



**Listed Building Consent Application 07/01987/LBC
at
41,42 Inverleith Gardens
Edinburgh
EH3 5PR**

**Development Management Sub-Committee
of the Planning Committee**

26 September 2007

Supplementary Report

This application was previously considered by Committee on **12 September 2007**.

An addendum is included at the end of Section 3 of this report.

1 Purpose of report

To consider application 07/01987/LBC, submitted by T - Mobile (UK) Ltd.. The application is for: **Installation of stealth telecommunications flagpole on church tower, associated equipment housing and all ancillary development (as amended to conceal cabinets within tower with existing equipment)**

It is recommended that this application be **GRANTED** subject to the conditions below.

2 The Site and the Proposal

Site description

The property is an early English style church dating from 1879 -1881. It has a 4 stage square plan pinnaced tower. The tower is the highest architectural feature within the immediate vicinity and as a consequence, it is visually prominent, particularly in views along Granton Road.

It is listed category C(S) (ref. 50116) and was listed on 10.5.05.

This property is located within the Inverleith Conservation Area.

Site History

21.7.1999 - consent granted for satellite dish and 18 radio ports within main tower behind GRP louvres (99/01622/FUL)

22.8.2006 - consent granted to repave front courtyard 06/02796/FUL

Description of the Proposal

The application proposes a faux GRP flagpole standing at the centre of the square tower of the church. This conceals a slim telecommunication mast.

The pole is 5.9m high, which is 1.9m higher than the existing stone pinnacles, and around 1.3m higher than the four lightning conductors currently topping each pinnacle.

The application is accompanied by various photomontages illustrating the proposal and full assessment of alternative site considerations.

The application was amended to move the associated cabinets from the base of the pole to the interior of the tower just above the existing telecommunication equipment, in order to fully conceal it from view.

3 Officer's Assessment and Recommendations

Determining Issues

- Do the proposals harm the character or appearance of the conservation area? If they do, there is a strong presumption against granting of permission.
- Do the proposals preserve the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses? If not, there is a presumption against the granting of permission. For the purposes of this issue, "preserve", in relation to the building, means preserve it either in its existing state or subject only to such alterations or extensions as can be carried out without serious detriment to its character.

- Do the proposals preserve the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses? If not, there is a presumption against the granting of consent.
- Do the proposals comply with the development plan?
- If the proposals do comply with the development plan, are there any compelling reasons for not approving them?
- If the proposals do not comply with the development, are there any compelling reasons for approving them?

ASSESSMENT

To address these determining issues, the Committee needs to consider whether:

- a) The alterations have an adverse affect on the character or appearance of the listed building.

Telecommunications equipment has been installed on many listed church buildings throughout the City as these buildings offer the height and coverage that the applicant requires. The principle of using the church as a site is acceptable.

The application has been amended so the associated equipment is within the building and hidden from public view. The only change to the church will be the installation of the GRP flagpole on the tower. There is no physical damage to the building and no original fabric is being removed. While the proposal will add a non-original feature, the proposed flagpole is traditional in design and fits in with the form and design of the church. It is considered that the telecommunications installation is effectively disguised in an appropriate manner that respects the character of the building. It does not detract from its overall composition. This is considered a sensitive means of accommodating a telecommunications installation without compromising the character or appearance of the listed building.

No other considerations outweigh this conclusion.

It is recommended that the Committee approves the application subject to conditions on colour finishes and requiring the removal of equipment when redundant.

Addendum

Committee continued the application on 22nd August 2007, mainly for issues relating to the parallel application for planning permission.

The issue relating to listed building consent was a query as to the appropriateness of a flagpole on a tower such as this.

Flagpoles on church towers are not uncommon. Locally the best example is South Leith Parish Church, but many other examples exist.

It is concluded that addition of a flagpole on the tower is appropriate and retains the character of the building.

It is recommended that the Committee approves the application subject to the conditions as already outlined.

SECOND ADDENDUM

The application was further considered at the Development Management Sub-Committee on 12 September 2007.

Committee was concerned that the proposal would be a visually intrusive feature on the skyline to the detriment of the character of the listed building and would be an alien feature on this church tower.

Committee indicated it was minded to refuse the application and continued the application for reasons to be drafted.

The suggested reason is as follows:

The installation would be an inappropriate addition to this listed building to the detriment of its character and contrary to policy CD2 of the Central Edinburgh Local Plan and policy Env3 of the Finalised Edinburgh City Local Plan.

It is recommended that Committee approve this application.

Alan Henderson

Alan Henderson
Head of Planning and Strategy

Contact/tel	Stephen Dickson on 0131 529 3529
Ward affected	A05 - Inverleith (NEW)
Local Plan	Central Edinburgh
Statutory Development Plan Provision	Housing and Compatible Uses Inverleith Conservation Area
Date registered	11 May 2007
Drawing numbers/ Scheme	1a-6a Scheme 2

Advice to Committee Members and Ward Councillors

The full details of the application are available for viewing on the Planning and Building Control Portal : www.edinburgh.gov.uk/planning.

If you require further information about this application you should contact the following Principal Planner, Anna Grant on 529 3521. Email: anna.grant@edinburgh.gov.uk.

If this application is not identified on the agenda for presentation, and you wish to request a presentation of this application at the Committee meeting, you must contact Committee Services by 9.00a.m. on the Tuesday preceding the meeting on extension 4229/4239. Alternatively, you may e-mail gavin.king@edinburgh.gov.uk or carol.richardson@edinburgh.gov.uk

Application Type Listed Building Consent Application
Application Address: 41,42 Inverleith Gardens
Edinburgh
EH3 5PR

Proposal: Installation of stealth telecommunications flagpole on church tower, associated equipment housing and all ancillary development (as amended to conceal cabinets within tower with existing equipment)

Reference No: 07/01987/LBC

Consultations, Representations and Planning Policy

Consultations

No consultations undertaken.

Representations

Six representations were received that referred to the listed building consent application (seven representations were made on the planning permission application and a further thirty non-material representations were received).

Materials reasons for objection were:

- Not sympathetic to tower and disrupt silhouette of tower
- Impact on historic roofscape/skyline
- Aesthetic effect on church will be damaging

Full copies of the representations made in respect of this application are available in Group Rooms or can be requested for viewing at the Main Reception, City Chambers, High Street.

Planning Policy

The building lies in an Area of Housing and Compatible Uses of the Central Edinburgh Local Plan and the Urban Area of the finalised Edinburgh City Local Plan.

Relevant Policies:

Relevant policies of the Central Edinburgh Local Plan.

Policy CD2 (LISTED BUILDINGS) sets out criteria for assessing proposals affecting listed buildings and seeks to safeguard their character and setting.

Relevant policies of the Edinburgh City Local Plan.

Policy Env 3 (Listed Buildings – Alterations & Extensions) identifies the circumstances in which alterations and extensions to listed buildings will be permitted.

Relevant Non-Statutory Guidelines

Non-statutory guidelines on "RADIO TELECOMMUNICATIONS" set out detailed guidance for the siting and design of masts, antennas, cabins and equipment in all locations, with special reference to listed buildings and other sensitive situations

The Inverleith Conservation Area Character Appraisal emphasises the predominance of Georgian, Victorian and Edwardian villas and terraces which form boundaries to extensive blocks of public and private open space. The villa streets are complemented by a profusion of mature trees, extensive garden settings, stone boundary walls and spacious roads. The villas are in a considerable variety of architectural styles, unified by the use of local building materials.

Application Type Listed Building Consent Application
Application Address: 41,42 Inverleith Gardens
Edinburgh
EH3 5PR

Proposal: Installation of stealth telecommunications flagpole on church tower, associated equipment housing and all ancillary development (as amended to conceal cabinets within tower with existing equipment)

Reference No: 07/01987/LBC

Conditions/Reasons associated with the Recommendation

Recommendation

It is recommended that this application be **GRANTED**

Conditions

1. The works hereby permitted shall be commenced no later than five years from the date of this consent.
2. The flagpole shall be finished in white
3. In the event that equipment becomes obsolete or redundant it must be removed and the site reinstated to the satisfaction of the Planning Authority within 3 months from that date.

Reasons

1. In order to accord with the statutory requirements of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Acts.
2. In order to safeguard the character of the statutorily listed building.
3. In order to safeguard the character of the statutorily listed building.

End

Application Type Listed Building Consent Application

Proposal: Installation of stealth telecommunications flagpole on church tower, associated equipment housing and all ancillary development (as amended to conceal cabinets within tower with existing equipment)

Reference No: 07/01987/LBC



Location Plan

Reproduction from the Ordnance Survey mapping with permission of the Controller of Her Majesty's Stationery Office © Crown Copyright.

Unauthorised reproduction infringes Crown copyright and may lead to prosecution or civil proceedings. Licence Number 100023420 The City of Edinburgh Council 2005.