

## South Edinburgh 20mph Limit Pilot – Response to TRO Consultation

---

### Transport, Infrastructure and Environment Committee

2 August 2011

#### Purpose of report

- 1 To advise the Committee of the results of the statutory consultation on the Traffic Regulation Order (TRO/11/17) for the 20mph Speed Limit Pilot in South Edinburgh.
- 2 To note the objections received, and subsequently to recommend that the Traffic Regulation Order can be made as advertised at the following locations;
  - a) In the streets indicated with ‘proposed 20mph speed limit’ on the plan attached as Appendix 1.
  - b) On Ratcliffe Terrace and Causewayside between the junctions with Fountainhall Road and West Preston Street.

#### Main Report

- 3 A report was submitted to the Transport, Infrastructure and Environment Committee on 8 February outlining the results of a consultation exercise for proposals on a 20mph speed limit pilot in South Edinburgh and approval was sought to commence the statutory procedure to promote the Traffic Regulation Order for a 20mph speed limit in south Edinburgh. Appendix 1 shows the streets included within the proposed area.
- 4 The decision of the Committee was to approve the commencement of the statutory process on streets outlined in Appendix 1 with the addition of:
  - (a) Ratcliffe Terrace and Causewayside between the junctions with Fountainhall Road and West Preston Street, which forms part of the Quality Bike Corridor; and
  - (b) the north-south Marchmont Road-Kilgraston Road-Blackford Avenue West Mains Road-Esslemont Road route and the east-west Churchill - Strathearn Road-Grange Road route.

- 5 The Traffic Regulation Order to reduce the speed limit to 20mph was advertised to the public from 9 May 2011 to 3 June 2011. This report outlines the results of this statutory consultation that was undertaken on the proposals for an extended 20mph limit as shown in Appendix 2.
- 6 33 letters/emails of objection were received, seven outlining comments/concerns, and 21 in support of the scheme. The following paragraphs provide details of the objections/concerns raised and the Council's response to them.
- 7 Appendix 3 provides details of the objections/concerns raised and the Council's response to them; however the following is a summary of the objections/concerns received:
  - a) The environmental impact of the 20mph pilot speed limit, including the effects on air quality and emissions;
  - b) The inclusion of the North-South Marchmont Road – Kilgraston Road – Blackford Avenue – West Mains Road – Esslemont Road route & East-West Church Hill – Strathearn Road – Grange Road route in the 20mph pilot speed limit;
  - c) The effect that the proposed 20mph speed limit will have on cyclists in terms of safety;
  - d) The inclusion of bus routes in the 20mph speed limit area and the effect it will have on buses, including delays to the timetable, resulting increases in operation costs and emissions;
  - e) Monitoring and enforcement of the 20mph speed limit pilot;
  - f) Possible increases in traffic congestion;
  - g) Driver frustration;
  - h) Traffic calming - both for and against its introduction;
  - i) Costs of the proposed 20mph speed limit;
  - j) Justification for the proposed 20mph speed limit; and
  - k) Street clutter and signage.

- 8 Traffic speed and volume surveys have been undertaken at locations across the proposed area. The results have indicated that current average speeds have been recorded at or above 24mph along these main routes as shown in the table below.

<b>Location</b>	<b>Average Speed</b>	<b>85<sup>th</sup> Percentile Speed*</b>	<b>Traffic volume (24hr average)</b>
West Mains Road	28.9mph	31.4mph	12,524
Grange Road	27.6mph	33.8mph	9,998
Marchmont Rd	27.3mph	30.5mph	7,880
Kilgraston Road	26.8mph	33.8mph	9,445
Esslemont Road	26.1mph	33.8mph	8,232
Church Hill	26.0mph	33.0mph	3,213
Blackford Ave	23.9mph	30.0mph	12,559
* The 85th percentile speed is the speed which 85% of the vehicles are not exceeding.			

- 9 Lothian and Borders Police have expressed concerns over applying a 20mph limit to busier streets where current average speeds are above 24mph. They believe that as no traffic calming measures are proposed for these routes, the desired reduction in speed may not be achieved on some routes and will require police enforcement which cannot be sustained in the medium to long term.
- 10 Lothian Buses have raised concerns regarding the additional streets that have been included in proposed 20mph speed limit. Their concerns are based on bus journey times, delays to services and the cost of operation. If journey times are increased due to the new 20mph speed limit, they may have to provide additional buses in order to meet the timetable schedule. Appendix 3 contains a plan indicated the bus services affected by the 20mph speed limit pilot.
- 11 Lothian Buses service number 38, which would be affected by the 20mph limit along West Mains Road and Esslemont Road, can only be operated with financial support from the Council. So any possible increase in operating cost would need to be borne by the Council in the form of an increased subsidy.
- 12 With respect to the impact on bus service number 5, Lothian Buses have indicated in April 2011, it was necessary to introduce additional resource to accommodate deteriorating average speeds along the route, which led to an increase in operating costs. Service number 5 follows the east-west Church Hill – Strathearn Road – Grange Road route. They consider that the proposed 20mph limit along this route may result in them having to add additional buses to this route in order to meet timetable demands.
- 13 Lothian Buses service numbers 24 and 41 which operate along both the proposed additional east-west and north south routes cannot sustain an increase in operating costs without being pushed into deficit.

14 So although there is a cogent argument for extending the coverage of the 20mph limit from the point of view of encouraging walking and cycling and improving road safety, there is a more compelling case for keeping a clear network of more heavily trafficked, strategic routes on which the 30mph speed limit should be retained. In order of priority, listed according to their current speed profiles and impact on the bus network, the routes to be kept at 30mph should be:

- West Mains Road and Esslemont Road
- Marchmont Road-Kilgraston Road-Blackford Avenue
- Church Hill – Strathearn Road – Grange Road

So taking into account the concerns of the police and Lothian Buses, it is recommended that these main routes should not be included in the 20mph pilot speed limit.

### **Financial Implications**

15 The cost of the proposed scheme is estimated to be in the region of £100,000 - £150,000, depending on the number of streets included in the final scheme. This would be met from the 2011/2012 Capital Road Safety and Cycle budgets.

### **Equalities Impact**

16 No negative impacts are anticipated. It is expected that the scheme should improve conditions for vulnerable road users.

### **Environmental Impact**

17 It is expected the scheme will lead to positive environmental effects through reductions in vehicle speeds and a contribution towards encouraging a transfer of motorised journeys to walking and cycling. The siting of signs for the scheme will incorporate use of existing lighting columns and sign poles.

18 The Council Air Quality Monitoring Unit have greater concerns about the introduction of the 20mph speed limit on the busier bus corridors than in the quieter residential streets in general. Higher gear ratios at lower running speeds result in greater tailpipe emissions. This is true for all vehicles, but slower buses and HGVs are likely to contribute to air quality issues in the city. Edinburgh, being a city with a high proportion of city centre dwellers in high density buildings means that greater numbers of people are potentially exposed per kilometre of route, than in the majority of urban environments elsewhere in the UK.

### **Recommendations**

18 To note the objections received and the responses made to these objections.

- 19 To note the objections received from Lothian and Borders Police and Lothian Buses and to omit the introduction of the 20mph speed limit on:-
- a) The north-south Marchmont Road – Kilgraston Road – Blackford Avenue – West Mains Road – Esslemont Road route; and
  - b) The east-west Church Hill – Strathearn Road – Grange Road route.
- 20 To recommend that the Traffic Regulation Order can be made as advertised at the following locations:-
- a) In the streets indicated with ‘proposed 20mph speed limit’ on the plan attached as Appendix 1.
  - b) On Ratcliffe Terrace and Causewayside between the junctions with Fountainhall Road and West Preston Street.

---

Appendices	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Proposed 20mph speed limit plan</li> <li>2. 20mph speed limit plan- TRO/11/17</li> <li>3. Bus Route plan</li> <li>4. Schedule of Objections/Concerns</li> </ol>
Contact/tel/Email	Jacqueline Haley - 0131 469 3558 - jacqueline.haley@edinburgh.gov.uk
Wards affected	<p>10 - Meadows/Morningside</p> <p>15 - Southside/Newington</p> <p>16 - Liberton/Gilmerton</p>
Single Outcome Agreement	<p>Will contribute to the current National Outcomes:</p> <p>6 - We live longer, healthier lives.</p> <p>9 - We live our lives safe from crime, disorder and danger.</p> <p>10 - We live in well-designed, sustainable places where we are able to access the amenities and services we need.</p> <p>12 - We value and enjoy our built and natural environment and protect it and enhance it for future generations.</p> <p>14 - We reduce the local and global impact of our consumption and production.</p>
Background Papers	<p>Report to the Transport Infrastructure and Environment Committee Papers 8 February 2011 "20mph Speed Limit Pilot in South Edinburgh"</p> <p>Report to the Transport Infrastructure and Environment Committee Papers 21 September 2010 "20mph Speed Limit Pilot in South Edinburgh"</p> <p>20mph Speed Limit in South Edinburgh Consultation Report</p> <p>Letters of objections/concerns</p>