

Committee Minutes

The City of Edinburgh Council

Year 2005/2006

Meeting 2 - Thursday 2 June 2005

Edinburgh, 2 June 2005 - At a meeting of The City of Edinburgh Council.

Present:-

LORD PROVOST

The Right Honourable Lesley Hinds

COUNCILLORS

Elaine Aitken
Rev Ewan Aitken
Robert C Aldridge
Donald Anderson
Phil Attridge
Ian J Berry
Andrew Burns
Robert Cairns
Stephen Cardownie
Maureen M Child
Bill Cunningham
Trevor Davies
Jennifer A Dawe
Paul G Edie
Edward B Fallon
William Fitzpatrick
James Gilchrist
Sheila Gilmore
George Grubb
The Hon David Guest
Kenneth Harrold
Ricky Henderson
George A Hunter
Allan G Jackson
Shami Khan
Douglas J Kerr
Allan Laing
John Longstaff

Jim Lowrie
Gordon Mackenzie
Kate MacKenzie
Fred Mackintosh
Marilyne A MacLaren
Elizabeth Maginnis
Lawrence Marshall
Mark McInnes
Eric Milligan
Gordon J Munro
Ian Murray
Jack O'Donnell
Liz O'Malley
Alastair Paisley
Ian Perry
Thomas V Ponton
Jason G Rust
Andrew A Scobbie
Lorna Shiels
Kingsley E F Thomas
Marjorie Thomas
Susan B Tritton
David J Walker
Phil Wheeler
Iain Whyte
Chris Wigglesworth
Donald Wilson

1 The G8 Summit, Gleneagles July 2005

The G8 Summit was due to be held on 6-8 July 2005 at Gleneagles, Perthshire. The event would have a major impact on the surrounding areas and cities in Scotland by attracting worldwide media coverage and a number of related events, rallies and demonstrations.

The Summit also presented an opportunity to promote Scotland and Edinburgh internationally. All pre-event planning had been based on the theme of a welcoming city within a strategy designed to achieve minimum disruption and the safety of citizens and visitors.

(a) Deputation – G8 Alternatives

Frances Curran, MSP and Pat Smith explained that G8 Alternatives was an umbrella group comprising organisations and individuals from a broad range of social movements which had come together to facilitate and organise peaceful protests and a “counter-summit” to the official G8 event.

They appealed to the Council:

- to enter into discussions with the organisation on arrangements for dealing with large numbers of people expected to come to Edinburgh between 2 and 6 July 2005;
- to provide accommodation at a covered site for people coming to Edinburgh during this period;
- to announce plans as soon as possible so that visitors could be informed of the arrangements.

Following questions from members, the Lord Provost thanked the deputation for its presentation and invited it to remain for the debate on the matter.

(b) Report by the Director of City Development

Information was provided on the extensive work done to mitigate the impact of the G8 Summit on the normal life of the city. Attention was also drawn to the costs of this work incurred to date and the steps being taken to obtain funding from the Scottish Executive.

The City of Edinburgh Council
2 June 2005

The Director of City Development and Assistant Chief Constable Dickinson, Lothian and Borders Police, gave an update on contingency arrangements to handle the potential increase in the number of people expected in Edinburgh following comments made at the launch of "Live8".

Decision

- 1) To note the extensive work by officials and Lothian and Borders Police to ensure a safe environment for the city's residential and commercial sectors, for visitors to the city and demonstrators alike during the very busy G8 Summit period.
- 2) To uphold the rights of all people who wished to demonstrate on items of public concern in the city and encourage all demonstration organisers to ensure that this took place in a safe and legal fashion. To recognise also the needs of members of the public in Edinburgh to go about their normal business without threat of public disorder.
- 3) To note the Council decision of 7 April 2005 to support the Make Poverty History Campaign. In light of developments within the last 48 hours to agree:
 - i) that any demonstrations in the city should be planned and organised on the basis that the safety of residents and visitors to the city was paramount;
 - ii) to call on the organisers of all events to work closely with the Council, the Police and all other agencies as had been successfully achieved by the organisers of the Make Poverty History march;
 - iii) that accommodation should be utilised across Scotland and that officials be authorised to liaise with VisitScotland to achieve a co-ordinated and planned approach to welcoming any visitors to Edinburgh and Scotland; and
 - iv) that all visitors should secure accommodation and put in place appropriate travel arrangements before setting out but that it was inappropriate for unaccompanied children to travel to Edinburgh.
- 4) To note the comments on liability and insurance in para 4.5 of the report by the Director of City Development and to ask that the further information on the legal position of the Local Authority and Police Authority be reported to the Member Officer Review Group and circulated to all members.

The City of Edinburgh Council
2 June 2005

- 5) To endorse the representations to date with the Scottish Executive to enable the Council to recover its costs in the matter.
- 6) To note that a further report would be submitted on the outcome of G8 following an assessment and debrief of pertinent issues.

(References – e-mail from G8 Alternatives 1 June 2005 and report no CEC/27/05-06/CD by the Director of City Development, submitted).

2 Questions

Questions put by members to this meeting, written answers and supplementary questions and answers are contained in the Appendix to this minute.

3 Minutes

Decision

To approve the minute of meeting of the Council of 12 May 2005, as submitted, as a correct record.

4 Appointments to Outside Bodies

(a) Edinburgh UNESCO City of Literature – Nomination to the Board of Trustees

Edinburgh had been successful in its bid to become the first UNESCO City of Literature. The Council was now invited to nominate a Trustee to the Board of Edinburgh UNESCO City of Literature.

Decision

To nominate the Lord Provost as a Trustee to the Board of Edinburgh UNESCO City of Literature.

(References – Act of Council No1 of 14 October 2004; report no. CEC/17/05-06/CS by the Director of Corporate Services, submitted).

(b) NISUS Scotland – Nomination

The Council was invited to nominate a replacement for Councillor Wilson who had resigned from the Board of NISUS Scotland.

The City of Edinburgh Council
2 June 2005

Decision

To nominate Councillor Attridge to the Board of NISUS Scotland.

(References – Act of Council No. 6(b) of 19 August 2004; report no. CEC/18/05-06/CS by the Director of Corporate Services, submitted).

5 Leader's Report

The Leader presented his report to the Council. The following issues were raised in questions on the report:

- | | |
|---------------------------|--|
| Councillor Whyte | - Traffic report from the Edinburgh Evening News of May 1926 |
| Councillor Dawe | - City brand – website domain name |
| Councillor Kate MacKenzie | - Bookstart project – availability in other languages. |
| Councillor Scobbie | - Firrhill High School replacement – community improvements |

(Reference – report no CEC/25/05-06/L by the Leader, submitted.)

6 Edinburgh City Region Brand – Update and Proposal for Council Use of the Brand

Information was provided on the Edinburgh city region brand, developed using Cities Growth Fund money, which had been launched on 25 May 2005.

An update on the implementation and future development of the brand was provided and approval sought on how it should be adopted and used by the Council.

Decision

- 1) To acknowledge and support the chosen city region brand as detailed in Appendix 1 to the report by the Director of Corporate Services.
- 2) To adopt the endorsement option for use of the city region brand by the Council as detailed in paragraphs 3.20 to 3.24 and Appendix 2 of the Director's report.

The City of Edinburgh Council
2 June 2005

- 3) To ask the Head of Corporate Communications to prepare detailed guidelines and costings for the use of the city region brand by the Council.
- 4) To consider updating the Council logo following adoption of the brand marque.
- 5) To note the application for funding through the next round of the Cities Growth Fund.

(References – Act of Council No 14 of 18 March 2004; report no CEC/19/05-06/CS by the Director of Corporate Services, submitted.)

7 Edinburgh Tram Project: Tram Lines 1 and 2 – Proposed Amended Limits of Deviation

Approval was sought for three significant changes to the proposals for Tram Lines 1 and 2 currently being considered by Committees of the Scottish Parliament. The proposed variations, which followed further detailed design work and negotiations with objectors, were set out.

Decision

- 1) To approve the amendments to the alignment and limits of deviation to:
 - a) Tram Lines 1 and 2 at Haymarket Yards;
 - b) Tram Line 1 at Newhaven; and
 - c) Tram Line 2 at the Gyle.
- 2) To ask the Director of City Development to submit a progress report on the Business Case for Tram Lines 1 and 2 to all members.

(Reference – Act of Council No 9 of 22 January 2004; report no CEC/20/05/06/CD by the Director of City Development, submitted.)

Declaration of Interests

Councillors Burns, Child and Cunningham declared a non-financial interest in the above item as non-Executive Directors of **tie**.

8 **tie Limited Business Plan – 2005/06**

Approval was sought for **tie** Ltd's draft annual Business Plan for the financial year 2005/06, setting out the company's activities, costs and funding requirements in connection with the development and implementation of the Council's major transport projects.

Motion

To approve the **tie** Business Plan for the financial year 2005-06, subject to (i) any expenditure in excess of the **tie** projected out-turn for 2004-05 being contained within the **tie** 2005-06 budget; and (ii) the award of grant from the Scottish Executive to meet the additional funding required.

- moved by Councillor Burns, seconded by Councillor Cunningham (on behalf of the Labour Group)

Amendment

To continue consideration of the matter to the Council meeting on 30 June 2005 for consideration in conjunction with the Council's revised integrated public transport strategy and the report requested by the Council on 24 February 2005 on a range of transport issues.

- moved by Councillor Wheeler, seconded by Councillor Mackintosh.

Voting

For the motion - 29 votes
For the amendment - 15 votes

Decision

To approve the motion by Councillor Burns.

(References – Act of Council No 7 of 29 April 2004; report no CEC/28/05-06/CD by the Director of City Development, submitted.)

Declaration of Interests

Councillors Burns, Child and Cunningham declared a non-financial interest in the above item as non-Executive Directors of **tie**.

9 Proposal for a Members Bill in the Scottish Parliament – Local Government Elections (Scotland) Bill

A response was proposed to consultation by the Scottish Parliament on decoupling the Scottish Parliament and Local Government Elections as proposed in the Local Government Elections (Scotland) Bill.

Motion

- 1) To approve the Council's response to the Local Government Elections (Scotland) Bill consultation document as detailed in Appendix 2 to the report by the Returning Officer subject to including the following as the response to question 3 of the document:

“This Council believes that for the citizens of Edinburgh to express a clear preference on the political governance of the city, the election for the representatives of the City of Edinburgh Council should be separated from the election for any other representative body.

It is important that the citizens of Edinburgh have an opportunity to pass judgement on the performance of the outgoing Council and to make a recommendation on its future political direction in a clear and unambiguous manner.

Separate election will also lead to a more vigorous discussion of local issues and ensure that local government elections are decided on local issues.

This Council therefore agrees that the next Council election should be postponed for one year and held in 2008.”

- 2) To write to all Scottish Local Authorities to raise the issue and to make representations to the Scottish Executive to support this view.

- moved by Councillor Perry, seconded by Councillor Cunningham (on behalf of the Labour Group).

Amendment

To approve the Council's response to the Local Government Elections (Scotland) Bill consultation document as detailed in Appendix 2 to the report by the Returning Officer.

- moved by Councillor Dawe, seconded by Councillor Mackintosh.

The City of Edinburgh Council
2 June 2005

Voting

For the motion - 41 votes
For the amendment - 15 votes

Decision

To approve the motion by Councillor Perry.

(References – Act of Council No 10 of 25 January 2001; report no CEC/21/05-06/RO by the Returning Officer, submitted.)

10 The Edinburgh Makar

(a) Stewart Conn – 2002-2005

The Council had appointed the poet and playwright Stewart Conn as the city's first Edinburgh Makar on 30 May 2002 for a period of three years.

Information was provided on the success of the Makar post and the Council was invited to acknowledge Stewart Conn's achievements as the first incumbent.

Decision

To commend Stewart Conn for his enthusiasm and commitment to the post of Edinburgh Makar.

(b) Valerie Gillies – 2005-2008

The Council was invited to approve the appointment of Valerie Gillies as the Edinburgh Makar for 2005-2008.

Decision

- 1) To appoint Valerie Gillies as the Edinburgh Makar for 2005-08.
- 2) In order to mark the building of the new City Council Headquarters, to ask the Edinburgh Makar to write a poem to be displayed in an appropriate way (e.g. etched on glass, in stone, or framed) in a prominent position in the new HQ.

(References – Act of Council No 9 of 30 May 2002; reports nos CEC/22/05-06/C&L and CEC/23/05-06/C&L by the Director of Culture and Leisure, submitted.)

14 Proposed New Regional Park

In response to a motion by Councillor Murray on the possibility of introducing Country Park status to the area of land known as the Braid Hills wedge, options available to the Council for enhancing public access and benefits in the area were detailed.

The pursuit of Country Park status was not recommended for the Braid Hills wedge because of the anticipated expenditure and legal process involved in obtaining those areas of the land in private ownership.

Decision

- 1) Not to pursue Country Park status for the Braid Hills wedge.
- 2) To establish a short-life Member/Officer Group, to include the Executive Member for Sport, Culture and Leisure and the Convener of the Planning Committee and representatives of the Culture and Leisure and City Development Departments, to develop a proposal, for inclusion in the new City Plan and action thereafter, for a wider area Regional Park in the green belt, including the Braid Hills Wedge.

(References – Act of Council No 20 of 27 January 2005; joint report no CEC/24/05-06/C&L and CD by the Directors of Culture and Leisure and City Development, submitted.)

Declaration of Interests

Councillors Gichrist and Mackintosh declared a non-financial interest in the above item as Directors of EDI.

15 Local Government Elections – Candidates Election Addresses – Motion by Councillor Berry

The following motion by Councillor Berry was submitted in terms of Standing Order 28:

“Council notes that under the provisions of Section 91 of The Representation of the People Act 1983 (as amended) candidates for election to the Westminster Parliament are entitled to send an election address to households within the relevant constituency post free. Similar provision for candidates at elections to the Scottish Parliament is to be found at Paragraph 58 of The Scottish Parliament (Elections etc) Order 2002. Regulation 63 of The European Parliamentary Regulations 2002 enables a free posting by candidates at European Parliamentary Elections. At present, the local government election rules make no similar provision for candidates for election to local authorities.

The City of Edinburgh Council
2 June 2005

Given the change to large multi-member wards for the local government elections in 2007 and, in the interests of equality of treatment and ease of communication with electors for all those seeking an electoral mandate, Council asks the Chief Executive to report on the possibility of the introduction of a similar legislative provision for those seeking election to local authorities.”

Decision

To approve the motion by Councillor Berry and:

- 1) To ask the Chief Executive to include in his report comments on and approximate costings for a post-free provision for local government elections to each household based on:
 - a) one election communication per candidate in each multi-member ward; and
 - b) one election communication per group of candidates in each political party/grouping or independent candidate standing in each multi-member ward.
- 2) To refer the terms of the motion to the Lothian Electoral Joint Committee.

16 Armenia – Motion by Councillor Anderson

The following motion by Councillor Anderson was submitted in terms of Standing Order 28:

“The Council notes that a growing number of Parliaments around the world have recognised the deaths of 1.5 million Armenian men, women and children in 1915 (during WW1) as genocide by the Turkish Ottoman Empire. This Council notes and supports the efforts of representatives of the Armenian community in Edinburgh and worldwide in seeking recognition of the genocide and raising awareness of the need for increasing openness and historical understanding of the scale and nature of these events in the interests of humanity, justice and future peaceful international relations.

The Council also notes the symposium entitled “Remembering the Past, Looking Forward to the Future” that took place on 20 May 2005 in the presence of His Excellency Dr Vahe Gabrielyan, Ambassador of the Republic of Armenia.”

Decision

To continue consideration of the matter to the Council meeting on 30 June 2005.

17 Sir William Y Darling Bequest for Good Citizenship

The Council resolved, in terms of Section 50(A)(4) of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973, that the public be excluded from the meeting during consideration of the following item of business for the reason that it involved the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in Paragraph 6 of Part 1 of Schedule 7(A) of the Act.

Details were given of nominations for the award of the Sir William Y Darling Bequest for Good Citizenship for the municipal year 2004/2005.

Decision

To award the Sir William Y Darling Bequest for Good Citizenship for the municipal year 2004/2005 to Ejaz Nazir.

(Reference – report no CEC/26/05-06/CS by the Director of Corporate Services, submitted.)

Appendix
(As referred to in Act of Council No 2 of 2 June 2005)

QUESTION NO 1

**By Councillor Mackintosh
answered by the Executive
Member for Children and
Families**

Question (1) By secondary school how many pupils in Edinburgh are entitled to receive the educational maintenance allowance?

Answer (1) There are 2379 pupils resident within the City of Edinburgh Council area who are of age to apply for an EMA (those born between March 1988 and February 1989) who attend Local Authority Schools – each individual's eligibility can only be determined by household income. See Appendix 1 "EMA Age Eligibility".

(The number of pupils at Independent Schools is not known to the Department)

Question (2) By secondary school how many pupils have received or have applied for the educational maintenance allowance in financial year 2004/5?

Answer (2) See Appendix 2 "EMA Applications and Awards".

Question (3) What publicity has been employed to inform young people and parents at secondary schools in the City of Edinburgh Council area of the possibility that they might be eligible for the educational maintenance allowance?

The City of Edinburgh Council
2 June 2005

Answer (3) This is a Scottish Executive Scheme which has been advertised nationally. In addition there has been a seminar at Murrayfield for all school staff to raise awareness prior to the issue of application forms. Leaflets (for both staff and pupils), posters and application forms were issued to all schools (Local Authority and Independent) for distribution to all eligible pupils by age.

Note

In session 2005/06 numbers will increase as year groups S5 & S6 will be eligible to apply.

**Supplementary
Question**

I am grateful for the extensive answer provided. This is a laudable project and certainly my party is delighted to see it working. I would be grateful if the Executive Member would consider promoting the project further through Edinburgh Outlook next year. Also I think the project could be promoted in a more interactive way on the Young Scotland website because feedback from my constituents indicates that the information is not particularly accessible at certain times of the year. This is not a criticism of the Children and Families Department but more a criticism of the Scottish Executive.

**Supplementary
Answer**

Yes, I am happy to do that.

The City of Edinburgh Council
2 June 2005

Appendix 1

EMA Age Eligibility

School name	Female	Male	Grand Total
Balerno High School	67	53	120
Boroughmuir High School	85	72	157
Broughton High School	73	50	123
Canonmills School	1	0	1
Castlebrae Community High School	14	5	19
Craigmount High School	95	86	181
Craigroyston Community High School	15	13	28
Currie Community High School	67	72	139
Drummond Community High School	20	18	38
Firrhill High School	74	75	149
Forrester High School	36	32	68
Gracemount High School	22	12	34
Graysmill School	1	4	5
Holy Rood High School	29	40	69
James Gillespie's High School	75	93	168
Kaimes School	1	7	8
Kingsinch School	0	1	1
Leith Academy	67	42	109
Liberton High School	44	36	80
Oaklands School	1	2	3
Pilrig Park School	5	7	12
Portobello High School	93	81	174
Queensferry High School	52	55	107
St Augustine's RC High School	44	45	89
St Nicholas School	3	2	5
St Thomas of Aquin's RC High School	48	42	90
St. Crispin's School	2	4	6
The Royal High School	73	84	157
Trinity Academy	51	76	127
Tynecastle High School	37	39	76
Wester Hailes Education Centre	21	11	32
Willowpark School	1	3	4
Grand Total	1217	1162	2379

This is age eligibility only - actual eligibility of individuals is based on household income.

The City of Edinburgh Council
2 June 2005

Appendix 2

EMA Applications Awards

School Name	EAP Status					
	Pending	Query	Active	Refused	Archived	Grand Total
Balerno High School		1	27	3	1	32
Boroughmuir High School			30	3	1	34
Broughton High School			56	7	6	69
Castlebrae Community High School			11	1	4	16
Craigmount High School		1	41	6	6	54
Craigroyston Community High School	2		17		9	28
Currie Community High School			32	4	1	37
Drummond Community High School			24	4	5	33
EMA Edinburgh*			72	13	5	90
Firrhill High School			40	8	4	52
Forrester High School			32	3	8	43
Gracemount High School			17	2	3	22
Graysmill School			1			1
Holy Rood High School			40	4	21	65
James Gillespie's High School	2	1	48	6	3	60
Kaimes School			6	1	1	8
Kingsinch School			1			1
Leith Academy	1		67	6	7	81
Liberton High School	1		34	5	7	47
Pilrig Park School			2			2
Portobello High School		2	51	7	12	72
Queensferry High School			25	2	4	31
St Augustine's RC High School		1	25	6	7	39
St Nicholas School			2			2
St Thomas of Aquin's RC High School			34	14	2	50
St. Crispin's School			3			3
The Royal High School			24	5	4	33
Trinity Academy			42	3	4	49
Tynecastle High School	1		35	3	13	52

The City of Edinburgh Council
2 June 2005

School Name	EAP Status					
	Pending	Query	Active	Refused	Archived	Grand Total
Wester Hailes Education Centre	2		23	2	4	31
Willowpark School			1			1
Grand Total	9	6	863	118	142	1138

* EMA Edinburgh = pupils from Independent Schools.

KEY - Pending and Query = Further information requested following application
 Active = Those currently in receipt of an award.
 Refused = Those refused awards.
 Archived = Those who have now left school, and received an award for part of the year.
 Grand Total = Total number of applicants.

The City of Edinburgh Council
2 June 2005

QUESTION NO 2

**By Councillor Longstaff
answered by the Executive
Member for Sport, Culture and
Leisure**

Question

What progress has been made in preparing the report on curling facilities required by the motion to Council submitted by me and agreed by Council at its meeting on 10 April 2003 and when is the report expected to be published?

Answer

Work on the preparation of the report was suspended while the bid to **sportscotland** for the National Curling Academy was being progressed but the bid was unsuccessful. Following **sportscotland's** decision, several meetings have been held with Gogarburn Curling Club to ascertain if the City Council can assist in the provision of a new centre for the Club. At this time, these discussions are ongoing and once a solution to the problem is found, the report will be completed and submitted to the Council.

QUESTION NO 3

**By Councillor Longstaff
answered by the Executive
Member for Sustainability and
Finance**

Question

What progress has been made since 30 May 2002 on my motion to council on school meals?

"To ask for an annual report indicating the percentage of foodstuff in meals provided in City of Edinburgh schools which is:

- a) produced locally;
- b) grown organically;
- c) produced locally and grown organically;

and which will detail measures which might increase these percentages," which was remitted to the Executive of 18 June 2002, whose decision was:

- "1) To approve the motion and to widen its terms to include how the Council used organic foodstuffs and supported organic farming.
- 2) To note that the Director of Finance would prepare the report on this matter."

Answer

At the Council meeting of 13 November 2003, Councillor Longstaff asked what progress is being made on the school meals report prompted by the motion to Council on 30 May 2002 and when can it be expected to be published?

The City of Edinburgh Council
2 June 2005

The Council approved the following answer:

“Information will not be available in sufficient detail until e-procurement is in place. Developing Edinburgh into a Fairtrade City is intended partly to help promote the procurement and promotion of locally-sourced and organic products throughout the city. A report on progress is due to come to the December meeting of the Council.”

The Council on 11 December 2003 approved the Fairtrade city report and the Council Executive on 4 May 2004 discharged the outstanding motion.

The main suppliers have assured the Council that, wherever possible, they buy from local sources, though not specifically organically-grown produce and the Council buys British meat exclusively. There are now Fairtrade apples, bananas, grapes and other fruits available on the CPU contract CT0101 (food) which were not available when the Councillor first asked his question.

With the introduction in 1 April 2005 of the new Oracle system for procurement – ordering requires to be improved before the management information relating to uptake of Fairtrade products etc will be meaningful.

**Supplementary
Question**

Would this information have been available more quickly if the Executive had not widened the report's terms of reference?

**Supplementary
Answer**

Quite possibly. Nevertheless, I think it provided information to the Council based on the thrust of the original question. I apologise if this was not the information you wanted but I'm sure you would like to get more information which would provide a proper base on which to build for the future.