

Committee Minutes

Development Quality Sub-Committee of the Planning Committee

Edinburgh, 27 July 2005

Present:- Councillors Davies (Convener), Child, The Hon David Guest, Harrold, Hunter, Laing, Longstaff, Lowrie, Munro, Ponton and Tritton.

Also Present:- Councillor Edie, Henderson, Jackson, Kate Mackenzie, Shiels and Wilson.

1 Trinity Park House (A2 South Trinity Road) – Demolition of Existing Office Building, Change of Use to Residential, Construction of 256 Flats

A planning application (05/01230/FUL) had been received for the demolition of the existing office building, change of use to residential and the construction of 256 flats with associated parking and amenity site at Trinity Park House, A2 South Trinity Road.

116 letters of representation commenting on the proposals had been received, including letters from Mark Lazarowicz MP, Mark Ballard MSP, Margo MacDonald MSP, Robin Harper MSP, Malcolm Chisholm MSP, James Douglas Hamilton MSP, the Architectural Heritage Society of Scotland, the Cockburn Association, CTC, SPOKES and Trinity Park Residents Association.

Councillor Jackson was heard as local ward member.

Motion

- 1) To grant planning permission subject to:
 - (a) The conditions contained in the report by the Director of City Development.
 - (b) A legal agreement.

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
27 July 2005

- 2) To request the Director of City Development to pay particular attention to the local junction improvements in relation to the legal agreement.

- moved by Councillor Ponton, seconded by Councillor Davies.

Amendment

To continue consideration of the application for a site visit.

- moved by Councillor Hunter, seconded by Councillor The Hon David Guest.

Voting

The motion was carried by 7 votes to 4.

Decision

- 1) To grant planning permission subject to:
 - (a) The conditions contained in the report by the Director of City Development.
 - (b) A legal agreement.
- 2) To request the Director of City Development to pay particular attention to the local junction improvements in relation to the legal agreement.

(Reference – report by the Director of City Development, submitted.)

2 39B Watson Crescent – Re-development of the Site to form Dwelling

The Sub-Committee had previously continued consideration of a planning application (05/01004/FUL) for the re-development of the site at 39B Watson Crescent to form one dwelling, for a site visit and to request the Director of City Development to report on the principle of development of this site and access to the canal.

The site was visited on 9 June 2005.

3 letters of representation commenting on the proposals and a supporting statement from the applicant had been received.

The Director of City Development reported further on the application.

Councillor Shiels was heard as local ward member.

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
27 July 2005

Motion

To grant planning permission subject to conditions to be determined by the Head of Planning and Strategy.

- moved by Councillor Munro, seconded by Councillor Ponton.

Amendment

To refuse planning permission for the reasons that:

- 1) The proposal was contrary to Central Edinburgh Local Plan Policies H1 and H2 (Housing Development), in that the constrained nature of the site was not appropriate for the development of the house and would adversely affect the spatial character of the surrounding area and set an unacceptable precedent.
- 2) The proposal was contrary to Central Edinburgh Local Plan Policy H11 (Housing Amenity) and the Council's non-statutory guidelines on daylighting, privacy and sunlight, in that the position of the house in relation to the residential accommodation to the north would lead to the loss of residential amenity for its occupants in terms of intrusion and loss of privacy.

- moved by Councillor Davies, seconded by Councillor Longstaff.

Voting

The amendment was carried by 7 votes to 4.

Decision

To refuse planning permission for the reasons that:

- 1) The proposal was contrary to Central Edinburgh Local Plan Policies H1 and H2 (Housing Development), in that the constrained nature of the site was not appropriate for the development of the house and would adversely affect the spatial character of the surrounding area and set an unacceptable precedent.
- 2) The proposal was contrary to Central Edinburgh Local Plan Policy H11 (Housing Amenity) and the Council's non-statutory guidelines on daylighting, privacy and sunlight, in that the position of the house in

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
27 July 2005

relation to the residential accommodation to the north would lead to the loss of residential amenity for its occupants in terms of intrusion and loss of privacy.

(Reference – Development Quality Sub-Committee 18 May (Appendix, item 20). report by the Director of City Development, submitted.)

3 34 Barnton Avenue West - Development of 9 Apartments

A planning application (05/01262/FUL) had been received to develop and build 9 apartments at 34 Barnton Avenue West.

17 letters of representation commenting on the proposal had been received.

Councillor Kate MacKenzie was heard as local ward member.

Motion

- 1) To grant planning permission subject to:
 - a) The conditions contained in the report by the Director of City Development.
 - b) A legal agreement.
 - c) The following additional conditions:
 - (i) “The applicant shall enter into a suitably worded legal agreement with the Council to ensure a financial contribution of £4,000 per unit towards the upgrading of the existing road surface and road drainage on Barnton Avenue West.
 - (ii) “The applicant shall ensure that surface water outfall drainage is provided for the development to the satisfaction of the Director of City Development, such that existing drainage is not placed under any additional stress and such that local flooding problems are in no way worsened.
 - (iii) “Prior to the commencement of works on site, details of access to and space for waste management facilities, including recycling, shall be submitted to and approved and writing by the Head of Planning and Strategy. Thereafter, the requirements agreed shall be implemented to the satisfaction of the Head of Planning and Strategy, prior to the occupation of the development hereby approved.”

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
27 July 2005

- 2) To indicate that the Sub-Committee would not wish to consider any further applications in Barnton Avenue West until the results of the traffic impact study were available.

- moved by Councillor Davies, seconded by Councillor Longstaff.

Amendment

- 1) To continue consideration of the application for a site visit.
- 2) To indicate that the Sub-Committee would not wish to consider any further applications in Barnton Avenue West until the results of the traffic impact study were available.

- moved by Councillor The Hon David Guest, seconded by Councillor Laing.

Voting

The motion was carried by 7 votes to 3.

Decision

- 1) To grant planning permission subject to:
 - a) The conditions contained in the report by the Director of City Development.
 - b) A legal agreement.
 - c) The following additional conditions:
 - (i) "The applicant shall enter into a suitably worded legal agreement with the Council to ensure a financial contribution of £4,000 per unit towards the upgrading of the existing road surface and road drainage on Barnton Avenue West.
 - (ii) "The applicant shall ensure that surface water outfall drainage is provided for the development to the satisfaction of the Director of City Development, such that existing drainage is not placed under any additional stress and such that local flooding problems are in no way worsened.
 - (iii) "Prior to the commencement of works on site, details of access to and space for waste management facilities, including recycling, shall be submitted to and approved and writing by the Head of Planning and Strategy. Thereafter, the requirements agreed shall be implemented to the satisfaction of the Head of

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
27 July 2005

Planning and Strategy, prior to the occupation of the development hereby approved.”

- 2) To indicate that the Sub-Committee would not wish to consider any further applications in Barnton Avenue West until the results of the traffic impact study were available.

(Reference – report by the Director of City Development, submitted.)

4 Applications

The Sub-Committee considered the remaining items of the agenda.

Councillor Edie was heard as local ward member in respect of agenda item 3 (36 Clerwood Terrace).

Councillor Henderson was heard as local ward member in respect of agenda item 20 (1 Parkhead Grove).

Councillor Wilson was heard as local ward member in respect of agenda item 19 (11(3F3) Merchiston Grove).

Decision

To agree as detailed in the Appendix to this minute.

Decision

(Reference – reports by the Director of City Development, submitted.)

Declaration of Interest

Councillor Child declared a non-financial interest in agenda item 3 (36 Clerwood Terrace) as a member of the governing body of the QMUC, took no part in the determination of the application and left the meeting room.

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
27 July 2005

APPENDIX

Applications

(As referred to in item 4 of the foregoing minute)

Note: Detailed conditions/reasons for the following decisions are contained in the statutory planning register.

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No	Details of Proposals	Decision
3	36 Clerwood Terrace (04/03378/FUL)	Demolition of existing buildings for the erection of new residential development (as amended).	Continue consideration for: 1. A site visit. 2. Further information on the options for a second site access and the reasons why these were not taken up. 3. To reconsider single aspect houses and flats which are below daylight standard. 4. Further information on waste disposal and recycling arrangements. 5. Reconsideration of sustainability and energy measures to address Local Plan Policy DQ4. 6. Reconsideration of the use of standard house types.

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
27 July 2005

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No	Details of Proposals	Decision
			<p>7. Improved presentation materials to include professional photo montages of long and short views and consideration of provision of a model.</p> <p>8. Further information on sustainable drainage arrangements.</p>
<p>Declaration of Interest – Councillor Child declared a non-financial interest in the above item as a member of the governing body of QMUC, took no part in the determination of the application and left the meeting room.</p>			
4	Trinity Park House (A2 South Trinity Road) (05/01230/FUL)	Demolition of existing office building, change of use to residential, construction of 256 flats (216 private, 40 affordable) with associated parking and amenity site (as amended).	<p>Grant conditional planning permission subject to a legal agreement.</p> <p>(On a division. See item 1 of the foregoing minute.)</p> <p>(Note: The Sub-Committee requested the Director of City Development to pay particular attention to local junction improvements in relation to the legal agreement.)</p>

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
27 July 2005

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No	Details of Proposals	Decision
5	39B Watson Crescent (05/01004/FUL)	Redevelopment of site to form one dwelling.	<p>To refuse planning permission for the reasons that –</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The proposal was contrary to Central Edinburgh Local Plan Policies H1 and H2 (Housing Development), in that the constrained nature of the site was not appropriate for the development of the house and would adversely affect the spatial character of the surrounding area and set an unacceptable precedent. 2. The proposal was contrary to Central Edinburgh Local Plan Policy H11 (Housing Amenity) and the Council's non-statutory guidelines on daylighting, privacy and sunlight, in that the position of house in relation to the residential accommodation to the north would lead to the loss of residential amenity for its

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
27 July 2005

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No	Details of Proposals	Decision
			<p>occupants in terms of intrusion and loss of privacy.</p> <p>(On a division. See item 2 of the foregoing minute.)</p>
6	294-328 West Granton Road, 1-6 Caroline Park Grove 242 West Granton Road (premises of National Museums of Scotland, North of Caroline Park Grove) (04/03325/OUT)	A mixed use development of primarily commercial/ retail/parking with associated residential.	Grant conditional planning permission subject to a legal agreement and an additional condition requiring that a design study and design proposal for the entire junction and the open space and associated public realm be approved prior to the submission of any reserved matters. Any detailed scheme will require to take due account of the approved design proposal.
7	Bankhead Drive (Unit 5, Catalyst Trade Retail Park) (05/01508/FUL)	Change of use to children's play centre (supervised by parents).	To continue consideration for: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. A site visit. 2. To ask officials to examine any conditions that might allow the operation of the premises within the surrounding business/industrial land use, should the Sub-Committee be minded to grant the application.

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
27 July 2005

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No	Details of Proposals	Decision
8	34 Barnton Avenue West (05/01262/FUL)	Development and erection of nine apartments.	<p>Grant planning permission subject to:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The conditions contained in the report by the Director of City Development. 2. A legal agreement. 3. The following additional condition: "The applicant shall enter into a suitably worded legal agreement with the Council to ensure a financial contribution of £4,000 per unit towards the upgrading of the existing road surface and road drainage on Barnton Avenue West. 4. The following additional condition: "The applicant shall ensure that surface water outfall drainage is provided for the development to the satisfaction of the Director of City Development, such that existing drainage is not placed under any additional stress and such that local flooding problems are in no way worsened.

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
27 July 2005

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No	Details of Proposals	Decision
			<p>5. The following additional condition:</p> <p>“Prior to the commencement of works on site, details of access to and space for waste management facilities, including recycling, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Head of Planning and Strategy. Thereafter, the requirements agreed shall be implemented to the satisfaction of the Head of Planning and Strategy, prior to the occupation of the development hereby approved.”</p> <p>(Note: The Sub-Committee indicated that it would not wish to consider any further applications in Barnton Avenue West until the results of the traffic impact study were available.)</p> <p>(On a division see item 3 of foregoing minute.)</p>
9	110 Caroline Terrace (05/01945/FUL)	Single storey extension to enlarge and re-plan kitchen and dining areas.	Grant planning permission.

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
27 July 2005

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No	Details of Proposals	Decision
10	14 Cluny Place (04/04422/FUL) (04/04422/LBC)	(a) Alter and extend dwelling with oak and glass extension to rear (as amended). (b) Alter and extend dwelling with oak and glass extension to rear (as amended).	Grant conditional planning permission. Indicate intention to grant conditional listed building consent subject to the views of the Scottish Ministers.
11	1 Cramond Bridge (Grass Verge to South Bound of Queensferry Road) (05/01108/FUL)	Installation of 10m high slim line telecommunications monopole supporting 3 dual band antennas within GRP shroud, 2 ground based cabinets and ancillary development.	Grant conditional planning permission.
12	7 Cramond Vale (05/01367/FUL)	Form bedroom and en-suite above existing garage.	Grant planning permission.
13	1 Denham Green Terrace (05/01428/FUL)	Form new hard-standing for one car, form 4 velux windows and 1 pyramid rooflight as part of attic conversion works (as amended to move run-in to South Trinity Road).	Grant planning permission.
14	27 Forbes Road (05/01581/FUL)	Installation of condenser unit at rear of property at ground level.	Grant conditional planning permission.

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
27 July 2005

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No	Details of Proposals	Decision
15	7 Hillhouse Road (05/01631/FUL)	Extensions to provide kitchen/breakfast room, lounge and bedroom/ensuite and dressing room and a front porch.	Grant conditional planning permission.
16	53 Juniper Avenue, Juniper Green (04/03358/FUL)	(a) Vacant land with empty house to be demolished and construction of 3 two bedroom town houses.	Refuse planning permission.
	(04/03358/CON)	(b) Demolition of property to allow building of 3 town houses.	Refuse conservation area consent.
17	17(3F1) Links Gardens (05/01726/FUL)	Extension into roof space of tenement with Velux rooflights.	Grant planning permission.
18	17/6 Links Gardens (05/01717/FUL)	Extension into roof space of tenement with Velux rooflights.	Grant planning permission.
19	11(3F3) Merchiston Grove (05/01383/FUL)	Formation of 2 rooms in attic space, one dormer with window and one velux window.	Grant planning permission.
20	1 Parkhead Grove (05/01992/FUL)	Proposed car run-in to front garden.	Grant conditional planning permission.
21	97-99 Shandwick Place (Canning Street Elevation) (05/01871/FUL)	Pave garden ground to form restaurant terrace (in retrospect).	Grant conditional planning permission.
22	10 Silverknowes Road East (05/01738/FUL)	Build extension to dwellinghouse to form family room.	Grant conditional planning permission.

Development Quality Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee
27 July 2005

Agenda Item No.	Address/ Reference No	Details of Proposals	Decision
23	25 South Barnton Avenue (05/00814/FUL)	Erection of first floor extension over existing ground floor extension to rear of dwelling (as amended).	Grant planning permission.
24	4 West Mill Road (04/01320/FUL)	Residential Development (as revised).	Grant conditional planning permission subject to a legal agreement and the following additional condition: "Prior to the commencement of works on site, details of access to and space for waste management facilities, including recycling, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Head of Planning and Strategy. Thereafter, the requirements agreed shall be implemented to the satisfaction of the Head of Planning and Strategy, prior to the occupation of the development hereby approved."