

Listed Building Consent Application
at
7 Whitehouse Terrace
Edinburgh
EH9 2EU

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee

Proposal: Erect orangery/garden room extension and garage/studio flat to replace existing garage
Applicant: Mr Afshar
Reference No: 03/01507/LBC

1 Purpose of report

To recommend that the application be **GRANTED** subject to;

Conditions

1. The works hereby permitted shall be commenced no later than five years from the date of this consent.
2. The application shall be referred to the Scottish Ministers prior to determination.

Reasons

1. In order to accord with the statutory requirements of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Acts.
2. In order to accord with the statutory requirements of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Acts.

2 Main report

Site description

The application property is a sandstone constructed, two storey, near rectangular-plan villa with an Italianate entrance tower and service wing, dating from circa 1862. The building, which is set in extensive mature grounds bounded by high stone walls, is category B listed (North Morningside/GrangeWard) and situated within the Grange Conservation Area.

Site history

August 2002 - consent granted to erect a contemporary style, single storey extension to the west of the existing house and a new garage to replace the existing garage in the north east corner (02/02449/FUL and 02/02449/LBC).

Development

The application is for the erection of a traditional style, garden room extension to the west of the existing house, measuring approximately 90 square metres floor area and constructed in squared and snecked sandstone with timber framed, astragalled windows and glazed and slated piended roofs.

A section of the west elevation of the original villa measuring approximately 4m by 2.2m, which includes a sash and case window, is to be removed to create an open plan kitchen/dining room with the new extension. A clerestory window will be formed above the roof line of the garden room where it abuts the original villa to provide additional daylight to the extended kitchen. The remaining ground level sash and case window in this bay will be replaced with a timber framed, astragalled door leading to new external stone steps.

A new triple garage/studio flat is to be erected in the north east corner of the site, comprising a coach house style, two storey, rectangular plan, rubble sandstone constructed block with slated wallhead dormers and vertically slatted timber doors. The footprint is approximately 100 square metres.

Consultations

No consultations undertaken.

Representations

The application was advertised on 23 May 2003. One letter of representation was received.

The Cockburn Association objects to the proposed "orangery" on the grounds that it is an over elaborate pastiche building without flair, which does not relate to the principal house in terms of roof form and astragal pattern. The Association also objects to the proposed garage building on the grounds of scale and detailing.

Policy

The site is located within the Central Edinburgh Local Plan, in an area of Housing and Compatible Uses.

Relevant Policies:

Policy CD2 (LISTED BUILDINGS) sets out criteria for assessing proposals affecting listed buildings and seeks to safeguard their character and setting.

Non-statutory guidelines on 'HOUSE EXTENSIONS' set out the design principles against which proposals will be assessed.

Non-statutory guidelines 'ALTERATIONS TO LISTED BUILDINGS' provide general guidance for assessing proposals for both internal and external alterations.

3 Conclusions and Recommendations

DETERMINING ISSUES

The determining issues are:

- do the proposals preserve the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses? If they do not, there is a presumption against the granting of consent;
- do the proposals comply with the development plan?
- if the proposals do comply with the development plan, are there any compelling reasons for not approving them?
- if the proposals do not comply with the development plan, are there any compelling reasons for approving them?

ASSESSMENT

To address the determining issues, the Committee needs to consider whether the proposals have an adverse impact on the character of the listed building.

Sandstone and timber constructed garden rooms and conservatories are characteristic features of the listed villas within the Grange Conservation Area. The proposed extension is indeed a pastiche of the original architecture, but one of the highest quality in terms of design, detailing and materials. The south/entrance elevation reflects the principal elevation of the original villa with its Italianate entrance tower with arch headed windows and one-over-one sash and case windows. The north elevation incorporates astragals in its mullioned windows to reflect the six-over-six fenestration pattern on the side and rear elevations of the listed house. The proposed shallow hipped roofs also echo those of the existing architecture and the sandstone walls will be constructed to match the original stonework.

The scale of the proposed garden room extension is acceptable in principle, as the structure will be sufficiently subservient to the main villa and will not occupy a significant area of garden ground. The existing garage is of no special historic or architectural merit.

The associated alterations to the existing villa will result in the loss of a section of the original west wall. However, this is a relatively minor and inconspicuous part of the building and its removal is justified in order to create a more flexible space. The proposed new access door on this elevation is acceptable in order to provide easy access to the garden and the incorporation of a lower solid panel retains the appropriate ratio of solid to void.

The new structure will be discreetly located in the north east corner of the site behind the existing 2.6 metre high boundary wall and will be inconspicuous from public views due to the high stone wall along the front boundary and narrow access gates. The traditional stable block style and construction materials are consistent with original outbuildings in the grounds of similar listed villas in this area.

The proposals comply with the development plan and non-statutory policies and have no adverse impact on the character of the listed building.

There are no other material planning considerations which outweigh this conclusion.

It is recommended that the Committee approves this application, subject to the conditions stated.

Alan Henderson

Alan Henderson
Head of Planning and Strategy

Contact/tel Clare Macdonald on 0131 529 3510

Ward affected 46 -North Morningside/Grange

Local Plan Central Edinburgh

**Statutory Development
Plan Provision** Housing and Compatible Uses

File AF

Date registered 13 May 2003

**Drawing numbers/
Scheme** 01-10
Scheme 1