

Full Planning Application 07/01568/FUL
at
3 Craigmillar Park
Edinburgh
EH16 5PG

**Development Management Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee**

9 April 2008

Supplementary Report

This application was previously considered by Committee on **9 April 2008**.

An addendum is included at the end of Section 3 of this report.

1 Purpose of report

To consider application 07/01568/FUL, submitted by S Hafeez. The application is for: **Change of use to residential and extension of existing building, demolition of existing garage + conservatory and addition of new dwelling house.**

It is recommended that this application be **GRANTED** subject to the conditions below.

2 The Site and the Proposal

Site description

2 The Site and the Proposal

Site description

The property is a detached villa on the east side of Craigmillar Park, and on the north side of the junction with Crawford Road. It is currently in use as a guest house (Ben Craig). It has a rear conservatory, and a large double garage accessed from Crawford Road.

This property is located within the Craigmillar Park Conservation Area.

Site History

94/02408/FUL - Change of use from dwelling house to guest house, approved 08.02.1995

96/00686/FUL - Proposed extension (as amended), approved 04.09.1996

96/01266/FUL - Erect a conservatory, approved 18.06.1996

98/00619/FUL - Erect single-storey side extensions to guest house (as amended), approved 29.07.1998

06/00810/OUT – outline planning permission for 1 dwelling house with garage. Refused 05.06.2006

07/01568/CON – demolition of conservatory and detached double garage. Pending decision.

Description of the Proposal

The proposal comprises the change of use from a hotel to residential use incorporating 4 dwelling units, the addition of a 1½ storey side extension to the property and the location of a small lodge style dwelling in the rear garden area. 4 parking spaces are being provided, with an additional car port attached to the lodge.

The main building and side extension is to be divided into 3 flats with a further residential unit being located in the lodge within the garden grounds.

The side extension is to be constructed from stone and slate to match the existing dwelling. The lodge is to be constructed from sandstone with slate roof and vertical timber cladding. All windows and doors are to be timber framed. There are two rooflights and a dormer added to the main building.

It should also be noted that an application for the demolition of an existing side extension, rear conservatory and freestanding garage has also been submitted in conjunction with this application (07/01568/CON – pending decision)

Previous Scheme

Scheme 1 included a change of use from a hotel to residential incorporating 4 dwelling units, the addition of a two storey side extension with attic space and a two storey rear extension with attic space.

3 Officer's Assessment and Recommendations

Determining Issues

Do the proposals harm the character or appearance of the conservation area?
If they do, there is a strong presumption against granting of permission.

Do the proposals comply with the development plan?

If the proposals do comply with the development plan, are there any compelling reasons for not approving them?

If the proposals do not comply with the development plan, are there any compelling reasons for approving them?

ASSESSMENT

To address these determining issues, the Committee needs to consider whether:

- a) the proposed use is acceptable in this location.
- b) the proposal will maintain or enhance the character and appearance of the conservation area

- c) the proposal will not adversely affect the amenity of neighbouring residents
- d) the proposal will not adversely affect road safety

a) The property is located within an area designated within the relevant local plans as one of housing and compatible uses. The property was previously used as a dwelling house, the return of buildings to residential use is supported by the Central Edinburgh Local Plan. The proposed use is acceptable in principle.

b) The supplementary guidelines regarding Villas are not applicable to corner sites and therefore will not be considered in this assessment.

The conservation area is characterised as follows

An area of late Victorian villas and terraces centred on a main arterial road with high traffic flows. The area has a predominantly residential character with few public or institutional buildings – the exception being the Suffolk Road Halls of Residence (1914) which comprise five two storey blocks arranged around a central green.

The side extension is of a suitable scale which is set down from the original dwelling, resulting in a visually subservient feature which respects the appearance of the property. The proposed windows are a traditional timber frame sash and case design.

The materials proposed for the side extension are of an acceptable nature which matches the existing dwelling, thus maintaining the character of the property.

The design and scale of the 'lodge style' dwelling is of a high quality which sits comfortably in the streetscape does not result in a visually dominant feature. It is also replacing an existing structure within the rear garden, therefore a building within in this location is well established.

The total building coverage equates to 26% of the site area. Although the hard landscaping and parking covers 30% of the site, leaving 44% as green garden ground, the proposal provides an adequate level of amenity space to future residents and also maintains the character and appearance of the property.

The area is characterised by semi-detached properties, large detached dwellings and a number of non-residential buildings (St Margaret's School), resulting in a mixed spatial pattern to the area. The building coverage and scale of the proposed additions, along with the open layout of the site maintains the character of the property that of a detached dwelling set within large garden grounds, reflecting the spatial pattern of the area and maintaining its character and appearance.

The main building and the proposed 'lodge' are set in front of the building line of the properties situated on Crawford Road. However, the application site is not a continuation of the building line of the properties on Crawford Road, which are defined by their open front gardens. The site takes its reference from the building line of Craigmillar Park and its orientation and high boundary wall separates it visually from Crawford Road.

Crawford road, defined by their open front gardens, and a clear division can be made between these properties and that of the application site.

It is therefore considered that the 'lodge' is situated in an acceptable location which will not adversely impact upon the street scene or the character of the properties on Crawford Road.

The materials proposed for the detached unit complement that of the main building and surrounding properties, maintaining the character of the area.

The rooflight to the rear elevation of the main building is of a small scale which respects the form of the roof. The rooflight positioned on the side elevation of this building is also of an acceptable scale. It is positioned behind the existing chimney breast and as a result will not be visible, its impact upon the appearance of the building will therefore be minimal.

The proposed dormer is appropriate in terms of scale and detailing, and does not dominate the front plane of the roof.

In conclusion, the design and scale of the proposed alterations respect the spatial pattern of the area and maintain the character and appearance of the conservation area.

c) The proposed window to the gable elevation of the main building looks out onto the roadway and will therefore have no impact upon the privacy of neighbouring residents.

The gable windows in the proposed lodge house does not result in a loss of privacy as the proposed windows facing No 1 Craigmillar Park are situated 9m from the boundary of the neighbouring property. The window in the opposite gable looks onto a roadway.

The side extension to the main building results in small amount of overshadowing to the neighbouring property (15.4m²), but this is a gable to gable situation and will therefore be no loss of amenity. The lodge house does not result in any overshadowing to neighbouring properties.

d) The proposal includes four parking spaces in the courtyard area and a further parking space specifically for the detached dwelling unit. The level of off street parking proposed accords with the Council's parking standards and is acceptable.

The existing vehicle entrance to the property off Crawford Road is to be relocated to a new location on the same street. The existing driveway off Craigmillar Park is also to be blocked up. A condition is to be attached to planning consent stating that the existing access points must be built up to match the existing boundary wall.

Transport Planning has raised no objection to the application in respect of highway safety or parking. The proposal would not detrimentally impact highway safety or parking.

Transport Planning has requested that a condition be placed on any consent regarding a requirement for 7 cycle parking spaces. However, taking into consideration the layout of each proposed residential unit, it is considered that the cycle parking spaces can be accommodated within each proposed flat.

It has been suggested that the description of the proposal is misleading as the description of the proposed development does not make reference to the property being sub-divided into flats. This fact is however, stated in section 7 of the application form, which is publicly available.

Reference is also made to the fact that the alteration to the front driveway off Craigmillar Park to be replaced with a grassed area is also not stated within the application documents. This is however, clearly shown on the plans.

The application is not misleading and inspection of all related documents and drawings shows all the alterations which are being proposed.

In conclusion, the proposed change of use to residential is of an acceptable nature and the proposed alterations and additions are of an acceptable nature which does not result in a detrimental impact upon the character and appearance of the conservation area, adversely affect the amenity of neighbouring residents or adversely affect road safety.

It is recommended that the Committee approves this application subject to a condition regarding the boundary treatment.

Addendum

This application was previously at Committee on 9 April 2008 and a request for continuation was accepted to allow the revised scheme to be advertised.

Prior to the re-advertisement, 4 letters of comment were received as neighbours became aware that the proposals had changed from an extension to the existing villa to a separate house within the grounds. The revised proposals were advertised on 18 April 2008 and 5 further responses were received, making a total of 8 responses, all objections, to the revised scheme.

The main points of concern are

- proposed new house is out of keeping in terms of size, design and position
- lack of parking
- insufficient amenity space
- over development of site
- impact on trees
- villa policy
- sub division of front garden
- road safety
- adverse impact on conservation area
- daylighting and privacy
- disruption to wildlife

In response to these comments, the scheme has been further amended to retain the existing opening to the double garage and insert close boarded gates to keep the enclosure to the street and to ensure that the new house will not be visually prominent in the streetscene. The existing pedestrian opening further down will be widened instead. This will allow all the trees on this boundary to be retained.

The parking layout has also been amended and 5 spaces, one for each dwelling unit is shown on the site plan. In addition, the location for cycle parking and bins stores has been identified.

In relation to the villa policy, as stated in the original report, there is sufficient garden ground remaining to provide amenity space. Excluding corner sites from the villa guidelines effectively means that these cases must be looked at individually and a judgement made as to whether the proposals are in the spirit of the protection of Edinburgh's villa areas. Inserting a new house in place of a double garage does have an impact but, on balance, does not undermine the integrity of the villa area.

There is no proposal to subdivide the front garden of the villa as suggested by objectors and any impact on wildlife will be lessened as the trees to the road are now being retained.

It is recommended that the Committee approves this application, subject to a revised condition on the boundary wall and implementation of the parking arrangements.

Alan Henderson

Alan Henderson
Head of Planning and Strategy

Contact/tel	Chris Cornell on 0131 529 3665
Ward affected	A15 - Southside/Newington (NEW)
Local Plan	Central Edinburgh Local Plan
Statutory Development Plan Provision	Residential
Date registered	4 May 2007
Drawing numbers/ Scheme	6, 7A, 8A,9, 101,6-8 Scheme 2

Advice to Committee Members and Ward Councillors

The full details of the application are available for viewing on the Planning and Building Control Portal: www.edinburgh.gov.uk/planning.

If you require further information about this application you should contact the following Principal Planner,

If this application is not identified on the agenda for presentation, and you wish to request a presentation of this application at the Committee meeting, you must contact Committee Services by 9.00a.m. on the Tuesday preceding the meeting on extension 4229/4239. Alternatively, you may e-mail gavin.king@edinburgh.gov.uk or carol.richardson@edinburgh.gov.uk

Application Type Full Planning Application
Application Address: 3 Craigmillar Park
Edinburgh
EH16 5PG

Proposal: Change of use to residential and extension of existing building, demolition of existing garage + conservatory and addition of new dwelling house.

Reference No: 07/01568/FUL

Consultations, Representations and Planning Policy

Consultations

Transport Planning

No objections subject to 7 cycle parking spaces for residents to be situated in a secure location within the development.

Representations

The application was advertised on 11.05.2007, 11 letters of objection have been received, raising the following issues:

- 1) Overdevelopment of the site. (see section b of the assessment)
- 2) Adverse impact upon spatial character of the area. (see section b of the assessment)
- 3) Contrary to villa policy and guidelines. (see section b of the assessment)
- 4) Breach of building line. (see section b of the assessment)
- 5) Adversely affects amenity of neighbouring residents due to loss of privacy. (see section c of the assessment)
- 6) Additional vehicles result in increased pressure on parking. (see section d of the assessment)
- 7) Lack of adequate parking provision for number of residential units proposed. (see section d of the assessment)

- 8) Access point not adequate, no passing provision resulting in adverse impact upon road safety. (see section d of the assessment)
- 9) Procedural issues/misleading description of proposal incorrect, no mention in documents of removing front driveway. (see end of the assessment)

Full copies of the representations made in respect of this application are available in Group Rooms or can be requested for viewing at the Main Reception, City Chambers, High Street.

Planning Policy

The property is located within the Central Edinburgh Local Plan Housing and Compatible Uses land use designation, and Finalised Edinburgh City Local Plan Urban Area.

Relevant Policies:

Relevant policies of the Central Edinburgh Local Plan.

Policy CD4 (CONSERVATION AREAS) requires that developments in a conservation area retain all features which contribute to the area's character and appearance.

Policy CD5 (CONSERVATION AREAS - REDEVELOPMENT) sets out the criteria against which new development in conservation areas will be assessed, and seeks to preserve or enhance their character and appearance.

Policy CD16 (NEW DEVELOPMENT IN VILLA AREAS) sets out the essential requirements of approved guidelines which seek to regulate the form and layout of new development in the garden grounds of villa properties.

Policy CD17 (MATERIALS) sets out requirements for materials in new developments and seeks a greater use of stone, roofing slate and other traditional materials in appropriate cases.

Policy CD19 (BUILDING ALTERATIONS) sets out requirements for the design, form, materials and positioning of alterations and extensions.

Policy H3 (HOUSING - CONVERSION OF NON-RESIDENTIAL BUILDINGS) encourages, and sets out criteria for assessing, the change of use of suitable non-residential buildings to housing.

Policy H11 (HOUSING AMENITY) establishes a presumption against new development and changes of use likely to introduce increased levels of traffic or activity to the detriment of residential amenity or to the reasonable prospects of further residential development where this is an objective of the Local Plan.

Policy T15 (PRIVATE CAR PARKING) requires all new development to comply with car parking standards set out in the Development Control Handbook, including provision for people with disabilities, and requires car parking to be designed to minimise visual intrusion.

Relevant policies of the Finalised Edinburgh City Local Plan.

Policy Des 11 (Alterations and Extensions) sets criteria for assessing alterations and extensions to existing buildings.

Policy Env 5 (Conservation Areas – Development) sets out criteria for assessing development in conservation areas.

Policy Hou 5 (Conversion to Housing) sets criteria for assessing the change of use to residential.

Policy Tra 3 (Private Car Parking) requires private car parking provision to comply with the parking levels set out in supplementary planning guidance, and sets criteria for assessing lower provision.

Relevant Non-Statutory Guidelines

Non-statutory guidelines 'DAYLIGHTING, PRIVACY AND SUNLIGHT' set criteria for assessing proposals in relation to these issues.

Non-statutory guidelines on 'HOUSE EXTENSIONS AND ALTERATIONS' set out the design principles against which proposals will be assessed.

Non-statutory guidelines on 'PARKING STANDARDS' set the requirements for parking provision in developments.

The Craigmillar Park Conservation Area Character Appraisal emphasises the predominance of high quality stone-built Victorian architecture of limited height which provides homogeneity through building lines, heights, massing and the use of traditional materials, and the predominant residential use.

Application Type Full Planning Application
Application Address: 3 Craigmillar Park
Edinburgh
EH16 5PG

Proposal: Change of use to residential and extension of existing building, demolition of existing garage + conservatory and addition of new dwelling house.

Reference No: 07/01568/FUL

Conditions/Reasons associated with the Recommendation

Recommendation

It is recommended that this application be **GRANTED** subject to the conditions below.

Conditions

1. The development hereby permitted shall be commenced no later than five years from the date of this consent.
2. Details of the proposed works to the boundary wall shall be submitted to and approved in writing within six months of works commencing on site. The works shall be carried out concurrently with the development hereby approved.
3. The proposed access and parking arrangements shall be implemented prior to the occupation of the dwellings.

Reasons

1. In order to accord with the statutory requirements of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Acts.
2. In order to safeguard the character of the conservation area.
3. In order to ensure that the level of off-street parking is adequate.

End

Application Type Full Planning Application

Proposal: Change of use to residential and extension of existing building, demolition of existing garage + conservatory and addition of new dwelling house.

Reference No: 07/01568/FUL



Location Plan

Reproduction from the Ordnance Survey mapping with permission of the Controller of Her Majesty's Stationery Office © Crown Copyright.

Unauthorised reproduction infringes Crown copyright and may lead to prosecution or civil proceedings. Licence Number 100023420 The City of Edinburgh Council 2005.