

**Listed Building Consent Application 07/03921/LBC  
at  
12 Bruntsfield Crescent  
Edinburgh  
EH10 4EZ**

---

**Development Management Sub-Committee  
of the Planning Committee**

19 December 2007

---

**1 Purpose of report**

To consider application 07/03921/LBC, submitted by J McBride. The application is for: **Change of use from office accommodation to four residential units**

It is recommended that this application be **GRANTED** subject to the conditions below.

**2 The Site and the Proposal**

**Site description**

This application relates to the upper floors of a 2- storey, attic and basement building which forms part of a terrace of 12 imposing Baronial villas by David MacGibbon and Thomas Ross for W and D McGregor, builders 1870-73 including some minor alterations by Robert Lorimer.

This building is Category 'A' listed (listed on 15.04.1991, 30498)

This property is located within the Merchiston Greenhill Conservation Area.

## **Site History**

1981 - Personal grant for the change of use of the top floor of number 11 to offices.

94/02535/FUL - Permitted development for 'Change of use from caretakers flat to offices' (17.01.1995)

05/04192/FUL - Permission granted for 'Change of use from offices to 2 residential units with extension to rear of property in garden (as amended)' (03.03.2006)

05/04192/LBC - Consent granted for 'Alter from offices to 2 residential units with extension to rear of property in garden and internal alterations to accommodate new units (as amended)' (06.04.2006)

06/00678/E01 - Enforcement enquiry for 'Change of use to office & alterations'. There is both PP and LBC for changes to the building and formation of 2 dwellings. Under Working from Home guidelines, it is permissible to run a business from home as long as it complies with certain criteria and there was no evidence that this is not the case here. The rear extension has consent too. Other legal matters are not for planning consideration. No further action was taken. (13.11.2006)

07/02400/LBC - Consent granted for 'Re - arrangement of internal layouts, re - positioning of stairs to entrance to unit 2 at front of building (in retrospect)' (20.08.2007)

05/04192/VARY - Permission varied for 'Non Material Variation Minor alterations to layout' 30.10.2007

07/03921/FUL - Concurrent application for 'Change of use from office accommodation to four residential units. This is considered in a separate report.

07/00817/ELBB - Enforcement enquiry for 'Alterations to a listed building'. Works were limited to preparatory works associated with bathrooms on the second floor only, there is therefore no breach of planning control. No further action taken. (27.11.07)

## **Description of the Proposal**

The proposals were amended to omit a partition in a rear room on the first floor due to the adverse effect it would have on that rooms character.

The remaining proposals are for:

- Internal alterations to subdivide the property and form four residential units.

- Replacement of the existing chainlink fence with traditional style steel railings.

#### Ground Floor

- A new partition will be erected within the entrance hall and the existing cornice will be re-run round this to match.
- The original timber doors to the front lounge and proposed rear bedroom will be retained and pinned shut.
- The existing toilet will be reconfigured to form an ensuite.

#### First Floor

- An existing office room to the rear will be created into an ensuite and a new door formed into the proposed master bedroom
- An existing toilet will be reconfigured
- Non original partitions will be removed to create a kitchen

#### Second Floor

- Reconfigure existing bathrooms

### **3 Officer's Assessment and Recommendations**

#### **Determining Issues**

Do the proposals harm the character or appearance of the conservation area? If they do, there is a strong presumption against granting of permission.

Do the proposals preserve the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses? If not, there is a presumption against the granting of permission. For the purposes of this issue, "preserve", in relation to the building, means preserve it either in its existing state or subject only to such alterations or extensions as can be carried out without serious detriment to its character.

Do the proposals preserve the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses? If not, there is a presumption against the granting of consent.

Do the proposals comply with the development plan?

If the proposals do comply with the development plan, are there any compelling reasons for not approving them?

If the proposals do not comply with the development plan, are there any compelling reasons for approving them?

## **ASSESSMENT**

To address these determining issues, the Committee needs to consider whether:

- a) The proposals have an adverse effect on the character of the listed building.
  
- a) The property is a large Baronial villa spread over three floors. The proposal will see the property reinstated to its original domestic use and its sub-division is acceptable as the majority of the proposals are minor and there is no unacceptable loss of architectural or historic character.

The new partition on the ground floor will re-run the existing cornice and is in-keeping with the buildings character. Original doors and architraves will be retained and doors will be pinned shut where necessary maintaining the buildings architectural integrity. The remaining proposals include creating and reconfiguring bathrooms which are of a minor nature and sympathetic to the buildings historic character, detailing and form. All ventilation will be ducted to the rear of the property reusing existing vents where possible.

The existing chainlink fence around the perimeter of the property is in poor condition and detracts from the setting of the listed building. The replacement railings are simple traditional style steel railings and will improve the property's boundary treatment. They will be mounted into the existing stone wall and sensitively integrate the few remaining original fence posts. This is a high quality alteration and improves the sense of enclosure around the building.

The previous unauthorised works referred to in the objection letter to the top floor of no 11 Bruntsfield Crescent included the creation of new toilets and some partitioning. These proposals were compliant with listed building policy and were covered in a retrospective Listed Building Consent application in early 2007 (07/02400/LBC). The building was recently inspected on 27.11.07 by case officers from ECC Enforcement team responding to an emailed complaint regarding unauthorised works. The work that was ongoing in the property involved tiling a bathroom and there was no work that required remedial action.

In conclusion the proposals comply with the development plan and non-statutory guidelines and have no adverse effect on the character of the listed building.

There are no material planning considerations, which outweigh this conclusion.

It is recommended that the Committee approves this application, subject to the standard conditions.

  
**Alan Henderson**  
Head of Planning and Strategy

Contact/tel	Grainne Lennon on 0131 529 3543
<b>Ward affected</b>	A10 - Meadows/Morningside (NEW)
<b>Local Plan</b>	Central Edinburgh Local Plan/Finalised Edinburgh City Local Plan
<b>Statutory Development Plan Provision</b>	Housing and Compatible Uses/Urban Area
<b>Date registered</b>	31 October 2007
<b>Drawing numbers/ Scheme</b>	01-04,05a,06a,7-12 Scheme 2

#### **Advice to Committee Members and Ward Councillors**

The full details of the application are available for viewing on the Planning and Building Control Portal: [www.edinburgh.gov.uk/planning](http://www.edinburgh.gov.uk/planning).

If you require further information about this application you should contact the following Principal Planner, Anna Grant on 529 3521. Email: [anna.grant@edinburgh.gov.uk](mailto:anna.grant@edinburgh.gov.uk).

If this application is not identified on the agenda for presentation, and you wish to request a presentation of this application at the Committee meeting, you must contact Committee Services by 9.00a.m. on the Tuesday preceding the meeting on extension 4229/4239. Alternatively, you may e-mail [gavin.king@edinburgh.gov.uk](mailto:gavin.king@edinburgh.gov.uk) or [carol.richardson@edinburgh.gov.uk](mailto:carol.richardson@edinburgh.gov.uk)

**Application Type** Listed Building Consent Application  
**Application Address:** 12 Bruntsfield Crescent  
Edinburgh  
EH10 4EZ  
**Proposal:** Change of use from office accommodation to four residential units  
**Reference No:** 07/03921/LBC

---

## Consultations, Representations and Planning Policy

### Consultations

No consultations undertaken.

### Representations

The application was advertised on 21.09.07 and was re-notified on 31.10.07 due to improper neighbour notification on the accompanying planning application. The application attracted two letters of representation from the same neighbour, and one late representation from the AHSS. The neighbour objected to the proposals on the following grounds:

- a. Issues of principle, taken account of in assessment a.:
- Subdivision of a listed building
  - Unauthorised works to no.11

***Full copies of the representations made in respect of this application are available in Group Rooms or can be requested for viewing at the Main Reception, City Chambers, High Street.***

Planning Policy

Housing and Compatible Uses, Central Area Local Plan

Urban Area, Finalised Edinburgh City Local Plan

## Relevant Policies:

### **Relevant policies of the Central Edinburgh Local Plan**

Policy CD2 (LISTED BUILDINGS) sets out criteria for assessing proposals affecting listed buildings and seeks to safeguard their character and setting.

### **Relevant policies of the Edinburgh City Local Plan**

Policy Env 3 (Listed Buildings – Alterations & Extensions) identifies the circumstances in which alterations and extensions to listed buildings will be permitted.

### **Relevant Non-Statutory Guidelines**

Non-statutory guidelines 'ALTERATIONS TO LISTED BUILDINGS' provide general guidance for assessing proposals for both internal and external alterations.

**Application Type** Listed Building Consent Application  
**Application Address:** 12 Bruntsfield Crescent  
Edinburgh  
EH10 4EZ  
**Proposal:** Change of use from office accommodation to four residential units  
**Reference No:** 07/03921/LBC

---

Conditions/Reasons associated with the Recommendation

### Recommendation

It is recommended that this application be **GRANTED**

### Conditions

1. The application shall be referred to the Scottish Ministers prior to determination.
2. The works hereby permitted shall be commenced no later than five years from the date of this consent.

### Reasons

1. In order to accord with the statutory requirements of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Acts.
2. In order to accord with the statutory requirements of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Acts.

### INFORMATIVES

It should be noted that:

1. This consent is for listed building consent only. Work must not begin until other necessary consents, e.g. planning permission, have been obtained.

---

End



**Application Type** Listed Building Consent Application

**Proposal:** Change of use from office accommodation to four residential units

**Reference No:** 07/03921/LBC



## Location Plan

Reproduction from the Ordnance Survey mapping with permission of the Controller of Her Majesty's Stationery Office © Crown Copyright.

Unauthorised reproduction infringes Crown copyright and may lead to prosecution or civil proceedings. Licence Number 100023420 The City of Edinburgh Council 2005.