

Listed Building Consent Application 04/04052/LBC
at
23A Northumberland Street
Edinburgh
EH3 6LR

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee

1 Purpose of report

To consider application 04/04052/LBC, submitted by Mr + Mrs Prentice. The application is for: **Erect single storey extension (in retrospect)**

It is recommend that this application be **REFUSED AND ENFORCED** for the reasons in Appendix B.

2 The Site and the Proposal

Site description

The application property is the basement flat of a three storey, sandstone constructed, terraced tenement by Robert Reid and William Sibbald, dating from the early 19th century. The building, which is on the north side of Northumberland Street, is category A listed (New Town Ward) and situated within the New Town Conservation Area and World Heritage Site.

Northumberland Street North East Lane containing single storey garages runs along the rear of the terrace.

Site history

March 1986 - consent granted to form a car parking space in the rear garden (2190/85).

September 1997 - consent granted for alterations including the replacement of patio doors to the rear with a new sash and case window (A 01840 97).

November 2002 - consent granted to demolish two outhouses and replace with a single storey extension (02/03194/FUL).

December 2002 - consent granted to demolish two outhouses and replace with a single storey extension (02/03194/LBC).

27 May 2004 - letter received from a neighbour stating that the erected extension is not in accordance with the approved plans.

An associated application for planning permission (04/004052/FUL) accompanies this application for listed building consent.

Description of the Proposal

The application is for the erection of a new contemporary style garden room, in retrospect.

The new structure, measuring 18sqm in area, has a grey painted mild steel structural frame with natural finish hardwood-framed glazed panels. The flat roof and slope of the ridge light is finished in a dark grey metal membrane. The section of the garden room immediately below the existing two storey extension is constructed in natural stone matching the coursing and finish of the existing stonework. A 1.8m wide strip of timber decking abuts the new extension.

The apex of the ridge light of the erected structure is 25cm higher than that approved in the previous applications.

The exposed upper section of the east wall of the extension will be finished in sandstone to match the mutual boundary wall. This will replace the unauthorised cedar boarding on the east elevation.

Supporting Statement

The agent has submitted a supporting statement, which is available in the Group Rooms.

The statement explains why for structural reasons cedar cladding was erected on the exposed section of the east wall of the extension and confirms that this will be replaced with sandstone.

As regards that increased apex height of the ridge light, the agent states that this resulted from Building Control's requirement to construct roof insulation on top of the roof deck rather than between the joists and as a result of inaccurate survey drawings prepared by another firm. The agent argues that

the change in level is minimal and does not affect the amenity of the neighbour above. The agent also claims that the extension is largely hidden from the lane and surrounding properties therefore the increased height does not materially affect the rear of the building.

3 Officer's Assessment and Recommendations

Determining Issues

The determining issues are:

- do the proposals preserve the buildings or their settings or any features of special architectural or historic interest which they possess? If they do not, there is a presumption against the granting of consent;
- do the proposals comply with the development plan?
- if the proposals do comply with the development plan, are there any compelling reasons for not approving them?
- if the proposals do not comply with the development plan, are there any compelling reasons for approving them?

Assessment

To address the determining issues, the Committee needs to consider whether the proposals have an adverse impact on the character of the listed building.

The rear elevation of this terrace at ground level is punctuated with single and two storey stone built outshoots dating mainly from the 19th century. The proposed garden room is therefore acceptable in principle as its footprint and single storey height is in keeping with existing extensions in the terrace.

The introduction of a contemporary style glazed extension is considered acceptable in this context as the design and materials are high quality. The structure includes a stone section that provides visual support for the remaining section of the existing two storey outshoot above and an appropriate ratio of solid to void. The replacement of the unauthorised section of cedar cladding on the east elevation will improve the appearance of the structure in the historic context.

However, the installed ridge light projects vertically to an unacceptable degree in terms of visual impact on the character and appearance of the listed building. The approved apex height is discreet lying below the level of the cill of the window above. While there are two storey outshoots within the terrace, including one on this building, these are historic stone built structures, which were erected prior to listing and conservation area status. The existence of these outshoots does not justify the encroachment of a modern structure significantly above ground floor level. The agent has been given ample opportunity to submit an alternative design for the ridge light that reduces its visual impact. However, no such design has been forthcoming.

The proposals do not comply with the development plan and non-statutory policies and have an adverse effect on the character of the listed building.

There are no other material planning considerations which outweigh this conclusion.

It is recommended that the Committee refuses this application, for reasons relating to the character of the listed building. It is also recommended that enforcement action is taken to remove the unauthorised ridge light.

Alan Henderson

Alan Henderson
Head of Planning and Strategy

Contact/tel	Clare Macdonald on 0131 529 3510
Ward affected	18 - New Town
Local Plan	Central Edinburgh
Statutory Development Plan Provision	Housing and Compatible Uses
Date registered	4 November 2004
Drawing numbers/ Scheme	01-03 Scheme 1

Advice to Committee Members and Ward Councillors

The full details of the application are available for viewing on the Planning and Building Control Portal : www.edinburgh.gov.uk/planning.

If you require further information about this application you should contact the following Principal Planner, Nancy Jamieson on 0131 529 3916. Email: nancy.jamieson@edinburgh.gov.uk.

If this application is not identified on the agenda for presentation, and you wish to request a presentation of this application at the Committee meeting, you must contact Committee Services by 9.00a.m. on the Tuesday preceding the meeting on extension 4229/4239. Alternatively, you may e-mail blair.ritchie@edinburgh.gov.uk or sarah.bogunovic@edinburgh.gov.uk

Application Type Listed Building Consent Application
Application Address: 23A Northumberland Street
Edinburgh
EH3 6LR
Proposal: Erect single storey extension (in retrospect)
Reference No: 04/04052/LBC

Consultations, Representations and Planning Policy

Consultations

No consultations undertaken.

Representations

The application was advertised on 26 November 2004 and attracted three letters of representation from the Cockburn Association, AHSS and a neighbour.

The material concern raised relates to the installed rooflight and its impact on an A listed building within the World Heritage Site. The replacement of the unauthorised cedar cladding with sandstone is welcomed. The other comments relate to the associated application for planning permission.

Full copies of the representations made against this application are available in Group Rooms or can be requested for viewing at the Front Counter, 1 Cockburn Street.

Planning Policy

The site is located within the Central Edinburgh Local Plan, in an area of Housing and Compatible Uses.

Relevant Policies:

Policy CD2 (LISTED BUILDINGS) sets out criteria for assessing proposals affecting listed buildings and seeks to safeguard their character and setting.

Non-statutory guidelines 'ALTERATIONS TO LISTED BUILDINGS' provide general guidance for assessing proposals for both internal and external alterations.

Application Type Listed Building Consent Application
Application Address: 23A Northumberland Street
Edinburgh
EH3 6LR
Proposal: Erect single storey extension (in retrospect)
Reference No: 04/04052/LBC

Conditions/Reasons associated with the Recommendation

Recommendation

To recommend that this application be **Refused and Enforced** for the following reasons;

Reasons

1. The proposal is contrary to Central Edinburgh Local Plan Policy CD2, in respect of Listed Buildings, as the proposed ridge light adversely affects the character of .
2. The proposal is contrary to Non Statutory Guidelines in respect of Alterations to Listed Buildings, as the proposed ridge light adversely affects the character of

End