, Edinburgh</u> | Change of use from garden ground to form one new dwelling house including a shed in the garden. (11/01573/FUL) | To GRANT planning permission subject to the conditions and with informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |

Committee Minutes

Development Management Sub-Committee of the Planning Committee

Edinburgh, 3 August 2011

Present:- Councillors Lowrie (Convener), Blacklock, Burgess, McIvor, Milligan, Mowat, Munn, Paisley and Rose.

1 Glencairn Terrace (No. 5), Edinburgh – Access Stairs

The Sub-Committee considered an application (no. 11/01166/LBC) for listed building consent for proposed new access stairs to rear of property, at raised ground floor level, at 5 Glencairn Terrace, Edinburgh. The Head of Planning gave details of the application and the planning considerations involved. He recommended that the application be refused for the reason that the proposals would not comply with the development plan and Edinburgh planning guidelines and were likely to have a detrimental impact on the character of the listed building.

Motion

That the recommendation by the Head of Planning that the application be refused be approved for the reasons described in his report.

- moved by Councillor Lowrie, seconded by Councillor Burgess.

Amendment

That the proposals, having regard to the half-flight nature of the proposed staircase over an existing structure, would not be detrimental to the character and appearance of the listed building and not likely to set a precedent and were an allowable exception to policy. Therefore, to agree to grant listed building consent, with the Head of Planning authorised to issue consent.

- moved by Councillor Mowat, seconded by Councillor Rose.

Voting

The Amendment was carried by 6 votes to 3.

Decision

To resolve in terms of the motion by Councillor Mowat and thereby authorise the Head of Planning to issue listed building consent subject to standard conditions for this type of development, including standard conditions on material samples and details of railings to be submitted for approval by the Head of Planning.

(References –report by the Head of Planning, 3 August 2011, submitted)

2 General Applications

The Sub-Committee dealt with the remaining applications on the agenda as outlined in the Appendix to these minutes.

Decision

The Sub-Committee agreed to determine the applications as detailed in the Appendix to these minutes.

(Reference – reports by the Head of Planning, 3 August 2011, submitted.)

APPLICATIONS

Note: Detailed conditions/reasons for the following decisions are contained in the statutory planning register.

(Control click on the report references to view the reports for this meeting)

| Agenda Item No/ Address | Details of Proposals/ Reference No | Decision |
|--|--|--|
| <u>Item 3 - 80 Albion Road, Edinburgh</u> | Residential development of 126 flats and ancillary office accommodation. (11/01708/FUL) | To GRANT planning permission subject to the conditions with informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| <u>Item 4 - 59 Bonaly Crescent, Edinburgh</u> | Conversion of former garage to front of existing house into a new study. Creation of dropped kerb to access two new parking spaces at rear. Erection of a new free standing single garage and DIY workshop at rear. (11/01548/FUL) | To GRANT planning permission with informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| <u>Item 5 - 32 Chambers Street, Edinburgh</u> | Proposed new kitchen extract duct (as amended) (11/00876/FUL) | To GRANT planning permission with informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| <u>Item 7 - 150 Morrison Street, Edinburgh</u> | Erect 4 directional and promotional signage boards (11/02080/ADV) | To GRANT planning permission subject to the conditions as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |

Planning Committee
Development Management Sub-Committee
3 August 2011

| Agenda Item No/ Address | Details of Proposals/ Reference No | Decision |
|---|---|---|
| <u>Item 8 - 16-22 Picardy Place, Edinburgh</u> | Extension of existing hotel to form 25 additional bedrooms, restaurant extension and secondary kitchen (09/00715/FUL) | To GRANT planning permission subject to the conditions and with informatives as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| <u>Item 9 - 91-93 Princes Street, Edinburgh</u> | Erect internally illuminated signage on facade. (11/00825/ADV) | To issue a Mixed Decision (part approval), with conditions and reasons as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| <u>Item 10 - St Kentigern's Church, St Peter's Place, Edinburgh</u> | Change of use, conversion and extension of St Kentigern's Church to form 31 student bedrooms and a restaurant (09/03320/FUL) | To continue consideration for a site visit. |
| <u>Item 11 - 174 Whitehouse Road, Edinburgh</u> | Demolition of existing house and detached garage, erection of 2 flatted blocks consisting of 11 units total with associated hardstanding and parking. (11/00214/FUL) | To continue consideration for a site visit. |

Planning Committee
Development Management Sub-Committee
3 August 2011

| Agenda Item No/ Address | Details of Proposals/ Reference No | Decision |
|---|---|--|
| <u>Item 12 - 160 Woodhall Road, Edinburgh</u> | Deletion of legal agreement applied under condition G09 of planning application A01191/96 (11/00681/OBL) | To GRANT the application as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| <u>Item 13 - 160 Woodhall Road, Edinburgh</u> | Removal of condition G09 from Planning application A01191/96. (11/00681/FUL) | To GRANT the application as detailed in the report by the Head of Planning. |
| <u>Item 14 - Cowgate, Edinburgh - Forthcoming Application by SOCO (Edinburgh) Ltd</u> | Report by the Head of Planning on a forthcoming application by SOCO (Edinburgh) Ltd for a mixed use development comprising, hotel, bar, restaurant, café, retail, commercial and night club uses. | To note the key issues as described in the report; also, importance of development opportunity relative to improvement to South Bridge streetscape and Old Town to be emphasised; issues of <i>safe access</i> routes for pedestrians to be considered early in the proposals; and appropriateness of materials to be an important element of any plans. |

Planning Committee
Development Management Sub-Committee
3 August 2011